



Department
for Education

International approaches to careers interventions

Literature review

March 2021

**Authors: Pye Tait Consulting and Carol
Stanfield Consulting**



Government
Social Research

Contents

Glossary	4
Executive summary	5
Chapter 1: Introduction	8
1.1 Methodology	8
1.2 Report structure	9
Chapter 2: Recent international literature reviews and recommendations	10
2.1 Introduction	10
2.2 Careers education	10
2.3 Careers in the curriculum	11
2.4 Career guidance	12
2.5 Employer engagement	14
2.6 Conclusions	16
Chapter 3: Commonalities and differences across international CIAG systems	17
3.1 Introduction	17
3.2 Policy design, development, and evaluation	17
3.2.1 Northern Ireland	18
3.2.2 Wales	19
3.2.3 Scotland	21
3.2.4 Republic of Ireland	21
3.2.5 Germany	22
3.2.6 Netherlands	23
3.2.7 Ontario	24
3.2.8 Singapore	25
3.3 Delivering CIAG: who?	27
3.4 Delivering CIAG: what?	30
3.4.1 CIAG at school	30
3.4.2 CIAG after compulsory education	36
3.5 Funding	41
3.5.1 Northern Ireland	41
3.5.2 Scotland	41
3.5.3 Wales	41

3.5.4 Republic of Ireland	41
3.5.5 Germany	42
3.5.6 Netherlands	42
3.5.7 Ontario	42
3.5.8 Singapore	43
3.6 Conclusions	43
3.6.1 Commonalities	43
3.6.2 Interesting or unique features	44
Chapter 4: Recent evidence of effective career interventions	46
4.1 Introduction	46
4.2 Recent evidence on interventions in school	46
4.2.1 Primary age intervention	46
4.2.2 Secondary school interventions	47
4.3 Recent evidence on interventions post-school	49
4.4 Recent evidence on interventions aimed at parents	50
4.5 Recent evidence on teacher engagement in interventions	50
4.6 Conclusion: what works best	51
Appendix 1: Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (Sherman et al., 1997)	53
References	54

Glossary

The use of acronyms has been avoided where possible in this report, but a few have been used for ease of reading and these are defined below:

- Careers Information, Advice and Guidance (CIAG)
- European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP)
- Information and Communications Technology (ICT)
- Not in Education, Employment or Training (NEET)
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
- Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)

Executive summary

Introduction

International policy and practice reviews support policy development by learning what works, in what contexts, and why. They also provide the opportunity to consider how that learning might be effectively translated to the English context. Three years after the publication of the 2017 Careers Strategy (Department for Education, 2017), Pye Tait Consulting and Carol Stanfield Consulting were commissioned to review literature relating to the following two questions:

- What are the features of Careers Information, Advice and Guidance (CIAG) systems in other countries?
- What recent causal or outcome evidence is there regarding the impact of CIAG?

International review of CIAG

This report draws upon the findings of 5 major international literature reviews, published since 2016, which covered areas such as careers education, careers in the curriculum, career guidance and employer engagement. Chapter 2 summarises these reviews and presents common recommendations. These recommendations include starting careers guidance activities early, with approaches and interventions tailored appropriately to age, as well as the need for activities that encourage self-reflection. This process of self-reflection, and understanding of individual motives, underpins further exploration of career options through study and work. The reviews also emphasised the importance of employer engagement in successful CIAG interventions. Employer contact provides young people with experiences of the working world and helps them to understand and navigate their career choices.

Common features of international CIAG systems

Eight nations¹ were selected for the review of CIAG systems: Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Republic of Ireland, Germany, Netherlands, Ontario in Canada, and Singapore. All were selected on the basis that the Department for Education understood their provision to be of high quality, offering a potential for learning. Chapter 3 describes policy design, development and evaluations found in those nations.

There are commonalities to the approaches utilised in the 3 devolved nations of the UK. For example, CIAG policies can be traced to wider economic policies and there are similar policy and delivery frameworks. In schools, provision of careers education and advice is carried out jointly by teaching staff and external (though school-based) careers

¹ Whilst Ontario is a region, we refer to them collectively as 'nations' for ease of drafting.

advisors. Teachers deliver careers education – a statutory part of the curriculum – while careers advisors support this provision by providing impartial guidance to pupils. All three devolved nations also have initiatives designed to ease transitions from education into employment, as well as CIAG services for adult workers in need of upskilling and retraining. Services for young people and adults are typically delivered in the community, through careers advice centres and co-locations, such as Jobcentres and community hubs. Services are also increasingly being delivered via online sources.

In contrast, the model for Germany reflects the country's federal approach of a top-down policy, with contributions expected from institutions, such as chambers of commerce and trade unions, and delivery is left to each state to optimise. This is similar to Ontario, without the additional source of national information delivery. In the Netherlands, delivery is left to schools.

Other commonalities are the programmes centred around the individual thinking about their respective needs, as in Ontario, Singapore and, to some extent, Germany.

Interesting or unique features of CIAG

Some features that were reviewed stand out for being unique. In Ontario, for example, the use of questions set within a framework in the All About Me portfolio, encourages consistency and familiarity. It also develops the habit to keep returning to one's individual personal plan. The use of one portal for continuity, from education onwards, ensures a strong portfolio of information and enables evidence to be built up.

In Singapore, an end-to-end programme has been devised to reduce the risk of individuals dropping-out of the system. Singapore created the SkillsFuture brand for ease of identification of career-related products and to facilitate grouping of relevant support. Specialist career counsellors are available in all schools and provider institutions.

Recent evidence of effective career interventions

The literature review also explored robust evidence on careers interventions published since Hughes' (2016) review. The studies identified covered different activities and used different measures, but presented some relatively consistent themes:

- positive results were more evident on shorter-term outcomes, such as career readiness (Cadaret & Hartung, 2020) and attitude to school/education (Kashefpakdel & Mann, 2016), as opposed to longer-term outcomes, such as career adaptability measures (Caderet & Hartung, 2020) or education and employment outcomes (Lane, 2017). This has been seen across programmes, regardless of how 'short-term' or 'long-term' the objectives of each programme are
- time was needed for effective counselling interventions

- reflective approaches to counselling were generally favoured (see Hughes, 2016 and Musset and Kureková, 2018) and can work with disadvantaged groups; though such groups may need to be specifically targeted or risk missing out (Casey et al., 2019)
- activities to raise aspirations to study at higher levels can have a positive impact, particularly experiential activities (Gorard, 2017) and those which involve a student counsellor (Tomaszewski et al., 2017)
- experimental designs prove complex to conduct, with many factors that can impinge on the purity of careers research.

Conclusion

Since Hughes' (2016) review, there has been a significant amount of evidence (including some causal evidence) emerging on CIAG (or related policy interventions) and a further review is due later this year from The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)². The European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP) has an array of resources on [European lifelong guidance systems](#), aimed at aiding careers policy development, which we have drawn on in this review and of which there is scope to make further use.

The evidence reviewed here is fragmented in its coverage of different aspects of CIAG systems (content, delivery, and target group) and different short-term or longer-term outcomes (personal, educational or employment). However, there are consistent messages about the need to allow sufficient time for CIAG activities, including personalisation and age-appropriate coaching-types, as well as delivery by trained professionals.

The countries we reviewed have similar objectives for careers activities, but the implementation of careers policy is very much set in the national context and aligned to existing relationships and arrangements. Hence, it is vital to translate policy learning from these different contexts to apply it to the policy environment in England.

² This review is due to explore indicators of successful transitions into adult employment (including career uncertainty, ambition and misalignment; career misalignment, participation in career development activities, and teenage emotional readiness), as well as indicators of effective labour market signalling (including career confusion, concentration and interests; historic and contemporary patterns in young people's occupational expectations, and the relationship between parental occupation and teenage occupational ambitions).

Chapter 1: Introduction

International policy and practice reviews support policy development by learning what works, in what contexts, and why. They also provide the opportunity to consider how that learning might be effectively translated to the English context. As the government looks to build on its 2017 Careers Strategy (Department for Education, 2017) and to deliver new measures set out in the Skills for Jobs White Paper (Department for Education, 2021), this review explores the latest robust evidence of ‘what works’ with regard to careers interventions. It also considers how other countries deliver CIAG.

The 2017 Careers Strategy (Department for Education, 2017) set out a long-term plan to build a world-class careers system for young people and adults, putting in place the building blocks of an all-age approach to careers. Organisations funded by the Department for Education have distinct roles to strengthen the support for individuals, as they move through different stages of their lives:

- for young people, schools and colleges lead, with a legal duty to secure independent careers guidance for 12- to 18-year-olds; schools and colleges are expected to develop their careers programme in line with the Gatsby Benchmarks (Gatsby Foundation, 2014) which define what world-class careers guidance looks like
- the government-established Careers and Enterprise Company encourages greater engagement between schools and businesses; it also supports schools and colleges to deliver a world-class careers education which is responsive to individual pupil needs, as underpinned by the Gatsby Benchmarks
- the National Careers Service provides an intensive multi-channel service including face-to-face guidance for priority groups in the adult population; it also supports individuals of all ages via extensive website, telephone, and webchat services.

1.1 Methodology

This research addresses the following two questions:

- What are the features of CIAG systems in other countries?
- What recent causal or outcome evidence is there regarding the impact of CIAG?

To ensure that there was value in proceeding with the project, the Department for Education commissioned an initial search of the literature before taking the decision to proceed to a full literature review. Research was therefore conducted in two phases.

In phase one, 11 countries were selected for an initial search of documentary evidence on CIAG systems. When searching for CIAG research and policy evaluation evidence, the country criteria was widened and focussed on the last 10 years. A range of sources were used including Google and Google Scholar, as well as international organisations such as the OECD, CEDEFOP, and International Labour Organisation.

For each source, biographical and access information was recorded, along with factors such as country; policy type (for example, advisor training, schools-based, employer engagement, technological); target group(s), and, for evaluation reports, a ranking against the Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (Sherman et al., 1997) (see Appendix 1 for further detail).

The decision was taken to proceed to phase two which comprised a full literature review of 8 countries/regions, selected on the basis of the number and quality of sources available and being of policy interest: Ontario in Canada, Germany, Netherlands, Northern Ireland, Republic of Ireland, Scotland, Wales, and Singapore. This phase also comprised the analysis of recommendations from 5 major careers literature reviews, conducted since 2016, along with the review of robust research and policy evaluation sources identified in phase one³.

1.2 Report structure

Chapter 2 summarises recommendations from recent literature reviews pertaining to CIAG. Chapter 3 presents commonalities and differences in CIAG systems across the 8 selected countries/regions. Chapter 4 presents recent robust research evidence on the impacts of specific CIAG interventions.

³ On deeper review, many sources were not found to be as robust as initially expected, given the descriptions reviewed during phase 1. These sources were then excluded, and further discussions were held with Department for Education on the rationale for retaining the sources covered in this review.

Chapter 2: Recent international literature reviews and recommendations

Summary

This chapter draws on recently published literature reviews in the field of careers advice and presents the recommendations of those reports. The reviews covered careers education in general, careers guidance, careers in the curriculum and employer engagement. There are several key points highlighted in this chapter. They include recommendations about ensuring a process of self-reflection and identifying what motivates the individual; starting careers guidance at an early age and ensuring interventions are appropriately designed for the age group. Employer engagement is also commonly reported as important to give young people experience of the world of work and to help them understand and define their options.

2.1 Introduction

In this section, we bring together the recommendations from 5 major literature reviews which have been conducted since 2016. The reviews covered careers education, careers in the curriculum, career guidance and employer engagement. This chapter presents the recommendations of these reviews under headings and draws together common recommendations in the conclusion.

2.2 Careers education

The 2017 Careers Strategy for England (Department for Education, 2017) built on the comprehensive literature review by Hughes (2016) which examined careers evidence from over the last 20 years. The recommendations drew on 76 robust evaluation and longitudinal data sources, published between 1996 and 2016, on the impact of careers interventions on educational, economic, and social outcomes. The report urged caution in how the findings should be treated because of the overall weakness in the evidence base (in particular, a lack of experimental pilots). The report did, however, identify features of effective practice as:

- career reflection – the individual should develop an understanding of their motivations and aptitudes, self-regulation, self-determination, and resilience to cope with unforeseen setbacks
- career exploration – exploring the options for study or work
- career action – opportunities to learn from differing types of interventions

- networking – building and maintaining a network of key contacts
- learning environment – stimulating real-life work experiences and talking about these experiences
- career dialogue – having meaningful conversations with teachers, parents or carers, employers and employees, alumni, and trained and qualified career development professionals
- career conversations in the workplace – giving students exposure to and experience of work in real-life situations.

In this, we can see how the recommendations move from self-reflection and what motivates the individual, to understanding more about those options through research, contacts, experience, and dialogue.

2.3 Careers in the curriculum

A recent international review (Collins & Barnes, 2017) for the Careers and Enterprise Company identified over 90 UK and international primary and grey/secondary sources, published in English between 1997 and 2017, on careers in the curriculum. The report defined 3 ways of delivering careers in the curriculum:

- providing career learning as a subject in its own right
- incorporating career learning within other subjects
- organising career learning through co-curricular activities (i.e., enrichment activities strongly connected to the formal curriculum).

The impact of careers delivered as a subject in its own right was noted in 3 areas:

- improved personal effectiveness (for example self-esteem, motivation, personal agency, and self-efficacy beliefs)
- improved career readiness (for example, career exploration skills, understanding of occupations, decision-making, and decidedness/preparedness for transitions)
- improved educational outcomes (for example, attendance and attainment).

However, for the other two ways of delivering careers in the curriculum (careers embedded in subject learning and through co-curricular activities), the evidence is more limited, less conclusive, and less impactful.

The Careers and Enterprise Company review made the following recommendations:

- a whole-school strategy should be underpinned by effective leadership, a shared vision and be built on local and national initiatives; cited resources to support this include the Gatsby Benchmarks (Gatsby Foundation, 2014), Quality in Careers Standard (Quality in Careers Consortium, 2017) and online tools such as Grofar, Future First and Outstanding Careers
- a well-designed curriculum should focus on the transition from primary school, use high-quality resources, and allocate sufficient time to careers
- focus on how the student learns, through combining reflection, dialogue, practice, and inquiry
- train staff to deliver careers in the curriculum, particularly for subject teachers to embed career learning
- engage school partners, for example parents or carers, employers, further and higher education and other school partners
- deliver consistent quality and volume of careers education.

2.4 Career guidance

A study for the OECD conducted by Musset and Kureková (2018) reviewed international policy and practice in:

- designing effective career guidance services
- engaging employers in careers guidance (see Section 2.5 on Employer engagement).

The review is cognisant of the context of increased use of ICT in all sectors, including CIAG, as well as the marketisation of education and broader changes in the labour market.

The OECD report identified a number of implications for the design of careers interventions. Firstly, start early and deliver proactively at key decision points. Citing evidence from the US (see Sadler et al., 2012), the report stated that career interests remain relatively stable throughout upper-secondary education and therefore career guidance needs to start early – even before primary school - when children’s expectations may already be shaped by personal experiences and family background. Through-school approaches are recommended which are tailored to age and student need; for example, supporting identity-development through play at pre-primary and

primary age and encouraging personal reflection and workplace experiences at secondary school age.

Secondly, ensure that career counsellors are well-trained, independent, and impartial, and integrate teachers into the provision of CIAG in school-wide approaches. The need for well-trained, impartial counsellors is well-documented, but the report made a case for teachers to also be trained for the role they play. The report cited findings from PISA's (2015) survey in which teachers were asked if student careers guidance and counselling were included in a) their initial teacher education and b) their professional development activities during the last 12 months. Across 9 countries where data was available, Korea showed the highest levels of teachers having had training in careers guidance and counselling during their initial teacher education (70%); but even there, only 4 in 10 had received recent professional development training.

Thirdly, personalise approaches to CIAG and focus on those who need most assistance. The report showed that young people's aspirations are influenced by their socioeconomic status, gender, ethnicity, and migrant status. Proactive careers guidance is essential for overcoming barriers faced by disadvantaged groups. Providing information is not enough, for example, to help young people from a lower socioeconomic background feel they belong in higher education, or to help girls feel that they belong in science roles. The report cited the example of National Boys' Days and Girls' Days' (in Switzerland, Belgium, and Germany), whereby universities and employers invite students to spend a day learning about occupations in sectors where their gender is under-represented.

Finally, take advantage of opportunities presented by ICT. Suggestions of such opportunities include using ICT to deliver labour market information, education and careers options, as well as engaging with partners.

To illustrate this further, CEDEFOP has developed 25 case studies of the use of ICT in careers guidance. These case studies include knowledge and learning on:

- a means of sharing information on best practice between career counsellors (for example, Bid-Wiki in Austria and Syvonline in Sweden)
- sources of labour market information (for example, eGuidance in Denmark)
- information on education and/or job opportunities for young people and/or adults (for example, Professions in the Picture in the Netherlands which presents videos and texts to describe working and training, internships, and job opportunities for almost 500 occupations)
- diagnostic tools (for example, Work Profiler in the Netherlands)
- signposting opportunities for work experience (for example, TET-tori in Finland)

- an ePortfolio service that allows an individual to gather their educational and professional information in one place (for example, Kyvvyt in Finland)
- job-matching services across Europe (for example, EURES).

Evaluations reported for each of the case studies tend to report on the numbers using the tools, process evaluations or qualitative evaluations of impact. The evaluation methods and the variety of purposes for which the ICT is being used mean that it is difficult to draw out general success factors on how ICT should be applied in CIAG. A general conclusion is to ensure that any ICT solution is carefully designed for the purpose and context in which it is applied.

2.5 Employer engagement

The OECD conducted by Musset and Kureková (2018) also explored effective employer engagement. The report cited barriers to employer engagement, such as knowing what education providers need; time and motivation to engage in careers guidance; legal constraints, such as health and safety matters; reluctance of teachers and school leaders to accept people in work into schools; and school resources. Demonstrating how these barriers play out in practise, the report featured data from PISA's (2012) survey which showed that only 27% of students reported that they had participated in an internship programme as a careers guidance activity, compared to 70% searching the internet.

The report offered a few recommendations with regard to engaging employers:

- raise awareness of the range of different activities, from simple to more intensive types, which may address some barriers for both employers and schools
- incentives to engage employers, such as information exchange and co-design of programmes, and awards for participating employers
- pooling placement opportunities, within and across schools, to enable exposure to non-familial placement opportunities.

A study conducted by Mann, Rehill and Kashefpakdel (2018) for the Education Endowment Foundation examined ways in which employers can effectively support schools to improve pupil educational and economic outcomes. The report developed a typology of employer engagement, via the lens of everyday teaching and learning:

- supplementary – directly supporting conventional teaching and learning approaches to achieve established learning outcomes (for example, reading support programmes)

- complementary – offering alternative means to achieve established learning outcomes (for example, mentoring programmes aimed at helping students improve attainment)
- additional – offering means to achieve learning outcomes additional to those found in conventional teaching and learning (for example, enterprise activities aimed at developing employability skills or entrepreneurial capabilities).

Additionally, the Education Endowment Foundation report identified 4 outcomes of employer engagement:

- enhanced understanding of jobs and careers
- enhanced knowledge and skills demanded by the contemporary labour market
- enhanced knowledge and skills demanded for successful school-to-work transitions
- enrichment of education and improved pupil attainment.

The Education Endowment Foundation report provided consistent findings of young people achieving some, or all, of the outcomes listed above, when they engaged with employers. However, there were variations depending on who the young person was, their school, their age, and their perception of the quality of the experience. Effective employer engagement should, the report suggested, be authentic, real world, frequent, valued, contextualised, personalised and begin at a young age.

An international policy guidance document, from the Inter-Agency Working Group on Work-based Learning (2019), similarly defined effective employer engagement as ‘authentic, frequent, personalised, varied, embedded in careers education and beginning in primary school’. Identifying career talks and job fairs as easy starting points for employers, the international report also suggested that this engagement can be particularly effective in tackling gendered assumptions and other forms of stereotypes about occupations.

To supplement the reviews described above, we identified additional sources which provide further practical guidance in the UK. The initial engagement of employers is recognised as difficult, particularly as employers themselves cite barriers around the offer of work experience. These barriers include limited understanding of the ways in which employers can help schools, as well as perceptions that work experience placements involve navigating cumbersome legal constraints, such as health and safety or safeguarding regulations. In 2014, the UK Commission for Employment and Skills published an employer-facing document which challenged myths about barriers to offering work experience opportunities. This report identified easier initial routes, such as

mentoring, talks in schools, offering project and challenge opportunities. Benefits were expressed by various employers, who provided case study illustrations of how they offered work experience.

In 2016, Business in the Community likewise published a guide for employers on how to engage with primary schools. The guide outlined the benefits for employers, as well as recommending employers learn about the primary school environment and its needs so that they could assess what their business could offer and build relationships. This would appear to follow the recommendations listed earlier about starting early. In Chapter 3, we will see examples of countries which have done this and the methods they have chosen.

2.6 Conclusions

These 5 major literature reviews have taken slightly different perspectives, but common themes are identifiable in their recommendations.

The evidence suggested that to maximise effectiveness, interventions should start at a young age, with tailored approaches for different ages, and activities be clearly distinguished by timing (for example, primary, a key transition point); by type (for example, career education or mentoring), and by desired outcomes (attitudinal, educational, or economic).

Actions which encourage reflection, dialogue, practice, and inquiry seem vital to success. These activities need to be allowed sufficient time and space in the curriculum and this would appear to be more likely where there is a focus on career learning as a subject in its own right, taught by professionals. Incorporating career learning into other subjects requires sufficient materials and training for teachers to develop confidence in delivery. This needs significant resource and there is an argument to focus resource on personalised support for disadvantaged groups (such as those from lower socioeconomic backgrounds) and to challenge gender-based stereotypes about certain occupations.

Chapter 3: Commonalities and differences across international CIAG systems

Summary

This chapter reviews CIAG systems across 8 countries/regions. A number of practises are identified, many of which are in common with the recommendations reported in Chapter 2. The different CIAG systems illustrate some of the difficulties in implementing best practice, notably the need for resources to ensure consistently high-quality, personal provision. Other key findings include a mix of mandatory or optional CIAG provision; extensive use of professional counsellors, though reductions in resources have seen their numbers diminish; little evidence of parental involvement, other than materials provided for parents to help their children with career planning, aspirations, and insights. Employers appear more integrated in Germany, where there is the pre-existing, well-integrated and recognised chambers of commerce, which operates alongside the delivery of guidance by the state. Across all 8 countries/regions, there has been minimal recent evaluation or monitoring of CIAG activities.

3.1 Introduction

In this chapter, we describe the features of 8 nations⁴ CIAG systems that were reviewed: Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Republic of Ireland, Germany, Netherlands, Ontario in Canada, and Singapore.

This chapter considers the delivery of careers provision in terms of policy design, development, and evaluation; who and what, and levels of funding. The detail of each nation is presented in some sections, although in other sections examples are given to prevent repetition and illustrate key points. It should be noted that it was not possible to obtain consistent information across all nations.

3.2 Policy design, development, and evaluation

In this section, we consider the broader policy context in which CIAG sits and how it has been developed by describing each of the nations in turn. We also provide evidence from available evaluations or reviews of CIAG policies.

⁴ Whilst Ontario is a region, we refer to them collectively as 'nations' for ease of drafting.

3.2.1 Northern Ireland

Northern Ireland's 2016 Careers Strategy was closely linked to the aims and objectives of the country's Economic and Skills Strategies.

Northern Ireland's Skills Strategy: 'Success Through Skills - Transforming Futures' (Department for Employment and Learning, 2011) emphasised the need to grow the country's skills to promote productivity. It aimed to 'enable people to access and progress up the skills ladder' to:

- raise the skills level of the whole workforce
- raise productivity
- increase levels of social inclusion by enhancing the employability of those currently excluded from the labour market
- secure Northern Ireland's future in a global marketplace.

Their 2012 Economic Strategy (Northern Ireland Executive, 2012) established as priorities improving the economic competitiveness of Northern Ireland and rebalancing their economy through the development of the private sector. This was to be achieved by stimulating innovation, research, and development, as well as by improving 'the skills and employability of the entire workforce, so that people could progress up the skills ladder, thereby delivering higher productivity and increased social inclusion'.

Northern Ireland's 2016 Careers Strategy (Department for Employment and Learning, 2016) was largely a continuation of their previous strategy for the period 2009 to 2014. It was designed to assist in achieving the aims and objectives of its predecessor by raising awareness of the various routes to work, as well as helping people to make informed decisions about their career pathways.

The two ministries responsible for the Careers Strategy – the Department of Education (DE) and the Department for Employment and Learning (DEL) – commissioned an independent review to take account of progress made during the preceding years. The review reported in October 2018 and concluded that the partnership model, where DE and DEL shared responsibilities in delivering CIAG services, was:

'...probably the strongest model for the delivery of careers services, and while there are lessons to be learned from other countries in relation to particular practices, they should be viewed as desirable enhancements of a basically sound model'.

As a result, the partnership model was retained⁵. The independent review did, however, include 5 recommendations for improving the existing careers service in Northern Ireland. These recommendations were made into the 5 priority commitments in the 2016 Careers Strategy (Department for Employment and Learning, 2016):

- an accountability and quality assurance framework to ensure delivery of high-quality careers services and to improve transparency
- open up new channels of e-delivery and labour market information (including online web chat and social media) to enhance flexibility and improve customer satisfaction and cost efficiency
- work experience to ensure equality of opportunity and improve the administrative process of organising work experience opportunities
- provide access to impartial advice and additional support to those at risk of becoming disengaged, as well as provide more advice to parents
- record achievements and experiences through an e-portfolio.

3.2.2 Wales

In Wales, careers policies are aligned to the broader economic policies. All Welsh policy is guided by the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act (2015), and in their 2017 report, Careers Wales aligned the 7 goals of the act to their high-level outcomes, which are:

- improve efficiency of the labour market by reducing skills mismatches
- increase participation and attainment in education and training (reducing the number of young people classed as NEET)
- reduce drop-out and 'churn' within post-16 education and training
- increase take up of apprenticeships
- help other agencies target their services more efficiently and effectively
- ensure the new curriculum for Wales prepares young people for the world of work.

Another key policy is Prosperity for All (Welsh Government, 2015), which included a commitment to providing careers advice to help young people access entrepreneurial opportunities and jobs in new and growth sectors. This commitment was reiterated in their 2017 Economic Action Plan.

⁵ In 2016, the Department for Employment and Learning was dissolved and replaced by the Department for Economy (DfE). All careers advice services formerly entrusted to DEL are now undertaken by DfE.

The 2018 Employability Plan (Welsh Government, 2018) emphasised the importance of targeted support, delivered in co-locations, and the importance of regional delivery. It cited positive examples of co-location, with locally delivered services in Cardiff and Llanelli.

Winckler (2017) has summarised the history of CIAG in Wales as moving from local authority to private sector provision in the 1990s. With devolution came the establishment of Careers Wales and 7 private sector companies initially operated within the Careers Wales brand and remit; they were subsequently wound up in 2013, when Careers Wales became a company limited by guarantee, wholly owned by the Welsh Government.

Careers Wales' 2017 strategy identified 4 changes in focus:

- stronger focus on young people
- supporting partners by enabling and training
- focus on digital intervention
- limiting face-to-face support for those above compulsory school-age to prioritise 16- to 18-year-olds classed as NEET, as well as those in the youth justice system and adults unemployed or facing redundancy.

The strategy also stated that the Welsh government's investment in Careers Wales had halved in recent years and reported that a third of young adults, who did not receive careers advice from Careers Wales (because they were not at risk of becoming NEET), had changed their post-16 career and learning plans after leaving school.

Careers Wales used key performance indicators in their 2019/20 Business Plan to drive outcomes, for example: 'careers advisors will work in no more than two schools or with an average case load of 570 in Key Stage 4'.

A review of the Careers and World of Work framework conducted by the schools' inspectorate for Wales, Etsyn, in 2017, found that reduced support from Careers Wales in schools due to budget cuts had impacted on CIAG provision. The report found that nearly all schools provided pupils with a range of information in year 9 to help them make their Key Stage 4 subject choices. However, it also pointed out that most schools had not responded effectively to reductions in the Careers Wales support and only a few schools were ensuring that all Key Stage 4 pupils had an interview to discuss their careers options. There was also a reported decline in work experience placements since the Welsh Government stopped requiring Careers Wales to maintain a national work experience database on behalf of schools.

3.2.3 Scotland

Scotland's 2020 Careers Strategy (Scottish Government, 2020) stated that technological change, Brexit and shifts in the pattern and organisation of work (non-standard working and the rise of the 'gig' economy) placed increased pressure on young people and adult workers, many of whom may need to switch jobs, retrain, and upskill.

With these changes, Scotland's 2020 Careers Strategy recognised the need for a careers service which is visible and accessible to all individuals, provided through its all-age careers service and My World of Work – an online careers management skills service.

Scotland's 2020 Careers Strategy acknowledged that while there exists a strong foundation of careers advice services in Scotland, this system is 'the sum of many parts'. As such, the current system carries with it 'the risk of incoherency, inconsistency and of people falling between the cracks'.

However, there are reports which indicate more effective, uniform policy implementation of CIAG in schools across the country. Between 2013 and 2020, Education Scotland undertook external assessments of the CIAG services offered by Skills Development Scotland in each of Scotland's 32 local authority areas. External assessors used 3 key principles, which were outcomes and impact, service delivery and leadership, and quality culture, to examine the impact of CIAG activities on the quality of customer experiences.

Overall, the assessments revealed that Skills Development Scotland was effectively delivering a broad range of careers advice services, both in schools and in the community. In the majority of cases, they scored 'good', 'very good' or 'excellent', across the 6 themes of assessment (customer progression; achievement of relevant high-quality outcomes; meeting the needs of stakeholders; delivery of key services; management of service delivery; strategic leadership). Of the independent assessments conducted in 2019/20, 93% of CIAG services scored 'good' or above.

However, even local authorities which scored 'excellent' in service delivery have been earmarked for improvement in the implementation of the Career Education Standard (Education Scotland, 2016). Examples include school curricular staff being yet to relate their subject material to the Career Education Standard expectations and entitlements, and schools making greater use of My World of Work ambassadors to effectively promote the online platform.

3.2.4 Republic of Ireland

The 1998 Education Act requires schools to use their own resources to give students access to guidance that will assist them in their education and career choices.

The 2025 National Skills Strategy (Department of Education and Skills, 2019) set the framework for related policies in the Republic of Ireland. Whilst there was no specific CIAG objective, the strategy did refer to the development and review of CIAG tools.

This strategy made recommendations in 4 areas:

- reforms to governance
- improvement in career guidance tools and career information
- enhancement of enterprise engagement
- promotion of inclusion.

An implementation taskforce was assembled to drive reforms, including the development of a coherent, long-term strategy for lifelong career guidance, an emphasis on evidence-based policy and a new organisation to oversee technology-facilitated guidance services.

There is no current formal evaluation of careers services, although in schools this forms a part of the inspection regime.

Post-compulsory education guidance was set out in the 2014 Further Education and Training Strategy (SOLAS Further Education and Training Authority, 2014).

3.2.5 Germany

Since the early 2000s, careers guidance has increased significantly in importance in the German education system. However, the means of implementation vary to a certain degree between the German states, different school types and institutions. The German Federal Institute for Vocational Training provides careers information and conducts research on developments in career guidance and the labour market; it also defines the purpose of careers guidance as to help young people with the transition from school through further education and into the labour market (Bertelsmann Foundation, 2015).

Careers management skills are delivered in different ways across the different states. For example, in Hamburg, schools must offer 34 hours of careers orientation lessons during the last 3 school grades, which is assessed and based on a dedicated curriculum within each school. In Baden-Wuerttemberg, careers orientation starts at grade 5 (age 10 years-old) (CEDEFOP, 2020b).

Careers guidance and support for young people already in work, for lifelong learning across all age groups, and for adults either already in the labour market or seeking employment, has become increasingly important. In recent years, a considerable number of initiatives have been piloted, many of which were aimed at establishing closer links

between education and employers; these have recently focused on extending into early professional life and establishing mechanisms for lifelong learning.

A study of the implementation of a web-based self-assessment tool on careers choice readiness found that after interaction with a counsellor, participants scored improvements on the 5 dimensions of the tool which were:

- problem awareness and motivation
- preferences
- level of career information
- decision-making behaviour
- skills for implementation.

An evaluation of other pilots found greater improvements with more frequent guidance interventions to prevent long-term unemployment. These pilots resulted in changes to the service provision for such groups (CEDEFOP, 2020b).

Recognising that careers guidance may play an essential part in addressing skills shortages and adjusting the workforce to technological transformation, including digitisation, has increased political interest and momentum in the subject. A declared goal is to increase careers maturity and competence, ensuring that young people find and choose suitable work placements and further or higher education to prevent apprenticeship and university drop-outs. In addition, careers guidance is being more widely understood as a key factor in facilitating a smooth transition from school into professional life (Conference of Ministers of Culture, 2017), as well as promoting and sustaining inclusiveness, gender equality and upward social mobility.

3.2.6 Netherlands

Approaches to CIAG services in the Netherlands have focused increasingly on the self-reliance and responsibility of all job seekers within the Netherlands. This has led to a shift towards the adoption of online self-service facilities via the Employee Insurance Agency, available to job-seekers in the Netherlands (CEDEFOP, 2020a).

A key priority of the Dutch CIAG system has always been the reduction of youth unemployment and lifelong learning has also become a key priority. The starting point is that the government wants to encourage people to take control of their own careers and lives, so that they can continue to develop and make their own choices; lifelong development plays an important role in this. People have access to resources that can be used for training and development, so that they remain sustainably employable in the labour market. The government is working on a scheme for a public learning and development budget to give people the financial possibility to take steps in their

development. Added to this, the financial feasibility of a digital overview of training opportunities is being explored, in order to support development (CEDEFOP, 2020a).

When compared to Germany, which relies on top-down federal initiatives and cooperation between the Federal Employment Agency and other stakeholders, the Dutch system relies on schools developing their own initiatives while following national guidance. Such guidance includes the Ambition Agenda on Career Guidance Education, set out by the Ministry of Education between 2016 and 2017, which ensures that the quality of CIAG in secondary schools and vocational education and training sectors is monitored by the Educational Inspectorate. It is not yet clear whether giving schools ownership over the process might ensure their CIAG delivery is attuned to addressing regional issues, such as local labour market needs, but this bottom-up approach may be effective at addressing the needs of individual schools and their student population.

The Netherlands Initiative for Education Research collates research into CIAG's impact. It shows that research tends to focus on the design and implementation of policy, rather than longer-term effects, and that effects tend to be self-reported. Research has also varied in its interpretation of CIAG at the local level. Where longer-term evaluation is available, it has emphasised the importance of dialogue-based CIAG, the significance of which has been highlighted in Chapter 2's recommendations. Another study of first year higher education students found that while a CIAG offer did not guarantee students made the right career decisions, it increased the likelihood of that outcome (CEDEFOP, 2020a).

The Dutch system is decentralised and there are ongoing political discussions about the future of CIAG which focus on lifelong learning. It appears that schools are still at the start of implementing career guidance, or at least formulating their related agendas (Arbeitleidingen Consult, 2020).

3.2.7 Ontario

The main change to Ontario's CIAG policy in recent times was the introduction of the Creating Pathways to Success programme, in 2014. Through the programme, students plan for their post-secondary destinations and gain the confidence to implement or adapt their plan throughout their lives (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2013).

The All About Me portfolio and Individual Pathway Plans are tools which provide a structure for pupils' career development activities and an online space where resources and reflections can be saved. It builds on existing capacity for careers guidance in schools, including qualified guidance counsellors and departments within schools, as well as the mandatory careers module undertaken in grade 10 (age 15 years-old).

Some amendments were made to the policy in 2017, whereby some of the requirements were changed from mandatory to optional, to allow further autonomy and flexibility for

educators at the elementary level (kindergarten to grade 6, ages 4 to 11 years-old) to exercise their own professional judgement on how best to work with students (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2017).

Research conducted by People for Education (2019) showed variation, hinting at inconsistency in delivery, in the implementation of the specifics of the Creating Pathways to Success policy:

- 57% of secondary schools reported that all their students had Individual Pathway Plans
- 34% of schools reported that they had career and life planning advisory committees
- only 23% of elementary schools reported that they had guidance counsellors.

Beyond school, in 2019, the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities announced that a new service model would be introduced for Ontario's employment services, over the following 3 years. The new model integrates social assistance employment services, as well as other government employment services, into Employment Ontario, aiming to be more responsive to the needs of job seekers, businesses, and local communities. These changes are due to start with 3 prototype areas (Government of Ontario, 2020).

While the policy for CIAG in Ontario is universal, there are some key groups that services particularly aim to support – in particular, young people, people with additional support needs, and those who have been made redundant in key sectors.

3.2.8 Singapore

CIAG policy in Singapore is driven through the SkillsFuture vision, introduced in 2015 and implemented from 2016. It aims to provide Singaporeans with opportunities to develop to their fullest potential, regardless of their starting point, and to drive Singapore further in its journey of being an advanced economy and inclusive society.

Traditionally, much employment in Singapore was based on family and community networks. However, following independence in 1965, employment and careers development became more focussed on the individual and their skills and interests. Globalisation and technological advancement have required Singaporean workers to attain mastery of skills in the competitive economy (Sing Chee Wong, 2016).

Overall, the SkillsFuture policy (Singapore Ministry of Education, 2020) aims to:

- engender a shift in societal culture towards lifelong learning

- provide greater support for individuals to initiate and take ownership of their learning
- strengthen Institutes of Higher Learning as the third pillar of the Continuing Education and Training ecosystem which complements employers and private training providers.

The SkillsFuture policy is seen as crucial to the development and success of the economy in Singapore, particularly in times of crisis and it will play a key role in recovery following the Covid-19 pandemic (Ong Ye Kung, 2020).

Further support is being built into the SkillsFuture programme from 2020 through 'The Next Bound of SkillsFuture', which will:

- provide additional support to enable individuals to continue learning through a \$500 SkillsFuture Credit top-up, for the over 25s
- enhance the role of enterprises in developing their workforce
- have a special focus for mid-career workers through a new SkillsFuture Mid-Career Support Package, for people in their 40s and 50s to help them stay employable and move to new jobs or new roles. It will increase capacity for placements, provide higher incentives for employers hiring over 40s through re-skilling programmes, and develop a network of volunteer career advisors from professional communities to provide peer-level support.

Additional initiatives have also been introduced more recently to accelerate the transformation of Singapore's Training and Adult Education sector to ensure it strengthens links with, and meets the needs of, employers. This includes the sector growing via digital transformation to support companies and people with their upskilling and reskilling needs, as well as strengthening workplace training via the establishment of National Centres of Excellence in Workplace Learning (SkillsFuture, 2020).

A new National Jobs Council was also established in June 2020 as part of a \$2 billion jobs and training package that will create close to 100,000 opportunities for workers affected by the Covid-19 economic slowdown (Seow, 2020). Since its formation, the National Jobs Council has set up 8 Jobs and Skills Centres. They are staffed with careers counsellors who will help Singaporeans access jobs and traineeship opportunities. It is expected that, by the end of 2020, there will be centres in 24 towns.

Other SkillsFuture support will also be expanded as part of this package, including career conversion programmes.

3.3 Delivering CIAG: who?

In this section, we look at the main bodies responsible for the delivery of CIAG for all the countries reviewed. Delivery seems to be largely shared between schools and an organisation that oversees or delivers guidance (for schools and adults). At the school level, what appears to be driving the approach is a balance between professionally delivered services and integration into school activities, and there appears to be different ways to strike that balance.

In Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland, the services delivered at schools are determined by partnership agreements (or service level agreements), between each school and the national careers service (Careers Wales, Skills Development Scotland, and the Northern Ireland Careers Service, respectively). The delivery of careers advice and guidance in schools is shared between the school teaching staff and professionally trained careers advisors, who are employed by each country's national careers service.

For example, Careers Wales provides the following support to schools:

- Careers Wales Mark – an award designed by Careers Wales to recognise a commitment to continuous quality improvement within an educational institution; it aims to meet the Welsh Government's requirements set out in the 'Careers and the World of Work: a framework for 11–19-year-olds in Wales'
- training and consultancy support to teachers in implementing on the Careers and World of Work Framework
- piloting the Gatsby benchmarks
- production of appropriate careers-related resources for teachers
- delivering the Certificate in Careers Leadership to a cohort of teachers.

The Republic of Ireland operates a different model of CIAG provision in schools. Careers guidance is carried out by guidance counsellors who work in schools but are employed by the National Centre for Guidance in Education. Guidance counsellors are qualified teachers who must possess a recognised post-graduate qualification in counselling. While the guidance counsellor takes the lead role in the provision of guidance services, all school teaching staff are expected to support the delivery of guidance to all students. This is known as a 'whole-school approach'. Although this has been advocated by the Department of Education and Skills since 2005, the shift was accelerated in 2012 when budget cuts meant a contraction of the time available to guidance counsellors to undertake one-to-one guidance counselling with students.

Although subsequent research has emphasised the continued importance of one-to-one appointments with guidance counsellors, numerous reports published in the Republic of Ireland since the budget cuts of 2012 have indicated reductions in direct contact between students and counsellors in favour of indirect, classroom-based approaches. A survey of 145 principals, conducted in 2013, by the Association of Secondary Teachers of Ireland, on the impact of austerity measures on schools in the Republic of Ireland, found that 70% of school principals had reduced hours allocated to one-to-one counselling, in response to the removal of the ex-quota guidance posts.

These and other findings were corroborated by a case report carried out by the University of Limerick and Dublin City University, between November 2014 and May 2016, into the impact of the whole-school approach on guidance counselling in a single Irish voluntary post-primary school. The main finding of this case study showed that increasing workloads for guidance counsellors meant that students were finding it increasingly difficult to access one-to-one appointments (Hearne et al., 2016).

In continuing with the whole-school approach, the National Centre for Guidance in Education produced, in 2017, 'A Whole-School Guidance Framework' to support schools to plan, design and deliver the whole school guidance programme. The framework presented a continuum of support model:

- guidance for all
- guidance for some
- guidance for a few.

It also identified 3 areas of learning:

- learning relating to oneself (personal and social development)
- educational opportunities
- career decision-making (career development).

In Germany, the provision of CIAG is federalised, so it follows the German education system's structure of federal, state, and municipal levels. But interestingly, there are 3 sources of information delivery to schools: the Federal Employment Agency, regional chambers of commerce and trade unions.

The Federal Employment Agency provides educational materials on careers guidance to schools, tailored to school years. This includes resources for school lessons, guidance materials (for instance, how to liaise with parents) and related checklists to support teachers and other education professionals. The Federal Employment Agency operates a dedicated web portal ('Check U'), through which students may navigate to different professions or undertake a self-assessment, either in the classroom or at home.

These activities are complemented by careers guidance, offered by the regional chambers of commerce's resident careers guidance professionals. The chambers of commerce offer a variety of services, such as face-to-face careers guidance or events for parents. In addition, the chambers of commerce initiatives target schools and pupils, with a current total of 250 projects. Provision of careers guidance may vary across the regional chambers of commerce but, in general, tends to be focused on vocational occupations, apprenticeships and degree apprenticeships.

Similarly, the German trade unions provide careers guidance to schools and pupils. Aside from information on vocational professions, the trade unions also offer information on higher education and degree apprenticeships and employee rights in the workplace.

In the Netherlands, while careers guidance and counselling is technically overseen by the Dutch Ministry of Education, Culture and Science, individual schools usually set the goals for the provision of CIAG for students. As such, it is the legal responsibility of schools to develop in-house capacities for CIAG and ensure its provision. Careers development is part of the examination and certification. Careers advisors may have bachelor's degree-level education in Human Resources or Applied Psychology and can progress to master's degrees in Careers Management. In addition, there are numerous continuous professional development opportunities available.

Dutch schools are also supported by several organisations, including the Expertise Centre Careers Guidance and Education which provides information and tools. National guidance is complemented by regionally based advisors to support schools and the Cooperation Organisation for Vocational Education, Training, and the Labour Market, which accredits and supervises work placement activities, amongst other things.

A 2016/17 evaluation focused on the development of CIAG in the Netherlands noted its increase and foothold in a prominent place in education policy. However, it recommended more work be done to increase its visibility even further by institutions (CEDEFOP, 2020a).

In Ontario, schools are responsible via careers studies for delivery to pupils and Employment Ontario delivers CIAG for adults. Employment Ontario is managed by the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities Employment Training Division, and delivered by a network of approximately 400, mostly not-for-profit, service providers, at about 740 service delivery sites (Office of the Auditor General Ontario, 2016). Available documentation does not indicate whether the advisors would be required to have minimum level careers-qualifications. However, programme guidelines indicate service providers must demonstrate evidence of quality within their organisation, the Employment Service they provide and their clients' outcomes.

In Singapore, the SkillsFuture Division helps to drive SkillsFuture by undertaking planning and policy work for SkillsFuture initiatives. CIAG is delivered through the SkillsFuture policy, designed with both students and adults in mind. CIAG comprises one element within this system and aims to offer holistic and experiential support to provide people with the necessary knowledge, skills, and values to make informed education and career decisions. Teachers are equipped with basic CIAG knowledge to provide support to students and increasing numbers of careers counsellors have been employed across government-funded schools to provide individual counselling or group guidance (Singapore Ministry of Education, 2019).

Careers counsellors also communicate with parents, staff, and industry partners to get them engaged in students' decision-making processes. Careers fairs are organised in collaboration with industry partners and post-secondary education institutions to bring the world of work to students and teachers (Singapore Ministry of Education, 2017). The SkillsFuture Division also formulates, reviews, and implements policies to support continual and lifelong learning and works with universities, polytechnics, and the Institute of Technical Education to develop multiple pathways for skills development.

3.4 Delivering CIAG: what?

In this section, we look at the content of CIAG at school and beyond post-compulsory education.

3.4.1 CIAG at school

In Wales and Northern Ireland, careers education is a statutory part of the curriculum at post-primary level only. In Wales, the Careers and World of Work framework is taught to pupils at Key Stages 3 and 4, aged 11 to 16 years-old.

While careers guidance is not a curricular subject in the Republic of Ireland, careers guidance is mandatory in the post-primary school years and is aimed at students aged from 12 to 18 years-old. It encompasses Levels 3 to 5 on the National Framework of Qualifications.

In Scotland, careers education is embedded into the curriculum at primary school level. Singapore starts careers guidance in primary schools through a mandatory policy approach. Ontario operates a holistic approach, which is embedded in the curriculum.

This brief synopsis tells us that there are a number of approaches to CIAG at the school level, in addition to who delivers the guidance, as described in the earlier section. In this section, we continue by providing examples from some of the countries to illustrate what they do with regard to those key variables: primary provision; embedding careers in the curriculum; segmentation of intervention by age, and employer engagement.

Provision for primary school pupils

It is useful to reflect on provision for primary school pupils, as we have seen the OECD study earlier (Musset and Kureková, 2018) which recommended starting early when children are developing their self-image. Only Scotland, Singapore and Ontario have statutory provision for primary schools.

In 2015, the Scottish Government published the 'Career Education Standard (3-18)' which recognised that careers education and advice must begin in the early, primary school years and must be embedded throughout the curriculum, for all age groups. The standard lays down several entitlements which all children and young people should expect of their careers education, provided through the curriculum.

For students in compulsory formal education in Singapore (ages 6 to 15 years-old), the CIAG curriculum covers primary to pre-university levels and is supported through the MySkillsFuture online portal. Further detail is provided under the 'segmenting provision by age' section.

Ontario's guidance activities for primary school children is discussed in the next section 'careers in the curriculum'.

While careers education in Wales focuses on the post-primary years, Careers Wales is in the process of developing careers services for primary school children, which will see their careers and work-related experiences course expanded to cover children aged 3 to 16 years-old. They are working with Skills Development Scotland to identify an appropriate model (Careers Wales, 2019).

In Northern Ireland, there is some non-statutory provision for primary schools. In the primary curriculum, pupils learn about the world of work and career pathways through compulsory courses, such as Areas of Learning, The World Around Us and Personal Development and Mutual Understanding (CEDEFOP, 2020d).

Careers in the curriculum

In Chapter 2, we reported that most evidence pointed to career learning being more effective when taught as a specific subject. In this section, we will explore how some of the nations that we reviewed have embedded careers in the curriculum.

As reported in Chapter 2, careers in the curriculum may comprise:

- providing career learning as a subject in its own right
- incorporating career learning within other subjects

- organising career learning through co-curricular activities (i.e., enrichment activities strongly connected to the formal curriculum) (Collins and Barnes, 2017).

In Germany, CIAG is an element of the curricula of the German states and is considered a cross-cutting responsibility. It is mandatory for schools to provide and arrange careers guidance as part of the curriculum. Whilst this may vary across the German states, in terms of school year, age groups and school type, this is most often done in the classroom and provided as specific lessons, in taught subjects.

Ontario's approach to careers in the curriculum at different ages is described below whereby CIAG provision for children and young people in school is delivered in 4 ways:

- activities are undertaken as part of the Career Pathways to Success education and career/life programme; the programme involves an ongoing 4-step inquiry process that is built into school activities (both related to the curriculum and school-wide activities, such as careers fairs and post-secondary presentations) and underpinned through portfolio building from kindergarten to grade 12 (ages 4 to 17 years-old)
- support is available from teachers and guidance counsellors; each school has a guidance department and guidance counsellors are all trained teachers first and foremost with additional qualifications in career education and counselling (Gatsby Foundation, 2014)
- pupils can take part in a mandatory half-credit module in careers studies in grade 10 (age 15 years-old); the course aims to consolidate activities undertaken in Career Pathways to Success by developing skills strategies and habits needed to succeed, exploring, and preparing for the world of work, and establishing planning and financial management to help meet post-secondary goals (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2019)
- pupil engagement in other vocational experiential and community programmes; this includes various forms of experiential learning and programmes, such as the cooperative education (work experience), dual credit, Specialist High Skills Major, Ontario Youth Apprenticeship, and school-work transition programmes.

Segmenting provision by age

All nations provide different services to young people of different ages – again this was a recommendation of the OECD report that was cited in Chapter 2 (Musset and Kureková, 2018) - and is illustrated here in the examples of Wales and Singapore.

Age segmented provision in Wales

Careers Wales provides the following services to pupils in Key Stage 3:

- a job matching quiz – introduced to all pupils by their careers advisor
- one-to-one support for those identified in need of CIAG
- web chat (currently being trialled)
- campaigns which focus on growth sectors
- pupils with additional learning needs receive a booklet to help them start identifying interests; they are prioritised for face-to-face interaction and benefit from a year 9 transitional planning review by their careers advisor.

At Key Stage 4, a Careers Check is the first, diagnostic stage of the Career Discovery Model. Careers Wales (2019) stated in their business plan that this has allowed them to develop a holistic approach to delivery in secondary schools, through the account executive role and blended delivery of service.

The 3 steps are:

- diagnosis – an accurate diagnosis of need
- discovery – a range of activities that help pupils discover the world of work
- delivery – an effective delivery of a blended service, incorporating face-to-face and digital means of delivery.

Whilst all pupils at Key Stage 4 are offered a group session on labour market demands and on options post-16 (to promote parity of esteem between vocational and academic routes), there is additional support available for those with a higher diagnosed level of need. For example, Altro-Evolve is a new programme of one-to-one coaching, mentoring, group sessions and employer experiences, for those unlikely to reach their full potential during Key Stage 4. Pupils educated at home or outside a school setting, or with additional learning needs, are also offered face-to-face support. Those likely to become NEET, or moving on to work-based learning, an apprenticeship, employment or self-employment, are connected to a Working Wales advisor within Careers Wales.

Careers Wales appear to have been successful in focusing their resource on disadvantaged individuals. A 2017 study (Davies and Yunus, 2017) found that pupils who were eligible for free school meals, had special educational needs, lower academic attainment, or high absenteeism, were more likely to get careers-related support in schools.

The segmented approach continues into post-education. This is the case in all the nations reviewed.

Age segmented provision in Singapore

In Singapore, we can see that there are elements of provision in primary schools, how careers are taught in and through the curriculum and the use of ICT to support delivery, in addition to demonstrating segmentation at different ages.

Curriculum content in Singapore is differentiated based on age. From ages 8 to 12 years-old, the CIAG curriculum focuses on awareness, introducing students to a wide range of occupations. Through lessons and interactive activities, students learn to:

- understand their strengths, interests, and aspirations
- explore different occupations in the world of work
- plan their educational pathways and select secondary schools.

The curriculum is delivered during form teacher guidance periods, comprising 10 periods for the first two years of primary and 12 periods for the following two years.

From ages 12 to 18 years-old, the CIAG curriculum focuses on exploration. CIAG helps students understand themselves better and guides their exploration of different education and career pathways. Students learn to:

- be more aware of their skills, interests, and abilities
- manage relationships with people who have influence over their decisions
- explore relevant courses of study
- understand careers in different sectors.

The curriculum is delivered as part of the Character and Citizenship Education syllabus in which students receive at least 4 hours of CIAG lessons each year.

At junior colleges and similar institutions for those aged 16 to 19 years-old, the CIAG curriculum focuses on career planning. CIAG supports students in synthesising information, gathered from relevant sources, to make sound education and career decisions.

Students learn to:

- clarify their career identity
- develop skills in gathering information
- develop decision-making skills

- understand more about working in the globalised, ever-changing world of work.

The curriculum is delivered as part of the Character and Citizenship Education syllabus and students receive at least 9 hours of CIAG lessons, over 2 or 3 years.

For all ages, the curriculum content is underpinned by use of MySkillsFuture, an online portal, designed to support students from age 10 years-old to pre-university through the curriculum and more widely through structured classroom learning, as a tool for education and careers exploration and planning. Parents are encouraged to take part in the process and navigate the MySkillsFuture with their child, using it as an opportunity to discuss their child's aspirations, interests, and plans.

Engaging employers in careers advice

Section 2.5 discussed employer engagement in schools, which is often cited as vital to supporting effective careers decision-making, by enabling young people to learn about the world of work directly. The role played by employers varies across CIAG systems. In this section, we look at specific examples from Germany, Scotland, and Wales.

We have reported how the chambers of commerce are engaged in the delivery of careers guidance in Germany, where work placements also form a central element of CIAG. The Federal Employment Agency cooperates with employers and schools, listing current vacancies and providing matching services. Germany's CIAG system features a variety of initiatives which aim to establish closer links between schools, students, and employers.

In addition, local branches of the Federal Employment Agency cooperate with employers and professional bodies to organise work placements and internships for school years 9 and 10 (ages 14 to 15 years-old). This extends to post-compulsory education, as we will see in section 3.3.2.

Scotland is currently establishing a series of school-employer partnerships, through the government's Developing the Young Workforce Programme.

In 2015, Education Scotland published Guidance on School Employer Partnerships, which made clear the government's aim to establish meaningful and productive school and employer partnerships in all secondary schools, by 2018/19. The Developing the Young Workforce Programme is currently seeking to establish these collaborative partnerships between employers and education, through a national network of 21 industry-led regional groups covering the whole of Scotland.

The purpose of these partnerships is to get employers involved in designing the curriculum, so that all young people in schools become better equipped with the skills, knowledge, and experience that they need to succeed in the world of work. Employers

involved in partnerships engage via numerous activities, including workshops, talks, workplace visits or placements.

The fourth progress report of Developing the Young Workforce Programme attributed a number of positive outcomes, such as an increase of employers offering work experience placements, to these school-employer partnerships (Scottish Government, 2018).

According to the Scottish government's 2020 Careers Strategy, there are plans to do more 'employer engagement co-ordinated activities, with partners in primary and secondary education, vocational education and training providers, further and higher education institutions'.

Like Developing the Young Workforce Programme in Scotland, Business Class in Wales is a programme, run by Careers Wales, which aims to bring about mutually beneficial partnerships between schools and employers. The programme seeks to build a talent pipeline for local businesses by improving young peoples' understanding of the working world and developing employability skills.

Careers Wales also maintains the Education Business Exchange database. This enables schools and young people to see the opportunities available to them from employers and facilitates interchange between schools and business. It identifies what activities businesses are willing and able to support, including curriculum-focused visits; work or business simulation workshops, in place or online; work-related volunteering; industry fairs; and extended work placements for identified learners. Whilst this type of tool is useful and was a recommendation of the OECD report cited in Chapter 2 (Musset and Kureková, 2018), we have also seen that there is evidence its usage is declining, as Careers Wales are no longer required to maintain it.

Northern Ireland has launched [Connect to Success NI](#); a web portal which allows users to search for a range of work experience options and apprenticeships.

3.4.2 CIAG after compulsory education

Careers guidance services for post-compulsory education focuses on employment and preventing or supporting people out of unemployment. Careers guidance becomes embedded as part of training or employment programmes and is less visible as a distinct activity, as it is at school.

Careers guidance organisations continue to play a pivotal role, however, except in higher education where institutions are fairly independent in their approach.

In this section, we consider these two elements of post-compulsory CIAG: higher education and other post-compulsory education, using specific examples.

Higher Education CIAG

Careers guidance in higher education in the Netherlands is not controlled by law, but it is regulated and supervised by the Accreditation Organisation of the Netherlands and Flanders. Most higher education institutions have careers centres and centralised services and events, as well as entrepreneurship centres and virtual business games (CEDEFOP, 2020a).

Unlike the CIAG system for German secondary education, the CIAG services provided in German higher education institutions usually feature resident careers guidance professionals, for instance at a university faculty or a dedicated careers centre. University careers centres were introduced in the early 1990s. The association of German universities confirmed, in 2011, that careers services should act as interfaces between universities and employers and that they are an indispensable service. The Federal Employment Agency coordinates its services with the university careers centres. Additionally, the individual university careers centres have been integrated as voluntary members of the Careers Services Network Germany to co-ordinate research and to schedule development activities (CEDEFOP, 2020b).

In Singapore, careers centres are available at all polytechnics and Institutes of Technical Education. All students at these institutions undergo 40 to 60 hours in total of the CIAG curriculum, guided by their lecturers and careers counsellors. Students are also exposed to careers options, through learning visits to companies, workshops with industry representatives and alumni, careers fairs, and internships (Singapore Ministry of Education, 2018).

Careers centres in publicly funded universities are less well-defined and not curriculum-based (unless specified by the individual university). Typically, students have access to careers counsellors and preparation programmes. Institutes of Technical Education, polytechnics, and university students also use the MySkillsFuture portal independently, supported by school and guidance counsellors for careers planning, building resilience and lifelong learning.

Other post-compulsory education CIAG

Largely the same organisations are involved in post-compulsory education CIAG as are involved at school – the same expert bodies oversee or implement CIAG. In Ontario, this passes from schools to Employment Ontario, which provides services to young people and students, including arranging summer jobs and career exploration activities.

Both Scotland and Wales operate a databased system, which tracks the outcomes and destinations of school leavers and enables a targeted approach to those who are, or at risk of, becoming NEET. In Wales, this is known as the Youth Engagement and Progression Framework (YEPF). Careers Wales hosts data which categorises young

people who have left school, up to the age of 18 years-old, ranging from Tier 5 (successfully and positively engaged in employment, education, or training) to Tier 1 (unknown whereabouts). This data is given to local authorities to support the YEPF.

Careers Wales supports Tier 3 (NEET, but actively seeking support from Careers Wales) via Working Wales advisors, through careers centres, outreach locations and access via Jobcentre Plus and libraries. Youth Services and Engagement and Progression Co-ordinators in local authorities support Tiers 4 and 5.

A 2015 evaluation of the YEPF (Welsh Government, 2015) reported that each local authority received £50k per year, for two years initially, from the Welsh government, to deliver YEPF. There are discussions to extend this framework to 18- to 25-year-olds.

Additionally, from May 2019, Careers Wales has had a lead assessment and delivery role, on behalf of Welsh Government, on the Employment Advice Gateway called Working Wales. This is aimed at young people and adults in need of additional careers and employment support. Replacing earlier programmes, such as Re-Act (Redundancy Action, a programme which had been run by the Welsh government up to 2014 and provided training and support to workers impacted by redundancy) has led to the recruitment of more careers advisors and has a contract value of up to £9.18m (Welsh Government, 2019).

This service includes:

- visibility of provision at over 100 permanent careers centres and co-locations (for example, Jobcentre Plus offices and community hubs)
- online (Skills Gateway) and phone support
- face-to-face and group support
- rapid response support for employers and staff at threat of redundancy, at employer premises.

Skills Development Scotland hosts the age 16+ Data Hub, which provides a single source of information on the participation status of young people in Scotland. This data is used to support those young people who are classed as NEET. Skills Development Scotland provides extensive CIAG services to unemployed young people aged from 15 to 18 and a half years-old, through its Next Steps programme. Those eligible to access Next Steps include young people who are unemployed and seeking work (CEDEFOP, 2020e).

Scotland has support for people who have been made redundant or are at risk of redundancy. Partnership Action for Continuing Employment (PACE) is delivered by Skills Development Scotland, working with partners including local authorities, Department for

Work and Pensions (through Jobcentre Plus and Citizens Advice), colleges and training providers.

Since 2010, Scottish government and Skills Development Scotland have commissioned a biennial survey of PACE service users to evaluate the effectiveness of the initiative. In 2018, the evaluators reported success potentially attributable to PACE which was that 80% of respondents using the services in the previous 2 years had found new work, up from 71% reported in the 2016 survey (IFF Research, 2018).

The Next Steps service provides one-to-one support from post-school teams, based in careers centres and outreach delivery locations. The service offer is tailored to meet the needs and learning-style of each individual and combines a range of engagements, including needs-assessments, individual coaching guidance and group sessions (Skills Development Scotland, 2018).

According to Skills Development Scotland (2018), 64% of Next Steps customers progressed to learning, training or work, and 58% progressed to learning, training or work which was sustained for six months. Overall, 95% of customers were reportedly satisfied with the Next Steps service.

In October 2018, the Irish government set up the Youth Employment Support Scheme to support long-term unemployed young people into work. It is aimed at those aged 18 to 24 years-old who are unemployed and have been in receipt of a qualifying social welfare payment for at least 12 months.

The Youthreach programme is a broad programme that provides educational, training, and personal development opportunities to unemployed people aged 15 to 20 years-old who left school early or without formal qualifications. It also offers careers guidance counselling to learners. Guidance typically involves advice on preparing CVs, group or one-to-one meetings, and the organisation of work placements. Of particular importance in administering careers guidance is the guidance advocate, who works directly with young learners and helps with learners' progression into education or employment (Economic and Social Research Institute, 2019).

In keeping with the tripartite approach in Germany, German employers, through chambers of commerce, deliver projects for young people in post-compulsory education.

Singapore similarly brings together employers, trade unions and government in post-compulsory CIAG via SkillsFuture. Adults at different stages in their careers (including new workforce entrants, mid-career switchers, or individuals in career transition) can benefit from career coaching and training advisory services, tailored to their needs. This is offered through 7 centres across Singapore and delivered by professionally certified career coaches through Workforce Singapore's Careers Connect, as well as the National

Trades Union Congress's Employment and Employability Institute. Adults can also access and use the MySkillsFuture portal.

SkillsFuture also encourages the development of Sectoral Manpower Plans which aim to identify the future skills, development and careers progression pathways, and initiatives needed to prepare core groups of Singaporeans for the future.

Employment Ontario is the government-backed support service for adults and young people in the labour market, looking to get training, develop skills or find employment. It was established in 2007 and brought together existing employment and training services from federal and provincial governments (Government of Ontario, 2016). The service supports approximately one million people annually (Government of Ontario, 2019).

The service offers a wide range of support and programmes that fall into 4 broad categories, including:

- employment and training – offering programmes and services that provide support to people seeking employment, and incentives and grants for employers
- apprenticeships – programmes and services that ensure workers receive the required combination of workplace and classroom training to become certified and employed in a skilled trade
- foundational skills – programmes and services comprising literacy and numeracy skills needed for employment; also, bursaries for internationally-trained professionals, completing programmes at colleges and universities, to learn Canadian standards applicable to their profession
- labour market – programmes and services that provide planning and capacity-building for employment and training at the community level; also, local employment services following large-scale layoffs.

Other key Employment Ontario CIAG initiatives provide targeted support to particular groups. There are over 20 specific programmes which are subject to change based on need. This includes the Second Career policy, which provides significant support to individuals who are unemployed, or made redundant, to retrain for high-demand jobs; the government of Ontario is able to use this programme flexibly to support sectors in most need. For example, in order to recently support the manufacturing industry, it was agreed that laid-off manufacturing workers would no longer be required to search for a job for 26 weeks before qualifying for Second Career, and that they could apply regardless of how long they had been working in the manufacturing or auto industry (Government of Ontario, 2019).

3.5 Funding

The range of activities and partners in the delivery of CIAG makes it very difficult to compare funding of CIAG systems in any meaningful way. It is sometimes possible to identify core careers funding, but so much delivery takes place within schools that it is not possible to discern CIAG expenditure in the information we have been able to gather.

3.5.1 Northern Ireland

The Department for Economy receives funding from the Northern Ireland Assembly to provide the national, all-age careers service. In the year 2019/20, the Department for Economy allocated £5.8m to careers advice services. A further £34.5m was spent on youth training (Department for the Economy, 2019).

3.5.2 Scotland

Skills Development Scotland receives a budget allocation directly from Scottish Government, as part of the Skills and Training Budget. For the year 2020/21, the budget for Skills Development Scotland was £224.8m, but it is not possible to identify specific expenditure on CIAG from published documents.

3.5.3 Wales

Careers Wales had a total income of £31 million in the year 2019/20. Most of this (£18 million) derived from a core contract with Welsh government, while the remainder was provided through project-based funding (Careers Wales, 2019). An additional £12m was allocated to Careers Wales in December 2019, following the November 2019 budget. Expenditure by schools is unknown.

Between 2019 and 2020, Careers Wales received funding of £144k with which they established more than 80 partnerships with employers.

3.5.4 Republic of Ireland

The Department for Education and Skills (DES) provides funding directly to the National Centre for Guidance in Education, for the provision of guidance services in post-primary education. DES provides funding to support the guidance counsellor at the school/college, based on the DES teacher allocation at that school/college. The DES issues annual circulars to schools and colleges, detailing the teacher allocation for the following year.

The Republic of Ireland's Further Education and Skills Service provides a grant to the National Centre for Guidance in Education to support the development of Further

Education and Training-based guidance. Funding from this source also supports the Adult Educational Guidance services (CEDEFOP, 2020c).

3.5.5 Germany

The funding for careers guidance in Germany is based on different sources, with several ministries at federal and regional levels providing funding. It is therefore not possible to provide a single figure.

Guidance initiatives provided by the chambers of commerce or trade unions are usually financed by membership fees. Further financing sources are federal ministry budgets, drawn from taxes, especially for the programmes Education Chains, Career Orientation Programme, Job Entry Support Programme, Vocational Choice Passport and Typically Me. Until 2020, these programmes will have benefited from co-financing by the European Social Fund (ESF). There is a clear intent to continue these programmes into the mid-2020s and possibly beyond. Negotiations are being held between the German federal and state authorities about the division of contributions once ESF funding ends (Federal Ministry for Education and Research, 2020).

3.5.6 Netherlands

Between 2014 and 2017, the Dutch Government financed the Regional Investment Fund on secondary vocational education, which included CIAG and had a volume of €100m. In addition, the Dutch government is developing new funding instruments to promote CIAG and lifelong learning (CEDEFOP, 2020a). However, in essence, when careers guidance is implemented in schools, there is no dedicated means of indicating the costs of such activities.

The public employment division of the Employee Insurance Agency is also commissioned by, and receives a budget from, the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment. As of 2020, the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment subsidises initiatives aimed at stimulating learning and development in small- or medium-sized enterprises and in large companies in the agriculture, catering, and recreation sector. Initiatives range from research, education, and training needs in a company to the development of careers advice for company employees.

3.5.7 Ontario

CIAG in schools in Ontario is funded by the Ontario provincial government and funding is then controlled by the school board. The principals' decisions, and the way they choose to implement the curriculum and allocate funding, are monitored by the board superintendents of education (Gatsby Foundation, 2014).

For those supported by Employment Ontario, the funding varies. Overall, the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities Employment Training Division is responsible for funding the programmes.

The Ministry funds third-party employment service providers for operating costs, employer incentives for hiring programme participants, and client support to reduce barriers to employment (such as providing bus fares and suitable clothing for job interviews). Funding is determined for each site by considering the target number of clients, local employment and demographic conditions, and the relative costs of doing business in that community. In the year 2015/16, the average funding per site per client (excluding those doing non-assisted research and job searching) was \$1,828 and ranged from \$387 to \$5,162.

Other programmes are funded on a need and demand basis. For example, for the Second Career programme, the Ministry determines the amount of funding to provide to the client by assessing their financial needs. Approved clients then enter into a contract with the Ministry and receive funding, which needs to be re-paid if the client does not complete their training or attend regularly. In 2014/15, the median amount of funding received by an individual totalled \$14,000 (Office of the Auditor General Ontario, 2016). This system has received criticism for not recouping overpayments where individuals have not attended or provided adequate receipts.

3.5.8 Singapore

In Singapore, it was estimated in 2015 that the implementation of the full package of measures under SkillsFuture would cost an average of over \$1 billion per year, until 2020. Over the next 5 years, it is expected that the government will spend about \$1.4 billion on the next phase of SkillsFuture.

Funding for SkillsFuture in Singapore combines supply-side and demand-led. For example, the development and delivery of programmes and curriculum materials is supply-funded (with the funding going directly to providers), while specific packages of support (such as through the Adapt and Grow initiative) are demand-led and dependent on levels of interest and take-up.

3.6 Conclusions

3.6.1 Commonalities

There are clearly commonalities to the approaches utilised in the 3 devolved nations of the UK. All 3 nations have embedded their CIAG visions and goals into published

strategies. Various evaluations or studies, as discussed above, have been undertaken and examined for areas of improvement.

Each of the 3 devolved nations have similar structures and frameworks, with interventions aimed specifically at school pupils, school leavers and adult workers. In schools, provision of careers education and advice is carried out jointly by teaching staff and external (though school-based) careers advisors. Teachers deliver careers education – a statutory part of the curriculum – while careers advisors support this provision by providing impartial guidance to pupils. All 3 nations also have initiatives aimed specifically at young people leaving school or college, designed to ease transitions from education into employment. They also have CIAG services oriented towards adult workers in need of upskilling and retraining. Services for young people and adults are typically delivered in the community through careers advice centres and co-locations, such as Jobcentre Plus offices and community hubs, as well as increasingly through online resources.

In contrast, the model for Germany reflects the country's federal approach of top-down policy, but contributions are expected from institutions such as chambers of commerce and trade unions, with delivery left to each state to optimise. This is largely similar to Ontario, without the additional sources of information delivery, and also similar to the Netherlands, where delivery is left to schools. In Germany, the main feature is the federal employment of full-time careers advisors.

Other commonalities are the programmes centred around the individual thinking about their needs, as in Ontario, Singapore and, to some extent, Germany.

3.6.2 Interesting or unique features

Some features of the Ontario system which stand out are:

- embedded clear processes and a framework of questions for regular review throughout education ensures consistency and familiarity with the process; it also encourages the development of the habit to return to the Individual Personal Plan
- one portal to use from education through to adulthood ensures a strong portfolio of information and evidence can be built up
- flexibility in specific programme and delivery allows providers to respond quickly to local need and crisis, where appropriate.

Similarly, in Singapore's CIAG system:

- offers an end-to-end programme, including offering support to those who are in-work; this means that there is no obvious place where an individual would 'drop-out' of the system until they have achieved their career goals
- significant investment and support for the programme from the Singapore government, with the creation of the easily recognisable SkillsFuture brand
- emphasis placed on recruiting and training specialist careers counsellors who are available in all schools and provider institutions; this ensures clear responsibility for specific elements of delivery.

Chapter 4: Recent evidence of effective career interventions

Summary

Since 2016, a number of robust research reports have been published on careers advice, including causal and longitudinal evidence, as well as other, robust research that does not fall into either category. The evidence ranges from small-scale, shorter-term programmes, to an extensive quantitative evaluation of a national careers service. Overall, most careers (and related) interventions have been shown to have some degree of success, but arguably that success is focussed on shorter-term outcomes. Notably, shorter-term impacts have proven likelier where time and resource has been devoted to an intervention. There is less evidence of enhancements/changes to employment trajectories, in part because this evidence does not exist or, where it does, it has not demonstrated these longer-term impacts. This might reflect the complexity of influences on choices and/or the complexity of evaluating such programmes over the longer-term.

4.1 Introduction

In this chapter, we present research and evaluation published since Hughes' (2016) report. Eight of the sources are causal evidence from policy evaluations. They all used, or attempted, some form of experimental approach in the evaluation. Five are longitudinal studies which measured various impacts of careers interventions, and a further study was a large-scale survey in this policy area.

Following discussion with the department, it was decided to include all 14 of these sources. The relative strength of the different sources have been given due consideration in drawing together conclusions. This chapter discusses findings based on target group.

4.2 Recent evidence on interventions in school

In this section, we consider evidence of interventions in schools, looking first at one aimed at primary school pupils (although not specifically a CIAG intervention, it aimed to raise aspirations). This is followed by 7 studies which explored the impact of careers activities at secondary school on a range of attitudinal and educational outcomes.

4.2.1 Primary age intervention

The Children's University in England aims to improve the aspirations and attainment of pupils aged 5 to 14 years-old by providing learning activities (such as after-school clubs, visits to universities and museums) and social action opportunities (such as volunteering

in the community) outside school hours. It exposes young people to higher education or other opportunities that they might not usually experience, and thus is part of an approach to raise aspirations and awareness.

A trial by the Education Endowment Foundation (Gorard et al., 2017) in Lancashire, involving pupils in years 5 and 6, found positive effects of these enrichment activities on children's academic performance (attainment at Key Stage 2 Reading and Maths), and also non-cognitive outcomes (attitudinal outcomes, such as motivation, confidence and team working).

The similarity in the types of activity, a focus on disadvantaged pupils and the use of educational outcomes as indicators of success, combine to suggest that the Children's University could provide useful lessons for careers policy.

4.2.2 Secondary school interventions

In this section, we review 7 studies, 3 evaluations, one longitudinal study and 3 other studies which had sufficiently large samples to be included in this review.

The 3 evaluation studies measured the impact of careers counselling on a range of attitudinal, educational and careers outcomes.

Firstly, Cadaret and Hartung (2020) assessed the impact of a 3-week group-based career intervention, called My Careers Story, on a sample predominantly comprised of African American, Puerto Rican and Dominican students, within an urban high school in the United States (US). My Careers Story aimed to help individuals in constructing their career goals and identifying barriers to and ways of achieving those goals. In doing so, this evaluation found that students were better able to plan their jobs and make careers decisions. However, students were no more likely to be able to explore alternative employment options, or to be able to identify barriers in making career decisions. This suggests that the intervention helped achieve shorter-term career objectives but was less able to equip students to be resilient or responsive to change. Whether this was due to the content of My Careers Story, or the length of time allocated to it, is unclear.

Another US evaluation explored the nature and quality of school and careers counselling in relation to academic achievement (Lapan, Whitcomb and Aleman, 2018). The study found that the ratio of students to counsellors was an important factor in delivering fewer disciplinary incidents, suspension rates and improved attendance and graduation rates. Consequently, the report recommended keeping the ratio below that of 250:1 (the ratio that is typically recommended by the American School Counsellor Association).

In England, the University of Derby (Hanson and Clark, 2020) examined the impact of 10 sessions with a careers coach on pupils at risk of becoming NEET; this was part of the Future Frontiers programme in London. The study explored changes in career readiness

and in factors associated with successful transitions. The coaching significantly increased career readiness but was more mixed on those factors associated with longer-term successful transitions. As with My Careers Story (see Caderet and Hartung, 2020), this suggests that the intervention was better able to deliver shorter-term objectives.

Moving on to non-evaluation evidence, in Australia, Tomaszewski and colleagues (2017) used longitudinal data derived from the Longitudinal Survey of Australian Youth to examine the relationship between equity group membership (students from a low socioeconomic backgrounds; students from non-English-speaking backgrounds, and students from regional/remote areas of Australia) and school factors (including careers advice and school experiences) with students' likelihood of enrolling in higher education. The research sought to explore whether exposure to certain school factors, such as receiving careers advice, increased students' propensity to enrol at university.

The study found that school factors had a positive effect on the likelihood of university enrolment. Some forms of careers guidance had more positive effects on university enrolment than others. Talks by technical and further education specialists, university representatives and schools' careers advisors were associated with an increased likelihood of higher education enrolment. Conversely, talks by employers and group discussions about careers were associated with a reduced likelihood of enrolment.

The research also found that different forms of careers advice had positive effects for students from different equity groups. For young people from low socioeconomic backgrounds, positive student-teacher relations and talks by school careers advisors were found to increase the likelihood of university enrolment. For young people from regional/remote areas of Australia, positive student-teacher relations were again important, as were careers group discussions. Consequently, these findings emphasise the importance of personal discussions for pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds.

Two recent reports have made use of PISA's (2012) survey⁶ to examine the impact of careers activities on school perceptions/attitudes and on academic attainment.

In the first report, Kashefpakdel and Mann (2016) examined exposure to careers advice and its impact on how pupils felt about certain aspects of the usefulness of school. This was assessed through questionnaire statements, such as 'school helps you prepare for life'. The research found a strong, positive relationship between careers activities and perceived school utility. Speaking with a careers advisor at school was most closely associated with more positive attitudes, followed by participation in a job fair and participating in job shadowing or an internship.

⁶ PISA's (2012) survey included questions on teenage participation in career development activities and attitudes towards schooling. Australia, Belgium, Canada, Denmark, Finland, and Ireland included these questions.

Similarly, Kashefpakdel and Schleicher (2017) examined the impact of careers development activities on PISA mathematics test results. As with the usefulness of schooling, participation in careers activities was positively related to maths attainment. Again, careers advisors were most closely associated with high scores, followed by job fairs, job shadowing and internships.

Similar to the previous Australian longitudinal study (Tomaszewski et al., 2017), both of these reports using PISA's (2012) data emphasise the importance of careers advisors.

Finally, in this section, we draw on a survey of 13,000 year 11 students in England on student satisfaction with careers advice services in schools. Moote and Archer (2018) reported that there was strong student demand for 'more and better' careers education, concluding that some schools were failing to meet the statutory requirement to provide impartial careers advice to all students. The self-referral system was reported as contributing to inequitable distribution of careers advice to students, with male pupils more likely to report having received careers advice than female pupils; white pupils more likely to report having received careers advice than non-white pupils, and pupils from higher socioeconomic backgrounds more likely to report having received careers advice than pupils from lower socioeconomic backgrounds.

This report recommended more equitable means of offering careers support; specifically, targeted resource for schools and teachers to engage with and support pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds, and greater monitoring of participation (not just provision).

4.3 Recent evidence on interventions post-school

We found few recent robust evaluations of post-school CIAG interventions and the two evaluations described here varied in scale and method.

Firstly, in England, a substantial quantitative evaluation of the National Careers Service (NCS) was conducted, exploring educational and employment outcomes by aligning data from the NCS with education, benefits, and earnings data (Lane et al., 2017). The analysis identified a relatively strong and persistent effect for shorter-term outcomes of education and training, but no observable impact of the NCS on employment or benefit dependency outcomes. However, the crucial caveat to this longer-term finding is that unobservable differences were not controlled for between the NCS customer treatment group and non-customer comparison group despite use of propensity score matching.

A much smaller study in Canada tested the effects of an online self-help careers advice tool, the Self-Directed Search Form (SDS), on a group of 114 Canadian undergraduate students, who were at different levels of career readiness (Casey Dozier et al., 2019). The SDS was tested over a 3-week period and was found to be particularly effective in increasing career goal certainty amongst students with low prior career readiness. The

SDS was also found to have helped students from this category to make decisions about their occupational options, whilst increasing their satisfaction with their first occupational choice. Conversely, for those in the medium and high prior career readiness groups, the SDS had limited effects on their state of career readiness. This suggests that interventions of this kind could be best targeted at those with the greatest need.

4.4 Recent evidence on interventions aimed at parents

In this section, we examine two studies which sought to engage parents; one specifically in careers guidance and one in schooling more generally.

In a trial targeted at 150 schools across Merseyside and Cheshire, online and face-to-face careers guidance programmes were delivered to parents and children (Clark, 2019). Despite being launched in a Careers and Enterprise Company 'cold spot', the average annual household income of the parents/carers was £82,000 for the online cohort, and £62,000 for the face-to-face cohort. Annual household incomes for both groups were therefore much higher than the 2018 UK national average of £34,000, suggesting this programme did not attract its intended audience. Furthermore, attrition was high for both delivery formats. For the online cohort, no child-parent pairs attended all 8 modules, nor completed the programme; thus, no findings are available for this group. For face-to-face cohort, 29 child-parent pairs were present at the first workshop, but only 16 at the second. The report speculated on reasons for this (such as the time of day the workshop was held) but provided no concrete evidence on reasons for the high attrition rates.

Crucially, this trial's failure to reach its intended audience and the high rates of participant attrition likely points to more factors to avoid in designing future careers interventions, as opposed to factors to replicate. Unfortunately, the limited details provided in the report mean that it is difficult to identify or understand exactly what these factors to avoid are.

We reviewed another trial on parental engagement. This study evaluated a trial by the Education Endowment Foundation (2018) to inform parents about children's homework completion and progress via text messages. The trial reported some additional impact on maths results and reduced absenteeism, but no impact on English or Science. However, it is identified as a relatively cost-effective way of engaging parents and could be used for careers-focussed engagement by schools with the communication systems in place.

4.5 Recent evidence on teacher engagement in interventions

Two studies we reviewed considered how to effectively engage teachers in the delivery of careers education policies.

The first study drew on evidence from two surveys conducted in Hong Kong, exploring the implementation of the Life Planning Education policy in 2014 (Ho and Leung, 2016). The aim of this policy was to help students progress toward career pathways by setting personal goals, reflecting on those goals, and developing their self-understanding. The first survey asked teachers about the implementation and reported a positive reception to the rationale and principles of the policy. Respondents agreed that a person-centred, developmental approach was most important in careers guidance delivery. However, the survey also revealed barriers to the provision of high-quality careers guidance and Continuing Professional Development of careers teachers. Workload intensification and lack of support from school leaders were cited as problems. The second survey found some evidence of positive systematic change as a result of the new policy, as well as some limitations. Respondents reported greater resource allocated to life planning and careers guidance, but this had not helped reduce the workloads of careers teachers.

In 2012, Career Orientation and Guidance in Secondary Vocation Education (COG/SVE) was developed in the Netherlands to encourage vocational educational institutions to initiate strong careers learning environments for students. This included training teachers to have careers conversations, underpinned by a well-developed vision and policy on career guidance in their schools. In 2017, longitudinal research was conducted to assess the impact of the COG/SVE project (Draaisma et al., 2017). The results found evidence that teachers focused increasingly on promoting dialogue with their students and that there was increased clarity on their schools' careers vision. However, the research also showed that this vision was not shared by all teachers. Many teachers had different perspectives on the role that they and their schools played in careers guidance. The research highlighted the limited involvement of teachers in developing their schools' vision. Consequently, the research found minimal evidence that the project succeeded in changing the school culture and developing a strong careers learning environment.

4.6 Conclusion: what works best

In this section, we consider what works best, from the analysis presented in this chapter.

Most obviously, because we presented a range of interventions tied only by their being recent and robust, it is difficult to assess what works best. The studies we drew on have done different things with different cohorts and used different measures of success.

However, there were some relatively consistent themes:

- there were mainly positive results from careers interventions on shorter-term objectives (such as career readiness) and on attitude to school/education. However, there were fewer observed longer-term impacts reported across programmes. This likely reflects the methodological challenges of conducting

longer-term evaluations, as well as the many extraneous influences on employment outcomes

- time was needed with careers professionals for effective counselling interventions
- reflective approaches to counselling do work with disadvantaged groups, but these groups may need to be specifically targeted or they risk missing out
- the two examples regarding parental engagement suggested that parents can be effectively, and relatively cheaply, engaged in their child's education to positive effect; however, the means of doing this for careers purposes, as explored in this chapter, have not had the desired reach
- activities to raise aspirations to study at higher levels have had a positive impact on disadvantaged groups
- experimental designs have been shown to be complex to conduct, with many factors that can impinge on the purity of careers research.

Appendix 1: Maryland Scientific Methods Scale

(Sherman et al., 1997)

Level 5: Reserved for research designs that involve explicit randomisation into treatment and control groups, with randomised control trials providing the definitive example. Extensive evidence is provided on comparability of treatment and control groups, showing no significant differences in terms of levels or trends. Control variables may be used to adjust for treatment and control group differences, but this adjustment should not have a large impact on the main results. Attention paid to problems of selective attrition from randomly assigned groups, which is shown to be of negligible importance. There should be limited or, ideally, no occurrence of 'contamination' of the control group with the treatment.

Level 4: Quasi-randomness in treatment is exploited, so that it can be credibly held that treatment and control groups differ only in their exposure to the random allocation of treatment. This often entails the use of an instrument or discontinuity in treatment, the suitability of which should be adequately demonstrated and defended.

Level 3: Comparison of outcomes in treated group after an intervention, with outcomes in the treated group before the intervention, and a comparison group used to provide a counterfactual (for example, difference in difference). Justification given to chosen comparator group that is argued to be similar to the treatment group. Evidence presented on comparability of treatment and control groups. Techniques, such as regression and (propensity score) matching, may be used to adjust for difference between treated and untreated groups, but there are likely to be important unobserved differences remaining.

Level 2: Use of adequate control variables and either (a) a cross-sectional comparison of treated groups with untreated groups, or (b) a before-and-after comparison of treated group, without an untreated comparison group. In (a), control variables or matching techniques used to account for cross-sectional differences between treated and control groups. In (b), control variables are used to account for before-and-after changes in macro level factors.

Level 1: Either (a) a cross-sectional comparison of treated groups with untreated groups, or (b) a before-and-after comparison of treated group, without an untreated comparison group. No use of control variables in statistical analysis to adjust for differences between treated and untreated groups or periods.

References

- Andrews, D. and Hooley, T. (2019) '*Careers leadership in practice: a study of 27 careers leaders in English secondary schools*'. British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, pp. 1-13. DOI: 10.1080/03069885.2019.1600190.
- Arbeitobleidigen Consult (2020), *Rapport Monitor LOB 2019-2020*.
- Association of Community and Comprehensive Schools, Irish Vocational Educational Association, Joint Managerial Board, and National Association of Principals and Deputy Principals (2012) *Framework for considering provision of guidance in post-primary schools*.
- Association of German Chambers of Industry and Commerce (Accessed 3rd September 2020) *Career orientation: The IHKs are committed*.
- Association of Secondary Teachers of Ireland (2013), *ASTI survey of principals on the impact of cutbacks on second-level schools*.
- Augar, P. (2019) Independent panel report to the review of *post-18 education and funding*. *Post-18 Education and Funding Review Panel*.
- Barnes A. (Accessed 26th August 2020) *A guide to evaluating your careers programme*. Cegnet.
- Bell, D, Benes, K., and Redekopp, D. (2016). *Improving the School-to-Work Transitions of Youth in Canada: A Scoping Review*. Ottawa: Canadian Career Development Foundation.
- Bertelsmann Foundation (2015), *Careers guidance in German schools: recent reforms, best practice and lessons learned*.
- Business in the Community, (2016) *Principles & Practices for Primary Engagement*.
- Cadaret, M. and Hartung, P. (2020): *Efficacy of a group career construction intervention with urban youth of colour*, British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, DOI: 10.1080/03069885.2020.1782347.
- CareerBuilder. *Budget 2020 – Spotlight on Enhancement to Adapt and Grow*. [online]. Published: 12/03/2020. Available at <https://www.careerbuilder.com.sg/blog/articles/budget-2020-spotlight-on-enhancement-to-adapt-and-grow#:~:text=Enhancements%20to%20the%20Adapt%20and,outbreak%20will%20get%20additional%20support.&text=Funding%20support%20duration%20for%20existing,a%20maximum%20of%20six%20months> (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Career Service Network Germany, (Accessed 3rd September 2020), *Association*, <https://csnd.de/en/association/>.
- Careers Wales (2019) *Career Choices Dewis Gyfra Ltd: Business Plan 2019-20*.
- Careers Wales *The Careers Wales Mark*. Available at <https://www.careerswales.com/en/professionals/the-careers-wales-mark/> (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- Careers Wales (2017) *Changing Lives: Vision for Careers Wales 2017-2020*.

- Cedefop (2020a). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - Netherlands*. Careers Net national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-netherlands>.
- Cedefop (2020b). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - Germany*. Careers Net national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-germany>.
- Cedefop (2020c). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - Ireland*. CareersNet national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-ireland>.
- Cedefop (2020d). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - UK / Northern Ireland*. CareersNet national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-uk-northern-ireland>.
- Cedefop (2020e). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - UK / Scotland*. CareersNet national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-uk-scotland>.
- Cedefop (2020f). *Inventory of lifelong guidance systems and practices - UK / Wales*. Careers Net national records. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications-and-resources/country-reports/inventory-lifelong-guidance-systems-and-practices-uk-wales>.
- Centre Career Guidance and Education (2020), *Rapport Monitor LOB*.
- Chambers, N., Percy, C. and Rogers, M. (2020) *Disconnected: Career aspirations and jobs in the UK*. Education and Employers.
- Citizens Information, *unemployment and redundancy*. Available at https://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/employment/unemployment_and_redundancy/ (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- Clark, L. (2019) *Evaluation of the INSPIRED teenager programme* Derby: University of Derby.
- Collins, J. and Barnes, A. (2017). *Careers in the Curriculum. What works?* London: The Careers & Enterprise Company.
- Committee for Employment and Learning (2013), *Inquiry into Careers Education, Information, Advice and Guidance in Northern Ireland*.
- Davies, R. and Yunus, S. (2017) *Addressing Inequality? The Provision of Careers Guidance in Welsh Schools*.
- Department for Education (2017) *Careers strategy: making the most of everyone's skills and talents*.
- Department for Education and Skills (2012), *Circular 0009/2012: Staffing arrangements in post-primary schools for the 2012/13 school year*.

- Department for Education and Skills (2005), *Guidelines for Second Level Schools on the Implications of Section 9 (c) of the Education Act 1998, relating to students' access to appropriate guidance*.
- Department for Employment and Learning (2016) *Preparing for Success 2015-2020 A Strategy for Careers Education and Guidance* Northern Ireland Executive (2012), *Economic Strategy. Priorities for Sustainable Growth and Prosperity*.
- Department for the Economy (2019), *Business Plan 2019/20*.
- Department for the Economy (2011), *Success through Skills - Transforming Futures*.
- DGB-Jugend (2014), *German Trade Youth Union*. Available at https://jugend.dgb.de/dgb_jugend/ueber-uns/wer-wir-sind/++co++5ff01d14-c61e-11e3-bffd-525400808b5c.
- Early Intervention Foundation. (updated 2018). *EIF evidence standards* Available at <https://guidebook.eif.org.uk/eif-evidence-standards>. (Accessed 4th June 2020).
- Economic and Social Research Institute (2019), *Evaluation of the National Youthreach Programme*. Dublin: ESRI.
- Education Scotland (2015). *Developing the Young Workforce Career Education Standard (3-18)*. Scottish Government.
- Education Scotland (2016), *Career information, advice and guidance delivered by Skills Development Scotland in Highland - 11/11/16*.
- Euroguidance (2017), *Framework for career guidance for young people*.
- European Commission (2020), *Career guidance and counselling Netherlands*, <https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/en/content/youthwiki/34-career-guidance-and-counselling-netherlands>.
- European Commission (2020), *Career guidance and counselling Germany*, <https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/en/content/youthwiki/34-career-guidance-and-counselling-Germany>.
- European Commission. *The Youth Guarantee*. <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1079&langId>. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- Expertise point LOB (Accessed 3rd September 2020), *Materials> Practical examples*, <https://www.expertisepuntlob.nl/materialen/praktijkvoorbeelden>.
- Federal Employment Agency, <https://www.arbeitsagentur.de/en/welcome>.
- Federal Ministry for Education and Research (2020), *Berufsbildungsbericht*.
- Federal Ministry for Education and Research (2015), *Quality Standards of the BMBF for the implementation of potential analysis for career orientation 2015*.
- Gatsby Foundation (2014). *Good Career Guidance: Appendices 1-5*. London: Gatsby Foundation.
- Gatsby Foundation, Pye Tait Consulting (2020), *Secondary School and College leadership views on the impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic on Careers Guidance*.
- Gorard, S. et al (2017) *Children's University* Education Endowment Foundation.

- Government of Ontario (2016). *Employment Service: Program Guidelines*. Toronto: Government of Ontario. Available at http://www.tcu.gov.on.ca/eng/eopg/publications/es_guidelines.pdf.
- Government of Ontario. *Ontario Moving Ahead with the Reform of Employment Services*. [online]. Published: 14/02/20. <https://news.ontario.ca/mol/en/2020/02/ontario-moving-ahead-with-the-reform-of-employment-services.html>. (Accessed 13th August 2020).
- Government of Ontario. *Labour market report, January 2020*. [online]. Updated: 03/03/20. <https://www.ontario.ca/page/labour-market-report-january-2020>. (Accessed 13th August 2020).
- Government of Ontario (2019). Ontario Increasing Support and Creating Opportunities for Manufacturing Workers [Press release] 10/03 <https://news.ontario.ca/mol/en/2020/03/ontario-increasing-support-and-creating-opportunities-for-manufacturing-workers.html> (Accessed 13th August 2020).
- Government of Ontario (2019). *Helping Job Seekers and Employers Make Ontario Open for Business*. Available at <https://news.ontario.ca/maesd/en/2019/02/province-helping-job-seekers-and-employers-make-ontario-open-for-business.html> (Accessed 13th August 2020).
- Halfon, R. (2017) Consolidate the UK's 'Duplicated' Careers Services, Schools Week.
- Hanson, J., and Clark, L. (2020). 'Future frontiers: the impact of career coaching on year 11 students'. IAEVG Conference Proceedings Career Guidance for Inclusive Society. Bratislava, Slovakia 11-13 September 2019. IAEVG: Slovakia, pp. 185-203.
- Hearne, L., Geary, T. and Martin, N., (2016). Guidance counselling as a whole school responsibility in the Irish post primary sector. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 45(2).
- Ho, Y. and Leung, S. (2016) *Career Guidance in Hong Kong: From Policy Ideal to School Practice* <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/cdq.12056>.
- Hochschule Der Bundesagentur Tür Arbeit. *Labour market management* <http://www.hdba.de/studium/bachelorstudiengaenge>. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- Hughes, D. et al, (2016) *Careers Education: International Literature Review*. Education Endowment Foundation.
- IFF Research (2018), *PACE Client Experience Survey 2018* (Scottish Government and Skills Development Scotland).
- Ismail, S.M. (2018). *Effective Education and Career Guidance Policies and Practices to Strengthen Career Decision-Making Abilities in Singapore Students (NIE Working Paper Series No. 13)*. Singapore: National Institute of Education. <https://www.nie.edu.sg/docs/default-source/nie-working-papers/working-paper-series-no-13.pdf?sfvrsn=2>.
- Kashefpakdel, E. and Mann, A. (2016) *The impact of career development activities on student attitudes towards school utility: an analysis of data from the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)* Education and Employers Research.
- Kashefpakdel, E. and Schleicher, A. (2017) *The impact of career development activities on PISA mathematics tests*. Education and Employers Research.

- KlischeeFrel. The *Klischeefrei initiative*, https://www.klischeefrei.de/dokumente/pdf/20200326_Die%20Initiative%20Klischeefrei_EN.pdf. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- KlischeeFrel. *Organisation of the Klischeefrei initiative*, https://www.klischeefrei.de/de/klischeefrei_88509.php. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- KPMG Consulting (2014), *Evaluation of education and employer partnerships in Northern Ireland* (Confederation of British Industry).
- Lane, M. et al (2017) *An economic evaluation of the National Careers Service*. Department for Education.
- Lapan, R. Whitcomb, S. and Aleman, N. (2018) *Connecticut Professional School Counsellors: College and Career Counselling Services and Smaller Ratios Benefit Students*. Sage Journals. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1177/2156759X0001600206>.
- Mann, A., Rehill, J. and Kashfepakdel, E., (2018) *Employer engagement in education: Insights from international evidence for effective practice and future research*. Education Endowment Foundation.
- Moore, N. and Czerwinska, K. (2019) *Understanding the use of digital technology in the career development sector*. International Centre for Guidance Studies, The University of Derby.
- Moote, J. and Archer, L (2017). Failing to deliver? Exploring the current status of career education provision in England. *Research Papers in Education*, 33(2).
- Morris, M and Hooley, T. Presentation slides: *Evaluating school careers' provision*. Available at https://www.thecdi.net/write/Presentations/Keynote_3_-_Evaluating_school_and_college_careers_provision.pdf. (Accessed 26th August 2020).
- Mr Ong Ye Kung. 'Opening Address by Mr Ong Ye Kung, Minister for Education, at the Skills future Forum 2020'. Singapore Ministry for Education. Singapore. Published: 04/03/20. <https://www.moe.gov.sg/news/speeches/opening-address-by-mr-ong-ye-kung--minister-for-education--at-the-skillsfuture-forum-2020>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Musset, P. and Kureková, L., (2018) *Working it Out: Career Guidance and Employer Engagement* OECD.
- National Centre for Guidance in Education, *Guidance in Post Primary*, <https://www.ncge.ie/guidance-post-primary>.
- NCGE (2019), *Output Statement of the National Centre for Guidance in Education*.
- Nentwig (2015), *Vocational orientation as an unpopular additional task? Attitudes and self-efficacy experiences of teachers at the lower secondary level regarding*.
- Northern Ireland Executive (2012), *Economic Strategy. Priorities for Sustainable Growth and Prosperity*.
- OECD (updated April 2020) *Public employment services in the frontline for jobseekers, workers and employers*. OECD.
- Office of the Auditor General Ontario (2016). *Annual Report of the Office of the Auditor General of Ontario: Section 3.04*. Toronto: Office of the Auditor General Ontario.

- Ontario Ministry of Education (2013). *Creating Pathways to Success: An education and career/life planning program for Ontario schools*. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Education.
- Ontario Ministry of Education (2019). *The Ontario Curriculum: Career Studies Grade 10*. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Education.
- Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges, and Universities (2017). *Employment Service: Program Guidelines*. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges, and Universities.
- People for Education (2019). *What makes a school? People for Education annual report on Ontario's publicly funded schools 2019*. Toronto: People for Education. Available at: <https://peopleforeducation.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/PFE-2019-Annual-Report.pdf>.
- Putra, F.W., Yusuf, M. and Solfema, S. (2019) *Analysis of parent support in career planning of vocational students* in KONSELOR Volume 8 Number 2, pp 47-51 Available at <https://doi.org/10.24036/0201982105428-0-00>.
- Roe, P. (2015). Evaluation of the Re-Act programme 2008-2014. Cardiff: Welsh Government, GSR report number 46/2016. Available at: <http://gov.wales/statistics-and-research/evaluation-react/?lang=en>
- Scottish Government (2020), *Scotland's Careers Strategy Moving Forward*.
- Sing Chee Wong (2016), Transformation of Employment Patterns and Need for Career Services in Modern Singapore, *Career Development Quarterly*, Vol 64 Issue 3, <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1002/cdq.12061>.
- Singapore Ministry of Education (2018). *Career Guidance for Polytechnic and ITE students* [Parliamentary reply] 09/07. <https://www.moe.gov.sg/news/parliamentary-replies/career-guidance-for-polytechnic-and-ite-students>. (Accessed 14th August 2020)
- Singapore Ministry of Education (2019). *Education and Career Guidance* [Parliamentary reply] 15/01. Available at <https://www.moe.gov.sg/news/parliamentary-replies/education-and-career-guidance-ecg>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Singapore Ministry of Education. *Education and Career Guidance Curriculum*. <https://beta.moe.gov.sg/programmes/education-and-career-guidance/curriculum/>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Singapore Ministry of Education (2017). *Education Statistics Digest 2017: Moulding the Future of Our Nation*. Singapore: Ministry of Education. Available at https://www.moe.gov.sg/docs/default-source/document/publications/education-statistics-digest/esd_2017.pdf.
- Singapore Ministry of Education (2020). *MOE FY2020 Committee of Supply Debate Response by Senior Minister of State for Education, Chee Hong Tat* [Debate response] 04/03 <https://www.moe.gov.sg/news/speeches/moe-fy2020-committee-of-supply-debate-response-by-senior-minister-of-state-for-education--chee-hong-tat>. (Accessed: 14th August 2020).
- Singapore Ministry of Education. *My Skills Future Parents Guide*. [online]. <https://www.moe.gov.sg/docs/default-source/document/education/programmes/social-emotional-learning/ecg-resources/parents-brochure.pdf>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Skills Development Scotland (2020), *Annual Review, 2019-2020*.

- Skills Development Scotland (2018), *Delivering Scotland's Career Service*.
- Skills Future. *About Skills Future*. [online]. <https://www.skillsfuture.sg/AboutSkillsFuture>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Skills Future. Education and Career Guidance. [online]. <https://www.skillsfuture.sg/Programmes-For-You/Initiatives/Education-and-Career-Guidance>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Skills Future (2020). New multi-agency effort to ramp up transformation of Singapore's Training and Adult Education sector [Press release] 13/08, <https://www.skillsfuture.sg/NewsAndUpdates/DetailPage/6050dc8d-ca8c-42b7-a2da-9cd341910c69>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- Skills Future. *P-Max*, [online], <https://www.skillsfuture.sg/p-max>. (Accessed 14th August 2020).
- The Inspectorate of Education, *the Netherlands The State of Education in the Netherlands 2015/2016*. <https://www.onderwijsinspectie.nl/onderwerpen/staat-van-het-onderwijs/documenten/rapporten/2017/04/12/the-state-of-education-in-the-netherlands-2015-2016-kopie>. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- The Inspectorate of Education, *the Netherlands The State of Education in the Netherlands 2016/2017*. <https://www.onderwijsinspectie.nl/onderwerpen/staat-van-het-onderwijs/documenten/rapporten/2018/11/14/the-state-of-education-in-the-netherlands-2016-2017>. (Accessed 2nd September 2020).
- The Inter-Agency Working Group on Work-based Learning (2019) *Investing in Career Guidance*. https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/2227_en.pdf.
- The Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs (KMK), *Information in English*. <https://www.kmk.org/kmk/information-in-english.html>.
- Tomaszewski, W. et al (2017) *School Experiences, Careers Guidance and University Participation of Young People from three Equity Groups in Australia*. <https://www.ncsehe.edu.au/publications/school-experiences-career-guidance-and-the-university-participation-of-young-people-from-three-equity-groups-in-australia/>.
- UK Commission for Employment and Skills (2014) *Not Just Making the Tea* <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/not-just-making-tea-a-guide-to-work-experience>.
- Warwick Institute of Employment Research (2014). *Measuring Outcomes*. <https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/ngrf/effectiveguidance/impact/assessing/outcomes/>. (Accessed 26th August 2020).
- Welsh Government, (2018) *Employability Plan*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Welsh Government (2015) *Prosperity for All*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Welsh Government (2015) *Youth Engagement and Progression Framework: Approach to an Impact Evaluation*. Cardiff: Welsh Government.
- Welsh Government (2015) *Wellbeing of Future Generations Act*.
- What Works Centre for Local Economic Growth, *Maryland Scientific Methods Scale*. <https://whatworksgrowth.org/resources/the-scientific-maryland-scale/>. (Accessed 5th June 2020).

Workforce Singapore (2018). *Adapt and Grow Brochure*. Singapore: Workforce Singapore. [https://www.wsg.gov.sg/content/dam/ssg-wsg/wsg/ag-tg/jobseekers/A%26G_A5%20brochure_12%20\(FINAL\).pdf](https://www.wsg.gov.sg/content/dam/ssg-wsg/wsg/ag-tg/jobseekers/A%26G_A5%20brochure_12%20(FINAL).pdf).

Workforce Singapore, *Career Trial Factsheet*. [online]. https://www.wsg.gov.sg/content/dam/ssg-wsg/wsg/programmes/career_trial/careertrial-jobseeker/Career%20Trial_Factsheet_v3.pdf. (Accessed 14th August 2020).

Workforce Singapore. *Factsheet on the Career Support Programme*. [online]. https://www.wsg.gov.sg/content/dam/ssg-wsg/wsg/programmes/csp/csp-employer/WSG_CSP%20Extension_Factsheet_20200107_V01Final.pdf. (Accessed 14th August 2020).

Workforce Singapore. *Professional Conversion Programmes Factsheet*. [online]. https://www.wsg.gov.sg/content/dam/ssg-wsg/wsg/programmes/pcp/PCP_Factsheet_Feb2020_Online.pdf. (Accessed 14th August 2020).

Vera (Accessed 14th August), *Senior Experts*. <https://vera.ses-bonn.de/senior-experten>.



Department
for Education

© Department for Education 2021

Reference: DFE-RR1105

ISBN: 978-1-83870-237-3

For any enquiries regarding this publication, contact us at:

www.education.gov.uk/contactus

This document is available for download at www.gov.uk/government/publications