

A Comparative Study of John Dewey and Muhammad Iqbal as Educationists

Yusrat Hussain*
Niaz Muhammad Aajiz**
Muhammad Idrees***

Abstract

A comparative study of Dewey and Iqbal as Educationists is based on scientific approach which combines findings of different scientific researches and is recognized as Meta-analysis. The fundamental principle in Meta-analysis is to search for a shared truth which may be found in good number of conceptually similar scientific researches. The interviews of Heads of Education Departments may be considered the most valuable inputs of scholarly personalities. During literature review special attention was paid to the original work by Dewey and Iqbal. It was found that the real aims of education as explained by both educational thinkers are much more similar. Dewey and Iqbal stand at the point of greatest achievements or success in the field of educational philosophy, especially in their own cultures. Iqbal is surely preface to Pakistan and the Muslim philosophy while Dewey can be regarded as master mind in relation to secular liberalism for the Americans. Dewey and Iqbal make commencement of different philosophical presuppositions but it is astonishing to note that their educational philosophies do not sharply go to the level of antagonistic contrast. It is because of such reasons that this study became interesting and valuable for comparison and analysis of Dewey's and Iqbal's educational thoughts.

Keywords: self-experience, pragmatism, inquiry, society.

* PhD Scholar, Sarhad University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar
yusrathussain@yahoo.com

** Assist Professor in Education: Islamia College University Peshawar
aajizedu@gmail.com

*** Assist Professor in Education: Department of Education, AWKUM
midrees@awkum.edu.pk

Introduction

It is an established and acknowledged fact many have had the chances to live on this planet but factually very few are remembered for their notable contributions. Persons like Dewey (1859-1952) and Iqbal (1877-1938) are definitely remembered by the readers for making improvement in the lives of learners in the domain of education.

The dictum says 'respond to circumstances but avoid reactive attitude. Dewey and Iqbal are the most important personality even today. Dewey thought process of education was not providing capability to learners for bringing the best out of themselves. Brubacher (1947) has explained this idea in a masterly manner. According to him merely gaining information is just a part of education. Along with the concept, pragmatic approach increases the rate of success in life.

Iqbal is considered as one of the profound thinkers of his times because of the value of his educational thoughts. This philosophy contains such principles which are possible of application in many areas of human experience and endeavor. Tufail (1966) has very vehemently expressed his ideas about Iqbal's educational philosophy. He is of the opinion that there is a need to infer Iqbal's educational philosophy from his writing. He says, "The fact that education is an important aspect of human experience and the consideration that Iqbal did not express his views, specifically on educational problems justify the attempt in the present study to imply and infer Iqbal's probable educational views from his philosophy". In order to evaluate their comparative value, the inferred views have been analyzed, compared and contrasted with the educational ideas of a prominent thinker, John Dewey.

Periaswamy (1969) states "Dewey was deeply interested in Philosophy and he got a loan of five hundred dollars from his aunt to study this subject in John Hopkins University in Baltimore. He studied Philosophy from professor George Sylvester while professor G. Stanley Hall made him interested in Psychology and Pedagogy". Dewey could be called great psychologist and an experienced educationist. He attached priority to nature and nurture in mental progress of learners. Improving a learner, his hidden talents, the teacher as an important task to pay heed to learner's inner capability and social setup. It is definitely an uphill task. With this aim in view if the learners could be assisted, my attempt would be successful. Important concepts such as experience, pragmatic view, idea of enquiry appear to be intimately concern with concerned with his Dewey's philosophy of education.

According to Wright (1960) “Basically John Dewey believes that growth is the main criterion of a meaningful life. Growth is based on intelligent interaction of the individual with his environment. Individuality is originally a potentiality”. There is a need to put down analysis of his philosophy of education. There is a pressing necessity to understand philosophy of learning and techniques of acquiring knowledge, and objectives of education. Finally, an evaluation of these two educationists has been made through an endeavor to see the relevance of these educationists to the present day concepts of global education and society. To conclude, education aims at helping a learner, to lead a prosperous living. His philosophy of education targets the learners who are of prime importance. Dewey’s approach is not related with human beings who are lacking resources in life. However, Iqbal’s views are about the learners who can be called poor and also for the masses. While Dewey emphasizes moral aspects of consciousness, Iqbal speaks about ethical views. A mixture of critical enquiry that was advocated by Dewey and providing consciousness for reality as Iqbal believed would improve prevailing educational views. We are badly in need of such improvements.

Statement of the Problem

Dewey and Iqbal have been separately made topic of searching studies by a large number of educationists, around the globe. It is beyond doubt that both of them are great educationist, and have contributed immensely for development of potentials of the learners. Comparative and analytical studies of these educationists would bring forth new dimensions of education and would positively add to the literature on education with renewed interest and enthusiasm.

Objectives of the Study

The following were the objectives of the study:

1. To investigate the key features of educational views of Dewey and Iqbal on education.
2. To access similarities and differences between Dewey’s and Iqbal’s educational philosophy.
3. To find out ultimate aim of education as explained by Dewey and Iqbal.
4. To give possible recommendations for the integration of Dewey’s, Iqbal’s and modern educational philosophy.

Research Questions

- Q. 1 What are important features of educational philosophy of John Dewey?
- Q. 2 What are key features of Iqbal's educational philosophy as per available printed knowledge?
- Q. 3 What major commonalities and differences do we find in Dewey's and Iqbal's educational philosophies?
- Q. 4 Dewey and Iqbal are very clear as to what is the ultimate aim of all education. How can we throw light on this significant aspect of their philosophies?
- Q. 5 How can Dewey's and Iqbal's educational ideas be integrated with modern educational philosophy?

Review of Literature

According to Government of Pakistan (Planning Board,1955) it is clarified that more educational opportunities have been provided since the independence of Pakistan but the facilities are neither enough nor suitable. There is no well thought out and sound philosophy of education to steer the educational reforms in Pakistan. Education is primarily a social process; this process formulates one of the major dimensions of any philosophy of education. Thus education as a social institution is a great concern for Iqbal and Dewey.

Butler (1957) believes "Education is scarcely anything at all unless it is a social institution". Dewey (1954) holds "School is expected to provide a broad, balanced, and a representative social environment in order to give an opportunity to each individual to escape from the limitations of the social group in which he was born". The school should also coordinate for disposition of each individual and effects of the different social set ups in which the learner joins. Thinking on these lines Iqbal (1924) said:

A person lives in soundness to the society,
Individually he is meaningless!
The wave is in the river,
Out of the river, there is naught!

Vahid (1948) expressed an irreparable loss on the death of Iqbal especially as an esteemed educationist, which reaffirms the need for our comparative study of great scholars. He says, "A poet and a philosopher who was also a fine prose-writer, a great linguist, a remarkable jurist, a

well-known lawyer, a leading politician, a front rank statesman, an esteemed educationist, a respected teacher and a great art critic”.

According to Dewey (1954) method cannot be called antithetical to subject-matter. It is focused direction of subject-matter to wanted ends. Method can be defined as arrangement of subject-matter that can make it most effective in use. While Iqbal does not agree with the organization of the lesson, singly or exclusively that may be in logical or psychological arrangement. However according to the analysis by Tufail, (1966) “Both logical and psychological orders are necessary for different phases of the same lesson.” Dewey (1938) places the teacher as a discipline maintaining force among pupils like parents in the family. He is significant member of family who helps in maintaining a well-ordered home life.

Methodology of the Study

The method of research is a Meta-analysis which is based on scientific approach of research. The population of the study was all the private sector universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Heads of Education Departments (Who were six in number) and 58 Professors of these institutions along with 310 M.Phil scholars comprised the population of this research work. The sample included 06 Heads of Education Departments, 12 Professors of education from these universities and 30 M.Phil Scholars in the discipline of education. Data were treated and analyzed as per scientific methodology of research.

Data Collection and Analysis

The art of data collection requires systematic gathering of information on the topic of research: be it people or objects and in certain cases it can be a phenomenon. In case data are not collected systematically the research questions would remain unanswered, in an effective manner. Thus the primary data has been collected through works by Dewey and Iqbal, and questionnaires and interviews. Similar data has been also based on Meta-Analysis of different authentic publications and relevant literature on the subject. The questionnaires have been handled personally. Quantitative and qualitative aspects of data analysis have been carried out and the data which are based on quantitative aspects of data analysis have been carried out as per quantitative techniques. The data which are based on quantitative aspects are also interpreted in the form of figures and tables. In order to make it

further clear and meaningful all discussions and interpretations have been shown in the form of tables and graphs for different trends of thought pattern of great educationists. Unbiased and objective approach has been adopted throughout the research work. Exploring all available knowledge on the subject, carrying out critical observations, interviewing (personally), and putting up written questionnaires were some of the chief sources of data collection and analysis Salant and Dillman (1994) produced a masterly source for the individuals who are interested in conducting structured interviews or their own well thought out questionnaires. This pattern has been followed during data collection phase. Copley (2004) maintains that the evidence put forward through analysis cannot be considered at its face value as to what it supports. In fact, the contents of such publication must pass through critical analysis by any researcher for assessing its potential usefulness. McCulloch (2004) citing Tosh (2002) says that a number of problems are involved in analysis of such publication, especially when deliberation on primary source of study is carried out. Fitzgerald (2007) argues that it is difficult to mark such rigid distinction in secondary and primary sources and this type of questions inquired “read between the lines”. Thus nicely established rules can be considered for analyzing publications. Scott et.al (2004) maintains that four important terms like authenticity, representativeness, meaning and credibility must be given due considerations. Meta-Analysis is such an uphill task that certain results of research become subject to challenge, when these are impartially and critically examined with null hypothesis. Thus data collection and analysis pose serious difficulties for the researcher, especially when Meta-Analysis is being applied to the research work. All these difficulties have been considered while tackling the situation and reaching at the authentic conclusions.

Findings

On the basis of detailed analysis, the following findings have been revealed:

1. Result analysis of responses by the HOEDs of private sector universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to question No. 1 reveal that following domains of education are 100% key features of Dewey’s educational philosophy:
 - Educational Aims
 - Growth and Development

- Individually and Collectively Democratic Indoctrination
 - Student centered teaching
 - Project Method of Teaching
 - The Functions of a Teacher
 - Curriculum Development
 - Usefulness of Curriculum
 - Flexibility in Curriculum
2. Result analysis of responses by the HOEDs of private sector universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to question No. 2 reveal that following domains of education are 100% key features of Iqbal's educational philosophy:
 - Self or concept of Individuality
 - The Process of Socialization Through Education
 - Teaching Methods
 - Heterogeneity
 - The Teacher as Perceived by Iqbal
 - The Curriculum and its Selection
 3. Result analysis of responses by the HOEDs of private sector universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to question No. 3 show that following domains of education are 100% commonalities of thoughts between Dewey and Iqbal:
 - Process of Socialization
 - Instructional Methods
 - Homogeneity and Heterogeneity
 - Growth and Development
 4. Result analysis of responses by the HOEDs of private sector universities of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to question No. 3 show that following domain of education has 100% difference of approaches between Dewey and Iqbal:
 - Democracy in Education
 5. Dewey and Iqbal 100% agree that "Growth and Development is the Final Aim of Education.
 6. All HOEDs of private sector universities 100% agree that following domains of education can best be integrated with the modern educational philosophy:
 - Dewey's Progressive Education
 - Iqbal's Concept of Tolerance, Avoidance of War and Universal Brotherhood.
 7. By and large there are more commonalities between Dewey and Iqbal than differences of thoughts in the domain of education.

8. One most striking difference of opinion is that Dewey considers education to serve the mankind as per their needs so long they live on this planet while Iqbal continues advocating this need even in the life here after.
9. Both of them advocate need based aim as important objective of education.
10. Dewey and Iqbal support the idea of global education for the unity of mankind.
11. Dewey is against physical punishment in the process of education and so does Iqbal.
12. Global Education would be the only solution for all the suffering of humanity on this planet, especially in the modern era of nuclear weapons with at least seven countries of the world.

Conclusion

According to Iqbal society is responsible for making youth capable of participation in collective run of life. The school, which is provided by the society, has to undertake the responsibility of giving wholesome education by personality grooming of the learner. Sayyidian (1950) says about Iqbal that "school is or rather should be, an idealized epitome of social life, reflecting within it the elements of all worth-full major activities that make up the work of society." According to Dewey as reflected in *Democracy and Education* (1954) the school must provide a social environment for giving an opportunity to the learner to get out of the social group to which he belonged and was brought up. Similarly, the school must provide the capability to the individual for various social groups in which he enters.

Iqbal's educational philosophy underlines the ultimate aim of all education to develop ego (self) of all individuals. It may be inferred from Iqbal's poetry that supreme aim of any person in life is the actualization and realization of infinite possibilities before a human being. Thus according to Iqbal growth of intellect and intelligence is not the supreme aim of education rather these may be supporting forces for enrichment of the life of self. Dewey maintains that supreme educational aim, although indicated through existing concrete situation, should not be valued as indicated by external conditions in different walks of life. It is justified to judge the achievement of educational process. However, these indicators cannot be considered ultimate educational norms (1929). As Dewey (1954) states, "The educational process has no end beyond itself; it is its own end".

The aims of education and curriculum are so intimately related that curriculum may be understood as aims and values written in expanded form. Curriculum is dynamic and should be given to change because Iqbal stands out for IJTEHAD or adjustment of even values contained in religion, which are mostly considered fixed. All that suits for the development of the self and individuality is preferred by Iqbal. However, not caring for history and culture and adopting values from others indiscriminately spoils the individuality by repression of originality.

According to Dewey (1954), the school curriculum may be judged by the indicator which is animated by a social spirit. He criticizes purely traditional subject, instead it should be regularly revised to suit the purpose. Dewey (1954) believes that there is a dire need of surveying curriculum because it is probable that values of adults are represented rather than children are may be for the needs of previous generation.

The searching study reveals that although there are fundamental differences in the final aims of education, Iqbal's educational ideas compare well with the pragmatic approach of Dewey, who is definitely a modern educational thinker of highest rank. It would not be justified to judge the value and soundness of one individual's educational views in other for validity. When considered independently, Iqbal's educational concepts have valuable educational implications. It is also proposed that there is a need of extensive and intensive work in Iqbal's educational philosophy for its application in other spheres of life. New educational system can be reconstructed in the light of Iqbal's educational philosophy.

Recommendations

This research work recommends that the educators, students and educational planners should pay head to the following factors for more effective and meaningful educational process: -

1. Need-based aims, as important objectives, for different levels of learner may be worked out. It is the responsibility of all the stack holders to realize the pressing necessity of the time. For example, if there is a need to educate students against extremism and terrorism, it must be done in order to get rid of the menace. Similarly, other objectives depending upon the necessity of time, may be set and achieved.
2. Democratic persons and society may be created through indoctrination in this domain.

3. Global education for the unity of mankind may be considered as top priority.
 4. The educator should consider the school as society in miniature.
 5. Iqbal's concept of tolerance, avoidance of war and universal brotherhood may be considered while imparting instructions and developing curriculum.
 6. The educationist should regard creative vision of Dewey and Iqbal for inculcating this value among students so that they grow up good problem solvers.
 7. An effective and a model teacher is the one who understands that he has been entrusted with great responsibility of reforming human beings.
 8. Homogeneity and heterogeneity are opportunities and should be taken as positive situation for more discussion and clarity of realities.
 9. The problem solving or project method is good for imparting instructions because it creates a situation in which students get involved and they do not remain passive listeners.
 10. Student centered teaching is good because it considers the students as most important entity in the process of learning.
 11. As far as possible, learning should be done by practicing.
 12. It should be remembered that the theory and practice form the education.
 13. Education may not be considered as preparation for life, it should be considered as life itself.
- Following recommendations are also made on the basis of all information received through literature review, interviews conducted with the Heads of Departments and contribution made by the professors and M Phil scholars of all private sector universities of KP:
 1. Research may be carried out on character building and personality grooming of the learners in the light of Dewey's and Iqbal's educational thoughts. In fact, this is the most important objective of education and unfortunately this aspect is not being sharply focused by the educators.
 2. There is a dire need to study spiritual aspect of education with references to both the educationists in question generally in both the countries (the USA & Pakistan) and especially in the universities of the USA. The Americans are badly in need of educating their younger generations about spiritual aspects of education.

3. This research works appeals to all the educationists to revisit the modern concept of education which is global education indeed, so that international peace, prosperity and universal brotherhood prevails. Americans, being the super power must take lead in this pious aspect of education, so that the world becomes a heaven on earth. All issues are settled through dialogues and such indoctrination is carried out in minds of younger generation. New sun of happiness, peace and universal brotherhood arises. What the whole world is spending for the purchase of war equipment, is utilized for the well-being of mankind. This was one of the prime objective of present study as well.
4. It is also recommended that model institutions may be established on the integrated philosophies of Dewey and Iqbal, who were leading modern educational thinkers, so that proper application of their thoughts is promulgated in practical. These institutions should take a start from the USA. As a result of establishment of full fledged institutions on the educational philosophies of Dewey and Iqbal would bring a revolution in the domains of teaching/ learning.
5. Unfortunately, in spite of the fact that some of the American universities do have “Iqbal Chair” (as a discipline) but no serious research has been done on Iqbal in American Universities. There is a pressing necessity that some serious research is carried out in the USA on Iqbal and may be comparative study on Dewey and Iqbal is conducted from their perspective but impartially and without any predisposition.
6. The fundamental question about the meaning of education, as per Dewey’s and Iqbal’s perception needs independent research by the scholars especially the educationists. A lot depends on this basic question, when we proceed to set up an educational institutions and constitute educational environment. This aspect cannot be considered in general terms. We have to set the targets, so that the learners proceed to reach there, otherwise it will be like sawing through the same branch on which we are sitting, resultantly the education would bring no reforms.
7. Dewey and Iqbal have talked much about the psychology of child and its importance in the process of learning but hardly any serious study has been carried out either in American or in Pakistan. Process of learning and methods of learning spring out from the domains of psychology be it social psychology or general psychology. The educationists and the students would be

deprived of great benefit, if research is not carried out in this domain with reference to Dewey and Iqbal. If these ideas are further elaborated for their value for learning, these may prove a great source of suggestions for assisting in construction of new educational system.

8. Although, the concept of “growth and development” advocated by Dewey has been discussed by good member of educationists. They have also criticized growth and development without any destination but there is no formal research work on this significant objective of education. It is recommended that formal study on this universal objective of education with reference to Dewey educational thoughts may be carried out in the USA and Pakistan. Indeed, it will clarify as to what the real concept was advocated by Dewey’s because growth and development without any destination in mind becomes misdirected journey and the traveler ends up nowhere.

References

- Periaswamy, A. (1969). *School and society according to John Dewey and Mahatma Gandhi; A retrospective critique*. (unpublished thesis). Loyola University of Chicago:
- Brubacher, J. S. (1947). *Modern philosophies of education*, McGraw Hill, New York.
- Butler, J.D. (1957). *Four Philosophies, and Their Practice in Education and Religion*. New York: Harper Brothers.
- Copley, J.H. (2004). Decision Making in LEAs; the case of NAFE 1974-92 with special reference to West Glamorgan, thesis (Ed.D). University of Cardiff:
- Dewey, J. (1929). *The Sources of a Science of Education*. Macmillan. New York:
- Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience and Education*. Macmillan. New York:
- Dewey, J. (1954). *Democracy and Education*. Macmillan. New York:
- Fitzgerald, T. (2007). Documents and Documentary Analysis; Reading Between the Lines, in Briggs, ARJ, and Coleman. M.(eds). *Research Methods in Educational Leadership and Management* (2nd edition) SAGE Publishing. London:
- Government of Pakistan Planning Board. (1956). *The First Five Year Plan, 1955-1960*, Manager of Publications. Karachi:
- Iqbal, M. (1924). *Bang-i Dara*. Ferozsons. Lahore:
- Iqbal, M. (1934). *The reconstruction of religious thought in Islam*. Oxford University Press. London:
- McCulloch, G. (2004). *Documentary research in education, history and the social sciences*, Routledge. London:
- Saiyidain, K. G. (1950). *The problems of educational reconstruction*. Asia Publishing House. Bombay:

Salant, P. & Dillman, D. A. (1994). *How to Conduct Your Own Survey?* Wiley. New York:

Scott, J, Michael, L., Alan, B. & Tim. (2004). *Documentary Sources in Social Research*, The SAGE: Encyclopedia of social Science Research Methods. Sage Publications, London:

Tufail, M. M. (1966). *Iqbal's Philosophy and Education*. Din Muhammad press. Lahore:

Vahid, S.A.(1948). *His Art and Thought*. Ashraf Publishers. Lahore:

Wright, D. O. (1960). *A Comparative Study of the Relative Works of John Dewey and Victor Lowen Feld in the Field of Art and Art Education*. Unpublished Thesis, University of Sothern California:

Citation of this Article:

Hussain, Y., Idrees, Aajiz, N.M., & Idrees, M. (2019). Comparative study of John Dewey and Muhammad Iqbal as educationists. *Pakistan Journal of Distance and Online Learning*, 5(1), 31-44.