D

Graduating Black Males: A Generic Qualitative Study

Edward E. Bell

Independent Researcher, Raleigh, North Carolina, USA

Black males face a difficult educational battle. Across America, graduation statistics for Black males are sobering. The purpose of this study was to explore why Black males drop out of school and to examine the current employment status of the study participants. The research took place in rural North Carolina. Fifteen Black American male high school dropouts took part in a snowball sample. This study was qualitative and used open and axial coding. Findings from this study may provide guidance and directions for school and community leaders to help Black males stay in school through graduating. Keywords: Qualitative, Black Males, Graduation

The graduation numbers for Black males are dismal, chilling, and undeniably pathetic. The number of Black males who graduate from high school lags significantly behind their counterparts (Bell, 2010a; Schott Foundation for Public Education, 2010). Educators are not entirely to blame for this low level of achievement. When we look at the facts, it is difficult to understand why Black America has not shouldered more responsibility for the education of every Black male (Smith, 2005). Black males face a sundry amount of social and educational issues such as peer pressure, educational biases, and practices that hinder them from graduating (Bell, 2009, 2010a).

Graduating Black males from high school is a fundamental educational obligation. Graduating Black males from high school must become a central focus not only for Black males but also for the community. If Black males are to be successful and become high school graduates at comparative rates, then they and their communities must continue to address the issue of high school completion.

Literature Review

Black males face a difficult educational journey. Statistics show that they are more likely to withdraw from school and thus add to the dropout rate (Osborne, Walker, & Rausch, 2002). They fail academically and are not achieving on a level with their peers (Bell 2009, 2010a; Schott Foundation, 2010). It is not in the best interests of Black males to leave their graduation up to the educational system. Increasing the graduation rate of Black males necessitates implementing the common prose that we vociferously recite: "It takes a village" (Smith, 2005). It will require cooperation from many aspects of the community to change the dropout trend for Black males.

One harmful reality is that teachers and staff who work with Black males in the classroom may lack the capability and disposition to work with them effectively, leaving them misguided and facing mental and emotional challenges (Anthony, Krissonia, & Herrington, 2007; Sen, 2006). Right now, more than any other time in America's history, teachers of different racial and cultural backgrounds are educating Black males (Douglas, Lewis, Douglas, Scott, & Garrison-Wade, 2008). Strayhorn (2008) concluded in his research that teachers have lower expectations for the academic achievement of Black males. Even the assets available in our current education system—enhanced teacher effectiveness, advanced pedagogical practices for teaching Black males, and highly qualified educators—do not seem to keep a large number of Black males in school through graduation.

Black Males in Education: Is It Teacher Effectiveness? Or Not!

While the nation wrestles with what is the most appropriate pedagogical style for educating Black males, we cannot dismiss the possibility that teacher effectiveness, in isolation, may not be the panacea for improving the academic performance of Black males (Bell, 2010a, 2010b). Teacher effectiveness can undoubtedly influence student performance (Bell, 2009, 2010a; Goe, Bell, & Little, 2008). Given the demographics and social strata of Black males, effective teachers adapt to the learning styles of diverse students by implementing strategies to afford all Black males a fair academic experience (Alliance for Excellent Education, 2008; Bell, & Little, 2008.). Teacher effectiveness denotes the ability of teachers to promote student growth (Goe et al.).

Clarifying the definition of teacher effectiveness is important. Five characteristics effective teachers share are: (a) high expectations for all students; (b) contributions to positive academic and social outcomes; (c) use of diverse resources; (d) contributions to the academic development in classrooms; and (e) collaboration with others (Goe et al., 2008). An effective teacher engages all students in the learning process with the aim of positively influencing student growth and academic performance (Bell, 2009, 2010a; Goe et al.; Rothon, Arephin, Klineberg, Cattell, & Stansfeld, 2010). Moreover, teacher effectiveness assumes a didactic perspective that transcends culture, biases, and discrimination by assuming that educators can effectively teach all children (Bell, 2010a). Most education advocates concur that the primary benefit of effective teaching is improved student learning (Goe et al.).

Academic Socialization

Teacher effectiveness is not the single most important factor for increasing student performance (Bell, 2010a). Theorists of ethnic minority development postulate that Black males' parents engage in culturally distinctive practices (Cooper & Smalls, 2010). They may find it necessary to use culturally specific socialization practices to equip their sons with the needed competencies for survival in a school setting (Friend, 2009; Taylor, Clayton, & Rowley, 2004). For example, academic socialization involves preparing Black males for a learning environment (Bell, 2010b). This process teaches Black males the fundamental social skills necessary to be successful in classrooms such as mutual respect, valuing the learning process, and eliminating disruptive behaviors (Bell, 2009, 2010a). Appropriate social decorum such as raising hands, taking turns, and stopping "mama jokes" might promote academic socialization in the classroom (Bell, 2010b). Bell (2010a) concluded that Black males face a multitude of social, academic, and cultural concerns that often interfere with their academic potential. "Although there has been considerable research on the multitude of parental influences that shape the process of [development], less is known about the specific ways in which parents socialize their [Black males] in terms of school-related behaviors and [academic] outcomes" (Taylor et al., p. 163). There is limited research available addressing the nonacademic social factors that interfere with Black males graduating from high school. This study will add to the current body of research by understanding the phenomena of Black males not graduating from high school.

In this discussion, it is logical to explore the concept of academic socialization. The premise of academic socialization presupposes that Black males come to school with the propensity to learn. It assumes that they are prepared emotionally, socially, and culturally to navigate a controlled educational environment by possessing the disposition to learn for its intrinsic value (Bell, 2010a; Taylor et al., 2004). However, Black males must develop the social skills to succeed in today's classrooms (Bell, 2010a). Salient recommendations

undoubtedly will increase the graduation of Black males include staying on task, following directions, and being academically focused (Bell, 2010a).

Black males do possess the ability to demonstrate socialized learning in a teaching environment (Bell, 2010a). For example, the reverence and respect needed in a church setting are principles taught from infancy and nurtured throughout the social development of Black males (Bell, 2010a). Regardless of their socioeconomic status, Black males typically respect church, even if the preacher is not effective (Bell, 2010a). Therefore, teaching all Black males to respect a school environment is possible (Bell, 2010a, 2010b).

Black Male High School Graduation

A crisis looms in America's public classrooms, especially for Black males. This plight is not new, yet it has not received the attention needed to garner a clarion call or a much-needed educational discourse across America (Orfield, Losen, & Wald, 2004; Schott Foundation, 2010). While we fervently discuss the low graduation rates for Black males and while we speak stridently about it, the status quo continues. Black males are not graduating from high school at competitive rates with their counterparts (Orfield et al.; Schott Foundation, 2010).

Educating Black males is not a Black cause. While the nation has addressed the low Black male graduation rate, it is essential to obtain ongoing support from communities. The Black community must take on this issue as a Civil Rights mandate. The Black community must lead the charge. America's failure to graduate more Black males will cost the nation in terms of increased incarceration costs, poverty, and an ill-prepared labor force, which will translate into increased health costs and welfare services (Bell, 2009; Garibaldi, 2007; Jordon & Cooper, 2003; Orfield et al., 2004; Sen, 2006; Smith, 2005).

The research is clear and definitive: Many Black males are dropping out of high school before graduation (Heckman & LaFontaine, 2007; Schott Foundation, 2010). Researchers do not hesitate to report why Black males are consistently falling behind their contemporaries (Bridgeland, Dilulio, & Morison, 2006; National Research Council, 2001; Schott Foundation, 2010; Smith, 2005). The National Research Council (2001) concluded that the issues of schooling, personality dispositions, and the economic conditions of students might contribute to the dropout number. In addition, students reported that their major reason for dropping out of school was that classes were not interesting, which fundamentally translated into no classroom motivation (Bell, 2010a; Schott Foundation, 2010).

Black Male Learning

Social conditions in schools may contribute to low graduation rates for Black males, coupled with teacher expectations and the absence of academic socialization (Bell, 2010b). Matching teaching practices with cultural demands will likely improve the educational success of most students (Jordon & Cooper, 2003; National Research Council, 2003). Black males have diverse learning styles, such as being kinesthetic learners (Arephin, Klineberg, Cattell, & Stansfeld, 2010; Bell, 2009, 2010a; Rothon et al., 2010). Research has postulated that Black males tended to be more successful in cooperative groups (Rothon et al.).

Method

The purpose of this qualitative study was to understand why Black males drop out of school and to assess their current employment status. Qualitative research interprets human behaviors from the viewpoint of those who have experienced them (Ary et al., 2010; Jacobs, Razavieh, & Sorensen, 2006; Milacci, 2003). This study took place in the fall of 2010 over a one-month period. Fifteen Black males, ages 18-55, participated in a snowball sampling. Snowball sampling is useful for studying hard-to-reach populations (Goodman, 1961; Russell, 2002). The sample came from a rural North Carolina community. Participants recommended others who could contribute to the inquiry. Data collection took place at a community event. Each participant gave verbal consent to participate in the study. Participants took part in in-depth interviews and answered questions such as "Why did you drop out of school?"

The methodology involved the qualitative analysis of data collected from the interviews. After transcribing all interviews and coding them in two phases, the researcher analyzed the data. In the data analysis, open-coding procedures identified common themes by naming, categorizing, and describing phenomena (Creswell & Miller, 2000; Glaser, 1992; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Axial coding, the process of relating codes (categories and properties) to each other via a combination of inductive and deductive thinking, was also used in the data analysis (Creswell & Miller, 2000; Glaser, 1992; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Ground theory allows the emergence of inductive codes through the collection and analysis of the data. This approach promotes marking of key points from the text and the emergence of categories or themes (Corbin & Strauss, 1990; Glaser, 1978).

Qualitative research bias should be made explicit (Miles & Huberman, 1994). The researcher is a Black male, who has worked as a middle school teacher and as a school counselor. Moreover, the researcher has experience working with at-risk Black males, and he won the prestigious Nancy Susan Reynolds Award, an award given by the Z. Smith Reynolds Foundation, for working with at-risk Black males. The researcher's experiences add credibility to the findings.

To ensure the trustworthiness and credibility of the findings, results were maintained by peer examination, member checking, and prolonged engagement of the participants as strategies to ensure the trustworthiness and the credibility of the findings (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Shenton, 2003). Member checking allows participants an opportunity to match and validate their experiences (Koelsch, 2013). Every participant received a write-up of his interview and checked it for accuracy. The ultimate concern of member checking is to establish truth (Cho & Trent, 2006). All participants agreed that their write-ups were correct. In addition, two of the researcher's colleagues also examined the results. These peers shared their expertise in the areas of Black male development and education and allowed the researcher to understand the data even better (Creswell, 1998).

Lincoln and Guba (1985) stated that qualitative researchers seek results that are sensible, dependable, and consistent. Lincoln and Guba concluded that the extensive use of auditing ultimately improves data analysis dependability and conformability, leading to more meaningful and useful results. Two questions guided this research study:

- 1. How do nonacademic factors affect Black male graduation?
- 2. How does dropping out of high school affect participant outcomes?

Results

The aim of this study was to understand why Black males drop out of school and to access their current level of employment. The results of this study consist of verbatim responses from the participants. The responses are organized sequentially. The results of this study have implications for reducing the number of Black males who drop out of school. The three recurring themes among the participants were:

- a) Participants detected a cultural mismatch with their teachers;
- b) The participants felt that teachers and the schools did not care about them; and
- c) Participants demonstrated willingness to be better students.

Theme 1:

Participants detected a cultural mismatch with their teachers. These students felt that teachers were "prejudiced" against them. Comments included:

- "You know they [White teachers] don't like Black people."
- "They didn't help us learn, and I hate school."
- "We watched a movie about the slavery...I forget the name....I felt the teacher was supporting the man who owned the slaves...That hurt me... Man when we did our discussion."
- "My brother and me got in a car accident, and we couldn't go to school...We got behind in work and couldn't catch up...We both just dropped out of school...No one really cared about us."
- "My teachers didn't understand what I be saying sometimes; she always asked me to repeat. What's up with that? I remember using the word 'diss'...I had to explain that word to my teacher. I guess White kids don't talk like that."

Theme 2:

The participants felt that teachers and the school did not care about them. The participants offered strong statements regarding teacher's feelings about them. The participants gave the following examples:

- "Schoolwork was "too hard to understand" and that teachers "rushed" through the work.
- "They [teachers] didn't really teach us."
- "Some didn't give a damn."
- "We were on our little own."
- "They [teachers] wanted their work done... and we had other things on our little minds."
- "I remember one time I had a doctor appointment...She didn't let me make up my work...Man that was so mean...she didn't care if I failed or not."
- "We never got extra credit work."

- "Sometimes our lunch time was cut short, and we had silent lunch."
- "My mom is trying to be involved in school."
- "How can you study when you are tired and sick?"
- "I had to deal with other things, those personal home things...School was easy, but they [teachers] didn't want to hear about your home life."
- "I'm not giving up. I believe Miss____ want me to drop out."

Theme 3:

Participants demonstrated willingness to be better students. Although the participants were struggling academically, they wanted to excel. They stated the following:

- "But, we were smart."
- "The work wasn't hard...it was just that things happened."
- "I needed a good counselor."
- "The GED was best for me; it was quick and to the point."
- "Doing the GED took me away from going to school every day and still put me on the right path."
- "Obtaining a GED was an 'academic milestone' for me."
- "I'm gonna get my GED, got to."
- "Schools were too tight."
- "I have dreams...watch me one day."
- "My grades weren't the best. I'm still trying. Yes, I know; my high school diploma was needed."
- "But, man, it was hard for me in school."
- "It is hard now without an education."
- "I'm staying with my mom."
- "I am going to college...I will be a teacher."
- "I am going to college for a doctor."
- "I know college is going to be hard...but I am going to be successful...school is hard now...but these teachers here are hard to us."

Discussion

Based on this study, Black males did not overwhelmingly dropout of school due to academic reasons. Only 26% of the participants dropped out of school because of academic factors such as schoolwork being too hard and not liking the teacher. Yet, 74% of the Black males in the study dropped out of school because of nonacademic factors such as medical needs and home problems. Twenty-six percent of Black males reported earning their GED after dropping out of high school. Thirty-three percent of the participants were unemployed at the time of the study. Less than 1% of those interviewed were on probation, so criminality was not a dominant theme in this study—as one may have expected.

The limited number of participants in this study limits the scope and transferability of this research. Also, gathering the data from a community event significantly limits the results of this inquiry to that environment, so the findings cannot be widely generalized. However, studies like this one provide further understanding as to the reasons why Black males drop out of school, which may not entirely be due to academics. This study has great implications and significance for educating and graduating Black males.

Community groups, faith-based groups, and children advocates must rally and develop nonacademic programs (social and/or cultural) that will prepare Black males to graduate from high school. Social issues such as peer pressure, loss of focus, medical needs, and wanting to work presented as salient factors that seemingly prevented Black males from graduating high school (Bell, 2010a; Bridgeland et al., 2006; Whitting, 2009). Schools may need to concentrate on beefing up their student services departments by hiring more social workers, school counselors, and school psychologists to address the needs of the whole child. In addition, increased alliance with social services and mental health agencies might also prove significant for graduating more Black males.

For many Black males, academic content may not be enough to increase graduation potential. Suggestions for future research include studying nonacademic factors that prevent Black males from graduating from high school. To maximize meeting the needs of the whole child, it is imperative that the community implement social, cultural, spiritual, and physical health programs that will keep Black males in school and graduating. Without a doubt, there is more to educating Black males than academics. Swilley (2011) concluded in his research that Black males dropped out of school because of truancy issues regardless of their desire for positive schooling experiences—a finding that is also important to this discussion. Additionally, Rumberger and Lim (2008) postulated that educational performance and attitudes are predictors for boys dropping out of school. However, Bell (2009) found no link between self-esteem and increased student performance. School counselors, psychologists, social workers, mental health personnel, and other community leaders may help in graduating more Black males (Swilley).

Schools and especially community organizations must develop social and cultural wraparound services for Black males. The lack of appropriate social and cultural programs can retard the academic potential of Black males. They are often overwhelmed by a lack of resilience in regards to graduating from high school. Having rigorous academic standards and a relevant curriculum, without building strong social and cultural opportunities will net the same results: deplorable graduation statistics. Black males need more than academic support; they need the noninstructional support of social workers, school nurses, school counselors, and the community. These various groups are essential to increasing the graduation rates of this population.

References

- Alliance for Excellent Education. (2008, March). *Measuring and improving the effectiveness* of high school teachers. Retrieved from http://all4ed.org/reportsfactsheets/measuring-and-improving-the-effectiveness-of-high-school-teachers/
- Anthony, T. D., Kritsonia, W. A., & Herrington, D. E. (2007). National cry for help: Psychological issues as they relate to education; a realistic approach to understanding and coping with the African American males. *The Lamar University Electronic Journal of Student Research.* Retrieved from ERIC database. ED495296
- Ary, D., Jacobs, L., Razavieh, A., & Sorensen, C. (2006). *Introduction to research in education* (7th ed.). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth.
- Bell, E. E. (2009). Impact of self-self-esteem and identification with academics on the academic achievement of African American students. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from <u>http://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/266/</u>
- Bell, E. E. (2010a). Letters and lessons for teachers. Raleigh, NC: All About Children.
- Bell, E. E. (2010b). Understanding African American males. Retrieved from ERIC database. ED511010

- Bridgeland, J. M., Dilulio, U. J., & Morison, K. B. (2006). *The silent epidemic. A report by Civic Enterprises in association with Peter D. Hart Research Associates*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.getbacktoschool.org/images/thesilent/theSilent.html</u>
- Cho, J., & Trent, A. (2006). Validity in qualitative research. *Qualitative Research* 6(3), 319-340.
- Cooper, S. M., & Smalls, C. (2010). Culturally distinctive and academic socialization: Direct and interactive relationships with African American adolescents. *Journal of Youth Adolescence*, 39(2), 199-212.
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A. (1990). Grounded theory research: Procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria. *Qualitative Sociology*, 13(1), 3-22.
- Creswell. J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into Practice*, *39*(3), 124-131.
- Douglas, B., Lewis, C. W., Douglas, A., Scott, M. E., & Garrison-Wade, D. (2008). The impact of white teacher on the academic achievement of black students: An exploratory qualitative analysis. *Education Foundations*, 22(1-2), 47-62.
- Friend, C. A. (2009). *The influences of parental racial socialization on the academic achievement of African American children: A cultural-ecological approach*. (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from http://libres.uncg.edu/ir/listing.aspx?id=1857
- Garibaldi, A. M. (2007). The education status of African-American males in the 21st Century. *Journal of Negro Education*, 6, 99-112. Retrieved from <u>http://www.emeraldinsight.com/books.htm?chapterid=1826975&show=pdf</u>
- Glaser, B. G. (1978). *Theoretical sensitivity: Advances in the methodology of grounded theory*. Mill Valley, CA: Sociology Press.
- Glaser, B. G. (1992). Basics of grounded theory analysis: Emergence vs. forcing. Mill Valley, CA: Sociology Press.
- Goe, L., Bell, C., & Little, O. (2008, June). Approaches to evaluating teacher effectiveness: A research synthesis. Retrieved http://www.psea.org/uploadedFiles/TeachingandLearning/Teacher_Evaluation/ApproachesToEvaluatingTeacherEffectiveness.pdf
- Goodman, L. A. (1961). Snowball sampling. Annals of Mathematical Statistics, 32(1), 148-170.
- Heckman, J. J., & LaFontaine, P. A. (2007). The American high school graduation rate: Trends and levels. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 92(2), 244-262.
- Jordan, W. J., & Cooper, R. (2003). High school reform and black males: Limits and possibilities of policy and practice. *Urban Education*, *38*(2), 196-216. doi: 10.1177/0042085902250485
- Koelsch, L. E. (2013). Reconceptualizing the member check interview. *International Journal* of Qualitative Methods, 12, 168-179.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). Naturalistic inquiry. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Maxwell, J. A. (2010). Using number in qualitative research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *16*(6), 475-482. Retrieved from http://gix.sagepub.com/content/16/6/475.full.pdf+html
- Milacci, F. (2003). A step towards faith: The limitations of spirituality in adult education practice. Unpublished doctoral dissertation Pennsylvania State University, University Park.
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). Analyzing qualitative data. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- National Research Council. (2001). Understanding dropouts: Statistics, strategies, and highstakes testing. Washington, D.C.: Committee on Educational Excellence and Testing Equity, National Academy Press.
- Orfield, G., Losen, D., Walk, J., & Swanson, C. (2004). *Losing our future: How minority youth are being left behind by the graduation rate crisis.* Cambridge, MA: The Civil Rights Project at Harvard University Contributors: Advocates for Children of New York: The Civil Society Institute.
- Osborne, J. W., Walker, C., & Rausch, J. L. (2002, April). *Identification with academics, academic outcomes, and withdrawal from school in high school students: Is there a racial paradox?* Paper presented at meeting of the American Educational Research Association. New Orleans, LA.
- Rothon, C., Arephin, M., Klineberg, E., Cattel, V., & Standfield, S. (2010). Structural and socio-psychological influences on adolescents' educational aspirations and subsequent academic achievement. *Social Psychological Education*, 14(2), 209-231. doi:10.1007/s11218-010-9140-0
- Rumberger, R., & Lim, S. (2008). Why students drop out of school: A review of 25 years research. University of California, Santa Barbara, CA: California Dropout Research Project.
- Russell, B. (2002). *Research methods in anthropology: Qualitative methods*. Walnut Creek, CA: Alto Mira Press.
- Schott Foundation of Public Education. (2010). Yes we can: The Schott 50 state report on public education and black males. Retrieved from http://www.blackboysreport.org/bbreport.pdf
- Sen, R., (2006). *A positive future for black boys: Building the movement*. Cambridge, MA: The Schott Foundation for Public Education.
- Shenton, A. K. (2003). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information*, 22, 63-75.
- Smith, R. A. (2005). Building a positive future for black boys. American School Board Journal, 192(9), 26-28. Retrieved from <u>http://www.schottfoundation.org/publications/Saving%20Black%20Boys%20ASBJ%</u> 20Sept.%2005.pdf
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques.* London, UK: Sage.
- Strayhorn, T. L. (2008). Teacher expectations and urban black males' success in school: Implications for academic leaders. *Academic Leadership*, 6(2), 29-34.
- Swilley, D. C. (2011). A narrative inquiry of African American males who drop out of high school. (Dissertation).
- Taylor, L. C., & Clayton, J. D. (2004). Academic socialization: Understanding parental influences on children's school-related development in the early years. *Review of General Psychology*, 8(3), 163-178. doi:10.1037/10892680.3.163
- Whitting, G. W. (2009). The scholar identity institute: Guiding Darnel and other black males. *Gifted Child Today*, *32*(4), 53-63.

Author Note

Dr. Bell is an author, educator, researcher, poet, and workshop presenter. He has published several articles regarding the education of African-American males. He currently resides in Raleigh, NC. Dr. Bell is currently a program administrator for the North Carolina Department of Public Instruction. Dr. Bell received his AAS degree criminal justice technology from Craven Community College; BA in criminal justice from North Carolina Central University; MA in counseling and his earned doctorate in education leadership from Liberty University. Dr. Bell is a licensed school counselor and social studies teacher in Virginia and North Carolina respectively.

In 1993, Dr. Bell received the prestigious Nancy Susan Reynolds Award for personal services, given by the Z. Smith Reynolds Foundation—a \$25,000 prize. He was also named Tar Heel of the Week by the *News and Observer* in 1994 and has received numerous awards for his community and philanthropic services. In 2002, Dr. Bell studied abroad, in Israel, and visited Hebrew University and other academic sites and biblical locations. He may be contacted at 919.779.0779 and edbell1906@yahoo.com.

Copyright 2014: Edward E. Bell and Nova Southeastern University.

Article Citation

Bell, E. E. (2014). Graduating black males: A generic qualitative study. *The Qualitative Report*, 19(13), 1-10. Retrieved from http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR19/bell13.pdf