Attitudes and Perspectives of Teacher Performers on Pedagogy and Perceived Student Learning in the Elementary and Secondary School Music Classroom

John L. Vitale

Nipissing University

Abstract

This study investigated the lives of three active music teacher performers and how their performing experience impacted pedagogy and perceived student learning in the classroom. At the time of data collection, one participant was a full-time elementary school music teacher, and the other two participants were full-time secondary school music teachers. Philosophically, this study intended to discover the central meaning underlying the life experiences of each participant as they relate to pedagogy and perceived student learning (phenomenology). Methodologically, qualitative data (typical of phenomenological inquiry) were collected through both interviews and a focus group session. Furthermore, a traditional thematic exploration of the data was employed. Findings indicate that pedagogy and perceived student learning are positively impacted through the theme of respect and negatively impacted through the themes of fatigue and job dissatisfaction. Such themes invite all educators within the performing arts to reexamine and reflect upon the intricate relationship between performing and teaching.

Keywords: phenomenology, music teacher performers, pedagogy, perceived student learning

Résumé

Cette étude porte sur la vie de trois interprètes et professeurs de musique et sur les répercussions de leur expérience en tant qu'artistes sur leurs méthodes pédagogiques et leurs perceptions de l'apprentissage de leurs élèves. Lors de la collecte de données, les trois participants enseignaient la musique à temps plein, l'un au primaire et les deux autres au secondaire. D'un point de vue philosophique, cette étude visait à cerner le sens profond des expériences personnelles vécues par chaque participant quant à leur pédagogie et à leurs perceptions de l'apprentissage de leurs élèves (phénoménologie). D'un point de vue méthodologique, les données qualitatives (propres à la recherche d'ordre phénoménologique) ont été colligées au moyen d'entrevues et d'une discussion en groupe, le tout complété par une exploration thématique des données. Les résultats indiquent que, pour ce qui est de la pédagogie et de la perception de l'apprentissage, le respect a des impacts positifs alors que la fatigue et l'insatisfaction au travail ont des impacts négatifs. Ces observations peuvent inciter tous les éducateurs associés aux arts de la scène à réexaminer la relation complexe entre la performance artistique et l'enseignement.

Mots-clés : phénoménologie, interprètes et professeurs de musique, pédagogie, perception de l'apprentissage des élèves

Contextual Framework

In the classical world of conservatory music, it is imperative that teachers also maintain a reputation as noteworthy performers (Aureden, 2006). In the elementary and secondary school music classroom, however, teacher performers are often relegated as individuals who have chosen teaching as an ancillary career out of financial necessity (Regelski, 2009). In other words, the old adage that "those who can, do, and those who can't, teach." Even in recent times, there is some truth to this old adage. In a study conducted by Conway, Eros, Pellegrino, and West (2010), for example, undergraduate music education students felt they were perceived as weaker performers. Such perception, however, is unwarranted in many cases. In fact, I know many individuals who teach elementary/secondary school music on a full-time basis and simultaneously perform in a multitude of professional venues on weeknights and weekends. As a teacher educator in music, I still maintain a healthy performance schedule, and the institution that employs me recognizes such musical performances as creative scholarship worthy of consideration for purposes of tenure and promotion. I believe that such creative scholarship has helped me in many areas of my professional life, particularly with regards to (a) pedagogical concepts, theories, and philosophies within teacher education, and (b) aspects of research such as philosophical and theoretical approaches to problem solving, data collection, and data analysis/exploration. In fact, Springgay, Irwin, and Kind (2005) argue that the very process of making art is a method of inquiry in and of itself. Hence, my experience as an educator, researcher, and musician has inspired me to further explore the topic of teacher performer.

Literature Review

Thus far, the literature has primarily focused on the duality of teacher performer identities. In essence, do these individuals see themselves as teachers or performers, and why? Thus, there has been more of a psychological approach to this topic. With specific regards to pre-service music teachers, previous studies have corroborated the notion that performing figures centrally to identity construction. Froehlich and L'Roy (1985) and Roberts (1991), for example, found that most participants considered themselves performers first and teachers second. Similarly, Aróstegui (2004) found musical performance plays

a dominant role in the life of a music education major. Continuing with the same trend, Isbell (2006) argues that undergraduate music students maintain a strong musician identity. With "performing" enjoying the lion's share of identity construction for pre-service music education students, Woodford (2002) argues that postsecondary institutions should assist pre-service music education students to espouse a new self-perception where teaching plays a larger role in their identity.

With somewhat different findings, Gillespie and Hamann (1999) found that the majority of string teachers within pre-service programs experienced a positive relationship with both teaching and performing on their instruments. Moreover, Conway et al. (2010) found that pre-service student identities changed from performer to teacher over the course of their music education degree program. Similarly, Ballantyne, Kerchner, and Aróstegui (2012) found that there was a "dynamic and shifting relationship between pre-service music teachers' understandings of themselves as 'musicians' or as 'teachers' during their university years" (p. 211). Austin, Isbell, and Russell (2012) concluded that a mutually supported social structure might allow for "the integration of music, teacher and scholar identities" (p. 66).

From an in-service perspective, Ballantyne and Grootenboer (2012) found that in-service teachers "identify firstly as performing musicians" (p. 368). Likewise, Bernard (2005) reported that in-service music teachers highly valued music-making when asked about their identity. To the contrary, however, Isbell (2006) argues that experienced in-service teachers tend to shift over time from a performer identity to a teacher identity. In terms of in-service teaching at the advanced levels, Triantafyllaki (2010) found that in-service teachers within a prestigious conservatoire setting could take on the identity of performer at certain times of the year, whereas educators in a university music department were provided with more opportunities to take on the identity of teacher. In a study of in-service, early-career secondary classroom music teachers, Ballantyne (2005) found multiple identity constructions. Such identities included "a musician, who happens to be teaching," "a music teacher," and "a teacher who teaches music" (p. 5). Russell (2012) reported that in-service teachers who had "positive relationships with other music educators and music students were likely to develop an educator identity" (p. 145). Moreover, Russell predictably reported that in-service performer identity was influenced by relationships with teachers and students outside of music education.

Rationale for Research Problem

Beyond the issue of duality, Pellegrino (2010) has examined how music-making intersects with teaching and found that music-making outside of the classroom: (a) reinforced the value of performing, (b) assisted teachers with further understanding pedagogical issues, (c) helped teachers be more compassionate with their students, and (d) provided narratives/stories of music-making that were beneficial for student learning. This study, therefore, aims to further expand the knowledge garnered from Pellegrino (2010) regarding the music-making and teacher intersection. Specifically, this study offers the following guiding question: What are the attitudes and perspectives of teacher performers toward pedagogy and student learning in the elementary and secondary school music classroom? The exploration of these attitudes and perspectives, therefore, will provide a unique window into the life of a teacher performer. In addition, such exploration will (a) provide an opportunity to consider the value and impact of teacher performers, (b) build upon the overall knowledge base of teacher performers as they relate to music education specifically, and arts education generally, and (c) provide a uniquely Canadian perspective.

Phenomenological Inquiry

A phenomenological investigation was employed in an attempt to understand how participants experienced the role of teacher performer with regards to pedagogy and perceived student learning. Many of the ideas that currently permeate phenomenological inquiry can be traced back to philosophers Immanuel Kant and Friedrich Hegel (Vandenberg, 1997). It is German philosopher Edmund Husserl, however, who is largely credited as the father of modern-day phenomenology (Zahavi, 2003).

According to Moustakas (1994), phenomenology is a form of qualitative inquiry and is regarded as a comprehensive method of research. Pinar, Reynolds, Slattery, and Taubman (1995) regard phenomenology as "a disciplined, rigorous effort to understand experience" (p. 405). This study, therefore, principally aims to understand the experience of teacher performers as they relate to their own perception of pedagogy and student learning (Lewis & Staehler, 2010; Sokolowski, 2000). Such understanding is an important step for the researcher to reduce the experiences to a central meaning of the

experiences (Moustakas, 1994). The phenomenological approach of the Duquesne School of Thought (as cited in Moustakas, 1994) describes this central meaning as being able to determine what an experience means for the persons who have had the experience and being able to provide a comprehensive description of it.

The very spirit of this study, therefore, is to discover the central meaning underlying the experiences of my participants as they relate to pedagogy and perceived student learning. In addition, this study aims to provide a description of these experiences, as well as derive meanings of these experiences that might be helpful or beneficial for other teacher performers and music education professionals. Hence, a phenomenological inquiry provides an ideal philosophical foundation to support the findings of this study.

Method

This study investigated the professional lives of three active music teacher performers who live and work in Toronto, Canada. Specifically, each participant was interviewed and asked a series of 11 questions that addressed how performing impacted pedagogy and their perception of student learning in the music classroom. Interviews are a critical research tool, as they allow the interviewee an opportunity to tell his or her story. Moreover, Seidman (2006) posits that stories are a way of knowing, which lies right at the very heart of any research inquiry. Lastly, interviews allow the researcher an opportunity to actively participate in the stories of participants by engaging in a rich and dynamic dialogue (Holstein & Gubrium, 1995). See the appendix for the 11 interview questions used in this study.

In addition to the interviews, all three participants also partook in a focus group session. Using the same 11 interview questions as a launching point for participant dialogue, the focus group provided an opportunity for an interactive discussion between participants. The principal benefit of a focus group is "the group effect," where participants stimulate one another in a group setting in terms of past experiences and ideas in "a kind of 'chaining' or 'cascading' effect" (Lindlof & Taylor, 2002, p. 182).

Rossman & Rallis (2012) also posit that dialogue (which is readily achieved through interviews and focus groups) allows the quintessential meaning of the experience to manifest itself. Getting to know my participants through a research design that

incorporates interviews and a focus group is a vital aspect of phenomenology. In fact, both the interviews and the focus group session will provide a portal into the life experiences of each participant, and such experiences are an important component of phenomenological inquiry.

Given that all of the proposed data consisted of spoken words transcribed from three interviews and one focus group session, this study is essentially qualitative in nature with a rich textual description of the phenomenon of teacher performer (Merriam, 2014; Creswell, 2014; Glesne, 2011). Hence, this study uses phenomenology as both a philosophical framework and a qualitative research method.

Exploration of the Data

I intentionally avoided using "data analysis" as a sub-heading, as the word analysis can have risky implications for phenomenology. That is, analysis (the breaking down of a topic or concept into smaller parts) "means a loss of the whole phenomenon" (Hycner, 1999, p. 161). Moreover, Hycner (1999) argues that phenomenologists should be investigating "the constituents of a phenomenon while keeping the context of the whole" (p. 161). Hence the sub-heading "exploration of the data" was used with Hycner's (1999) argument in mind.

All data (interviews and focus group) were transcribed, read, and coded. The coding process was done with the assistance of the highlighting feature within Microsoft Word. Specifically, a number of different colours were used to highlight similar words and/or phrases. Once this process was completed, the search for overarching themes imbued within each colour code transpired. Essentially, "themes are similar codes aggregated together to form a major idea in the database" (Creswell, 2012, p. 248). Such themes are representative of the central meanings that imbue a phenomenological study. In essence, themes provide a structure "to describe the day-to-day experiential dimension" of my participants (Connell, 2003, p. vi).

Participant Profiles

All three participants are full-time music teachers at a publicly funded school board. One participant is an elementary school music teacher, and the other two are secondary

school music teachers. Moreover, they are all musicians who perform in a multitude of professional performances (between 60 to over 100) each year within the Greater Toronto Area. They are authentic music teacher performers with many years of experience in both settings.

All three participants were recruited through my own network of music education and performing professionals, and I did not know any of the participants at the time of data collection. In order to protect confidentiality, pseudonyms have been used for all three participants.

Manuel (participant #1) is a government certified teacher and works full-time as an elementary itinerant instrumental music teacher at five different schools for a large school district and has been in this role for nine years. He is an accomplished woodwind specialist and professionally performs on saxophone, flute, and clarinet at approximately 100 functions over the course of the year, including public festivals, corporate events, and private functions.

Joe (participant #2) is a government certified teacher who has been working full-time as an instrumental music teacher for 15 years at a secondary school that specializes in the arts. He is also a woodwind specialist but exclusively performs on the tenor saxophone at over 60 events over the course of the year, especially playing jazz at local bars and dining establishments.

Franklin (participant #3) is a government certified teacher who has been the Department Head of Music at a large high school for over 20 years. He is an accomplished piano player and performs at over 100 private functions per year, mostly as a solo cocktail piano player. From time to time, Franklin also accompanies the choir at his local church on Sunday mornings.

Findings: A Thematic Exploration of Participant Attitudes and Perspectives

The Theme of Respect: A Positive Impact

In general, findings indicate that performing positively impacts pedagogy and the perception of student learning through the theme of respect. In essence, teacher performers

clearly felt that students had more respect for them, which generated perceived enthusiasm and increased motivation for learning. Manuel, for example, often shared video clips of his performance with his music classes, which ultimately helped him create a special bond with his students:

> Students are very interested in my personal life, often asking me if I play outside of school. I often share pictures and video clips of my performances with them. They love it when I share this part of my life with them and they respect my musical ability. When students take an interest in what you are doing, class always seems to go well [pause] it always seems to go well!

Joe and Franklin made reference to the number of students that often attended their performances, either by design or chance: Joe, for example, stated:

> Teaching at a school of the Arts, many of my students often come to my gigs, especially when I am playing at local restaurants. Even when they don't come, they often ask me about when and where I gigged over the weekend and seem to really appreciate what I do outside of school. I guess it is cool for them to know that their teacher can actually play, which makes learning from me seem more authentic, more real to them I guess.

Similarly, Franklin stated:

> I often bump into my students while playing at the church and even while playing at a few other places here and there. They love seeing me and they often go out of their way to attract my attention. This creates a very good atmosphere in class, because the students really respect what I do and know that I am not just a teacher, but also a performing professional.

Respect was also evident within other partners of education, including parents, teacher colleagues, and administrators, which ultimately enhanced pedagogy and perceived student learning. Manuel, for example, referenced how parents of his students would often see and hear him perform, and how this chance encounter energized the classroom environment the following day:

> It's amazing what a small world it is. I have had many parents approach me at gigs just to say hello. The excitement of these parents is often manifested through their children, who come in the next day and say "my mom and dad saw you last night." This usually creates a level of excitement in the classroom and the students are usually eager to learn from me.

Franklin made similar remarks:

> As I already mentioned, many of my students have seen me performing outside of school, but they are often with their parents when this happens, especially at the church. So the parents also have an opportunity to see and hear me play. But the best part is always the next day in class when the students say things like "my dad thought you were fantastic." Comments like this make me feel good and the students feel good. It's a win-win situation, and there is noticeable positive energy in the classroom.

Joe made reference to his colleagues attending his performances and how that generated a positive cycle of good news and respect that permeated the entire school:

> Many of the teachers on staff, including the VP, come out to hear me play. It's a great time for them, and they really appreciate what I do. I think this makes the music program a little more real for these people. They actually see a connection between what I do in the classroom and what I do on stage. Many of my students have often told me that they have heard other teachers in the school say what a great player I am. This makes me feel great, really great, and very important, which helps me to take my job more seriously. This positive attitude makes me a better teacher, a better teacher for sure, and students pick up on that right away.

The Theme of Fatigue: A Negative Impact

Although predictable, teacher performers suffered from extreme exhaustion, which generated a theme of fatigue. Specifically, pedagogy (and subsequently perceived student learning) was notably impacted by the sheer lethargy teacher performers experienced during their daily teaching responsibilities. Manuel, for example, stated:

> I play over 100 performances over the course of the school year, and managing that with full-time teaching, only one word comes to mind—exhaustion! There is really no rest period, I work all week and play the majority of my gigs on the weekend, so you start the following week already being tired.

Joe has indicated that moonlighting as a performer makes him less effective in the classroom:

> I must admit that moonlighting, especially on weeknights, takes its toll on my body and mind. I am always tired, especially around the midway point of the teaching day—around noon–1 pm—I often don't have the energy to do my job as effective as I would like. [laughs] I drink a lot more coffee than I used to.

Similarly, Franklin admitted to being exhausted the day after a performance, which results in poor pedagogy:

> There is no doubt that performing in the evenings makes me always feel fatigued the next day. I must admit, to be honest I guess, that on days when I was particularly exhausted, I have resorted to showing movies just to avoid teaching. My students don't really learn anything on these days, and I often feel guilty for doing what I do.

The Theme of Job Dissatisfaction: A Negative Impact

Job dissatisfaction was the third and final theme that emerged from the data. Participants found teaching the day after a professional performance dissatisfying, ultimately affecting pedagogy and perceived student learning. Most of the feelings of dissatisfaction emanated from experiencing the thrill of performance to the hard work of teaching students. Manuel, for example, found teaching to be depressing and demoralizing the day after a performance:

> I always hate teaching the day after a performance. It is such a high to perform, especially when you are working with really great musicians. Coming into work the next day always feels demoralizing and depressing. I hate teaching on these days and my students sense that I am not that into it.

Joe also found it difficult to teach novice music students the day after a performance: "It's kind of hard to teach beginning band when you have been playing high energy R&B the night before." Moreover, Franklin admitted to suffering from depression on Monday mornings that followed a weekend performance:

> I remember playing piano at the same restaurant every Friday, Saturday, and Sunday evening for a three-month stretch. Monday morning was always a strong dose of reality, especially when the students played out of tune. I had a hard time doing my job to the best of my ability on Monday mornings. Mondays were often a real downer; I was often depressed on Monday mornings.

This theme of job dissatisfaction was directly linked to the duality struggle that each participant was experiencing. In fact, it became quite evident through the interview and focus group process that all three participants referenced how difficult it is to simultaneously manage and execute the dual roles of the teacher performer. Manuel, for example, stated: "You feel like two different people exist inside of you, both the performer and the teacher." Joe made similar remarks, but admits that performing is not something he is willing to give up, forcing him to achieve balance between the duality of teaching and performing:

> Although I choose to perform and accept gigs, I feel I don't really have any other choice…choosing not to perform is simply not an option I am willing to consider at this point in my life, so I will continue to juggle the two roles as long as I possibly can.

Franklin has also admitted that the duality of teaching and performing has ultimately caused him to struggle with his own identity:

> Some days it can be a bit overwhelming, and a lot of hard work. I often wonder about how much easier my life would be if all I did was teach or all I did was perform. But, to be honest, I think the decision to eliminate either one would put me under more stress. I would always be second-guessing myself for the rest of my life.

Discussion

General Perspectives

The three major themes of respect, fatigue, and job dissatisfaction have provided valuable insight into the guiding question of this study, namely, What are the attitudes and perspectives of teacher performers toward pedagogy and student learning in the elementary and secondary school music classroom? In addition, this study has also shed light on the importance and significance of teacher performers as an entity within music education specifically, and arts education generally. Furthermore, participants of this study contradict the old adage that "those who can, do, and those who can't, teach." Rather, the participants have demonstrated that "those who can, teach" (Ryan & Cooper, 2012) and perform, propelling us to appreciate the lifestyle of this unique group of individuals.

All three participants are well-respected teachers who are well liked by students, parents, and colleagues. Joe clearly made mention of the dozens of past students who consistently came back to visit him many years after graduating to reminisce about how great his class was. In fact, many of Joe's former students continue to attend his performances. This ongoing relationship is an excellent example of a dynamic teacher that has had "a lasting impact on the lives of students," which is indicative of efficacious pedagogy (Stronge, 2007, p. x). Moreover, all three participants are experienced performers who are in demand and well paid. Hence, the lifestyle of the teacher performer (although trying at times) provides many "wonderful opportunities." Joe stated:

> Being a music teacher during the day has allowed me to share my musical talents with hundreds of students over the years, many who have gone on after high school to study and work in the music field. As a performer, I also get a chance to express myself, [pause] to express myself and really do something I truly love to do… Both my teaching and performing life have provided me with very rich and wonderful opportunities.

Similarly, Manuel said: "I have respect for both teaching and performing, and both allow me to share my love of music, and my interest in music, with both my students and the general public."

Respect

The theme of respect proposes that students (as well as the entire school community) recognize and appreciate the value of a teacher who professionally engages in the very art that they have been entrusted to teach. In fact, the participants felt that such recognition and appreciation increases motivation for learning and creates a positive energy within the classroom. Such motivation and positive energy simultaneously influences and positively affects the quality pedagogy. Hence, a self-sustaining cycle—where learning and pedagogy feed off of each other—emerged from the data.

There is also evidence that professional performing informs pedagogy (Ball, 1990; Elliott, 1995; Jorquera-Jaramillo, 2008; Mills 2004) on a much deeper philosophical level, and vice versa, making the relationship between the two inseparable and indeed beneficial. That is, the art of performing is not a task, but rather, a profound lived experience (Leggo et al., 2011). Such experience is crucial to developing educational knowledge, skills, and understanding that inform and enhance teaching, as well as other things, such as research. This harmonious blend between the artist, the researcher, and the teacher is known as A/R/Tography (Irwin, 2004; Irwin & De Cosson, 2004). Similarly, Bennett, Wright, and Blom (2010) refer to the triality between artist, researcher, and teacher as the "ART nexus because of the strong flow of information reported between these three activities" (p. 3).

It is also important that elementary and secondary school music teachers have professional performance opportunities that are distinct and separate from their teaching duties, otherwise they often usurp performance opportunities during school-based public concerts (Grant, 2011). This usurpation calls into question the very integrity of a teacher's pedagogical practice and philosophy (Ball & Wilson, 1996). Although I agree with Kerchner (2002) that performing with students is an example of a teacher's musicianship, I maintain that such performances should only be in a supportive and background context, which is consistent with the principles of a student-centred approach to pedagogy (O'Neill & McMahon, 2005). The teacher should be the "guide on the side" and not the "sage on the stage" (King, 1993, p. 30).

Fatigue

The theme of fatigue clearly implies that the practical realities of a teacher performer can be very detrimental to the physical and emotional well-being of the teacher (Anderson, Levinson, Barker, & Kiewra, 1999; Skaalvik & Skaalvik, 2011), as well as adversely affect student learning through poor pedagogy. Such a situation raises morality and ethical issues regarding the teacher performer (Bullough, 2010; Ware & Kitsantas, 2007). Is there such a thing as too much performing given a full-time commitment to teaching? This question, in fact, did come up in the focus group session. Although all three participants admitted that their pedagogy was at times affected by performance exhaustion, they fervently contended that (a) the feelings of exhaustion did not affect the program as a whole, and (b) the overall advantages that performing afforded their pedagogy was far greater than the disadvantages associated with exhaustion. Franklin, for example, stated:

> The reason why I feel guilty on days when I'm tired and don't really teach my students to the best of my ability, is because on most days I am working my ass off and giving my students my best effort. Besides, my Christmas and spring concerts every year prove to the entire school and community that I have been doing my job all semester long.

In addition, Manuel stated: "Even though some days I am tired, and some days I am not that into it, I still take my job seriously, [pause] very seriously actually." Moreover, all three participants maintained the opinion that society should not dictate what they do in their free time outside of the classroom "unless they are breaking the law" (Franklin). On many levels, the ethical issue of performing and job exhaustion is related to the larger issue of how a teacher's personal life affects his or her professional role enactment (Pajak & Blase, 1989). Such an issue is very intriguing and beckons further study.

Given such a vigorous and demanding schedule, where do these teachers find the time to both teach and perform (Dolloff, 2007)? When participants were asked how they managed the demanding schedule of a teacher performer, two of the three participants (Joe and Manuel) responded that they were single and had no children. In particular, Joe's response was somewhat amusing when he stated: "I am married to my horns!" Franklin, however, found the management of teaching, performing, and family (he is married with

children) somewhat more challenging, but credited a large support network of extended family:

> It's not easy, but my wife is a stay-at-home mom, so she takes care of everything on the home front. My parents and my in-laws also help her out with the children and other domestic things when I am not around. With only one full-time income from teaching, our family really relies on the extra money that I make from performing.

Moreover, participants articulated that other teachers outside of music also experience fatigue during the school day because of demanding personal lives. Joe stated: "Many of my colleagues come into work totally exhausted. They have very young children and struggle to get a good night's sleep." Likewise, Manuel stated that many of his colleagues participate in recreational activities (such as ice hockey) several times per week, and that such activities "drain them of their energy throughout the school day." Hence, fatigue is not mutually exclusive with teacher performers. Furthermore, Manuel in particular became very emotional about the entire issue of fatigue. He stated:

> If people want to point the finger at me for being too tired, too exhausted, too whatever [pause], I can easily point my finger at others…we all have to respect what we choose to do when the school day is over.

Job Dissatisfaction

Finally, the theme of job dissatisfaction also figures centrally in this discussion. Specifically, the dual life of each participant generated episodes of displeasure with the teaching profession. For all three participants, such displeasure always came when the hat of performer was exchanged with the hat of teacher, which is remarkably consistent with the duality struggle that many teacher performers experience. For example, Mark (1998) concluded that individuals who thought of themselves as musicians first generally experienced disappointment as teachers. Such disappointment can perpetuate teacher stress, anxiety, and burnout (Carson, 2006; Fredrickson & Madsen, 2010; Vitale, 2012), all of which adversely affect the quality of pedagogy and level of student learning. Roberts

(2007) even contends that there is a "personal war" between "musician and teacher identities" (p. 7).

Moreover, the stress brought on by a duality struggle can even manifest itself outside of the classroom. Bernard (2005), for example, discusses a personal quandary she experienced by engaging in the decision process of choosing how to introduce herself at a conference. The participants of this study also live with a similar quandary every day of their lives, which has implications in the elementary and secondary classroom where there is a greater sense of full-time accountability, responsibility, and commitment expected from teachers (Crosswell & Elliott, 2004; Hurst & Reding, 2000; Palmer, 1997).

Although it is almost preposterous to think that music teachers would not engage in music-making (at least on an informal and casual level), I know first-hand that many music teachers simply do not perform or engage in music-making outside of the school. Pellegrino (2011), however, argues that music teachers can significantly improve their pedagogy through music-making as a professional development activity, including "self-awareness, attentiveness, and pedagogical knowledge" (p. 79). Furthermore, Pellegrino (2011) offers four ways that music-making can be included as professional development:

> Music-making in departmental or district-wide meetings, granting professional development credit to music teachers who make music outside of the classroom, setting up in-classroom reflection opportunities/action research based on integrating music-making and music teaching, and initiating a collaborative teacher study group that includes chamber music collaboration. (p. 79)

Pellegrino's (2011) second suggestion of "granting professional development credit to music teachers who make music outside of the classroom" reaffirms the positive attitudes and perspectives toward pedagogy and perceived student learning that were generated by the three participants of this study through the theme of respect. Moreover, Shankman (2005) clearly recognizes the critical importance and inherent benefits of performing:

> Music teachers themselves need to do music outside of school. It's like a doctor who continually takes courses to be up to date on the latest techniques. A person who doesn't practice his or her own music, loses something and loses something in their teaching. The more you are a musician, the better teacher you are. (p. 1)

This view is also consistent with Aróstegui (2004), where participants concluded that musical performance is "a prime requirement for being a good music teacher" (p. 171). Similarly, Parkes and Jones (2012) argue that both musician and teacher identities are necessary components to successful music teachers. In sum, music-making outside of the classroom is a significantly important component in the professional life of a music teacher.

Conclusion

Although two out of the three themes generated in this study were negative in nature, there is much we can learn from the attitudes and perspectives of Manuel, Joe, and Franklin. Despite identity struggles, all three of them were still committed to the dual existence of both teacher and performer, and have shown no signs of slowing down. In addition, all three participants were tremendously accommodating in every aspect of their participation during the interview and focus group stage. Despite pseudonyms being used, the participants took great risk by answering questions in an honest and sincere manner, particularly those answers that helped generate the themes of fatigue and job dissatisfaction.

Manuel, Joe, and Franklin's life experiences have provided a unique glimpse into the daily victories and struggles of a teacher performer. Victories included the feelings of respect and admiration from students, colleagues, and parents, which positively reinforced participant attitudes and perspectives towards pedagogy and student learning. Daily struggles, however, included fatigue and an ongoing identity struggle of engaging in two professional occupations. Such struggles, therefore, reveal that the respect of students, colleagues, and parents comes with an expensive price tag, both physically and psychologically.

In sum, these daily victories and struggles invite all educators within music education specifically, and arts education generally, to reflect upon the relationship between performing, pedagogy, and student learning. Moreover, such experiences also beckon educators in all disciplines to reflect upon the application of subject matter to real-life situations, and how such applications affect the teaching and learning process.

Future Research

This study has addressed pedagogy and perceived student learning from the perspective of the teacher performer. A natural extension of this study would be to explore the attitudes and perspectives of students who are taught by teacher performers. What are the experiences of these students? How do these students feel about the dual existence of their music teacher? How does this dual existence (a) affect their own learning, and (b) affect their perception of teacher efficacy? Moreover, the importance of phenomenological studies with education generally and music education specifically, cannot be overstated. The teaching and learning process is a crucial component of all education. Phenomenological inquiry provides an opportunity to explore and evaluate the experiences of teachers, students, and all other partners within the educational milieu, providing valuable perspectives into who and what we are. Such perspectives have implications for improving educational experiences in the music classroom. Given that music education is in crisis (Dickinson, 2013), future music education studies through the lens of phenomenology are warranted. Such studies would help improve and advance music education practices in Canada and beyond.

References

Anderson, V. L., Levinson, E. M., Barker, W., & Kiewra, K. R. (1999). The effects of meditation on teacher perceived occupational stress, state and trait anxiety, and burnout. *School Psychology Quarterly*, *14*(1), 3–25.

Aróstegui, J. L. (2004). Much more than music: Music education instruction at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. In J. L. Aróstegui (Ed.), *The social context of music education* (pp. 127–210). Champaign, IL: Center for Instructional Research and Curriculum Evaluation.

Aureden, E. (2006). *The performer as teacher* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Harvard Graduate School of Education, Cambridge, MA.

Austin, J. R., Isbell, D. S., & Russell, J. A. (2012). A multi-institution exploration of secondary socialization and occupational identity among undergraduate music majors. *Psychology of Music*, *40*(1), 66–83.

Ball, D. L., & Wilson, S. M. (1996). Integrity in teaching: Recognizing the fusion of the moral and intellectual. *American Educational Research Journal*, *33*(1), 155–192.

Ball, L. (1990). What role: Artist or teacher? *Art Education*, *43*(1), 54–59.

Ballantyne, J. (2005). Identities of music teachers: Implications for teacher education. *Teacher education: local and global*, 39–44.

Ballantyne, J., & Grootenboer, P. (2012). Exploring relationships between teacher identities and disciplinarity. *International Journal of Music Education*, *30*(4), 368–381.

Ballantyne, J., Kerchner, J. L., & Aróstegui, J. L. (2012). Developing music teacher identities: An international multi-site study. *International Journal of Music Education*, *30*(3), 211–226.

Bennett, D., Wright, D., & Blom, D. M. (2010). The artistic practice-research-teaching (ART) nexus: Translating the information flow. *Journal of University Teaching & Learning Practice*, *7*(2), 1–19.

Bernard, R. J. (2004). Striking a chord: Elementary general music teachers' expressions of their identities as musician-teachers. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, *65*(10), 1711. (AAT No. 3134467)

Bernard, R. (2005). Music-making, making selves, making it right: A call for reframing music teacher education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *4*(2). Retrieved from May Day Group website: http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Bernard4_2.pdf

Bullough, R. V., Jr. (2010). Ethical and moral matters in teaching and teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *27*(1), 21–28.

Carson, R. L. (2006). *Exploring the episodic nature of teachers' emotions as it relates to teacher burnout* (Doctoral dissertation, Purdue University). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3232157)

Connell, P. (2003). *A phenomenological study of the lived experiences of adult caregiving daughters and their elderly mothers* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Florida). Retrieved from University of Florida website: http://etd.fcla.edu/UF/UFE0001263/connell_p.pdf

Conway, C., Eros, J., Pellegrino, K., & West, C. (2010). Instrumental music education students' perceptions of tensions experienced during their undergraduate degree. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *58*(3), 260–275.

Creswell, J. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Toronto, ON: Pearson.

Creswell, J. (2014). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Crosswell, L. J., & Elliott, R. G. (2004, November, December). *Committed teachers, passionate teachers: The dimension of passion associated with teacher commitment and engagement*. Paper presented at the AARE Conference, Melbourne, Australia.

Dickinson, P. (Ed.). (2013). *Music education in crisis: The Bernarr Rainbow lectures and other assessments*. Suffolk, England: Boydell & Brewer Ltd.

Dolloff, L. (2007). All the things we are: Balancing our multiple identities in music teaching. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *6*(2), 1–21.

Elliott, D. J. (1995). *Music matters: A new philosophy of music education*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Fredrickson, W. E., & Madsen, C. K. (2010). Emotional differences between early and late degree program music teacher education students using a concise emotional inventory. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, *29*(1), 33–39.

Froehlich, H. C., & L'Roy, D. (1985). An investigation of occupancy identity inundergraduate music education majors. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *85*, 65–75.

Gillespie, R., & Hamann, D. (1999). Career choices among string music educationnstudents in American colleges and universities. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *47*(3), 266–278.

Glesne, C. (2011). *Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Grant, C. (2011, November). *Music as an instructional tool in the elementary classroom*. Presented at the Imagination and Creativity in Education Conference, Nipissing University.

Holstein, J. A. & Gubrium, J. F. (1995). *The active interview*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hurst, B., & Reding, C. (2000). *Professionalism in teaching*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Hycner, R. H. (1999). Some guidelines for the phenomenological analysis of interview data. In A. Bryman & R. G. Burgess (Eds.), *Qualitative research* (Vol. 3, pp. 143–164). London, England: Sage.

Irwin, R. L. (2004). A/r/tography: A metonymic métissage. In R. L. Irwin & A. de Cosson (Eds.), *A/r/tography: Rendering self through arts-based living* (pp. 27–38). Vancouver, BC: Educational Press.

Irwin, R. L., & De Cosson, A. (Eds.). (2004). *A/r/tography: Rendering self through arts-based living inquiry*. Vancouver, BC: Pacific Educational Press.

Isbell, D. S. (2006). Socialization and occupational identity among preservice music teachers enrolled in traditional baccalaureate degree programs. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, *67*(10). (UMI No. 3239420)

Jeffery, G. (2005). Professional identities: Artist and activist teachers? In G. Jeffery (Ed.), *The creative college: Building a successful learning culture in the arts*, (pp. 79–101). Stoke on Trent, England: Trentham Books.

King, A. (1993). From sage on the stage to guide on the side. *College Teaching*, *41*(1), 30–35.

Jorquera-Jaramillo, M. C. (2008). The music educators' professional knowledge. *Music Education Research*, *10*(3), 347–359.

Kerchner, J. L. (2002). Keeping the artistry: Modeling the professional life. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, *11*(2), 14–21.

Leggo, C., Sinner, A. E., Irwin, R. L., Pantaleo, K., Gouzouasis, P., & Grauer, K. (2011). Lingering in liminal spaces: A/r/tography as living inquiry in a language arts class. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, *24*(2), 239–256.

Lewis, M., & Staehler, T. (2010). *Phenomenology: An introduction*. New York, NY: Continuum.

Lindlof, T. R., & Taylor, B. C. (2002). *Qualitative communication research methods* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Mark, D. (1998). The music teacher's dilemma—Musician or teacher? *International Journal of Music Education*, *32*, 3–23.

Merriam, S. B. (2014). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.

Mills, J. (2004). Working in music: Becoming a performer-teacher. *Music Education Research*, *6*(3), 245–261.

Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

O'Neill, G., & McMahon, T. (2005). Student-centred learning: What does it mean for students and lecturers? *Emerging Issues in the Practice of University Learning and Teaching*, *1*, 27–36.

Pajak, E., & Blase, J. J. (1989). The impact of teachers' personal lives on professional role enactment: A qualitative analysis. *American Educational Research Journal*, *26*(2), 283–310.

Palmer, P. J. (1997). *The heart of a teacher: Identity and integrity in teaching.* Retrieved from Centre for Courage and Renewal website: http://www.couragerenewal.org/parker/%20writings/heart-of-a-teacher/

Parkes, K. A., & Jones, B. D. (2012). Motivational constructs influencing undergraduate students' choices to become classroom music teachers or music performers. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *60*(1), 101–123.

Pinar, W., Reynolds, W., Slattery, P., & Taubman, P. (1995). *Understanding curriculum: An introduction to the study of historical and contemporary curriculum discourses: Vol. 17. Counterpoints: studies in the postmodern theory of education.* New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Pellegrino, K. (2010). *The meanings and values of music-making in the lives of string teachers: Exploring the intersections of music-making and teaching* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, Horace H. Rackham School of Graduate Studies). Retrieved from University of Michigan website: http://deepblue.lib.umich.edu/bitstream/handle/2027.42/77829/krispell_2.pdf?sequence=1

Pellegrino, K. (2011). Exploring the benefits of music-making as professional development for music teachers. *Arts Education Policy Review*, *112*(2), 79–88.

Regelski, T. A. (2009). The ethics of music teaching as profession and praxis. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, *13*. Retrieved from Visions of Research in Music Education website: http://users.rider.edu/~vrme/

Roberts, B. A. (1991). Music teacher education as identity construction. *International Journal of Music Education*, *18*, 30–39.

Roberts, B. A. (2007). Music-making, making selves, making it right. A counterpart to Rhoda Bernard. Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6(2). Retrieved from May Day Group website: http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Roberts6_2.pdf

Rossman, G., & Rallis, S. (2012). *Learning in the field: An introduction to qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Russell, J. A. (2012). The occupational identity of in-service secondary music educators: formative interpersonal interactions and activities. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *60*(2), 145–165.

Ryan, K., & Cooper, J. (2012). *Those who can, teach*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Shankman, N. (2005). *Essential characteristics for a music teacher*. Retrieved from Artists House Music website: http://www.artistshousemusic.org/videos/essential+characteristics+for+a+music+teacher

Skaalvik, E. M., & Skaalvik, S. (2011). Teacher job satisfaction and motivation to leave the teaching profession: Relations with school context, feeling of belonging, and emotional exhaustion. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *27*(6), 1029–1038.

Sokolowski, R. (2000). *Introduction to phenomenology*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Springgay, S., Irwin, R. L., & Kind, S. W. (2005). A/r/tography as living inquiry through art and text. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *11*(6), 897–912.

Stronge, J. H. (2007). *Qualities of effective teachers* (2nd ed.). Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Triantafyllaki, A. (2010). Performance teachers' identity and professional knowledge in advanced music teaching. *Music Education Research*, *12*(1), 71–88.

Vandenberg, D. (1997). Phenomenological research in the study of education. In D. Vandenberg (Ed.), *Phenomenology & education discourse* (pp. 3–37). Johannesburg, South Africa: Heinemann.

Vitale, J. (2012). The perfect storm: Stress, anxiety, and burnout in the secondary school music classroom. *Brock Education*, *22*(1), 56–72.

Ware, H., & Kitsantas, A. (2007). Teacher and collective efficacy beliefs as predictors of professional commitment. *The Journal of Educational Research*, *100*(5), 303–310.

Woodford, P. G. (2002). The social construction of music teacher identity in undergraduate music education majors. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (Eds.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 675–694). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Zahavi, Dan (2003). *Husserl's phenomenology*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Appendix

Interview Questions

1. Tell me a little about yourself (how long you have been teaching music, what instrument(s) do you play, etc.).

2. What does the term "teacher performer" mean to you?

3. Do you consider yourself a teacher performer and why?

4. How often do you perform and what types of settings?

5. Does your performing experience help you to be a better, more effective teacher? If so, how?

6. Does your performing experience make you an inferior teacher? If so, how?

7. In your opinion, do your students benefit from your performance experience? If so, how?

8. In your opinion, are your students adversely affected from your performance experience? If so, how?

9. Has your performing experience impacted your teaching beyond the classroom (parents, colleagues, administration, the larger school community, etc.)? If so, please explain.

10. How do you manage the demanding schedule of being a teacher performer?

11. Open Floor: Is there anything else you would like to talk about regarding your dual role as a teacher performer?