

#### Harrison Taylor

To develop a deeper understanding of who Child Care and Early Education (CCEE) educators are—and what influences impact the entry, retention, turnover, and advancement (that is, the workforce dynamics) in this industry—the BASE research team identified and documented existing literature about the CCEE workforce and strategies that are intended to strengthen it. The team conducted a literature review (among several other research activities) to identify, review, and synthesize relevant literature and the evidence base on both multilevel influences that may shape CCEE workforce dynamics and the effectiveness of strategies that aim to build a sustained, qualified CCEE workforce. The team also conducted an environmental scan<sup>1</sup>—a review to identify strategies currently being implemented to build, advance, and sustain the CCEE workforce. This annotated bibliography contains a comprehensive list of the publications that were formally included in the literature review to provide researchers. practitioners, and policymakers with a quick guide to understanding the recent research landscape of the CCEE workforce.

This annotated bibliography details the methods that were used to review the published literature and summarizes elements of the publications. First, we describe the process of selection and

The Building and **Sustaining the Child Care** and Early Education Workforce (BASE) project aims to increase knowledge and understanding in child care and early education (CCEE) by documenting factors that drive workforce turnover and by building evidence on current initiatives to recruit, advance, and retain a stable and qualified CCEE workforce.









review and define terms used by the BASE research team. Then, we present information about all 97 publications that were included in the review and identify the type of study conducted in each publication, outcomes of interest, targeted levers of change, associated CCEE setting, ages of the children served within the study, and the characteristics of educators in the sample. This annotated bibliography is intended to serve as a supplemental resource for those in the CCEE field who are interested in examining the literature on CCEE workforce dynamics in more detail and would like to better understand the types and topics of literature found by the BASE research team.

# Methodology

The research team employed a variety of methods to identify and screen as much relevant and recent literature about CCEE workforce dynamics as possible. Strict and consistent search procedures were followed throughout a three-phase process that included a preliminary search, initial screening, and indepth review. The goal was to identify up to 100 studies for the in-depth review.

## **Preliminary Search**

The purpose of the preliminary search was to identify potential publications for review. The team first identified a short list of "seminal articles"—summary reviews, meta-analyses, and publications that provide foundational information on the topics of interest—that would be included in the review.

Additional publications were identified via database searches, consultations with internal project advisors and external consultants who were part of the BASE project's expert panel, and literature cited in publications that were identified for review.

Multiple databases and websites were used to search for publications and gray literature that focused on outcomes of interest and levers of change. The search identified experimental, quasi-experimental, correlational, and descriptive studies; single-case and qualitative studies; implementation studies; and meta-analyses. We conducted searches of academic research databases (i.e., Academic Search Complete, EBSCOhost, EconLit, Education Resources Information Center, Education Source, PsycInfo, and SocINDEX) for relevant peer-reviewed articles from the past 30 years that were conducted in the United States.

The research team looked through 36 websites to identify relevant gray literature, including the sites of the following sources:

- think tanks (e.g., Brookings and Urban Institute)
- independent research organizations (e.g., Abt Associates and Mathematica Policy Research)
- university-based research organizations (e.g., Buffett Early Childhood Institute at the University of Nebraska; the Center for the Study of Child Care Employment at the University of California, Berkeley; and the Prenatal-to-3 Policy Impact Center at the University of Texas at Austin)
- federal agencies (e.g., the Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation within the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, the U.S. Department of Education)

The research team used search terms that included job position and/or setting(s) (for example, teacher or early educator or administrator and preschool or day care or child care or Head Start) and search terms related to workforce dynamics (entry, retention, turnover, advancement, commitment, satisfaction). By using a specific and expansive set of terms, the research team was able to quickly identify relevant literature that covered every area of interest.

From this preliminary search, we identified 484 publications. To reduce the amount of material further, we removed dissertations and all publications that were more than 5 years old (from 2016 or earlier). The remaining articles went through the initial screening. (The seminal articles were an exception; they all went through the initial screening and the in-depth review.)

## Initial Screening

During the initial screening, the research team reviewed 130 publications. In order for a publication to qualify for an in-depth review, it had to focus on at least one outcome of interest: (1) turnover or retention, (2) recruitment and entry, (3) advancement, and (4) psychological well-being. It also had to do one or more of the following:

- provide descriptive statistics about—or examine predictors of—an outcome of interest
- describe the implementation or evaluate the testing of strategies that target one or more of the following levers of change: educator qualifications and competencies, educator economic wellbeing, educator psychological well-being, workplace demands or supports, and CCEE system alignment and inequities<sup>2</sup>
- focus on diversity, equity, and inclusion (for example, by examining discriminatory hiring practices or the need for more Black male educators in CCEE)

Publications were removed if they included educators who were not in the CCEE workforce (such as K-12 teachers or teachers in general), if they did not examine any of the outcomes of interest, if they described policy recommendations or author hypotheses without providing any evidence, or if they failed to discuss the implementation of a strategy or evidence on how it related to workforce dynamics.

The initial screening revealed that few publications focused on the implementation or testing of relevant strategies or on educators working in home-based child care settings. Because of these gaps, the research team incorporated literature published earlier than 2017 for these two specific areas.

### In-Depth Review

In total, 97 publications received an in-depth review. A research team member read through each publication and filled in a form with information on the CCEE setting, target population, and sample characteristics; the potential multilevel, contextual factors (such as an educator's experience level or the local labor market) that might affect workforce dynamics examined; outcomes of interest that were examined; levers of change that were targeted; and study findings and the measures that were used. The form ensured that each publication was reviewed consistently.

## **Annotated Bibliography**

Table 1 contains citations and information for the 97 publications that were selected for an in-depth review. The table classifies which type of study was done in each publication and its foci within the following five categories: (1) outcome of interest, (2) targeted lever of change, (3) CCEE setting, (4) age of children served, and (5) educator position. An "X" denotes a publication's focus within each category. In the columns showing the outcomes of interest, a red "X" highlights what the BASE team determined to be the primary outcome of interest discussed in the publication. In the columns showing the ages of the

children served, dash marks indicate when the ages were not explicitly specified. Seminal articles are footnoted and may not include an outcome of interest.

Definitions for the terms used in the table are included below. These definitions were used as a guide during the initial screening process. Terminology varies within the CCEE field, so it was important to establish standard definitions for the BASE project to ensure the publications were screened consistently.

### Type of Study

**Correlational:** A study that looks at the associations among variables of interest (for example, does *x* predict *y*)

**Ethnographic:** A qualitative study where researchers observe and/or interact with a study's participants in their natural environment

**Experimental:** A study that examines a causal relationship and that randomly assigns participants to an experimental group or a control group, or a study that aims to examine causality, with participants assigned to groups based on non-random criteria

**Exploratory or emergent design:** A descriptive study with fewer than 50 participants, or a qualitative study

**Implementation:** A study or description that focuses on the process or specified set of steps in which a strategy is put into place

**Large descriptive:** A descriptive study with more than 50 participants that examines "who," "what," "when," and "where" questions pertaining to a phenomenon or variable of interest

**Literature review:** A study that synthesizes information from various sources, including other studies, to come to general conclusions

**Single case:** A study that uses various methods to rigorously test the success of an intervention or treatment on a particular case (i.e., a person, school, or community)

**Theoretical:** A thought piece that discusses a theory or hypothesis but does not present data to empirically support it

#### Outcome of Interest

**Turnover:** An educator's exit or employment transition out of a given job, setting, type of care, or the CCEE field, or when a home-based care setting closes

**Retention:** An educator's tenure in a job, setting, type of care, or the CCEE field

**Entry:** The entry of prospective and current educators into a new job, setting, type of care, or the CCEE field

Advancement: Educators' upward economic and career trajectories within the CCEE field

**Psychological well-being:** The status of educators' mental health (for example, whether they exhibit symptoms of depression, anxiety or stress)

## Strategies Associated with the Levers of Change

**Educator qualifications and competencies ("qual. and comp." in Table 1):** Strategies that target this lever of change aim to improve the qualifications and competencies of participating individuals and include apprenticeship, scholarship, or credentialing programs.

**Educator economic well-being ("economic well-being"):** Strategies that target this lever of change aim to improve the income, earnings, or economic well-being of participating individuals and may include offering or putting into place financial incentives, wage increases, wage supplements, benefit supports (for example, expanding access to health insurance), career ladders, collective bargaining, or business coaching models and other business supports.

**Educator psychological well-being ("psych. well-being"):** Strategies associated with this lever of change aim to enhance how participating individuals perceive or cope with existing job demands and may include workshops and training sessions on topics like mindfulness and stress management.

**Workplace demands or supports ("demands/supports"):** Strategies associated with this lever of change aim to address structural-, social-, and setting-level factors or job characteristics and conditions. They may aim to reduce job stressors or provide resources to help educators accomplish work-related goals. Approaches may include marketing services, scheduling support, and substitute networks.

**CCEE system alignment and inequities ("align. and inequities"):** Strategies associated with this lever of change aim to coordinate and align strategic initiatives underway to support and advance the CCEE workforce. They may make efforts to integrate and align data systems, and may also attempt to align, create parity, or bring cohesion to regulatory; funding; and monitoring activities, resources, and supports.

### Setting

**Center-based care:** Child care and early education provided in a commercial group setting. It includes daycare facilities, independent preschools, or a chain of sites. Center-based child care includes for-profit or non-profit organizations.

**Home-based care:** Child care and early education offered by caregivers that work in a residential setting. It may also be referred to as family child care. Depending on state regulations, these providers may or may not be regulated or required to obtain a license. Home-based care does not include caregivers who are the parents or guardians of the children being cared for.

**School-based care:** Child care and early education that is provided by a K-12 school district that serves children up to 5 years old. It also includes after-school care for children up to 13 years old.

## Ages of Children Served

Infant: Typically refers to children up to 18 months old

Toddler: Typically refers to children that are 18 months to 3 years old

**Preschool-aged:** Typically refers to children that are 3 to 5 years old

**School-aged:** Typically refers to children that are 5 to 13 years old

## Educator Positioni

**Lead teacher:** An educator who guides a class through the day and leads activities. A lead teacher may be the only educator within a classroom.

**Assistant teacher:** An educator who helps a lead teacher. An assistant teacher is never the sole adult assigned to a classroom.

**Administrator/owner:** An educator who carries out managerial or directorial tasks, and who may supervise teachers. This position is considered higher on the ladder of advancement within center- or home-based care. This also includes owners of home-based care.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>i</sup> This category refers to the positions the educators in the sample hold or, in the case of some publications—including theoretical publications—it represents the educator position of focus.

TABLE 1		(	Outcom	e of I	nteres	st		_	ted Le Change			CCE	E Sett	ting	Ąį	ge of C Ser		n		ducato Positio	
Building and Sustaining the Child Care and Early Education Workforce (Base) Literature Review Annotated Bibliography		wer	ıtion		Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	t	er	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advar	Psyck	Qual.	Econ	Psyck	Dema	Align.	Cente	Home	Scho	Infant	Toddler	Presc	Scho	Lead	Assis	Admi
Abt Associates. 2019. Rhode Island PDG B-5. Workforce Needs Assessment Final Report. Cambridge, MA: Abt Associates.	Large descriptive	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х		Х	Х	Χ	Х	Χ	Х		Х	Х	X
Ali, Umair, Chris M. Herbst, and Christos A. Makridis. 2020. The Impact of COVID-19 on the U.S. Child Care Market: Evidence from Stay-At-Home Orders. IZA Discussion Papers, No. 13261. Bonn, Germany: Institute of Labor Economics.	Theoretical			X								Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	
Armenia, Amy B. 2009. "More Than Motherhood: Reasons for Becoming a Family Day Care Provider." <i>Journal of Family Issues</i> 30, 4: 554–574.	Large descriptive			Х									Х		-	-	1	1			Х
Austin, Lea J. E., Bethany Edwards, Raul Chavez, and Marcy Whitebook. 2019. <i>Racial Wage Gaps in Early Education Employment</i> . Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment.	Large descriptive				Х							Х	Х		Х	Х			Х	Х	
Bassok, Daphna, Justin B. Doromal, Molly Michie, and Vivian C. Wong. 2021. Reducing Teacher Turnover in Early Childhood Settings: Findings from Virginia's PDG 8-5 Recognition Program. Charlottesville: University of Virginia.	Experimental	X						X				Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	X	
Bassok, Daphna, Anna J. Markowitz, Laura Bellows, and Katharine Sadowski. 2021. "New Evidence on Teacher Turnover in Early Childhood." <i>Educational Evaluation &amp; Policy Analysis</i> 43, 1: 172–180.	Large descriptive	Х										Х		Х		Χ	Х		Х		

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcor	ne of I	nteres	t			ted Le Change			CCE	EE Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato ositio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Bassok, Daphna, Anna Markowitz, Amy Smith, and Laura Oleson. 2020. The Early Childhood Education Workforce in Jefferson Parish, Louisiana: Findings from the 2018 Early Childhood Workforce Survey. Charlottesville, VA: EdPolicyWorks at the University of Virginia.	Large descriptive	X		X		Х						X		Х	X	Х	X		Х	X	Х
Bellows, Laura, Daphna Bassok, and Anna J. Markowitz. 2021. Teacher Turnover in Early Childhood Education: Longitudinal Evidence from the Universe of Publicly-Funded Programs in Louisiana. (EdWorkingPaper: 21–453). Providence, RI: Annenberg Institute at Brown University.	Large descriptive	Х	Х									Х		Х		Х	Х		Х		
Black, Simon. 2012. "Mitigating Precarious Employment in New York City's Home-Based Child Care Sector." Labour, Capital and Society 45, 1: 96–121.	Implementation		Х	Х	Х		Х	Х					Χ		Х	Х	Х	Х			Х
Boyd-Swan, Casey, and Chris M. Herbst. 2017. The Demand for Teacher Characteristics in the Market for Child Care: Evidence from a Field Experiment. IZA Discussion Paper No. 10702. Bonn, Germany: Institute of Labor Economics.	Experimental			X								Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	
Boyd-Swan, Casey, and Chris M. Herbst. 2019. "Racial and Ethnic Discrimination in the Labor Market for Child Care Teachers." <i>Educational Researcher</i> 48, 7: 394–406.	Experimental			Х								Χ		Χ	Х	Х	Х		Χ	Х	
Bridges, Margaret, Bruce Fuller, Danny S. Huang, and Bridget K. Hamre. 2011. "Strengthening the Early Childhood Workforce: How Wage Incentives May Boost Training and Job Stability." <i>Early Education and Development</i> 22, 6: 1009–1029.	Correlational	Х					Х	Х				Х					Х		Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)			Outcor	ne of I	nteres	st		_	ted Le			CCE	E Set	ting	A	ge of C Ser		en	_	ducat Positio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Bromer, Juliet, Samantha Melvin, Toni Porter, and Marina Ragonese-Barnes. 2021. The Shifting Supply of Regulated Family Child Care in the U.S.: A Literature Review and Conceptual Model. Chicago, IL: Herr Research Center, Erikson Institute.	Literature review	Х	X			X							X		X	X	X	X			X
Brooks, Fred P. 2003. "What Differences Unionizing Teachers Might Make on Child Care in the USA: Results from an Exploratory Study." <i>Child and Youth Care Forum</i> 32, 1: 3–22.	Exploratory		Х					Х		Х		Х							Х		Х
Brown, Jessica H., and Chris M. Herbst. 2021. <i>Child Care over the Business Cycle</i> . Bonn, Germany: Institute of Labor Economics.	Correlational	X		Х								Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х
Brown, Tiara Saufley, and Tina L. Stanton-Chapman. 2017. "Experiences of Paraprofessionals in US Preschool Special Education and General Education Classrooms." Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs 17: 18–30.	Exploratory					X								X			Х			X	
Bryan, Nathaniel, and Toni Milton Williams. 2017. "We Need More than Just Male Bodies in Classrooms: Recruiting and Retaining Culturally Relevant Black Male Teachers in Early Childhood Education." <i>Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education</i> 38, 3: 209–222.	Theoretical		Х	X							X								X	X	
Campbell, Nancy D., Joan Entmacher, Helen Blank, and Amy K. Matsui. 2015. Extra Credit: How Louisiana is Improving Child Care. Washington, DC: National Women's Law Center.	Implementation				X		Х	Х				Х							Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	st .		_	ted Le			CCE	E Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato ositio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Carson, Russell L., Jennifer J. Baumgartner, Carrie L. Ota, Ann Pulling Kuhn, and Anthony Durr. 2017. "An Ecological Momentary Assessment of Burnout, Rejuvenation Strategies, Job Satisfaction, and Quitting Intentions in Childcare Teachers." <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i> 45, 6: 801–808.	Correlational	Х				X						X			-		-	-	X	Х	
Gaven, Meg, Noman Khanani, Xinxin Zhang, and Caroline E. Parker. 2021. Center- and Program-Level Factors Associated with Turnover in the Early Childhood Education Workforce. REL 2021-069. U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Northeast and Islands.	Correlational	Х										Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
Child Care Services Association. 2020. Working in Early Care and Education in North Carolina. Chapel Hill, NC: Child Care Services Association.	Large descriptive	Х	Х				Х	Х				Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
CMS Alliance to Modernize Healthcare, Federally Funded Research and Development Center. 2019. Environmental Scan of Early Childhood Care and Education Workforce Turnover. Washington, DC: Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review	X	X				X	Х				X	Х	Х	Х	X	Х		X	Х	Х
CMS Alliance to Modernize Healthcare, Federally Funded Research and Development Center. 2019. Policy Options and Recommendations for Reducing Early Childhood Care and Education Workforce Turnover. Washington, DC: Administration for Children and Families, Department of Health and Human Services.	Literature review	X	Х				X	Х				X	Х		Х	X	X		X	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	st .		_	ted Le Change			CCE	EE Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		n		ducato ositio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Cole, Kristen, Jean-Yves Plaisir, Mindi Reich-Shapiro, and Antonio Freitas. 2019. "Building a Gender-Balanced Workforce: Supporting Male Teachers." <i>Young Children</i> 74, 4.	Ethnographic		Х	X		Х						Х		Х	-	1	-	1	Х	Х	
Cramer, Travis, and Elise Cappella. 2019. "Who Are They and What Do They Need: Characterizing and Supporting the Early Childhood Assistant Teacher Workforce in a Large Urban District." <i>American Journal of Community Psychology</i> 63, 3–4: 312–323.	Correlational		Х			X						Х		Х	-					Х	
Cumming, Tamara. 2017. "Early Childhood Educators' Well-Being: An Updated Review of the Literature." <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i> 45, 5: 583–593.ª	Literature review					X						Х	Х	Х			Х				
Dowsett, Chantelle, Kate Steber, and Dale Epstein Richards. 2019. Spotlight on Louisiana's Early Childhood Ancillary Certificate. Bethesda, MD: Child Trends.	Implementation		X				Х	Х				Х		Х	-	1	-	1	Х		
Epstein, Dale, Tamara Halle, Shannon Moodie, Laura Sosinsky, and Martha Zaslow. 2016. Examining the Associations Between Infant/Toddler Workforce Preparation, Program Quality and Child Outcomes: A Review of the Research Evidence. OPRE Research Brief 2016-15. Washington DC: Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review						Х					Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х		
Farewell, Charlotte V., Jennie Quinlan, Emily Melnick, Jamie Powers, and Jini Puma. 2021. "Job Demands and Resources Experienced by the Early Childhood Education Workforce Serving High-Need Populations." <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i> 5: 1–10.	Correlational	Х				X						Х					X		Х	Х	X

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	t			ted Le Change			CCE	EE Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato Positio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Gable, Sara, Tanja C. Rothrauff, Kathy R. Thornburg, and Denise Mauzy. 2007. "Cash Incentives and Turnover in Center-Based Child Care Staff." <i>Early Childhood Research Quarterly</i> 22: 363–378.	Experimental	X			Х			Х				Х	Х		•	•		•	Х	Х	X
Gable, Sara, Tanja C. Rothrauff, Kathy R. Thornburg, and Denise Mauzy. 2010. "Analysis of Ongoing Participation in a Child Care Workforce Cash Incentive Programme in the United States." <i>Early Child Development &amp; Care</i> 180, 6: 719–734.	Correlational	X					Х	Х				Х					1		Х	Х	Х
Gardner, Madelyn, Hanna Melnick, Beth Meloy, and Jessica Barajas. 2019. Promising Models for Preparing a Diverse, High-Quality Early Childhood Workforce. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.	Implementation		Х	X	Х		Х	Х		Х		Х	Х	Х	1	1			Х	Х	Х
Gebhart, Tracy, Julianna Carlson, Phoebe Harris, and Dale Epstein. 2020. Workforce Perceptions and Experiences with the Alabama Early Care and Education Salary Parity Policy. Bethesda, MD: Child Trends.	Single case		X	Х		Х		Х				Х		Х			Х		Х	Х	Х
Gebhart, Tracy, Hallie Garrison, Audrey Franchett, Jackson Fojut, Dale Epstein, and Rebecca Madill. 2020. Examining Regional Differences in the Arkansas Early Care and Education Workforce. Bethesda, MD: Child Trends.	Correlational					X						Х	Х		1	1	1	1	X	Х	
Gerstenblatt, Paula, Monica Faulkner, Ahyoung Lee, Linh Thy Doan, and Dnika Travis. 2014. "Not Babysitting: Work Stress and Well-Being for Family Child Care Providers." Early Childhood Education Journal 42: 65–75.	Exploratory					X							Х		1	ı	ı	1			Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	st .		_	ted Le			CCE	EE Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en	_	ducato Positio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Grant, Ashley A., Lieny Jeon, and Cynthia K. Buettner. 2019. "Relating Early Childhood Teachers' Working Conditions and Well-Being to Their Turnover Intentions." <i>Educational Psychology</i> 39, 3: 294–312.	Correlational	Х				Х						Х		Х			Х		Х	X	
Hall-Kenyon, Kendra M., Robert V. Bullough, Kathryn Lake MacKay, and Esther E. Mashall. 2014. "Preschool Teacher Well-Being: A Review of the Literature." <i>Early</i> <i>Childhood Education Journal</i> 42: 153–162.	Literature review	Х				Х						Х					Х		Х	Х	
Harding, Jessica H., Maia C. Connors, Allison Friedman Krauss, Nikki Aikens, Lizabeth Malone, and Louisa Tarullo. 2019. "Head Start Teachers' Professional Development, Well-being, Attitudes, and Practices: Understanding Changes Over Time and Predictive Associations." American Journal of Community Psychology 63, 3–4: 324–337.	Correlational					X						Х					Х		Х		
Herbst, Chris M. 2015. The Rising Cost of Child Care in the United States: A Reassessment of the Evidence. IZA Discussion Papers, No. 9072. Bonn, Germany: Institute for the Study of Labor.	Correlational			X	Х							Х	Х	Х	-		-	-	Х	Х	
Herbst, Chris M. 2016. The Impact of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems on Families' Child Care Choices and the Supply of Child Care Labor. IZA Discussion Papers, No. 10383. Bonn, Germany: Institute for the Study of Labor.	Correlational	Х		X	Х		Х	Х				Х	Х	Х	-	1	-	-	Х	Х	
Holas-Huggins, Najeema, and Annemarie Lewis Kerwin. 2009. The State of the Early Education Workforce: Removing Barriers to Access and Advancement. Boston, MA: Bessie Tartt Wilson Initiative for Children, Inc.ª	Large descriptive	Х			Х							Х	Х	Х	-		-	-	Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	st .			ted Le Change			CCE	E Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato ositio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Institute of Medicine and National Research Council. 2015. Transforming the Workforce for Children Birth Through Age 8: A Unifying Foundation. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review	Х	Х		X	Х	·					Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X
Jeon, Lieny, and Michael B. Wells. 2018. "An Organizational-Level Analysis of Early Childhood Teachers' Job Attitudes: Workplace Satisfaction Affects Early Head Start and Head Start Teacher Turnover." <i>Child and Youth Care Forum</i> 47, 4: 563–581.	Correlational	X										Х			Х	Х	X		Х	Х	
Johnson, Laura Ruth, Seeta A. Pai, and Margaret Bridges. 2004. Advancing the Early Childhood Workforce: Implementation of Training and Retention Initiatives in the Bay Area. Policy Brief 04-1. Berkeley, CA: Policy Analysis for California Education, PACE (NJ1).	Implementation		X		Х		Х	Х				Х	Х		-		-	-	Х	Х	Х
Kornack, Cody, and Ashley LiBetti. 2021. Broader, Deeper, Fairer: Five Strategies to Radically Expand the Talent Pool in Early Education. Boston, MA: Bellwether Education Partners.	Theoretical			Х	Х		Х					Х	Х		Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	
Kwon, Kyong-Ah, Adrien Malek, Diane Horm, and Sherri Castle. 2020. "Turnover and Retention of Infant-Toddler Teachers: Reasons, Consequences, and Implications for Practice and Policy." <i>Children and Youth Services Review</i> 115.	Exploratory	Х	Х									Х			Х	Х			Х		
LeBoeuf, Whitney, Phil Perrin, and Stacey Kennedy. 2020. Colorado's Early Care and Education Professionals: 2019 Snapshot Report. Denver: Colorado Evaluation and Action Lab at the University of Denver.	Large descriptive	Х	Х	Х	Х							Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcor	ne of I	nteres	st .		_	ted Le Change	ver of		CCE	E Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		n		ducato ositio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Leifield, Lisa. 2020. "Influential Others: Infant/Toddler Teachers' Perspectives on Entry Into and Retention in the Infant/Toddler Workforce." <i>Early Years 42, 4–5: 465–479.</i>	Exploratory		Х	X								Х			Х	Х			Х		
Lessard, Laura M., Katilyn Wilkins, Jessica Rose-Malm, and M. Chaplin Mazzocchi. 2020. "The Health Status of the Early Care and Education Workforce in the USA: A Scoping Review of the Evidence and Current Practice." Public Health Reviews 41, 1: 1–17.ª	Literature review					X			Х			Х	Х		-			-	X	Х	Х
LiBetti, Ashley. 2019. Leading by Exemplar: Case Studies of Head Start Programs. Boston, MA: Bellwether Education Partners.	Single case		X	Х	Х		Х			Х		Х			Х	Х	Х		X	Х	
Lieberman, Abbie. 2019. Lessons from the Bayou State: Three Reforms for Improving Teaching and Caregiving. Washington, DC: New America.	Literature review			X	Х		Х	Х			Х	Х			Х	X	Х		X		Х
Lo, Yafen, Shu-Chen Yen, and Shinchieh Duh. 2017. "Using Learning Communities to Support Cantonese/Mandarin Family Child Care Providers in a Professional Development Intervention Program." Journal of Education and Learning 6, 4: 127–136.	Implementation				X		Х						X		Х	Х	Х			Х	Х
Madill, Rebecca, Tamara Halle, Tracy Gebhart, and Elizabeth Shuey. 2018. Supporting the Psychological Well-Being of the Early Care and Education Workforce: Findings from the National Survey of Early Care and Education. OPRE Report 2018-49. Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <sup>a</sup>	Large descriptive					Х						Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х		

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	t			ted Le	ver of		CCE	E Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato ositio	~ .
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
McCormick Center for Early Childhood Education. 2018. How Attitudes about Work Differ Across Program Types and Staff Roles. Wheeling, IL: McCormick Center for Early Childhood Education at National Louis University.	Correlational	X										Х			Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X
McDevitt, Seung Eun. 2020. "Tracing Diverse Pathways to Teaching: Tales of Nontraditional Immigrant Women of Color Becoming Teachers of Young Children." <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i> 49, 2: 325–335.	Ethnographic			X								Х		Х	-	-	-	1	Х	Х	
McLean, Caitlin, Lea J. E. Austin, Marcy Whitebook, and Krista L. Olson. 2021. <i>Early Childhood Workforce Index 2020.</i> Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California, Berkeley.	Literature review	Х				X	Х	Х	Х			Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
McLean, Caitlin, Harriet Dichter, and Marcy Whitebook. 2017. Strategies in Pursuit of Pre-K Teacher Compensation Parity: Lessons from Seven States and Cities. Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California, Berkeley and New Brunswick, NJ: the National Institute for Early Education Research.	Implementation	Х						Х				Х		Х			Х		Х	X	Х
McMullen, Mary B., Melissa S.C. Lee, Kate I. McCormick, and Jieun Choi. 2020. "Early Childhood Professional Well-Being as a Predictor of the Risk of Turnover in Child Care: A Matter of Quality." <i>Journal of Research in Childhood Education</i> 34, 3: 331–345.	Correlational	X				Х						X			X	Х	Х		Х		Х
Meidl, Christopher. 2019. "Challenges to Recruiting Black Males into Early Childhood Education." <i>Urban Education</i> 54, 4: 564–591.	Exploratory			X											-	•	-	-			

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	st			ted Le			CCE	EE Sett	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser		en		ducato Positio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Melnick, Hanna, Beth Meloy, Madelyn Gardner, Marjorie Wechsler, and Anna Maier. 2018. <i>Building an Early</i> <i>Learning System That Works: Next Steps for California</i> . Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.	Large descriptive	Х	Х	X	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	X	X
Miller, Joyce Ann, and Tania Bogatova. 2009. "Quality Improvements in the Early Care and Education Workforce: Outcomes and Impact of the T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood Project." Evaluation and Program Planning 32, 3: 257–277.	Large descriptive	Х	Х		Х		X	Х				Х	Х		X	X	Х		Х	Х	Х
Mowrey, Sascha C. 2021. "Triangulating Social Networks and Experiences of Early Childhood Educators in Emergent Professional Cultures." <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i> 49: 527–537.	Large descriptive	Х										Х					Х		Х	X	Х
National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. 2018. <i>Transforming the Financing of Early Care and Education</i> . Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review	Х		Х			Х	Х				Х	Х	Х	-	•	1	1	Х	Х	X
National Center on Early Childhood Quality Assurance. 2020. Addressing the Decreasing Number of Family Child Care Providers in the United States. Washington, DC: Administration for Children and Families, Office of Child Care.	Literature review	X					X	Х		Х	Х		Х		Х	Х	Х	X			Х
Oregon Center for Career Development in Childhood Care and Education and Oregon Child Care Research Partnership. 2019. Oregon Early Learning Workforce: Three Years Beyond Baseline Comparison of 2012 and 2018. Corvallis, Oregon: Oregon Child Care Research Partnership, OSU Family Policy Program.	Large descriptive	X	X				X	Х				Х	Х				-	1	X	X	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcor	ne of I	nteres	it			ted Le	ever of		CCE	EE Set	ting	Ą	ge of C Ser	Childre ved	n		ducato Positio	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Orfali Hall, Nadia S., Diane M. Early, and Deborah Seok. 2020. <i>Understanding Links Between Work Climate and Early Care and Education Classroom Quality</i> . Bethesda, MD: Child Trends.	Correlational	X				Х						Х				X	Х		Х		
Phillips, Deborah A., Sara Anderson, A. Rupa Datta, and Ellen Kisker. 2019. "The Changing Portrait of Center-Based Preschool Teachers: 1990 and 2012." <i>Children and Youth Services Review</i> 107.	Large descriptive	X										Х		Х			Х		Х	х	
Pierson, Ashley, Jill Cannon, Rachel Perera, Kata Mihaly, and Rebekah LeMahieu. 2021. Professional Development Incentives for Oregon's Early Childhood Education Workforce: A Randomized Study. REL 2021-111.  Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Northwest.	Experimental		Х		х		х	х				Х	х	х	х	Х	х		Х	х	
Porter, Toni, Diane Paulsell, Patricia Del Grosso, Sarah Avellar, Rachel Hass, and Lee Vuong. 2010. A Review of the Literature on Home-Based Child Care: Implications for Future Directions. Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review					Х	х						х		Х	Х	Х	Х			Х
Prenatal-to-3 Policy Impact Center. 2020. Prenatal-to-3 Policy Clearinghouse Evidence Review: Child Care Workforce Compensation. Austin: Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs, University of Texas at Austin.	Literature review	X	Х					х				Х	Х	Х	Х	X	X		Х	Х	Х
Research for Action. 2018. Detroit-Area Early Childhood Workforce Study. Washington, DC: The Policy Equity Group.	Large descriptive	Х	Х	Х		Х						Х			Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)			Outcon	ne of I	nteres	t			ted Le Change			CCEE Setting			Age of Children Served				Educator Position		
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. And Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. And Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Roberts, Amy M., Kathleen C. Gallagher, Alexandra M. Daro, Iheoma U. Iruka, and Susan L. Sarver. 2019. <i>Risk Factors for Depression Among Early Childhood Teachers</i> . Omaha: Buffett Early Childhood Institute at the University of Nebraska.	Correlational					X						X	Х	Х	•	•		-	X	Х	
Roberts, Amy M., Kathleen C. Gallagher, Alexandra M. Daro, Iheoma U. Iruka, and Susan L. Sarver. 2019. "Workforce Well-Being: Personal and Workplace Contributions to Early Educators' Depression Across Settings." Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology 61: 4–12.	Large descriptive					X						Х	Х	Х	ı		ı	-	Х	Х	
Roberts, Amy M., Kathleen C. Gallagher, Susan L. Sarver, and Alexandra M. Daro. 2018. <i>Early Childhood Teacher Turnover in Nebraska</i> . Omaha: Buffett Early Childhood Institute at the University of Nebraska.	Large descriptive	Х		Х								Х		Х					Х	Х	
Roberts, Amy M., Iheoma U. Iruka, and Susan L. Sarver. 2017. Nebraska Early Childhood Workforce Survey: A Focus on Providers and Teachers. Omaha: Buffett Early Childhood Institute at the University of Nebraska.	Large descriptive					Х						Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х
Ryan, Sharon, and Debra J. Ackerman. 2005. "Using Pressure and Support to Create a Qualified Workforce." Education Policy Analysis Archives 13: 1–17.	Large descriptive				X		Х					Х		Х			Х		Х		
Schaack, Diana, Vi-Nhuan Le, Courtney Donovan, Tobi Adejumo, and Mari Ortega. 2020. Teacher Retention and Turnover Post Salary Increase at Mile High Early Learning: Factors Shaping Teachers' Job Decisions. Denver: University of Colorado Denver.	Correlation	X	Х					X				Х			Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	

TABLE 1 (continued)		(	Outcon	ne of I	nteres	it	Targeted Lever of Change					CCEE Setting			Ą	ge of C Ser		Educator Position			
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. And Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. And Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Schaack, Diana, Vi-Nhuan Le, and Mari Ortega. 2020. Examining Two Teacher Pay Raise Models in Head Start and Publicly Subsidized Early Care and Education Programs. Denver: University of Colorado Denver.	Correlational	X	Х					Х				Х			Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	
Schaack, Diana D., Vi-Nhuan Le, and Jennifer Stedron. 2020. "When Fulfillment is Not Enough: Early Childhood Teacher Occupational Burnout and Turnover Intentions from a Job Demands and Resources Perspective." Early Education and Development 31, 7: 1011–1030.	Correlational	X				Х						Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х		Х
Schlieber, Marisa, Marcy Whitebook, Lea J.E. Austin, Aline Hankey, and Michael Duke. 2019. <i>Teachers' Voices: Work Environment Conditions That Impact Teacher Practice and Program Quality—Marin County.</i> Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California, Berkeley.	Large descriptive	Х	Х			X						Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
Schnake, Kerrie L., and Angela Moreland. 2021. Be Well Care Well: Taking Care of the Caregivers. Baltimore, MD: Zero to Three.	Theoretical					Х			Х			Х			-	•		-	Х	Х	Х
Shaw, Sara, Rowan Hilty, Chrishana M. Lloyd, Kerensa Nagle, Katherine Paschall, Mallory Warner-Richter, Kathryn Tout, and Leanna Moron. 2019. Evaluation of R.E.E.T.A.I.N., Minnesota's Child Care Workforce Retention Program. Minneapolis: Child Trends for the Minnesota Department of Human Services. DHS-7809A 1-19.	Implementation	х	х		Х			Х				Х	Х		Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
Shdaimah, Corey, Elizabeth Palley, and Amanda Miller. 2018. "Voices of Child Care Providers: An Exploratory Study on the Impact of Policy Changes." International Journal of Child Care and Education Policy 12, 4.	Exploratory	Х	Х			Х						Х	Х		-	-	•	-			X

TABLE 1 (continued)				ne of I	nteres	t		Targe (	ted Le Chang			CCEE Setting			Age of Children Served					or n	
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Sklar, Cara. 2020. Youth Apprenticeship in Early Childhood Education: Lessons and Opportunities. Washington DC: New America.	Implementation			X			Х		ł						-	•	•	-			
Smith, Sheila, and Sharmila Lawrence. 2019. Early Care and Education Teacher Well-Being: Associations with Children's Experience, Outcomes, and Workplace Conditions: A Research-to-Policy Brief. Child Care and Early Education Research Connections.	Literature review					X		Х	X	X		Х	Х		Х	Х	Х		X	Х	
Stormont, Melissa, and Laine Young-Walker. 2016. "Supporting Professional Development Needs for Early Childhood Teachers: An Exploratory Analysis of Teacher Perceptions of Stress and Challenging Behavior." International Journal on Disability and Human Development 16, 1: 99–104.	Correlational					X						Х					Х		X	X	X
Tonyan, Holli A., and Joce Nuttall. 2014. "Connecting Cultural Models of Home-Based Care and Childminders' Career Paths: An Eco-Cultural Analysis." International Journal of Early Years Education 22, 1: 117–138.	Ethnographic			Х	X								Х		Х	Х			Х		Х
Tonyan, Holli A., Joce Nuttall, Jeannette Torres, and Jessie Bridgewater. 2017. "Engaging with Quality Improvement Initiatives: A Descriptive Study of Learning in the Complex and Dynamic Context of Everyday Life for Family Child Care Providers." <i>Early Education and Development</i> 28, 6: 684–704.	Exploratory					X				Х			Х		-	1	1	-			X
Totenhagen, Casey J., Stacy Ann Hawkins, Deborah M. Casper, Leslie A. Bosch, Kyle R. Hawkey, and Lynne M. Borden. 2016. "Retaining Early Childhood Education Workers: A Review of the Empirical Literature." <i>Journal of Research in Childhood Education</i> 30, 4: 585–599.	Literature review	Х	X									Х		Х	-	1		-	Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)			Outcome of Interest						ted Le Change			CCEE Setting			Age of Children Served				Educator Position		
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Tuomienen, Mary C. 2012. "Speaking and Organizing Across Difference: The Multiracial, Grassroots Mobilization of Child Care Workers." <i>Feminist Formations</i> 24, 1: 26–48.	Ethnographic					X			Х				Х		-	1	-	-			X
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and U.S. Department of Education. 2016. <i>High-Quality Early Learning Settings Depend on a High-Quality Workforce</i> . Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and U.S. Department of Education. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review	X	Х	Х				Х				Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	X	Х	Х	
Uttley, Clarissa, and Diane Harm. 2008. "Mentoring in Early Childhood Professional Development: Evaluation of the Rhode Island Child Development Specialist Apprenticeship Program." Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education 29, 3: 237–252.	Exploratory	X					Х					Х			X	Х	X		Х	X	
Wells, Michael B. 2017. "Is all Support Equal?: Head Start Preschool Teachers' Psychological Job Attitudes." Teaching and Teacher Education 63: 103–115.	Exploratory	Х				X						Х					Х		Χ	Х	
Whitebook, Marcy, and Dan Bellm. 2005. Lessons from CARES and Other Early Care and Education Workforce Initiatives in California, 1999–2004: A Review of Evaluations Completed by Fall 2004. Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California at Berkeley.	Literature review		X				Х	Х				Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х
Whitebook, Marcy, Aline Hankey, Marisa Schlieber, Lea J. E. Austin, and George Philipp. 2018. Teachers' Voices: Work Environment Conditions That Impact Teacher Practice and Program Quality—Miami-Dade County. Berkeley, CA: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment.	Large descriptive	Х	Х			X						Х		Х	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х	Х

TABLE 1 (continued)		Outcome of Interest					Targeted Lever of Change					CCEE Setting			Age of Children Served				Educator Position		
Publication	Type of Study	Turnover	Retention	Entry	Advancement	Psych. Well-Being	Qual. and Comp.	Economic Well-Being	Psych. Well-Being	Demands/Supports	Align. and Inequities	Center-Based	Home-Based	School-Based	Infant	Toddler	Preschool-Aged	School-Aged	Lead Teacher	Assistant Teacher	Administrator/Owner
Whitebook, Marcy, Deborah Phillips, and Carollee Howes. 2014. Worthy Work, STILL Unlivable Wages: The Early Childhood Workforce 25 Years After the National Child Care Staffing Study. Berkeley: Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, Institute for Research on Labor and Employment, University of California, Berkeley. <sup>a</sup>	Literature review	X	X	X	Х	Х		X				X	X	X	Х	X	Х		Х	Х	
Zinsser, Katherine M., Catherine Main, Luz Torres, and Kate Connor. 2019. "Patching the Pathway and Widening the Pipeline: Models for Developing a Diverse Early Childhood Workforce in Chicago." <i>American Journal of Community Psychology</i> 63, 3–4: 459–471.	Implementation		Х	X	Х		Х					Х	Х	Х	•		-		X	Х	

NOTE: An "X" denotes a publication's focus within each category. In the columns showing the outcomes of interest, a red "X" highlights what the BASE team determined to be the primary outcome of interest discussed in the publication. In the columns showing the ages of the children served, a dash mark (-) indicates when the ages were not explicitly specified.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup>Seminal articles may not include an outcome of interest.

### References

<sup>1</sup>Bernardi, Alexandra, JoAnn Hsueh, Sydney Roach, and Lisa Rau. 2023. *Child Care and Early Education Workforce Recruitment and Retention: Insight from a Current Landscape of Strategies*. OPRE Report 2023-178. Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Available at: <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base</a>

<sup>2</sup> For more information on these levers of change, see the Environmental Scan brief. Bernardi, Alexandra, JoAnn Hsueh, Sydney Roach, and Lisa Rau. 2023. *Child Care and Early Education Workforce Recruitment and Retention: Insights from a Current Landscape of Strategies*. OPRE Report 2023-178. Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Available at: <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base</a> and the Conceptual Framework brief. Hsueh, JoAnn, Harrison Taylor, Michelle Maier, and Sydney Roach. 2023. *Influences on the Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement of the Child Care and Early Education Workforce*. OPRE Report 2023-191. Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Available at: <a href="mailto:sshttps://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base</a>.

# **Acknowledgments**

The author would like to thank several Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation staff for their thoughtful feedback and contributions to the preparation of this annotated bibliography, including Ann Rivera, Project Officer, and Krystal Bichay-Awadalla, Dianna Tran, and Brian Tchen, Project Team Reviewers. I appreciate the review and support of Jillian Verrillo, our editor. I also recognize several BASE team members whose work contributed to this report: from MDRC, Caitlin Anzelone, Alex Bernardi, JoAnn Hsueh, Michelle Maier, Cynthia Miller, Frieda Molina, Victor Porcelli, Sydney Roach, Kelsey Schaberg, and Carolyn Thomas; and from MEF Associates, Erin Bumgarner, Lorraine Perales, Marisa Putnam, Lisa Rau, and Kate Stepleton. I would like to thank ICF for their contributions in the production of this annotated bibliography. I thank the members of the BASE expert advisory group (Juliet Bromer, Debra Pacchiano, Aisha Ray, Amy Roberts, and Diana Schaack) for providing guidance on all aspects of the project. Finally, I express deep gratitude to the child care and early education practitioners, administrators, and teachers who participated in the project and allowed us to learn from their knowledge and experiences.

OPRE Report #2023-243 March 2024

Author: Harrison Taylor

**SUGGESTED CITATION**: Taylor (2024). An Annotated Bibliography of Select Literature on the Child Care and Early Education Workforce: A Supplement to the BASE Knowledge Review Series. OPRE Report 2023-243. Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Available at: <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/project/building-and-sustaining-early-care-and-education-workforce-base</a>

**DISCLAIMER:** The views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, the Administration for Children and Families, or the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. This report is in the public domain. Permission to reproduce is not necessary. This report and other reports sponsored by the Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation are available at <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre">www.acf.hhs.gov/opre</a>.

Contract #: HHSP233201500059I

Project Director:
Cynthia Miller
MDRC
200 Vesey Street
23rd Floor
New York, NY 10281-2103

**Submitted To:** Ann Rivera (Project Officer), Krystal Bichay-Awadalla, Dianna Tran, and Brian Tchen, Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.









