

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 227 461

CS 007 039

AUTHOR Crismore, Avon  
TITLE The Role of Tone in Processing Prose.  
PUB DATE Dec 81  
NOTE 177p.  
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC08 Plus Postage.  
DESCRIPTORS \*Affective Behavior; Cognitive Processes; Language Styles; Measurement Techniques; \*Models; Prior Learning; \*Reading Comprehension; \*Reading Processes; Reading Research; \*Schemata (Cognition)  
\*Reader Response; Reader Text Relationship; \*Tone (Language)

IDENTIFIERS

## ABSTRACT

Working on the assumption that an adequate model of comprehension must also deal with its connotative aspect (the aspect that concerns the feeling, mood, or "tone" of the text), this paper examines the concept of contextual tone. After defining tone according to its various senses and synonymous forms (voice, attitude, style, mood, and atmosphere), the paper discusses the relationship of tone to the paradigms of text structure, texture, and text types. This discussion is followed by a presentation of the categories of tone: sound, author relationship, simple and complex, biological and intellectual, and local and global. Arguing that tone is a necessary factor in a model of comprehension, the next section of the paper discusses the various types of meaning and tone as a symbol of meaning. It then explores levels of awareness and tacit inference, and examines the functions of tone in relation to the text, reader response, and comprehension. Determinants of tone such as adjustment to audience and subject matter, speaker role, point of view, and text type are presented in the next section. This is followed by an examination of the preconditions necessary in readers and texts for apprehending tone. It also discusses the problems and possibilities of measuring tone apprehension. Implications of tone problems for students are then examined, with particular attention to the studies of poor readers, subjectivity and biases, and prior knowledge and developmental problems. The paper concludes with a discussion of issues and implications for education. (HOD)

\*\*\*\*\*  
\* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
\* from the original document. \*  
\*\*\*\*\*

ED227461

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION  
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION  
CENTER (ERIC)

- X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
- Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

## The Role of Tone in Processing Prose

by Avon Crismore

December, 1981

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Avon Crismore

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES  
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

## Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction . . . . .	1
Definition . . . . .	3
Tone as voice . . . . .	4
Tone as attitude . . . . .	5
Tone as style . . . . .	9
Tone as mood . . . . .	13
Tone as atmosphere . . . . .	14
Description of Tone . . . . .	19
Paradigms of the structure of an utterance . . . . .	19
Levels of the semantics of an utterance . . . . .	22
Tone and subtext . . . . .	24
Tone and texture . . . . .	25
Categories of Tone . . . . .	31
Sound tones . . . . .	32
Author relationship tones . . . . .	32
Simple and complex tones . . . . .	34
Biological and intellectual tones . . . . .	42
Tone and Meaning . . . . .	44
Philosophic theories of meaning . . . . .	45
Response meanings . . . . .	47
Poetic theories of meaning . . . . .	48

	Page
Presentational symbols of meaning . . . . .	51
Implicit meaning . . . . .	58
Feeling as symbol of meaning . . . . .	61
Tone and Consciousness . . . . .	69
Subsidiary and focal relationships . . . . .	70
Functions of Tone . . . . .	73
Tone and the text . . . . .	73
Tone and reader response . . . . .	78
Tone and comprehension . . . . .	81
Determinants of Tone . . . . .	85
Tone and adjustment to audience . . . . .	86
Tone and adjustment to subject matter . . . . .	90
Tone and speaker role . . . . .	91
Tone and point of view . . . . .	93
Tone and text type . . . . .	96
Apprehending Tone . . . . .	103
Readers and pre-conditions . . . . .	103
Texts and tone categories . . . . .	108
Non-discursive texts and tone . . . . .	113
Non-fiction and tone . . . . .	115
Levels of tone apprehension . . . . .	121
Tone Problems for Students . . . . .	133
Studies of poor readers and tone . . . . .	133
Subjectivity and biases . . . . .	144
Prior knowledge and developmental problems . . . . .	149
Issues and Implications for Education . . . . .	153

## The Role of Tone

1

### The Role of Tone in Processing Prose

Theoretical models of reading comprehension have emerged in recent years showing the influence of many disciplines. Linguistics, psycholinguistics, sociolinguistics, cognitive psychology, as well as speech communication, anthropology, and computer science have made contributions to a better understanding of the basic processes and components of reading comprehension. As a result, the theoretical models are now more comprehensive than before. These models, whether for instance, top-down (Goodman, 1967; Smith, 1971), bottom-up (Gough, 1972), or interactive, a combination of these two models (Rummelhart, 1977), focus on understanding the literal sense meaning of the writer, what could be called the denotative aspects of the text. Discourse analysis with its concern for text structure (Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978; Meyer, 1975, 1977; Frederiksen, 1977) speech act theory (Austin, 1962; Searle, 1969) and story grammar (Stein & Glenn, 1979; Brewer, in press) have also concentrated on denotative sense meaning in addition to intentions, plans, and goals.

Much reading research is based on this denotative idea that comprehension is basically the extraction of the propositional content (logical structure or truth conditions) of the passage read. Comprehension thus can be measured in terms of the numbers of propositions expressed (and entailed) that subjects can recall from a text they have read. This view of reading as content extraction is also reflected in the educational system which produces students who can give a rough account of what is

## The Role of Tone

2

said, the denotative aspect, but who cannot isolate or describe the tone, the connotative aspect of texts read. The content extraction view of reading is deeply entrenched in most of the aptitude and achievement tests which are commonly cited as demonstrating how well students can read and how well the schools are doing their job (Dillon, 1981).

Although new insights into literal sense meaning and intention have been gained from the multi-disciplinary approach to reading, an adequate model of comprehension must also deal with the connotative aspect of comprehension, the aspect that concerns the feeling, mood, or tone of the text: We do not comprehend sentences by attending just to the structure of what is said in sentences, the denotative propositional content, but also to the structure of what is unsaid, the connotative emotional content. This connotative aspect referred to as textual tone, heavily influences what readers learn and remember from texts both in terms of entry into the text (Am I interested, put off by the text?) and in terms of understanding the meaning of the content presented (Dillon, 1981). It is a factor in comprehension; full understanding of a text requires the reader to have under his control the two levels of the internal structure of a text, the denotative propositional content level and the connotative emotional level, along with a realization of the interrelations of the two levels (Markova, 1979).

Research Evidence

I. A. Richards (1929; 1938) concluded that for adequate comprehension, a reader must not only understand the literal sense meaning of the text and recognize the writer's intent or purpose, but also recognize and comprehend the text's tone and the writer's tone or attitude toward the text and the reader. Frederick Davis (1972) determined after extensive study that reading comprehension is composed of separate skills and abilities and that detecting mood or tone was one of them. Although Richards and Davis recognized the importance of tone as the connotative aspect of comprehension, tone has generally not been included in models of reading comprehension. Because the concept of textual tone as a distinct characteristic of texts is elusive, difficult to define, and less easy to discuss, its importance may easily be overlooked, perhaps accounting for its omission in models of comprehension.

The purpose of this paper is to focus on tone as a vehicle of meaning, making it a necessary component in a complete model of reading comprehension. The paper is organized in the following fashion: Definition; Description of Tone; Categories of Tone; Tone as a Symbol of Meaning; Tone and Consciousness; Functions of Tone; Determinants of Tone; Apprehending Tone; Tone Problems for Students; Implications for Education.

Definition

Tone is difficult to define because it is a term rather loosely used by literary critics and the general public--sometimes used broadly and

## The Role of Tone

4

other times narrowly. It is also difficult to separate topics like tone, voice, involvement, subjectivity, and point of view because they all overlap. Some people define tone as voice, attitude, style, or context-plus manner (McCrawley, 1971). Many literary critics consider tone to be synonymous with the terms 'atmosphere,' 'mood,' 'impression,' 'spirit,' 'Gestalt-quality,' 'aura,' 'accent,' 'controlling image,' and 'controlling form' (Preminger, 1965). Other critics make fairly subtle distinctions between mood and tone or atmosphere and tone (Brooks & Warren, 1960). Literature has several senses for tone, while music, art, linguistics, physiology, and psychology each has its own way of defining tone. In order to fully understand tone, it is necessary to look at its various senses and synonymous forms.

Tone as voice. The fundamental association of "tone" in English is with "sound." The Oxford English Dictionary records some twenty different meanings under the entry for "tone," and most of them involve sound in one way or another. For example:

A particular quality, pitch, modulation, or inflexion of the voice expressing or indicating affirmation, interrogation, hesitation, decision, or some feeling or emotion. Vocal expression.

Some recent critics have analogized tone in literature to a quality of speech, seeing tone as a metaphor for "voice." McCrawley (1971) relates his definition of tone to sound and the human voice. He looks for tone in the voice, not the mind of the writer nor in the linguistic features

## The Role of Tone

5

of the text (although he believes these things will have importance in discussions of courses and results of tone). A voice begins immediately and continues throughout one's reading of the text, whether that reading is silent or oral. Attempting to remind one of all the essential associations the term should have and marking the boundaries of the territory covered by the term in his opinion, McCrawley defines the term as follows:

Tone is the series of vocal sounds that constitute the manner of delivery that seems prescribed by the particular combination of language elements (word choice, syntax, sound patterns, meter) selected and ordered by the poet--on the basis of his own (or his persona's) momentary orientation to his subject, himself, the reader, and the 'world'--and which may be thought of as the manner in which the speaker originally delivered the utterance.  
(p. 51)

McCrawley does not wish to confuse "tone" with "mood" or "style," since neither of those terms has anything to do with vocal sounds, nor with "the speaker's attitude" because that becomes a part of what the tone reveals and cannot be part of a "manner of delivery."

Tone as attitude. The most popular synonym for "tone" seems to be "attitude." The Handbook to Literature (Thrall & Hibbard, 1960) is fairly typical in its definition of tone as attitude.

Tone is used in contemporary criticism, following I. A. Richards example, as a term designating the attitudes toward the subject and toward the audience implied in a literary work. In such a usage, a work may have a tone that is formal, informal, intimate, solemn, sombre, playful, serious, ironic, condescending, or any of many other possible attitudes. (p. 487)

## The Role of Tone

6

Handbooks vary, however, in what they think the author's attitude is toward. Bloom, Philbrick, and Blistein (1961) believe that "Like mood, tone is part of a poet's attitude, but it is toward his audience rather than toward his subject" (p. 168). In contrast, Altenbrand and Lewis (1966) define tone as "the attitude of the author toward his subject matter as it reveals itself in the literary work" (p. 64). And Scott (1965) refers to tone as "the author's prevailing spirit, mental attitude, moral outlook appearing in the work itself" (p. 292) without indicating whether the mental attitude is toward life (his Weltanschauung), or toward his audience, or toward his immediate subject, or toward all of these at once. It is evident that although these handbooks agree that tone is attitude, they don't agree as to whether the attitude is toward the subject matter, the reader or things in general.

I. A. Richards (1929) is one of the sources cited by the supporters of "attitude" view of tone. For Richards it is basically a matter of the poet's putting himself into a right relationship to the reader. He sees all poetry as ultimately an utterance by the poet to the reader, whether made directly or through a persona, and whether the reader is addressed directly in the second person or not. He believes the poet's attitude toward the immediate subject of the poem is more a matter of "feeling" than tone; it is part of tone only so far as the right relationship with the reader involves a mutual understanding of just how original or how commonplace these sentiments are.

The Role of Tone

7

Richards' (1929) fundamental position is that any human utterance has four basic kinds of meaning: sense, feeling, intention and tone. That is, one speaks to say something, to direct the hearer's attention to some state of affairs (this he calls "sense"); one also reveals some attitude of his own, some emotional involvement with the matter ("feeling"); then, one has some aim, some purpose, ("intention"); and finally one "has ordinarily an attitude to his listener. He chooses or arranges his words differently as his audience varies, in automatic or deliberate recognition of his relation to them ("tone"). The tone of his utterance reflects his relation to them ("tone"). The tone of his utterance reflects his awareness of this relation, his sense of how he stands toward those he is addressing" (p. 182).

In his discussion of tone, Richards does not use the words "mood" or 'atmosphere' which some later critics do use in their definitions of tone (Thrall & Hibbard, 1960; Bloom, et al., 1961), but he does distinguish "tone" from "style," saying that many secrets of style could be shown to be matters of tone. Nowhere, however does Richards define what he means by 'style.'

The other major source for the view of tone as attitude is Brooks and Warren (1938). Their treatment of tone seems to be an amplification of Richards' view. Their approach to tone agrees with Richards' in seeing tone as chiefly a reflection of attitude, and in seeing it as analogous to tone of voice, a gesture, etc. in conversation. However their emphasis is different. They focus on attitude toward subject more than on attitude toward (that is, relationship with) the reader. They feel that the

## The Role of Tone

8

question of tone is concerned with the speaker in the poem, in the situation of the poem and not with the poet. The poem is a drama, according to their perspective (1961).

Richards' account of tone does not take into consideration the fact that poet and speaker may not be identical as in Browning's poem "My Last Duchess" while the Brooks and Warren approach makes no use of the author-reader relationship. The Brooks and Warren approach attempts to pin "tone" down to writing itself, mentioning all of the following as contributing to the tone of a poem: Choice of images, choice of words, arrangement of words on the page, alliteration, assonance, tempo of movement, rhythm and quantitative emphasis. Richards' account of tone does not tie itself down to the language of a text. It is a general aesthetic concept, useful for any art.

In an extensive discussion of tone, Hungerland (1958) disagrees with Richards "tone-as-attitude" views, arguing that "attitudes" are psychological dispositions, and to identify tone with attitudes is to classify it under the heading "what language conveys." Something that exists (is located, that is), in someone's mind cannot be the tone of a written utterance. She points out that the term is often used as if linguistic expressions themselves had tonal qualities; we describe a speaker's tone in ways that seem to apply to the language, not to the speaker, and something we recognize as we read, not to inferred attitudes. Hungerland insists on looking for tone in the poem, not in the mind of the author or reader and argues for the linguistic bases for tone, but she never really defines the term. In discussing the tone of Yeat's short lyric "Her Praise," she states (after describing the

The Role of Tone

9

linguistic traits of the poem) that the tone conveys "a casual, direct, and serious attitude toward the subject and listener" (p. 42) but goes beyond this. The tone does not just convey a certain attitude about a speaker; since "Attitudes, feelings, and emotions come in bundles" (p. 42), tone reflects a whole personality, a whole human being talking, not merely an attitude expressing itself.

Clearly the Richard's "tone-as-attitude" account does not settle the question whether tone is to be identified with the poet's attitude toward audience or with a manner of writing and unnecessarily restricts the kinds of things a certain manner of writing may reflect with its focus on attitude to audience. Both Richards and Brooks and Warren discuss only revealed attitudes rather than the preliminary notions of what tone actually is within the poem itself and how we become aware of it in contrast to Hungerland.

Tone as style. Although Richards (1929) distinguishes between tone and style (defining tone as the author's attitude to his audience but not defining style), many critics do not. Barnet et al. (1960) define tone as "the author's attitude as we come to infer" it. See "style" (p. 87) in their Dictionary of Literary Terms. The cross-reference indicates the authors link the terms "tone" and "style" in their minds. This linkage is also made by Coleridge in a passage from Biographia Literaria: "the stanza, and tone of style, were the same as those of the 'Female Vagrant,''" (p. 58). Style is often defined as a manner of expression (Fowler, 1973; Cudden, 1977; Brooks & Heilman, 1945). This is the same term used by

The Role of Tone

10

Hungerland (1958) when she expresses dissatisfaction with Richards' definition of tone pointing out that he leaves unsettled the question of whether tone is to be identified with the poet's attitude toward audience or with a manner of writing. Apparently Hungerland also links tone and style as does Perrin (1972) who asks in the exercise section of his composition text, "How would you describe the tone or style of each of the passages that follow?" (p. 14) and Brooks and Heilman (1945) who cross-reference tone in their style definition.

The reason some writers equate tone and style but others do not is no doubt that both are old, tormented terms with broad as well as specific meanings. Fowler (1973) states, "the word style" itself has relatively technical connotations; those not involved in (strict) stylistics tend to speak of "tone" or often "rhetoric" rather than style (p. 185). He assumes that all texts manifest style, for style is a standard feature of all language, not a delux extra peculiar to literature or just to some literature. The same situation is also true for tone according to most critics. Fowler believes that "Linguistic form is not absolutely controlled by the concepts we want to express. There are alternative ways of putting messages into work, and the choice among alternatives is exercised along non-linguistic principles." The extra-textual influences on the form of communication are the personal and situational facts structuring the communicative event of which the text is a part. Style is determined by context, and depends on a foregrounding of some selected feature or set

The Role of Tone

11

of features, of linguistic surface structure. Thoughts can be paraphrased.

Style is defined by Cudden (1977) to be synonymous with tone:

The characteristic manner of expression in prose or verse; how a particular writer says things. The analysis and assessment of style involves examination of a writer's choice of words, his figures of speech, the devices (rhetorical and otherwise), the shape of his sentences (whether they be loose or periodic), the shape of his paragraphs--indeed, of every conceivable aspect of his language and the way in which he uses it. Style defies complete analysis or definition (Remy de Gourmont put the matter tersely when he said that defining style was like trying to put a sack of flour in a thimble) because it is the tone and 'voice' of the writer himself; as peculiar to him as his laugh, his walk, his handwriting and the expressions on his face. The style, as Buffon put it is the man.

This view of style is characteristic of the Aristotelian school of critics who regard style as a generic term. They consider it not to be an essence but a product of many elements. To them, there are as many styles as there are writings. Styles differ both in kind and in degree. The genus style is broken down into species and subspecies until it terminates in the individual. "The style is the man himself" (Buffon) reflects this point of view. The term is usually preceded with a classifying epithet, a term stating which of seven species of style he is discussing. A style may take its epithet (species) from (1) its author, Homeric style; (2) its time, medieval style; (3) its language or medium; Germanic style or lyric style; (4) its subject, philosophical style; (5) its geographical place, Midwest style; (6) its audience, popular style; (7) its purpose or mood of its author, humorous style or sarcastic.

In contrast to the Aristotelian school, who regard style as a quality inherent in all expression, the Platonic school regards it as a quality that some expression has but that other expression has not. These two concepts are so far apart that only a broad definition is possible. The Platonic concept of style is a natural outgrowth of the Greek concept of the logos where every idea is perfect both in substance and form. When a thought is invested with its essential form, style results. The thought and the form are an indivisible one. Since style is an essence, a quality, it cannot be known by a logical, analytical process; it must be perceived directly in terms of its effect upon the trained perceptions of competent judges. Competence is acquired by experiencing the "whole effect that the thought ought to produce" (Shipley, 1970).

Preminger (1965) states that the relation between style and content must be described metaphorically. Two kinds of metaphors have been used. The first suggests that the relation is mechanical, that style is something added, more or less at the poet's discretion. The organic metaphor sees the relation as closer and more intimate. The organic view is found in Renaissance theory (Ben Jonson uses the body/soul analogy); but the organic view is mostly found in Romantic theory, in Coleridge's Biographia Literaria, for example. More modern critics such as Murray believe that style is found organically only in imaginative writing; in argument and exposition, it is detachable. Critic Spitzer argues that a reader must place himself in the creative center of the artist himself and recreate the artistic organism.

Tone is seen as an important element in style by Brooks and Warren (1949) (along with the elements of diction and metaphor), as context plus style by McCrawley (1971), as an equivalent to style by Cudden (1977), and as linked somehow to style by Barnet (1960). With the exception of Richards, critics seem in general agreement that there is a relationship between style and tone but not about the exact nature of the relationship. It is clear, however, that what is usually said of style is also usually said of tone.

Tone as mood. In addition to finding the words "voice," "attitude," and "style" connected to tone, one also finds the words "mood" and "atmosphere." Although Bloom (1961) sees mood and tone overlapping in some cases, he seems to suggest a distinction between the two terms. He sees tone as an intellectual attitude toward audience (e.g., satire) and mood as an emotional attitude toward subject. Thrall and Hibbard, on the other hand, simply equate "the mood of the work itself" (not the mood of the author) with tone.

If a text can be said to have a "mood" and if that mood is synonymous with the "tone" of the text, then it seems logical to equate "atmosphere" with "mood" as Coleridge does in Biographia Literaria according to McCrawley (1970). Coleridge explains why he liked a Wordsworth poem by saying,

It was the union of deep feeling with profound thought; the fine balance of truth in observing, with the imaginative faculty in modifying the objects observed; and above all the original gift of spreading the tone, the atmosphere, and with it the depth

and height of the ideal world around forms, incidents, situations of which, for the common view, custom had bedimmed all the lustre (cited in McCrawley, p. 9).

Besides Coleridge, there are others who equate atmosphere with mood and tone. The following entries from handbooks of literary terms illustrate how these terms are defined.

Atmosphere: The prevailing tone or mood of a literary work, particularly--but not exclusively--when that mood is established in part by setting or landscape. It is, however, not simply setting but rather the emotional aura which the work bears and which establishes the reader's expectations and attitudes.

Examples are the somber mood established by the description of the prison door in the opening chapter of Hawthorne's The Scarlet Letter, the brooding sense of fatality engendered by the description of Egdon Heath at the beginning of Hardy's The Return of the Native, the sense of "something rotten in the state of Denmark" established by the scene on the battlements at the opening of Hamlet, or the more mechanical but still effective opening stanza of Poe's "The Raven." (Holman, 1960, p. 47-48)

Atmosphere: The mood and feeling, the intangible quality which appeals to extra-sensory as well as sensory perception evoked by a work of art. For instance, the opening scene in Hamlet where the watch is tense and apprehensive, even 'jumpy.' By contrast, the beginning of Ben Johnson's The Alchemist indicates clearly that the play is going to be comic to the point of knockabout. (Cudden, 1977, p. 58, 59)

Atmosphere; mood: The overall effect of a literary work on the reader's mood. (Elkhadem, 1976, p. 14)

Atmosphere: The mood which is established by the totality of the literary work. Foreshadowing, though related to atmosphere is primarily a plot device. In the first act of Macbeth, the presence of the three witches establishes the atmosphere of the play, which is dark and sombre, but what they say is a foreshadowing of the evil which is later dramatized. (Becksen & Ganz; 1960, p. 14, 15)

Atmosphere: This term, borrowed from meteorology, is used to describe the overall effect of a creative work of literature or other example of art. It involves the dominant mood of a selection as created by setting, description, and dialogue. Thus the setting of Thomas Hardy's novels (Egdon Heath), the description in the first paragraph of Poe's "The Fall of the House of Usher" and in the first chapter of Hawthorne's The Scarlet Letter and the dialogue at the opening of Shakespeare's Hamlet and Macbeth each create the atmosphere (feeling and mood) of the entire work. Atmosphere embraces both physical and psychological details of the selection itself and the impression intended for the reader as well as his expected emotional response. See also Dominant Impression, Tone. (Shaw, 1972, p. 36,37)

Atmosphere: The general mood of a literary work. Atmosphere is presented by the setting, time, conditions under which the characters live. In Macbeth, the first appearance of the three witches establishes an atmosphere of danger and the foreboding of the supernatural, which runs through the play (Scott, 1965, p. 24).

The Role of Tone

16

Atmosphere: Mood or feeling created by events, places, and situations. Compare with and distinguish from tone. (Brooks & Heilman, 1945, p. 47)

Mood: A word coming from Old English mod that meant "heart," "spirit," and "courage," mood refers to a disposition of mind, a feeling, an emotional state. The mood of a literary work refers to its predominating atmosphere or tone. Every major work of literature has a prevailing mood, but many also shift in mood to achieve a counterpoint, to provide comic relief, or to reflect changing circumstances in plot (Shaw, 1972, p. 40).

Mood: In a literary work the disposition of mind or feeling; the general tone. In "To His Coy Mistress," Andrew Marvell's changes of mood show the alliance of levity and seriousness (Scott, 1965, p. 187).

Key: (Tone, manner or spirit) an aspect of a communication event (Hymes, 1972, p. 65).

Tone: General effect produced by an author's selection and treatment of materials--as comic, tragic, gay, etc. A product of the author's attitude to his materials and his skill in conveying that attitude to the reader. More inclusive than but not wholly distinguishable from atmosphere (Brooks & Heilman, 1945, p. 52).

Tone: The devices used to create the mood and atmosphere of a literary work; in this sense, the tone of a poem consists of its alliteration, assonance, consonance, diction, imagery, meter, rhyme, symbolism, etc. (Shaw, 1972, p. 381)

Tone: Traditionally, tone has denoted an intangible quality, frequently an affective one, which is metaphorically predicated of a literary work or of some part of it such as its style. It is said to pervade and "color" the whole, like a mood in a human being; and in various ways to contribute to the aesthetic excellence of the work. Some of the other terms naming the same concept are "Gestalt-quality," "impression," "spirit," "atmosphere," "aura," and "accent." (Preminger, 1974, p. 856)

Tone: A quality of the general level of background emotion or feeling. (Wolman, 1973; 388)

The last definition of tone is from the Dictionary of Behavioral Science rather than a dictionary of literary terms and is a psychological definition.

In the previous dictionary entries, tone is equated with mood and atmosphere except for the Brooks and Heilman view which sees some commonalities but considers tone a broader concept than mood and atmosphere.

Barnet (1960) cautions against such an equation:

Tone should not be confused with atmosphere, which is the world in which the characters move. The atmosphere of a work may be frightful, but the tone may be compassionate or bewildered.

(There follows a brief discussion of A Modest Proposal, in which the "economists'" way of talking is said to be the "atmosphere" of the piece. The author's conclude: The economist keeps talking, presenting his statistics, but his self-assured earnestness is not the author's tone, the author's attitude as we come to infer it. See style (86-87).

The phrase, "the world in which the characters move" seems to point toward visible imagery (the landscape of Wuthering Heights, the spooky hallways

of The Castle of Otranto) as a requirement for atmosphere. His discussion of characters and atmosphere versus author and tone indicate he is dealing with the concept of persona, a term used to indicate the difference between the man who sits down to write and the "author" as we realize him in and through the page and the narrator of the work. The persona is a "second self" of the author and is not the same as the narrator. The narrator in A Modest Proposal deliberately heightens and distorts the view Swift seeks to expose. The distortion establishes the tone of the work according to Scott (1965).

The application of the terms "tone," "mood," "voice," "attitude," "style," and "persona" varies greatly from one critic to another and involves some of the most subtle and difficult concepts in philosophy and social psychology--concepts such as "the self," "personal identity," and "role-playing." The terms (Abrams, 1971) "increasingly frequent in criticism, reflect the recent tendency to think of a work of literature, whether lyric or narrative, as a mode of speech." This tendency is no doubt related to the recent emphasis on speech act theory.

The extended discussion and definitions of tone as voice, attitude, style, and mood should give some indication of the uncertainty with which the word "tone" is used. It is clear that "tone" really is a confused concept, elusive, subtle, and not at all easy to define. How a critic defines tone depends on whether he sees tone as a mode of speech or a reflection of attitude toward something (subject, situation, reader); in the author's mind or in the text; semantic or background emotion; an

author/reader, author/subject relationship or feeling; attitudes or manner of writing; intellectual or emotional, physical or psychological, context-free or context-dependent; broad or narrow; a generic term or an essence; perceived by a logical, analytical process or perceived directly; organic or non-organic; a part or a whole; determined by events, places, and time or by dialogue; always affective or frequently affective; a voice metaphor or an atmosphere metaphor.

In this paper the atmosphere metaphor is more appropriate for an explanation of tone. Tone is considered to be an intangible, pervasive Gestalt-like quality found in the text itself that "colors" the whole, like a mood in a human being; it is a quality of the general level of background emotion or feeling text and the overall emotional or intellectual effect of the text.

#### A Further Description of Tone

In order to understand the role of tone as an affective factor in comprehension of texts, it is necessary to discuss the relationship of tone to the paradigms of text structure, texture, and text types.

#### Paradigms of the Structure of an Utterance

There are several ways of looking at what an utterance (whether a sentence, paragraph or extended text) is and its components, levels, and functions. Tyler (1978) discusses three main paradigms: the formalist, the functionalist and the interactionalist. In the formalist paradigm,

The Role of Tone

20

the primary conceptual content of utterances is more important than their instrumental, purposive, or expressive function. The general notion is that the basic or primary utterances are statements having a cognitive content that can be judged to have meaning or to be true or false solely on the basis of the meanings of their constituent words and the structure of the propositions which the words form. Sentences may also express the speaker's/author's feelings and attitudes towards the things talked about or about his audience or the situation: yet these are only secondary additions which may effect the primary conceptual content but at the same time are dependent on it, since they are in a sense a commentary on it.

In the functionalist paradigm, functionalists take a far more instrumental and pragmatic view, stressing that language is not only for representing ideas, but equally a means of expressing wishes, feelings, and emotions--that it is a way of getting things done in the world as well as making statements about it. They focus on the uses of language. Language is not an object consisting of relations but a means to establish relations. Their focus shifts, therefore, from language itself to what people do with language. The individual is more important in functionalism than in formalism. Intentions, purposes, plans, and attitudes are clues people use to interpret what an utterance means. Consequently, meaning is a matter of interpretation rather than the automatic reading off of preestablished word, sentence, or text meaning. Formalists are interested in how language represents and so distinguish "sense" which is the pointing of words to other words from "reference," the pointing of words to things.

Functionalists, by emphasizing what could be called the outer appearance of language, are interested in how language creates appropriate effects in others. Their view bypasses the problem of representation by reinterpreting it as behavior--acts of communication--or as stimulus response. Functionalists are suspicious of minds and unobservable interior events. Solipsism (the theory that self is all that can be known) is the result of functionalism--as of all empiricism according to Tyler.

Neither formalism nor functionalism can provide accounts of both the transcendental and the subjective. In the interactionalist paradigm, no direct discourse can capture both of these poles of our experience and remain coherent. We can only evoke in ourselves intimations of transcendence and recollections of subjectivity by means of indirect discourse--by hints, reminders, examples, exaggerations, and exhortations (Wittgenstein, 1958 cited in Tyler, 1978:25). In contrast to the interactionalists, generative linguists believe in the autonomy of language. They emphasize the cognitive function of language as opposed to instrumental or expressive functions and think that the primary function of language is to make thought and its communication possible--to make ideas accessible to the thinker himself and his audience. An interactional view of thought argues against the autonomy of language. Language is not just a code, a hermetic system of conventional linguistic signs which can be understood in terms of itself. It cannot be understood as an abstract, formal object independent of its organic and cultural context. In more particular terms, we do not comprehend sentences by attending just to the linguistic form of the

The Role of Tone

22

sentences, to the structure of the said but also to the non-linguistic part of sentences, to the structure of the unsaid.

Tone as the total emotional and intellectual effect of a text could perhaps be viewed as both transcendental and subjective, the unsaid part of an utterance. Full understanding of an utterance for the interactionalist requires a mutual dependency between the said (the linguistic, discursive part) and the unsaid. This is an organic view of utterance which can be traced back to Plato's view of language in Phaedrus and the Romantics' organic view of utterances (Tyler, 1978; Preminger, 1974).

Levels of the Semantics of an Utterance

Markova (1979) seems to be discussing the subjective aspect of utterances when she uses the term "sense" and contrasts with it the term "meaning." Her use of sense appears to correspond to tone as attitude, but much of what she says applies to tone as atmosphere, also. Her discussion of sense occurs in Stage Three; the Regulation stage in the development of language mastery in children. She states that sense (tone) in utterances is dependent on interests, level of education, and psychological states. We must take into account the dynamics of sense in the course of communication. Sense plays a crucial role in exerting influence since communication often takes place in order to exchange sense, that is, the emotional and evaluative information added to meanings that are already known. The existence of sense makes possible the phatic function of speech (emotional contact without explicit exchange of meanings).

Meaning and sense are two levels of the internal semantic structure of an utterance. Meaning is the information about external reality and the objects and events in which it actually takes place. All the personal, emotional and normative additions to meanings that the speaker injects into his speech constitute another level, the sense of an utterance. Every statement (except, of course, factual information) carries emotional and normative elements. Every utterance is permeated by personal, normative shades of meaning. Even the texts of scientific, scholarly publications abound in modal and normative judgments.

The sense of an utterance, according to Markova, is a complex structure. It may comprise a logically sound evaluation on the part of the speaker or reflect an emotional, expressive relationship. Thus a speaker may express a normative, emotional relationship: (a) to the subject of the statement: (b) to the content of his statement (to the succession of thoughts or to their logical conclusiveness): or (c) to the form or style of his statement. All these kinds of relationships may apply both to one's own statements and to those of someone else. When the relationship is to the subject of a statement, it is called a subjective modal meaning. The objective modal meaning, which must be present in every sentence, relates the message to some level of reality. "The personal nuances of an utterance establish the facts of an individual's subjective relation to reality and reflect the active relationship of the speaker to the content of his utterance. This is why school children must be shown that sense is an extremely important aspect of an utterance, since

The Role of Tone

24

it mediates the individual and personal aspects of the latter" (p. 78, 79).

Tone and Subtext

The personal aspects of an utterance may be represented in a text itself, using the system of expressive devices every language provides or they may be relegated to a subtext. In subtexts, the semantic elements of the text are omitted by the speaker and are situated between the lines. Subtext is a special kind of semantic textual structure. The communicative subtext is an exchange of personal values, a human form of contact, a joint endeavor, an ideological and emotional concord. There is, in communicative subtext a mutual understanding and influencing of others through subjective expression. Practically every utterance contains a subtext (every verbal statement is an allegory according to Vygotsky, 1968) which the speaker may or may not be aware of. The semantics of an utterance can be separated into the explicit and the implicit levels as well as the objective and subjective levels (Markova, 1979). Without mentioning the term "tone," Markova has given a good description of tone as the subjective, unsaid, mediating aspect of language that is relegated to a subtext and which involves a mutual dependency between subtext and reader and between the denotative, verbal and the connotative, non-verbal aspects of utterances for full understanding. Tone corresponds to the emotional elements entering a semantic field.

Tone and Texture

"Texture" is another term important for understanding tone. **Texture** in modern literacy criticism tends to designate the concrete, particular qualities of a poem as opposed to the abstract or general ideas. Thus texture refers to the verbal surface of a work, its sensuous qualities, and the density of its imagery. The term is derived from the plastic arts, where it normally refers to the tactile images used to represent the various physical surfaces of a work rather than the larger elements of form or design. Texture refers to those details that, while requiring formal organization, may be considered apart from the structure of a poem. They contribute largely to its technical interest, as also to its tone and feeling conveyed (Preminger, 1965).

By extension texture has come to mean, then, the representation in words of all sensible phenomena. Fowler (1973) states that the widespread use of the term is based on the assumption that words (and also texts) have an expressive or simulative aspect which helps to illustrate their meanings more immediately. This belief in the onomatopoeic properties of language has not always gone unchallenged, but the existence of techniques for producing particular sensory effects in the reader is undisputed, and it is thus possible to describe the texture of language in terms either of the means used or the effects obtained. The techniques of assonance (identity of vowel sounds), consonance (identity of consonant sounds), and alliteration (repetition of initial consonants) may each be used to produce such effects as cacophony (a sense of strain in

pronunciation) or euphony (a sense of ease in pronunciation). All are exemplified in this excerpt from Pope's 'An Essay on Criticism':

When Ajax strives some rock's vast weight to throw,  
The line too labors, and the words move slow;  
Not so, when swift Camilla scours the plain,  
Flies o'er th' unbending corn, and skims along the main.

Many critics do not believe that the ear governs the mind and that there is a possibility of any natural connection between the sound of language and the things signified. Richards (1936) concludes that most expressive words get their feelings of peculiar aptness from other words sharing the morpheme and supporting them in the background of the readers' mind such as the (fl) in flicker, flash, flare. Richards' views on the inter-inanimation of words avoids the implicit fallacies in the traditional notion of texture as verbal decor (Fowler, 1973).

Form must be either structural or textural, according to Fowler, the one being large-scale, a matter of arrangement, the other small-scale, a matter of impressionism. Structure at its most obvious (plot, story, argument) is the skeleton of a work, texture at the most obvious (metre, diction, syntax) is the skin. But certain elements are comparable to muscles. A motif or general tone of a text is structural insofar as the images and tones making it up are seen as a chain, textural insofar as each is apprehended sensuously as it comes--and contentual, rather than formal, insofar as the chain carries a meaning that one link, an unrepeated image or tone, would not. In the last analysis, structure is a matter of memory, texture of immediacy.

Texts which take liberties with chronology on the grounds that literature is not life, and need not resemble it, is characteristic of modern experimental writing. Works of this kind present themselves more concretely as objects in space than as abstract patterns of cause and effect. It follows that the reader's attention will be directed towards their textural rather than their structural qualities. What is normally background becomes foregrounded.

Fowler also states that the elaboration of texture invariably has the effect of arresting movement--whether of thought or action--and substituting the opaque for the transparent in language. At its furthest extremes such developments lead to Concrete poetry or Modern experimental prose involving a progressive elimination of meaning. In most works compromises are achieved between denotation and connotation, referent and reference. Texture, unlike structure, is an inherent (psychological) property of every part of language, and therefore is under the control of the artist. Part of his task then consists in eliminating or subduing indeterminate textual elements in the language he uses. He tries to materialize his meanings. Since language is not a subtle enough medium to classify the imitative function of texture according to the sensory apparatus to which it appeals, textual qualities are classified according to the known properties of language. They may be musical (onomatopelia, alliteration, meter); lexical (metaphor, synecdoche, etc.); syntactic (chiasmus, antithesis, etc.).

Christensen and Christensen (1976) designate texture as one of four principles necessary in any composition. In their process-oriented theory of rhetoric, to bring in the dimension of meaning a writer must not only use the structural principles of addition, direction of movement, levels of generality or abstraction, but also degree of texture. Texture provides a descriptive or evaluative term. Well-written poetry and prose has density and variety in texture and greater concreteness and particularity in what is added. The authors believe that the meaning of a text is in the modifiers, especially free modifiers. The addition of free modifiers (those word groups set off by punctuation and found at the end of sentences) make the differences between a bare primer style and a rich-textured style. Texture is thin when a writer adds free modifiers to few of his nouns or verbs or clauses or adds single word free modifiers. Texture is dense or rich when a writer adds free modifiers frequently and adds those (phrases and clauses) that are long and elaborative.

Other elements that are part of texture are imagery, metaphor, rhyme, meter, connotative meanings of words, and phonetic patterns. The textual elements are the particulars that result in tone. The particulars help the reader to real-ize the text. To real-ize as a creative reader, one must real-ize as a creative writer. Here, without texture, stripped down to the bare skeleton, is a passage from a well-known book by an eminent American writer cited in Christensen and Christensen,

1. The sky was changing now; it was coming on to storm, or I didn't know signs. 2. Before it had been mostly sunlight. 3. Now it was mostly shadow. 4. And the wind was down to earth and continual. 5. The smoke from houses where supper had been started was lining out to the east and flowing down. 6. It was a wind with a feel to it. 7. Out at the end of the street, the look of the mountains had changed too. 8. Before they had been big and shining. 9. Now they were dark and crouched down, and it was the clouds that did matter. 10. And they weren't spring clouds, or the kind that mean a rain, but thick, shapeless and white.

With texture added by way of free modifiers (various sorts of phrases and clauses set off by punctuation) the same passage looks like this: --that is, there are various sorts of phrases and clauses; and they are all free modifiers--they are all set off by punctuation. And it is no accident that they all come at the end of the sentences.

The sky was really changing now, fast; it was coming on to storm, or I didn't know signs. Before it had been mostly sunlight, with only a few cloud shadows moving across fast in a wind that didn't get to the ground, and looking like burnt patches on the eastern hills where there was little snow. Now it was mostly shadow, with just gleams of sunlight breaking through and shining for a moment on all the men and horses in the street, making the guns and metal parts of the harness wink and lighting up the big sign on Davies' store and the sagging white veranda of the inn. And the wind was down to earth and continual, flapping the men's garments and blowing out the horses' tails like plumes. The smoke from houses where supper had been started was lining straight out to the east and flowing down, not up. It was a heavy wind with a damp, chill feel to it, like comes before snow, and strong enough so it wuthered

under the arcade and sometimes whistled, the kind of wind that even now makes me think of Nevada quicker than anything else I know. Out at the end of the street, where it merged into the road to the pass, the look of the mountains had changed too. Before they had been big and shining, so you didn't notice the clouds much. Now they were dark and crouched down, looking heavier but not nearly so high, and it was the clouds that did matter, coming up as thick and high as you had to look at them instead of the mountains. And they weren't firm, spring clouds, with shapes, or the deep, blue-black kind that mean a quick, hard rain, but thick, shapeless and gray-white, like dense steam, shifting so rapidly and with so little outline that you more felt than saw them changing. (Walter Van Tilburg Clark,  
The Ox-Bow Incident)

The claim made by Christensen and Christensen is that the meaning is in the modifiers. The free modifier additions make the difference between a bare primer style and a rich-textured style. They give the scene "solidity of specification." A reader would read the skeletonized version (except for the fifth and last sentences) with a vacant mind, merely recognizing the figures alluded to. "Mostly sunlight" and "mostly shadow" because they are highly generalized would be read without forming any image at all or else inappropriate images as the reader drew on his own experience of sunshine and shadow. The concrete, specific, particular details realize the scene, so that instead of skimming over it with a distant nod of recognition, the reader experiences it. He sees the cloudy shadows "like burnt patches on the eastern hills" and the gleams of sunshine that make the guns and metal parts of harness

wink and the sign and the white veranda gleam. He sees and feels the wind flapping the men's garments and blowing the horses' tails. And he feels rather than sees the shifting of the thick but shapeless blue-black clouds. The elements of texture, the details, authenticate the scene, compelling the reader not only to participate but to accept. They create the illusion of reality.

The texture produces the ominous tone of the passage. The thin-textured, skeletonized version has only the propositional content, giving the passage a dry, flat, lifeless tone. The full meaning of Clark's passage depends on its tone which is a product of the texture. The reader knows and understands by using the propositional content along with the tone both working by reinforcing each other.

#### Categories of Tone

Plato believed that definition and categorization were essential activities in discussing a concept, but these are difficult tasks for the subtle concept of tone. Categorizing tone is no easier than trying to define or describe this "fuzzy" concept. Some attempts have been made to categorize and the following section discusses those attempts. The authors who see various types of tone seem to agree that there are no discrete boundaries between one type of tone and another, and that there is a continuum for these tone types. The categories of tones presented are: Sound Tones; Author Relationship Tones; Simple and Complex Tones; Biological and Intellectual Tones; Local and Global Tones. Whether an

author defines tone as sound, attitude, style, or mood determines his tone categories.

Sound tones. There are two categories possible for the sound of voice that can be applied to written tone. The two "sound" continuums are loud-soft and pleasant-harsh (McCawley, 1971). He gives poems as examples for each end of the continuum: (1) loud: "Ode to the West Wind" (Shelley); (2) soft: "To Sleep" (Keats); (3) pleasant: "To Autumn" (Keats); (4) harsh: "The Canonization," first stanza (Donne).

Author relationship tones. McCrawley uses other continuums to refer to various forces causing the speaker (writer) to speak as he does. The first force is the speaker's self-image at the moment of utterance (composed of elements that he is conscious of, others of which he is unconscious; and others of which he may be half-conscious). This is the relationship of the speaker to himself which has three continuums: confident-diffident; pompous-modest; abandoned-cautious. The poems that illustrate these self-image tones are: (1) confident: "Ulysses," lines 62-70 (Tennyson); (2) diffident: "In Memoriam," section LV (Tennyson); pompous. "Invictus" (Henley); modest: "Ode on a Grecian Urn," first stanza (Keats); abandoned: "Home-Thoughts, From Abroad" (Browning); cautious: "Loveliest of Trees" (Housman).

Another force operating on the speaker's manner of speaking is the set of suppositions he seems to make as to the presence of a listener and the nature of the listener. McCrawley finds five "listener" continuums: formal-informal, distant-intimate, courteous-discourteous, dominant-

dependent, loving-hating. The examples are: (1) formal: "Lycidas," lines 1-14 (Milton); (2) informal: "Marriage" (Corso); (3) distant: "The Kraken" (Tennyson); (4) intimate: "The Pasture" (Frost); (5) courteous: "Go Lovely Rose" (Waller); (6) discourteous: "Tract," lines 45-56 (Williams); (7) dominant: "Ode on Melancholy" (Keats); (8) dependent: "Ode on a Grecian Urn" (Keats); (9) loving: "Bright Star" (Keats); (10) hating: "Avenge O Lord thy slaughtered saints" (Milton). These examples would illustrate tones resulting from the author's relationship to the reader.

The final force discussed by McCrawley is the way a speaker chooses to position himself with regard to the subject his mind is focused on. Seven "subject" continuums are used to categorize tones produced by the author-subject relationship. The following poems illustrate this category: (1) serious: "Lycidas," lines 1-14 (Milton); (2) light: "The Theology of Jonathon Edwards" (Phyllis McGinley); (3) excited: "Corinna's Going a-Maying," first stanza (Herrick); (4) calm: "Elegy in a Country Church-yard," lines 1-12 (Gray); (5) emotional: "Composed Upon"; (6) detached: "Morning at the Window" (Eliot); (7) positive: "God's Grandeur (Hopkins); (8) negative: "Death of the Ball Turret Gunner" (Jarrell); (9) happy: "Pippa's Song" from Pippa Passes (Browning); (10) sad: "Me Thought I Saw my Late espoused saint (Milton); (11) sincere: "Ode to Duty" (Wordsworth); (12) ironic: "To His Coy Mistress," lines 31-32 (Marvell); (13) tough-minded: "Dulce et Decorum Est" (Owen); (14) tender-minded: "With Rue My Heart is Laden" (Houseman).

According to McCrawley, the examples "should be taken in the spirit of an algebra problem: Let X equal 10; then let what is the value of Y in the following equation . . . He realizes that not all readers of poetry will agree that "Ode to the West Wind" is an extremely loud poem but he proposes to let it stand for "extremely loud" and let "to sleep" represent "extremely soft" and test all other poems or passages by these norms. McCrawley is attempting with his continuum method to arrive at a more scientific classification of tone, realizing it is a sort of "personal" objectivity. His method would have a large number of subjects rate a certain set of poems on the continuum-chart, and then take those figures as a body of data to be examined for whatever results they might indicate for tone. The methodological comparison could be used as a means for setting up some basic categories of tone which could be studied in turn for family characteristics.

Simple and complex tones. Another way to categorize tone is by its simplicity or complexity. Some authors see simple and complex tones, easy and difficult tones, and tones appropriate or inappropriate for children. Lukens (1976) sees Tom Sawyer as having a complex tone because although Twain maintains an overall humorous tone, he has a variety of tones toward subjects such as boy-girl crushes, ceremony, theft, sermons, the forbidden, showing off accusation, and public sentimentality. These various tones include ironic, sarcastic, cynical, tenderness, delight, suspense, excitement and humor, all of which are used by Twain to show the complexity and perversity of life. Andersen's "The Ugly Duckling" is another example of complexity in tone because of the tone shifts and

	loud-soft	pleasant-harsh	confident-diffident	pompous-modest	abandoned-modest	formal-informal	distant-intimate	courteous-discourteous	dominant-dependent	loving-hating	serious-light	excited-calm	emotional-calm	positive-negative	happy-sad	sincere-ironic	tough-tender
Sh's Sonnet 73	6	3	5	6	4	7	7	1	5	1	1	7	2	7	1	1	5
Corinna's Going	1	1	1	3	1	7	7	4	3	1	7	1	1	1	1	1	4
Canonization, I	1	7	1	3	2	2	1	1	1	7	2	1	1	7	4	5	5
Lycidas 1-14	4	2	3	3	4	1	1	1	1	2	1	7	2	2	7	6	2
Go Lovely Rose	6	1	4	7	7	2	7	1	4	1	1	7	2	3	1	1	6
Constant Lover	2	5	1	1	2	5	6	4	4	3	7	2	2	2	1	1	2
Coy Mistress 1-20	3	1	1	4	1	7	6	1	4	1	7	2	2	1	1	5	2
Gray's Elegy 1-14	7	1	3	7	7	1	4	1	4	4	1	1	7	3	1	1	5
John A. My Jo	3	1	2	6	4	6	7	3	4	1	3	6	3	1	1	1	7
The Lamb	5	1	6	7	6	4	6	1	4	1	3	5	3	1	1	2	7
The Tiger	3	4	5	5	4	2	1	1	6	4	2	6	2	4	1	1	3
London	2	6	2	4	4	1	1	5	4	4	7	1	3	1	7	1	1
W'minster Bridge	7	1	4	7	2	4	5	4	4	4	2	1	1	1	1	1	6
Ode West Wind, I	1	2	5	4	1	1	5	3	6	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	7
Grecian Urn, I	7	1	4	7	2	1	1	7	1	7	1	1	3	1	1	1	6
Nightingale, I	7	1	4	7	1	1	6	1	7	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	7
Melancholy, I	2	5	2	3	3	2	6	3	1	3	2	4	3	6	1	1	4
Tithonus 1-10	3	3	5	2	5	2	2	4	4	5	1	6	2	7	7	1	2
Dover Beach 1-6	6	1	4	6	4	3	5	1	4	6	2	7	5	2	4	1	7
Dover Beach 29-37	3	5	2	3	3	4	5	3	1	2	4	3	7	6	2	3	4
Last Dutchess 1-13	2	2	1	2	5	1	1	1	2	4	4	3	7	6	1	1	4
Richard Cory	3	4	3	7	6	3	5	2	4	4	4	3	7	6	4	5	1
When Lilacs 33-45	3	2	3	2	2	1	4	1	6	2	1	5	1	2	7	1	7

Figure 1. Suggested continuum-ratings for twenty-three familiar passages of poetry.

McCrawley

range of tones. Lukens states that a child may read "The Ugly Duckling" often during the early years because of the range of tones; at each new reading, the child discovers a new tone open and available. The story, since it is rich in meanings, gives a richness of understanding to the reader.

There are some overall tones according to Lukens that are too intellectual and too complex for children and therefore unsuitable for children's texts. Satire with its intent to reform is often too intellectual because it demands breadth of experience and ability to see and interpret exaggeration and understatement. Sarcasm with its intent to wound is also too complex and thus questionable for children. Condemnation, as well as fear and pessimism, seem to have little place in literature; without experience to place these negative tones in perspective, children may be overwhelmed and moved to despair. Lukens believes that tone for children's literature must be, if not optimistic, at least positive, or perhaps objective. For Lukens, it appears that simple tones are optimistic or positive and non-intellectual while complex tones are negative and intellectual, requiring much prior experience and knowledge.

Phillips (1910) also believes there is such a thing as relative ease and difficulty in respect to some of the tones of emotions. The tones of joy, anger, appeal, pity and many other tones of emotion are easy to grasp because they are symbols for feelings aroused in us frequently. Tones of despair, horror, hatred, agony, and terror are more difficult than others since the corresponding feelings are aroused in us rarely. These can be graded in accordance with their relative difficulty of

expression. The essential thing is a grading, not of the kind of tone, but of the degrees of difficulty in the expression of a particular tone. This difficulty may be due either to the varying degrees of intensity in the tone as in the case of love, or, to varying degrees of difficulty in literary style, due to the unusual in phrase, sentence structure, or thought, as in many passages from Shakespeare and Milton.

Not only does Phillips classify tone according to ease or difficulty based on frequency of the arousal of the feeling, he also classifies tone as dominant or non-dominant based on whether it is sustained in a passage or not. He finds some 200 phases of feeling he calls tones. Some of the tones may have a close resemblance to others but each has some distinguishing characteristic (Phillips does not discuss what these would be) that justifies its inclusion. Some fifty to sixty tones can be illustrated for the dominant, sustained tones. For instance, selections can be found for (1) Explanation: "The Battlefield of Waterloo" (Victor Hugo); (2) Geneality: "Agreeable People" (Talmage); (3) Assertion: Selections from Emerson; (4) Solemnity: Selections from Abraham Lincoln.

Lumping various kinds of emotions into either a broad serious or light tone category, McCrawley (1971) considers the serious tone more difficult than the light tone. For his serious tone, one finds these kinds of emotions being expressed and kinds of things that have given rise to the emotions: regret, faith, bereavement, loneliness, nostalgia, religious ecstasy, despair, religious doubt, acceptance, admiration, stoicism, indignation, passion for beauty, among others, each with a poem

The Role of Tone

37

as an example. For the light tone one finds such feelings as delight in nature, delight in a girl's looks, amusement at human foibles, joy in certain human activities, and so on. Delight characterizes the light tone whereas the emotions range from delight to sorrow characterize the serious tone. The difference is a matter of range of emotions.

A text with a light tone is limited to delight of some kind while any feeling at all can be expressed in a text with a serious tone. A text with a serious tone is likely to be exploring an idea or angle of vision that is unfamiliar or unique, whereas a text with a light tone expresses what the reader already knows, believes or accepts as new. Serious tone usually involves a high degree of privacy with the author addressing either his own inner self or some close acquaintance; light tone involves publicness, with an author speaking for the record, to a larger audience. The author of a text with a serious tone, a poem, for instance, is so completely absorbed by his subject as to seem almost in a hypnotic trance, unaware of anything else that is going on around him; the author of a light toned poem, however, is not so enthralled by his subject, and is instead more likely to be keeping one eye on his audience as he performs.

Serious tone is a more difficult tone, perhaps, because of its syntax. Serious tone seems to be associated with extended syntax. By extended syntax, McCrawley means "the tendency to keep a sentence going once it has been set in motion, the tendency to find ways of branching off from one phrase into another, to add a qualifying phrase here and a relative clause there, or to prolong the syntactical unit in any of a dozen other

ways." An example is the first sentence of the poem "Go, Lovely Rose" written in prose-fashion: "Go, lovely rose, tell her that wastes her time and me that now she knows, when I resemble her to thee, how sweet and fair she seems to be." A poem with light tone, on the other hand uses short syntactical units such as "Gather ye rosebuds while ye may." In addition, the syntax of texts with serious tone seems to vary more than that of lighter tone, with a wider variety of sentence types (including the more unfamiliar, less frequently used ones) used for serious tone. Finally the syntax is complex for serious tone but simple for light tone.

The range of emotions possible, the unfamiliarity of ideas or angle of vision, privateness, intensity, and syntactical complexity account then for the difficulty of serious tone while the light tone is accounted for by the single emotion of delight, the familiarity of idea and perspective, publicness, lack of intensity, and syntactic simplicity.

Brooks and Warren use as examples of complex tones overstatement; understatement; irony (bitter, lighthearted, simple and complex); the familiar essay; and formal public utterance. The tone of the familiar essay is based on the assumption that the reader is a companion, one of the initiates who can be counted on to appreciate the writer's values, to respond to his jests, to understand his allusions, to take, without any urging, the writer's own attitude towards the materials with which he deals. The familiar essay, therefore, frequently makes use of literary allusions, quotations, and semi-quotations from the classics, the more subtle forms of irony, and in general, all the devices of indirection

because it is assumed the reader is able to follow them and will relish them. A relative complexity of tone may also characterize texts that are formal, a set piece, to a public audience. Here the complexity results from a literary vocabulary and formalized rhythms giving a sense of balanced ; antithesis or other classic rhetorical devices.

As an example of complexity of tone, Brooks and Warren give an example from the autobiography of T. E. Lawrence describing an incident that occurred in Arabia during World War I while he was serving with the Arabs in their revolt against Turkey. The incident occurred while Lawrence was leading a raiding party of Arab tribesmen.

My followers had been quarrelling all day, and while I was lying near the rocks a shot was fired. I paid no attention; for there were hares and birds in the valley; but a little later Suleiman roused me and made me follow him across the valley to an opposite bay in the rocks, where one of the Ageyl, a Boreida man, was lying stone dead with a bullet through his temples. The shot must have been fired from close by; because the skin was burnt about the wound. The remaining Ageyl were running frantically about; and when I asked what it was, Ali, their head man, said that Hamed the Moor had done the murder. I suspected Suleiman, because of the feud between the Atban and Ageyl . . . but Ali assured me that Suleiman had been with him three hundred yards further up the valley gathering sticks when the shot was fired. I sent all out to search for Hamed, and crawled back to the baggage, feeling that it need not have happened this day of all days when I was in pain.

As I lay there I heard a rustle, and opened my eyes slowly upon Hamed's back as he stooped over his saddle-bags, which lay

The Role of Tone

40

just beyond my rock. I covered him with a pistol and then spoke. He had put down his rifle to lift the gear: and was at my mercy till the others came. We held a court at once; and after a while Hamed confessed that, he and Salem having had words, he had seen red and shot him suddenly. Our inquiry ended. The Ageyl, as relatives of the dead man, demanded blood for blood. The others supported them; and I tried vainly to talk the gentle Ali round. My head was aching with fever and I could not think; but hardly even in health, with all eloquence, could I have begged Hamed off; for Salem had been a friendly fellow and his sudden murder a wanton crime.

Then rose up the horror which would make civilized man shun justice like a plague if he had not the needy to serve him as hangmen for wages. There were other Moroccans in our army; [Hamed the Moor was a Moroccan] and to let the Ageyl kill one in feud meant reprisals by which our unity would have been endangered. It must be a formal execution, and at last, desparately, I told Hamed that he must die for punishment, and laid the burden of his killing on myself. Perhaps they would count me not qualified for feud. At least no revenge could lie against my followers; for I was a stranger and kinless.

I made him enter a narrow gully of the spur, a dank twilight place overgrown with weeds. Its sandy bed had been pitted by trickles of water down the cliffs in the late rain. At the end it shrank to a crack a few inches wide. The walls were vertical. I stood in the entrance and gave him a few moments' delay which he spent crying on the ground. Then I made him rise and shot him through the chest. He fell down on the weeds shrieking, with the blood coming out in spurts over his clothes, and jerked about till he rolled nearly to where I was. I fired again, but was shaking so that I only broke his wrist. He went on calling

out, less loudly, now lying on his back with his feet towards me, and I leant forward and shot him for the last time in the thick of his neck under the jaw. His body shivered a little, and I called the Ageyl; who buried him in the gully where he was. Afterwards the wakeful night dragged over me, till, hours before dawn, I had the men up and made them load, in my longing to be free of Wadi Kitan. They had to lift me into the saddle. - T. E. Lawrence: "Seven Pillars of Wisdom," Chap. 31.

The first impression of tone in this seems to be one of detachment and dryness. A young or less able reader might well decide, on reading this passage, that Lawrence was a callous man, or that he considered the Arabs to be bloodthirsty savages and therefore without the feelings of real human beings, or even that he got a positive satisfaction out of ridding the earth of Hamed, the killer. The mature, sensitive reader, however, recognizes the subtle and complex tone and realizes that far from remaining cool and detached, Lawrence was indeed terribly shaken by the experience. The restrained account of the actions, leaves the reader to infer from the actions themselves what Lawrence's feelings must have been. This restraint has important effect on tone; it implies a certain confidence in the reader's maturity--the reader need not be "told" what Lawrence was feeling and it is a reflection of, and a type of the disciplined control which he imposed on his followers and on himself in the desert. His manner of writing about the event suggests his attitude toward the event itself.

Brooks and Warren point out that one can draw a more general conclusion about tone from this example. It is that subtlety of attitude

and complexity of attitude usually can only be suggested, not stated directly. The writer has to trust to the effect of the whole passage, or even to the whole book--not to explicit statements of feelings. And this means that he has to place a good deal of reliance on his readers. It is evident then that simplicity of tone for Brooks and Warren is the explicit statement of an author's own feelings and attitudes, a personalized statement, such as one might find in a political text rather than a generalized statement.

Biological and intellectual tones. A distinction is made by Beloof (1966) between basic, non-lingual, biologically-oriented tones and the non-instinctive, literary, intellectual tones. The biological tones such as hate, greed, love, pain, sadness, happiness, illness, discomfort are nonlingual in origin and have obvious and inevitable bodily correlations. These tones are easy to recognize by readers--they seem to have little trouble with those tones whose lingual signals they have adequately developed in their own bodies by imitation of the normal bodily, vocal, and verbal signals of their everyday environment. A happy person has a bodily attitude--he bounces along, smiles, and talks crisply--and a simple physical pose is likely to spring to the reader's mind that is very expressive and a subliminal bodily response. The conceptual; intellectual tones such as paradox, irony, ambiguity arise out of more complex and sophisticated levels of verbal signals. Readers are not likely to have encountered them during their openly imitative period; they are a new and subtle phenomena, difficult to recognize. These intellectual tones

are more literary in their construction and comprehension and cannot be visualized as a single pose. No doubt a dancer could execute a series of movements which could express these concepts which indicates that they are complexes.

Miller and Johnson-Laird (1976) and Ortony and Clore (1981) in discussing the emotional lexicon also distinguish between the biological and intellectual. Miller and Johnson note that emotions like colors occur with different intensities and can be mixed. The ability to be mixed suggests that there is some set of primary or landmark emotions from which more complex feelings derive but there is no agreement as to what these primary emotions might be. Another way to categorize emotions are feelings, feelings for, and feelings because. These distinctions are useful in trying to characterize emotional experiences.

A term like "pity" combines an intellectual and an emotional concept: to pity someone is to know or perceive (the intellectual part) something about him for which one feels sorry. "Blame" would be another example of the emotional-intellectual combination while "like" on the other hand, suggests a direct emotional bond. Not only has the emotional lexicon entered the semantic field of the intellect but also that of motivation and bodily states. Many states of mind with an emotional complexion such as bordeom, loneliness and curiosity can be motivating and the terminology of bodily states (cold, pain, warm, tired) pervade the emotional field.

An attempt was made by Ortony and Clore (1981) to disentangle the emotional lexicon using "a set of heuristics for isolating genuine emotion words (and other kinds of words) from a list of putative emotion words"

and taking the form of a group of sentence frames into which a candidate word is inserted. They classify the affective lexicon into pure emotions, hybrids, pure traits, other action words, body-state words, and cognitive state words. Examples of these categories are: (1) Pure Emotions: disgusted, distressed, embarrassed, jubilant, and love-sick; (2) Hybrids: anxious, proud; (3) Pure Traits: superstitious, materialistic; (4) Other Action Words: abused, abandoned, appreciate, ignored; (5) Body-state: breathless, dizzy, drowsy, refreshed; (6) Cognitive-state: bored, doubtful, puzzled, uncertain, uninspired, amused, certain, interested. The authors believe these categories are intuitively reasonable and that they represent psychologically important distinctions. They see the need to know how these distinctions correlate with behavioral differences.

All of this has implications for the study of tone and reading comprehension, for reading educators also need to know what categories of tone exist and how a certain type of tone might correlate with reading behaviors. As students move through the grades, reading more expository prose in content area classes, they will increasingly need to be able to handle complex, intellectual tone.

#### Tone and Meaning

To argue that tone is a necessary factor in a model of comprehension, it is necessary to discuss meaning in relation to comprehension and tone. This section discusses the various types of meaning and tone as a symbol of meaning, drawing on philosophy, literary criticism, and aesthetic theory.

The Role of Tone

45

Philosophic Theories of Meaning. The nature of meaning is still subject to philosophical inquiry and dispute, but it is commonly agreed that meanings are elements of understanding and that understanding is a broad term. Although many consider terms like "apprehend," "comprehend," "grasp," and "understand" to be equivocal, dictionaries point out that these verbs refer to varying degrees of mental perception. "Apprehend" is often limited to perception and does not imply full understanding. "Comprehend" stresses attainment of full understanding. "Grasp" suggests seizing an idea firmly. "Understand," nearer in meaning to "comprehend," can also suggest sympathy, compassion, or insight. Understanding then seems to have a similar but somewhat broader, richer meaning than comprehension, more emotion-oriented, experienced-based.

Richards (1929) discusses meanings in relation to the functions of language. Most human utterances can be regarded from four points of view: Sense, Feeling, Tone, Intention. (1) Sense: Here we direct our hearer's attention upon a state of affairs, present some items for consideration with words. Sense has to do with what we say--the content. (2) Feeling: We have some feelings about these states of affairs we are referring to--some special bias of interest towards it, some personal coloring of feeling, and we use language to express these feelings and this nuance of interest. (3) Tone: The speaker has an attitude toward his listener. The tone of his utterance reflects this relation, his sense of how he stands towards those he is addressing. (4) Intention: This is the aim, conscious or unconscious, the effect the speaker is endeavoring to promote.

The Role of Tone

46

Richards, Ogden and Richards (1923) and the general semanticists subscribe to a referential theory of meaning--language is a system of symbols and words are fundamentally names. Linguistic meaning is in the object to which the symbol refers, or in the relationship between symbol and object. Another theory of meaning is the ideational theory, espoused by Susanne Langer (1942, 1953) who asserts that symbols do not represent objects, "but are vehicles for the conception of objects." Consequently, in talking about things we have conceptions or ideas of them and "it is the conceptions, not the things that symbols directly mean" (p. 61). Osgood (1957) adopts a behavioral theory of meaning based on his mediation hypothesis and is a primary source for those maintain that a symbol's meaning is not to be found in its referent--whether object or idea--or in the relationship between symbol and what is symbolized. Instead, the behaviorists maintain that the meaning of a symbol is in the behavioral response that it elicits in those who perceive it. "Symbolization is a mediation process. A word can be a pattern of stimulation which 'means' or 'refers to' a particular object because it elicits in the organism employing it part of the same behavior which the object itself elicits" (p. 696).

The referential, ideational, and behavioral theories are representational theories in that they rest on the assumption that the function of linguistic entities (words, phrases, sentences) is to represent other things, and that these other things figure prominantly in what the entities mean.

The ordinary language philosophers such as Ryle (1949) and Austin (1961, 1962) question representational theories of language and meaning. Austin suggests that there is no meaning in some entity (referent, designation or idea). There is no simple and handy appendage of a word called 'the meaning of (the word) x.' They contend that generalizations about referring and naming are incorrect and distort the nature of language and that language using is ordinary behavior. The language analyst should be concerned not with formal structure of utterances but with the linguistic behavior of the speaker:--"The total speech act in the total speech situation." These philosophers feel that it is an overgeneralization to characterize language as essentially or uniformly representational or symbolic. They stress the importance of studying meaning by focusing not on the extralinguistic elements utterances allegedly represent or symbolize, but on the language games (specific instances of use, plus conventions, habits, rules, and traditions that determine ordinary use) which are the speech acts.

#### Response Meanings

Types of meaning are often distinguished by students of language according to the type of response involved (Shipley, 1970). The main distinction here is between "emotive meaning" and cognitive (or descriptive or referential) meaning. Some writers also speak of "pictorial meaning"--the tendency of a sign to evoke images in the hearer. Emotive meaning is a meaning in which the response (from the hearer's point of view) or the stimulus (from the speaker's point of view) is a range of emotions in

contrast to meanings in which the relevant response and stimulus are "cognitive" states and processes, such as thinking, believing, supposing, doubting. For example, an opponent of the "New Criticism" school of literary criticism might use the word "formalism" and the cognitive meaning would consist in its tendency to call attention to the structure and unity of poems. The emotive meaning consists, in part, in its tendency to arouse a feeling of disapproval in the hearer, as, in turn, its utterances shows a feeling of disapproval on the part of the speaker. The word "disapproval" does not have emotive meaning, though it refers to a feeling.

An important problem raised by this distinction lies in the connection between the emotive meaning of words, sentences or texts and their cognitive meanings. Modern empiricists argue that to a significant extent the emotive meaning is independent of the cognitive meaning, so that an utterance may have emotive meaning without having cognitive meaning; an utterance may vary in either type while the other remains unchanged; and two utterances may have the same cognitive meaning but very different emotive meanings. Others have urged a much closer connection between the two types, especially in the case of poetry; many critics, either in theory or practice, hold that the emotional effect of poetry depends in large part upon its cognitive meaning. Though much debated and very important, this issue is far from clear (Beardsley, in Shipley, 1970).

Poetic theories of meaning. Literary critics talk about two kinds of meaning: referential (the reference of verbal symbols and their syntactic relations to the outside world of things and their real relations)

an imitation view based on philosophic realism. Philosophic idealism lead to an opposite view of meaning, a poetic expressionism or intuitionism approach. The romantic critics claim there is more than one kind of meaning. Referential (propositional) meaning is inferior to transcendent, intuitive meaning in poetry. They see a psychological opposition between the reason and the imagination and regard poetry as dedicated to the kind of meaning furnished by the unbounded powers of imagination. Since the imagination is the only means of reaching this transcendent meaning, the cognitive function of poetry is unique and irreplaceable according to their view. The intuitionist view originates in Plato's idea of the inspired poet who intuits the highest truths. This definition of the poet developed into theories of imagination culminating in German and British romanticism. The intuitive position sees the act of imagination as being literally an act of cognition, the most crucial act of cognition we can perform (Preminger, 1965).

There were those who denied that poetry had any kind of meaning. These literary critics have not been interested in relating what is in the literary work to the nonaesthetic world outside - to life. Rather, they see the function of poetry in its affective relations with its readers. Poetry exists not for what it is or means, but for what it can do for us as therapy. Richards (1926) seems to have such a theory. He sees two types of discourse: (1) referential discourse which gives propositional truth using transparent, one-to-one signs and which is

The Role of Tone

50

thin, cold, and unfeeling, but lucid; (2) emotive discourse which does not make real statements, but pseudo-statements, which is pure myth--warm, able to appeal to impulses in readers, existing only to affect our total psychology, ambiguous and complex.

Antipositivistic critics, for example, Brooks (1947) and Ransom (1938; 1941), try to restore meaning to emotive discourse. They see propositional discourse as inadequate because it is so one-to-one in relation to things, thin, generic, and abstract. The pure symbols of science are static, unyielding, not highly charged or dense and without contextual qualifications and complexities. This discourse then cannot do justice to the dynamics and the fullness of our experiential world, but poetry can. According to this view, poetry has a meaning different from propositional meaning. It is not the intuitive meaning suggested for poetry by the romantics, nor is it related to any faculty psychology and it is not to break through to the essential realities of an intellectual world. Rather it is related to the immediate world of our experience. The meaning yielded by the poetic context might be termed "presentational meaning." Presentational meaning as contrasted to referential meaning is a many-faceted reflection of the fullness of experience which has its own rightful place as a possible cognitive function of discourse. Poetry has meaning because it deals with what Ransom calls the particularities in "the world's body." These are the aspects that must slip through "the inhumane sieve of formulae which either science or philosophy must use to accomplish its limited purposes" (Preminger, 1963: 478).

Poet critic T. S. Eliot discussed the 'thinking-feeling' dichotomy in connection with poetry and coined the term "dissassociation of sensibility."

He stated, according to Shipley (1970), "The poets of the seventeenth century . . . possessed a mechanism of sensibility which could devour any kind of experience . . . [But with Milton and Dryden] a dissociation set in, from which we have never recovered . . ." This malady of English poetry allegedly stemmed from a separation of the 'thinking' and 'feeling' parts of the poets' consciousness, an inability to accommodate intellection in the poetic synthesis. Thus thought and emotion appeared embarrassingly raw. A unified sensibility, such as Donne's, was able, on the other hand, to feel a thought, 'as immediately as the odour of a rose.' The poetry of the 'moderns' was to recapture this unified sensibility: 'The Waste-land' is a kind of pattern for the amalgamation of disparate elements. Coleridge's synthesizing Imagination is at the back of this idea, but the terms and concept derive from the French symbolist critic de Gourmont. Other critics attribute the disassociation to Hobbes or Bacon (Shipley, 1970).

Presentational symbols of meaning. For Langer (1942), the new key to philosophy of art is expressive forms. The idealists saw that science, myth, metaphorical thinking, and art are all intellectual activities determined by "symbolic modes" and revealed through phenomenal characteristics of experience. The idealists, according to Langer, have given us the most illuminating literature on non-discursive symbolisms--myth, ritual,

The Role of Tone

52

and art--which can be used in the study of symbol and meaning. She sees human response as a constructive processes and symbolization the key to that constructive (and perhaps reconstructive?) process. All genuine thought is symbolic; sense perception leads to symbolization which then leads to ideas. Symbolization is pre-ratiative but not pre-rational. The human brain carries on symbolic transformation of experiential data. Meaning, Langer argues, is that which makes symbols out of anything, symbols which can be discursive or presentational. Meaning rests upon a condition which is logical and has both a logical and a psychological aspect. Psychologically, anything used as a sign or a symbol must be used as a sign or symbol to someone and be capable of conveying a meaning. Both aspects, the logical and psychological, are always present and the interplay between them always produces a great variety of meaning-relations. The essence of meaning lies in the realm of logic--not qualities but relations.

Articulate symbols, Langer states, can be discursive or non-discursive. Non-verbal forms are capable of articulation but their laws are different from verbal forms. Rather than presenting their constituents linearly and sequentially, they present them simultaneously. The relations determining a non-verbal structure are grasped in one act of feeling. A complex feeling, one with many relations within relations cannot be projected into discursive form--it is too subtle for words. These non-discursive, presentational forms or symbols are the forms and qualities we distinguish, remember, imagine, or recognize--the entities which exceed and outlive our momentary experience. This non-discursive symbolism,

furnished by our purely sensory appreciation of forms, is a wordless one which is untranslatable, does not allow definitions within its own system, and cannot directly convey generalities. The meanings of all the other symbolic elements that compose a larger, articulate symbol are understood only through the meaning of the whole, through their relations within the total structure. Presentational symbolism is called so because the symbols involved are involved in a simultaneous, integral presentation that is a normal and prevalent vehicle of meaning.

This way of looking at presentational symbols, Langer argues, carries the scope of rationality far beyond the traditional boundaries, yet never breaks with logic. All symbols have meaning; no symbol is free from conceptualizing what it conveys. The import of each symbol is a meaning and therefore an element for understanding. Such a notion brings within the scope of reason, the much disputed life of feeling--much that has been traditionally relegated to "emotion" or intuition. Langer asks whether the order of perceptual forms is not a possible principle for symbolization and therefore the conception, expression, and apprehension of impulsive, instinctive, and sentient life, whether a non-discursive symbolism of light, color, or tone is not formulative of that life, and whether Bergsen's "intuitive" knowledge is not perfectly rational--a product of presentational symbolism which the mind reads in a flash, and preserves in a disposition or an attitude.

There are according to Langer, advantages of presentational forms like color or tone. They are a lower form of rationality than discursive

forms but are fast and have immediacy. In addition, the appreciation of meaning is probably earlier than its expression. The earliest manifestation of any symbol-making tendency, therefore, is likely to be a mere sense of significance attached to certain objects, forms, or sounds, a "vague emotional arrest of the mind." Our first understanding of forms is a literal comprehension of them as typical things or events. It is nondiscriminative, spontaneous, and practical, giving a common sense, primary meaning.

Richards (1929) seems to be discussing presentational meaning when he discusses the mutual dependencies occurring with sense and feeling.

Richards sees three types of sense-feeling interrelations with Type I the most obvious case where feeling is generated by and governed by the sense (propositional content). The feeling evoked is the result of comprehending the sense, and as a rule the two, sense and feeling, seem to form an indissoluble whole. Type II is an equally close tie, but the word (or text perhaps) first expresses a feeling, and such sense as it conveys is derived from the feeling. He illustrates this with "projectile" adjectives such as "gorgeous," "beautiful," "pleasant," and "good." These representative aesthetic adjectives register a "projection of feeling" and substitute for long descriptions of the specific feelings involved making up the more general feeling. The word "gorgeous" in poem 10, for instance, would have to include feelings of contempt mixed in with grudging admiration, and a certain richness, fullness, and satiation.

In Type III sense and feeling are less closely knit, the interrelationship coming as a result of their context. The distinction between words whose feeling tends to dominate their context and words of a more malleable nature is useful, for most mistakes in apprehending feeling hinge on this distinction. The influence of the whole work upon a part of the work such as a word or phrase is exerted in two ways--directly between the feelings and indirectly the sense. According to Richards, it's hard to say much about the direct way since words are chameleon-like in their feeling, governed in an irregular fashion by their surroundings like colors. Hardly anything is known about the laws governing the effects of collocation and mixture. More can be said about the indirect way in which the feeling of a phrase or word is controlled by the context--through the transactions between parts of the sense in the whole passage--since all of our verbal and logical intelligence can be brought to bear. Although we can usually determine rationally by examining the propositional content why we approve or disapprove a certain phrase, it is true that there is an odd fact to consider. "The phrase commonly is accepted or rejected, and its feeling, merged, for good or ill, into the poem long before the discursive intelligence has performed its task of working out the cross-implications, affiliations and discrepancies of senses which later on seem the explanation of its success or failure."

Three explanations are offered by Richards to account for immediate, instantaneous, apprehension and the undervaluing of intellectual analysis in the reading of poetry. First, it could be that the apprehension of a network of logical relations between ideas is one thing and the analysis

and clear formulation of them quite another. Apprehending the network of logical relations between ideas may often be easy and instantaneous. Here Richards appears to be discussing Langer's presentational meaning. At one point Richards states that of the four kinds of meaning (sense, feeling, tone, and intention) feeling and tone are more primitive than sense or intention. He goes on to say that the analysis and clear formulation of the logical relations is difficult and laborious. A case from life that shows this is a cricketer (or tennis player) who can judge a ball without being able to describe its flight; or say how or why he meets it as he does. A second explanation is that if, as is possible, some "dissociation" occurs during the process of reading a poem, the reader may under the influence of the poem, comprehend more than he does later in trying to reflect on it out of the "trance" afterwards. A third explanation is that concentrated, compressed language obstructs the normal way of discursively understanding where ideas are spread out and parts separated. The very concentration of closely packed, tightly woven ideas may assist immediate, instantaneous, apprehension.

For an example of how this indirect sense-feeling relationship might work, Richard uses this phrase: "O frail steel tissues of the sun" from a poem by G. H. Luce. Richards asks the reader to ask himself how much logical structure the sense seems to him to have as he reads (not when he reflects), how this logical structure which appears to him while reading seems the source of the feeling of the words, and whether the logical structure does not remain more a possibility than an actuality. He points out

that the sense here is intricate, and that when analyzed out shows a rational correspondence with the feeling which the reader may be supposed to have experience. Average readers, he believes, will not become clearly aware of the correspondence of the sense to feeling until they reflect on it, yet they will accept the logical statement. Moreover, he continues,

A definite and relevant feeling can be aroused at once. In fact, a feeling that is quite pertinent seems often to precede and clear grasping of the sense. And most readers will admit that, as a rule the full sense, analyzed and clearly articulated, never comes to their consciousness; yet they may get the feeling perfectly. The reception of Poems 1 and 5 was largely determined by whether the readers responded first to sense or to feeling. Still more does all this apply to tone. (Compare 5.81 and 5.53) [5.81 and 5.53 are student responses to poem 5.]

5.81. This is a studied orgasm from a "Shakespeare-R. Brooke" complex, as piece 7 from a "Marvell-Wordsworth-Drinkwater, etc., stark-simplicity" complex. Hollow at first reading, resoundingly hollow at second. A sort of thermos vacuum, "the very thing" for a dignified picnic in this sort of Two-Seater sonnet. The "Heroic" Hectoring of line 1, the hearty quasi stoical button-holing of the unimpeachably-equipped beloved, the magisterial finger-wagging of "I tell you this"!!! Via such conduits magnanimity may soon be laid on as an indispensable, if not obligatory, modern convenience.

5.53. On first reading, without fitting together the whole grammatically, meaning and spirit is caught. Bold start: uneven, forceful rhythm; imagery--(human, intimate, though so rapid): absence of colour: chiefly Saxon words with bold, unrestrained Latin interpolations:--all give clarity, vigour, cleanliness, virility, etc.

Both Langer and Richards seem to stress the importance of presentational meaning; cognition and acceptance of the text are influenced by presentational meaning.

The Role of Tone

57B

POEM 1

Life's more than breath and the quick round of blood.  
'Tis a great spirit and a busy heart;  
The coward and the small in soul scarce do live.  
One generous feeling, one great thought, one deed  
Of good, ere night, would make life longer seem  
Than if each year might number a thousand days  
Spent as is this by nations of mankind.  
We live in deeds, not years; in thoughts, not breaths;  
In feelings, not in figures on a dial.  
We should count time by heart-throbs. He most lives  
Who thinks most, feels the noblest, acts the best.

POEM 5

What's this of death, from you who never will die?  
Think you the wrist that fashioned you in clay,  
The thumb that set the hollow just that way  
In your full throat and lidded the long eye  
So roundly from the forehead, will let lie  
Broker, forgotten, under foot some day  
Your unimpeachable body, and so slay  
The work he most had been remembered by?

I tell you this: whatever of dust to dust  
Goes down, whatever of ashes may return  
To its essential self in its own season,  
Loveliness such as yours will not be lost,  
But, cast in bronze upon his very urn,  
Make known him Master, and for what good reason.

Implicit Meaning

Langer (1942) suggests a literary work of art both fiction and non-fiction, has more than discursive or presentational meaning. The text is an artistic symbol with implicit meaning. Understanding the idea in a work of art is a new experience, one where the idea imaginatively is experienced in the work of art, not apart from it. A literary artist's work is to create an emotive symbol with implicit meaning. The act of conception which sets this work going is the envisagement of the "commanding form," the fundamental feeling to be explored and expressed. This is the 'work of art in the artist's head'--a matrix of the work-to-be. The commanding form determines the weightiness, diction, the whole economy of the work. A lyric is composed of one total feeling; it is not "a series of little feeling-glimpses that string out into a play or novel." This commanding form is the implicit meaning the reader must comprehend, the total idea. The United Aim is what Phillips (1908) calls the implicit meaning. The United Aim is what the reader must understand, and it is a unity of the dominant thought and dominant feeling where the whole is more than the sum of its parts.

Meaning is considered by Langer to be a fabric of meaning. All thinking is conceptual and the conception begins with the comprehension of Gestalt. Gestalten, she says, have primary common sense meanings and secondary, dynamic, mythical, artistic meanings. Our first understanding of gestalten is a literal comprehension of them as typical things or such and such events. It is non-discursive, spontaneous, and practical, the meeting point of

thought and animal behavior based on sign-perception. The same items that are signs to our animal reflexes, however, are also contents for symbols.

It is possible that Richards (1929) was discussing this primary comprehension of gestalten. The reading where feeling is grasped before the logical structure is referred to by Richards as a summary kind of reading. If this summary reading is practiced by highly competent readers, there is no problem. But, he feels, the dangers to readers who are less quick and sensitive are obvious--dangers of not understanding the literal meaning and of a distorted understanding of feeling. Exercise in analysis and cultivation of the habit of regarding the text as capable of explanation is the corrective, but these are delicate exercises and usually this remedy is worse than the disease.

In Langer's view (1929) a work of art commands contemplation and reflective thinking. Full appreciation and comprehension involves the whole fabric of meanings in the work with the warp of the fabric being the facts (significations) which is the discursive meaning and the woof being the non-discursive, connotational meanings capable of indefinite growth along with other types of meanings not included in the true basic types of symbolism. These additional types of meaning do not necessarily correspond to either the discursive or non-discursive symbolism, but in general, literal meaning belongs to words and artistic meaning to images invoked by words and to presentational symbols, making it a sensuous construct. However, many presentational symbols such as maps, photographs, and diagrams have purely literal significance while a presentational symbol

like a poem has discursive statement as a factor in its complex, global form, although its significance is artistic.

The way that implicit meaning might come about in a text is suggested by Langer.

The fact that very few of our words are purely technical, and few of our images purely utilitarian, gives our lives a background of closely woven multiple meanings against which all conscious experiences and interpretations are measured. Every object that emerges into the focus of attention has meaning beyond the "fact" in which it figures. It serves by turns, and sometimes even at once, for insight and theory and behavior, in non-discursive knowledge and discursive reason, in wishful fancy, or as a sign eliciting conditioned-reflex action. But that means that we respond to every new datum with a complex of mental functions. Our perception organizes it, giving it an individual definite Gestalt. Non-discursive intelligence, reading emotive import into the concrete form, meets it with purely sensitive appreciation; and even more promptly, the language-habit causes us to assimilate it to some literal concept and give it a place in discursive thought. Here is a crossing of two activities: for discursive symbolism is always general, and requires application to the concrete datum, whereas non-discursive symbolism is specific, is the "given" itself, and invites us to read the more general meaning out of the case. Hence the exciting back-and-forth of real mental life, of living by symbols. We play on words, explore their connotations, evoke or evade their associations; we identify signs with our symbols and construct the "intelligible world"; we dream our needs and fantasisms and construct the "inner world" of unapplied symbols. We impress each other, too, and build a social structure, a world of right and wrong, of demands and sanctions.

The key to understanding a literary work of art is seeing the total idea, which is the commanding form that guided the composition of the work and recognizing that both the logical and psychological aspects are always present dynamically interrelating with each other. This interplay in turn, produces a great amount of meaning-relations. The essence of meaning and comprehension lies in the realm of logic--in the relations between meanings (Langer, 1929). An organic whole results from the various types of meaning working together in a text which authors refer to as the United Aim, Implicit Meaning, Total Effect, Total Attitude, or General Tone. The "Fabric of Meaning" metaphor allows one to see more clearly how important the connotative, unsaid aspects of an utterance (whether a word, sentence or whole discourse) is in a model of text comprehension.

Feeling as a symbol of meaning. Langer (1942) notes that many philosophical issues that seemed to concern the sources of knowledge now concern the forms of knowledge or even the forms of expression and symbolism. She feels, however, that it is not reasonable to renounce metaphysics since the recognition of the intimate relation between symbolism and experience is itself a metaphysical insight. Our whole criticism of traditional problems is based on this recognition. Metaphysics progresses from problem to problem rather than from premise to consequence; it is not a science with fixed presuppositions. Like philosophy, metaphysics is a study of meanings. Because all "the sciences" have not been finally established and because human language is not complete, we have not outgrown our need for metaphysics. Although most logicians view metaphysical

propositions as lyrics and music--expressive only with no representative functions," Langer disagrees, saying there is an unexplored possibility of genuine semantic beyond the limits of discursive language, the logical "beyond." Poetry and metaphysics are symbolisms often expressing the highly intellectual and should not be relegated to psychology. Rather, the study of the products of subjective experience, emotion, feeling, and wish which come to us as symptoms in the form of metaphysical and artistic fancies are a part of the field of semantics.

A language-bound theory of the mind errs, according to Langer, in its premise that all articulate symbolism is discursive. She believes that there are things that do not fit the grammatical scheme of expression in the physical, space time world of our experiences which are not blind, mystical affairs but simply matters requiring conception through a symbolistic schema other than discursive language. Such a symbolistic schema begins with an unconscious appreciation of forms which is the primitive root of all abstraction, which in turn is needed for rationality. Repeated experiences are analogous experiences, all fitting a form that was abstracted on the first occasion, and familiarity is the quality of fitting into very neatly into the form of a previous experience. The Gestalt-psychologists are correct, Langer notes, in their belief that Gestalting (forming?) is of the very nature of perception. It is this abstraction of forms that closes the gap and welds together perception and conception.

The sense data we receive from nature, the forms and qualities we distinguish, remember, imagine, or recognize are symbols of entities which go beyond and outlive our momentary experience. The symbols-qualities, lines, rhythms, colors, proportions are not only abstractable but combinatory. Many philosophers, therefore, speak of a "language of colors" or a "language of musical tones" but this is deceptive. Unlike language which has a vocabulary and a syntax, words equivalent to other words, and alternative words for the same meaning, non-discursive symbols have elements that are not units with independent meanings. The elements have no fixed meaning apart from their context. In language, the connotations are general, requiring non-verbal acts like pointing, looking, or emphatic voice-inflections, to give specific denotations to its terms. The propositional meanings conveyed through language are understood successively, and gathered into a whole by the process called discourse. The meanings of all other symbolic elements making up a larger, articulate symbol are understood only through the meaning of the whole, through their relations within the total structure. The functioning of the symbolic elements as symbols depends on their being involved in a simultaneous, integral presentation. Langer calls this kind of semantic "presentational symbolism," to distinguish it from discursive symbolism or "language" proper. One of these presentational symbolisms she says is tone.

An article by Professor Creighton "Reason and Feeling" cited in Langer (1942, pp. 91-92) states that if our mental life contains something besides

reason (discursive thinking) this something must be logical and must be feeling. Feeling then participates in knowledge and understanding somehow.

In the development of mind feeling does not remain a static element, constant in form and content at all levels, but . . . is transformed and disciplined through its interplay with other aspects of experience . . . Indeed, the character of the feeling in any experience may be taken as an index of the mind's grasp of its object; at the lower levels of experience, where the mind is only partially or superficially involved, feeling appears as something isolated and opaque, as the passive accompaniment of mere bodily sensations . . . In the higher experiences, the feelings assume an entirely different character, just as do the sensations and the other contents of mind.

We can see here that feelings have definite forms which become progressively articulated. Language is inadequate, Langer says to articulate that "character" which may be taken as an index of the mind's grasp of its object. Non-discursive symbolism, such as music, is peculiarly adopted to explanation of "unspeakable" things, the unsaid. Speakable thought and unspeakable thought are linked together since both are symbols, and unspeakable thought can be an aid in understanding representational, propositional meaning.

If "unspeakable thought," "feeling," and "tone" are all synonymous terms then tone is a symbol--a non discursive symbol that participates in knowledge, cognition, and understanding. This view of feeling and tone is held by the gestalt-psychologists and philosophers like Langer. Richards has a narrower meaning for feeling. He restricts feeling to

refer to pleasure/unpleasure; feeling is not another and vital way of apprehending but a set of signs of personal attitudes. Some people read these signs (feelings) better than others just as some people reason better than others--our great artists and expert sign readers. What matters for Richards is not the intensity of the signs but the quality of the reading of the signs (Shipley, 1970). Richards sees feeling as signs of personal attitudes (a subjective feeling) whereas Langer sees feeling as a symbol (an objective feeling). Langer notes that blind feeling conveys nothing but symbolic meaning conveys something the reader didn't know before like propositional content. Symbolic feeling is a conception, an object, an idea about feeling. This symbolic feeling is a paradox since it is impersonal and integral. It conveys a deeper meaning than personal feeling.

The notion of the paradox of "objective feelings" Langer discusses is an extension of the views of Baensch which appeared in an article in 1923 and which are cited in Langer (1953, pp. 19-20). Baensch wants to prove that the function of art is to be understood like science--not to give pleasure. He discusses objective feeling in the following manner:

The mood of a landscape appears to us to be objectively given with it as one of its attributes, belonging to it like any other attribute we perceive it to have . . . we never think of regarding the landscape as a sentient being whose outward aspect 'expresses' the mood that it contains subjectively. The landscape does not express the mood, but has it; the mood surrounds, fills and permeates it, like the light that illuminates it, or the odor it exhales; the mood belongs to our total

impression of the landscape and can only be distinguished as one of its components by a process of abstraction.

There are, then, 'objectives' given to . . . our consciousness, feelings that exist quite objectively and apart from us, without being inward states of an animate being. It must be granted that these objective feelings do not occur in an independent state by themselves; they are always embedded in and inherent in objects from which they cannot be actually separated, but only distinguished, by abstraction: objective feelings are always dependent parts of objects.

They do not belong to the form of the object, they are not relations, but belong to the content . . . they share in the non-sensory character of relational forms, but have something in common with the sensory content too, namely the fact that they are temporal qualitative contents . . . whose variety and richness readily match the prodigality of the sensory field.

(But whenever objective feelings 'inhere' in concrete objects) the manner of their inherence is such that the analogy with status of sense qualities breaks down. For the latter stand in relations to each other, they are combined and composed, so as to produce, jointly, the appearance of the object. Non-sensory qualities on the other hand surround and permeate this whole structure in fluid omnipresence and cannot be brought into any explicit correlation with its component elements. They are contained in the sensory qualities as well as in the formal aspects, and despite all their own variety and contrasts they melt and mingle in a total impression that is very hard to analyze.

Certainly feelings as experienced qualities are not vague or indefinite at all but have a very concrete and particular character. But to conceptual treatment they are recalcitrant

{

as soon as we try to go beyond the crudest general designations; there is no systematic scheme that is subtle enough in its logical operations to capture and convey their properties.

Nothing, therefore, avails us in life and in scientific thought but to approach them indirectly, correlating them with the describable events, inside or outside ourselves, that contain and thus convey them; in the hope that anyone reminded of such events will thus be led somehow to experience the emotive qualities, too, that we wish to bring to his attention.

Since they are non-sensory qualities, our apperception of them is also of a non-sensuous sort . . . there is no apperception so blind as the non-sensuous apperception of feelings . . . how we capture, hold, and handle feelings so that their content may be made conceivable and presented to our consciousness in universal form, without being understood in the strict sense, i.e., by means of concepts? The answer is: we can do it by creating objects wherein the feelings we seek to hold are so definitely embodied that any subject confronted with these objects, and emphatically disposed toward them, cannot but experience a non-sensuous apperception of the feelings in question. Such objects are called 'works of art.' (Logos, 11, 1923, pp. 1-14, cited in Langer, 1953, pp. 19-22)

Langer states "the status of the unfelt feelings that inhere in art objects is ontologically obscure" and their non-sensuous apperception epistemologically just as difficult. She feels the answer to these problems lies in picking up on his idea of the function of art like science being to acquaint the beholder with something he has not known before. This is close to her idea of symbolic agency. "The artistic symbol . . .

is deeper than any semantic of accepted signs and their referents, more essential than any schema that may be heuristically read."

So what then is one to make of tone and meaning? Certainly the relationship is problematic with the many interpretations of meaning, comprehension, tone, and feeling. It is obvious, too, that not all texts are literary works of art, and few texts are completely denotative or connotative. Perhaps it is safe to say that most are compromises--a fabric of meanings with discursive and non-discursive symbolic elements making up the warp and woof. The non-discursive meaning is not a residue but a key to understanding the text fully. Tone can be local or global; the general tone of a text can perhaps be best perceived as structural since the tones making it up are seen as a chain, textural insofar as each image or device producing a tone is apprehended sensuously as it comes--and contentual, since the chain carries a meaning that one link, an unrepeated image or tone, would not. A written utterance is a unified entity, an organic form with mutual dependencies of sense and feeling and intention. The objective feeling, which can be called tone, participates in knowledge of feelings and representational knowledge, giving the reader knowledge he didn't have before, reinforcing, reversing and integrating representational knowledge. The comprehension and full understanding of a text is a constructed fabric of meanings with the reader interacting with the objective denotative and connotative meanings. A model of reading understanding needs to be dynamic, making use of the

discursive, non-discursive, context, and reader factors for a rich, full understanding based on the rhythms of life.

#### Tone and Consciousness

When we read a text, or engage in any activity, we can distinguish levels of awareness, as if consciousness, like some geological formation, were stratified. We may be primarily aware of only one thing at a time, but be more or less aware of a great many other things going on around us at the same time. We are aware of them, but they are only the background to any dominant activity. Awareness is directed to one thing at a time, but that does not prevent us from being partly aware or tacitly aware of other things. Nor does it prevent us from doing more than one thing at a time. Some of these activities may be under conscious direction, others not. Our explicit knowing how is not a precondition for our doing (Tyler, 1978).

It is probable that when a reader reads a text, he is primarily aware of the "said"--the words, the propositional content--and only tacitly aware of the "unsaid"--the tone of the text. While the reader is focussing on the discursive meaning, he is at the same time making use of the non-discursive tone in subsidiary awareness. The pervasive tonal background of a text acts as a cohesive bond for all the elements of the propositional content in the reader's focal awareness. In a tapestry with some figures foregrounded and others in the background, a color scheme is a cohesive force, unifying all the figures. In the same way,

tone can be the unifying agent as it is in T. S. Eliot's poem The Wasteland, creating a unified sensibility out of jumbled impressions and assorted items.

#### Subsidiary and Focal Relationships

Leopold (1978), drawing on Michael Polanyi's notions of explicit and tacit inference, discusses the functional, phenomenal, and the semantic relationships between subsidiary and focal awareness, the two components of tacit inference. Leopold considers these relationships especially important for the problem of invention in rhetoric because they establish connections between categories of thought in focal and subsidiary awareness. It is possible that these relationships are equally important in establishing connections between the tone and propositional meaning of a text.

The functional relationship implies a pragmatic bond in which the subsidiary categories resemble mathematical variables whose values, assumed for the occasion, are necessary to interpret the focal object. It is the case in understanding the propositional content that the subsidiary categories of texture devices making up the tone are a requirement for knowing how to take and interpret the text. The phenomenal implies a transitive bond. The subsidiary categories do not disappear in the process of tacit experience; they reappear, though somewhat transformed, in the meaning of the focal object. This no doubt happens when the immediate apprehension of tone precedes the intellectual grasping of the

literal meaning, becoming integrated into the logical structure if the reader was mature and experienced with tone. The presentational meaning reappears in the full, final implicit meaning of the text. Finally, the semantic implies a heuristic bond between categories of thought in the two components; those in subsidiary awareness confer new significance on those of the focal object. Brooks and Warren (1949) have stated that tone qualifies and sometimes reverses the meaning of the literal statement. Leopold notes that these relationships emphasize both the purpose and the form of tacit inference.

That the reader has a tacit knowledge of tone is suggested by some of Sara Leopold's remarks. The concept of tacit knowledge is similar to the gestalt principle of recognizing a whole without being able to specify its parts. Leopold proposes an inclusive framework for discourse based on the Polanyian organic principle of tacit knowing (Polanyi, 1967, 1975 cited in Leopold). Her model of rhetoric contains two major parts: speaker/writer and audience/reader. Both parts include components of subsidiary awareness and focus linked by tacit inferences, to account for the similar process that occurs for both speaker and audience as they draw conclusions, make discoveries, or arrive at meanings. The writer or reader can arrive at knowledge by explicit inference or tacit inference. When using explicit inference, one can explain to himself and others, by means of specifiable evidence or method, a conclusion that has been drawn or a strategy used; it is reversible in that the path can be retraced. When using tacit inference, one cannot specify the evidence or strategy while

it is being used because it cannot be focused on during the process of tacitly inferring. The attention is fixed instead upon the focal object, which acquires meaning in the context of elements in subsidiary awareness. For the writer, tacit inference leads to the coherence of a pattern based on particulars in his subsidiary awareness. For the reader tacit inference leads to the discovery of the coherence of pattern based on particulars in his subsidiary awareness and the speaker's meaning.

The subsidiary awareness of the reader should include a sub-component of explicit inference which comprises all the ingredients used by the writer: topics of presentation, literary devices, and other elements of tone and style. These ingredients of explicit inference then become particulars of subsidiary awareness for the reader, who uses them, by means of a subsequent tacit inference, to understand the writer's meaning, his focal object. Tone is a particular of subsidiary awareness. Readers use tacit knowledge to apprehend tone while they focus on the linguistic forms of the text to understand it.

Functions of Tone

In most writing, as we noted earlier, an important part of what is being communicated is a quality of the general level of background emotion or feeling which is the mood or tone of the text. This is true not only of poetry and fiction, but also true of most essays, sermons, speeches, letters and exposition. Writers of exposition are rarely content to give mere facts or propositions, feeling that to do this would be painfully and technically "dry" (Brookes & Warren, 1979). Since texts have tone, one might ask, what is it that tone does for the text and for the reader. What exactly are the functions of written tone? This section will attempt to answer that question.

Tone and the text. When writers like Mark Twain in Tom Sawyer, for instance, use a variety of tones within an overall tone in their texts, they use tone to increase the scope and significance of the work. The text allows readers with various individual differences to continually be amazed, delighted, or informed on successive rereadings. At each new reading, the reader discovers a new tone open and available which corresponds to some idea or literal proposition in the text. The text, rich in tones that are symbols of meaning, gives a richness of understanding to the reader as he "unpacks" the meanings (Lukens, 1976).

The function of tone in 'atmospheric' writing is interesting and important. The word 'atmosphere,' according to Fowler (1973) reminds us of our ability to suspend analytical awareness as we think and read rather than the human propensity to arrange phenomena in patterns and think in

structures. 'Atmospheric' writing capitalizes on the reader's response of delight in an apparent temporary escape from structure.

Fowler characterizes 'atmospheric' writing and the functions of atmosphere (synonymous with tone) in the following passage:

Atmosphere is created where the overtones of the words and ideas employed reinforce one another; the avoidance of challenging disharmonies reduces the amount of intellectual effort required from the reader and prevents disruption of his sense of the uniformity and continuity of the work. The paradox of 'atmospheric' literature is that although (like almost all writing) it is linear, one word following another, it gives an appearance of stasis. Such German Romantics as Brentano and Eichendorff often use rhyme-words closely related in emotional colouring, so that the second rhyme-word, in recalling the first, includes it; thus a progressively all-engulfing sense of expansion is achieved. This, combined with effects of ebb and flow as one rhyme is replaced by another, eliminates a risk of 'atmospheric' writing, namely that it will seem aimless and meagerly repetitious, and sustains the paradox (exploited more complexly by some authors, e.g. Hardy) of a movement which is no movement.

Atmosphere is often created by the viewing of ordinary events from an unusual angle, giving them an air of mystery: in Alain-Fournier's Le Grand Meaulnes (1913) even everyday happenings at school (which themselves evoke nostalgia in the reader) are mysterious because the child's understanding is insufficiently developed to work out to his own satisfaction how they are affecting him.

One of the functions of textual tone then is to reinforce ideas. When there is a close correspondence between the overtones of words and other texture devices that produce tone and the propositional content, harmony results. Textual tone can act as a force to unify the work and give a sense of continuity to it, making the processing easier for the reader. With good writers there is a sense of movement rather than non-movement for the reader, expectations fulfilled, and needed redundancies where tone reflects theme, thesis or purpose.

In Grahame's The Wind in the Willows, Lukens (1976) notes the close relationship between the idyllic country setting, the gentle accepting characters and tone. The theme of peace, natural beauty, gentle and kindly acceptance are reflected in the setting which shows tone and in the characters' attitudes toward one another which also convey tone.

The ruddy brick floor smiled up at the smokey ceiling; the oaken settles, shiny with long wear, exchanged cheerful glances with each other; plates on the dresser grinned at pots on the shelf, and the merry firelight flickered and played over everything without distinction.

The tone in this passage reflects the theme of friendliness. Every item in Badger's house is friendly--we see smiles, cheerful glances, benches that have made visitors comfortable before the fire.

The setting for Moles' home shows tone, too, and with it the idea of love of home and a hospitable welcome:

A garden-seat stood on one side of the door . . . On the walls hung wire baskets with ferns in them . . . a skittle-alley, with benches along it and little wooden tables marked with rings that hinted at beer-mugs.

The kindness and acceptance of a generous host who seems his friends refreshments in leisurely comfort as evidence by the rings hinting of beer-mugs also appears in the characters' attitudes toward one another. Of the impetuous braggart toad, who keeps his friends in a state of constant concern, Rat says indulgently,

the best of animals . . . So simple, so good-natured, and so affectionate. Perhaps he's not very clever--we can't all be geniuses; and it may be that he is both boastful and conceited. But he has got some great qualities, has Toady.

Grahame's words intensify the strong feeling of community among the very different individuals. The accepting, positive tone parallels the main ideas of the text: peacefulness, acceptance, friendliness and concern.

Besides paralleling the main ideas of a text, tone also functions to hold details together in a text. In the following passage E. B. White skillfully holds his details together by a sustained and pervasive tone of affectionate incredulity.

It is a miracle that New York works at all. The whole thing is implausible. Every time the residents brush their teeth, millions of gallons of water must be drawn from the Catskills and the hills of Westchester. When a young man in Manhattan writes a letter to his girl in Brooklyn, the love message gets blown to her through a pneumatic tube--pfft--just like that. The subterranean system of telephone cable, power lines, steam pipes, gas mains and sewer pipes is reason enough to abandon the island to the gods and weevils. Every time an incision is made in the pavement, the noisy surgeons expose ganglia that

are tangled beyond belief. By rights, New York should have destroyed itself long ago, from panic or fire or rioting or failure of some vital supply line in its circulatory system or from some deep labyrinthine short circuit. Long ago the city should have experienced an insoluble traffic snarl at some impossible bottleneck. It should have perished of hunger when food lines failed for a few days. It should have been wiped out by a plague starting in its slums or carried in by ships' rats. It should have been overwhelmed by the sea that licks at it on every side. The workers in its myriad cells should have succumbed to nerves, from the fearful pall of smoke-fog that drifts over every few days from Jersey, blotting out all light at noon and leaving the high offices suspended, men groping and depressed, and the sense of world's end. It should have been touched in the head by the August heat and gone off its rocker.

-E.B. White, Here is New York

In the next passage filled with details about New York, there is no pervasive, consistent tone (or point of view) and as a result it seems disjointed, difficult to process and accept.

Although I was born and raised in New York, it still seems to me an exciting city. One can see beautiful sights no matter where you travel, especially up the West Side Highway where I saw the George Washington Bridge eloquently span the Hudson River from New York to New Jersey. What a hunk of engineering! All kinds of recreational activities are offered by New York: at Madison Square Garden you could be a spectator of almost any sport one is interested in: basketball, hockey, boxing. As for participating sports (which are, psychiatrists maintain,

therapeutically preferable), I can't imagine any that you wouldn't be able to take up: bowling, tennis, horseback riding, ad infinitum. A veritable cornucopia of cultural activities also awaits the visitor to New York: theatres where thespians from all over the country--nay, the globe-- exhibit their talents in plays that rival the splendor of the glorious age of Greek drama; museums which I had the opportunity to visit all my life and were always educational and are also interesting; concerts which are always well-attended by New Yorkers as well as a multitude of outsiders who will be eager to see their favorite artists in the flesh. No kidding, New York is an exciting city.

A reader would probably be turned off by the inconsistent, confused tone of this passage, a fact leading to the relationship of the function of tone and the reader.

Tone and reader response. Earlier it was noted that one of the reasons tone is important is that it affects not only comprehension, but also entry into the text (Dillon, 1981). Certain tones can turn off a reader so much that he refuses to read more than a few lines or pages of a text. Or if he does stay with the text, a tone he considers offensive may interfere with comprehension. Barzun speaks to this issue in his composition textbook:

What the reader calls pleasant or dull, what he remembers easily and returns to with eagerness, what he wishes more of in the form of new essays or stories or polemics or warns his friends to keep away from, is largely a function of tone. With rare exception, the subject matter of writing is common property to hundreds of authors. It is the treatment that

The Role of Tone

79

makes the subject more or less acceptable. To be sure, the response to any work varies with each reader, but it is possible to describe and classify tones so that the intending writer comes to notice in his own reading not the effect created as a whole--that is virtually automatic--but the features that make it what it is. Only by so doing can he learn to avoid the bad and adopt the good.

Some readers would feel quite negative with their first spontaneous impression of this sentence "When you're busted for drugs over there, you're in for the hassle of yo' life" which was produced by the U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare according to Barzun. Textual tone produces an impression that the reader always takes as deliberately aimed at him. Readers respond to the atmosphere and use it to picture the writer or his professional type which is why we can characterize tones as journalistic, novelistic, legalistic, pedantic, scientific, etc.

The tone of a text determines whether a reader will value the text or not. A text is judged by a reader to be "readable" or valuable depending on the tone. Lukens (1976) discusses differences in reader responses to the same text, noting that if the readers describe tone differently, "it is often the result of personal definitions of their descriptive terms, or the result of differing personal task and experience." Readers might describe the tone of the following passage from Winnie-the-Pooh quite differently:

"I think that I have just remembered something, I have just remembered something that I forgot to do yesterday and shant be able to do tomorrow. So I suppose I really ought to go back and do it now."

"It isn't the sort of thing you can do in the afternoon," said Piglet quickly. "It's a very particular morning thing, that has to be done in the morning, and, if possible, between the hours of--What would you say the time was?"

Pooh and Piglet do not converse in fragments the way people usually do, but in long, complex sentences filled with "that" clauses. And all the time, what they discuss so gravely is near nonsense. While one reader calls the tone whimsical and playful, another thinks the playfulness and sentiment excessive and calls the tone sentimental--an adult talking the way children never talk. The readers respond with differing opinions--a matter of taste--to the tone. Styles in writing change and sometimes it is the tone that retires a one time classic to a dusty shelf. Once popular sentimental novels, no longer are read, for the tone has gone out of style.

Another function of tone then is to make the text accessible to the reader which then leads to comprehension and appreciation and valuing. Tone is very powerful in its ability to turn a reader "on" or "off" to a text.

As Richards (1929) found in his experiment with college students tone is important for reading and responding to poems and in its ability to make readers persevere with a text to the end. A poorly written text where the

tone dissipates would no doubt loose readers as would texts that have little or no tone or a tone that conflicts with reader tone preference.

Tone and comprehension. Tone can function cognitively as well as affectively for readers. It is easy to perceive perhaps, how tone could give pleasure to readers, affect attitude arouse the same feeling in them as that contained in the text, but more difficult to see how tone might function in helping readers comprehend texts. Tone functions in comprehension as a symbol of meaning, a facilitator for knowledge and processing, a cohesive device and a signal.

The previous section on Tone and Meaning pointed out how tone is a symbol of meaning that may modify or even reverse the literal meaning indicated by words and syntax. As presentational meaning, it is part of the total meaning of the "speech act," according to Parrish (1968) who goes on to note that current teaching neglects a good many aspects of meaning needed for a full understanding of written language. Where attitudes are intended meanings, moods are generally unintended. Indications of how a writer intends what he says to be taken, attitudes, and moods are usually unnoticed by teachers and so not taught. Erwin-Tripp (1981) pointed out that both teachers and linguists look only at one function of text: to get the task done. They ignore second function of text which is to convey a changing or reconfirming relationship between text and reader or author and reader. Written texts have two systems or functions operating simultaneously just as spoken texts do, but the problem is that researchers and language experts have not looked at the systems in parallel, always disconnecting the feeling channel from the task channel. Many

readers also fail to see the multifunctionality of texts and disconnect the feeling and task channels (the unsaid tone and the said literal content). One result of this is that they take indirectness literally--taking literally what is said figuratively, ironically or sarcastically.

A text can be considered a gestalt. The Gestalt critics see all the elements of any work of art or literature as being variables with values that depend on their position in the "configuration" or on its total effect. Tone would have a high value because of its effect on reader comprehension. Since a gestalt is a structure, tone can be considered a key to text structure and text structure is an important part of what is to be comprehended by readers. By drawing on Polanyi (1967), it is possible to consider that when a reader reads, he fixes his attention on the linguistic forms (words, sentences, paragraphs) or semantic structures but cannot focus attention on subsidiary elements, the focal objects. The focal objects acquire meaning in the context of elements in subsidiary awareness; these elements are the texture of a text, which taken together result in tone. Perceiving a text or perceiving tone is like perceiving a gestalt. It is an active affair for the reader and functions in the discovery of new knowledge and recognition of prior knowledge. Perceiving tone begins with the particulars (the texture devices) that function as clues. The texture particulars of subsidiary awareness (the ingredients of tone) are used by readers to understand the authors' meaning, by way of tacit inference. The meaning of a text is the meaning of its features (the

particulars). The gestalt is an outcome of an active shaping of the reading experience performed in the pursuit of knowledge. Tone functions then as a facilitator for discovering knowledge and meaning. It functions as a clue because it is used subsidiarily to point to coherences beyond itself. Once readers see the coherence of a text, they see the texture clues differently. The tacit integration that results from readers using the particulars, the texture devices producing the tone, requires commitment, impassioned efforts, tentativeness, risk, and willingness to forego immediate closure (Watson, 198\_).

In his discussion of structure in literary texts, Beloof (1966) shows how emotion and logic are related and how emotion in texts relates to emotion in readers. Since tone is stipulated to be the general level of background emotion in a text, what he says is applicable to tone and its role in comprehension. Beloof states that the progression of emotion of speakers, narratives, characters (all the participants in fiction) are not the same as the implied author's, nor of the reader's. In many works, both poetry and prose, the emotional ordering provides the main structural pattern on which the work is based. The key structural device may be a sudden change of emotion or a gradual intensification using repetition. Some literary works use a strong sense of logic in their structure. At times the development of a logical pattern coincides with alterations in the emotion of the speaker; at times the development is for purposes of irony. The perception of these emotional and logical structures arises

## The Role of Tone

84

from perception of tones of voice. Literature also, since it moves in time, has narrative progression as part of structure. A reader who comprehends a literary work so that he is able to embody its elements in meaningful vocal patterns and bodily tensions, must have a thorough comprehension of narrative progressions and their successes and failures. The progression of gross patterns of action often provide the larger frame for other lesser progressions. A common description of the structure of a story--introductions, development, turning point, climax, denouement--equally describes the progression of not only the characters' emotions but also the reader's. The introduction serves to involve the reader's emotions, the complication or development serves to sustain, suspend, or complicate them, the climax serves to relieve tension, and the denouement serves to bring the reader's emotions back to tranquility, so that he doesn't feel frustrated. Here we see the interactive nature of tone and structure, the gestalt. Tone is a clue to perceiving the logical structure of a text when there is a correspondence between emotional and logical patterns.

As noted before, tone functions as a clue to the dominant themes, theses, and purposes of a text. It helps reveal emotional and logical structure, reveals character in fiction, acts in perceiving new knowledge and recognizing knowledge, aids in giving accuracy and completeness in interpretation, links together disparate details, and provides relations among linguistic items. It also functions to set up expectations for readers. Introductions and settings establish the dominant tone of a text even though there may be shifts of tone or embedded tones within

the text. Mature readers can use the expectations established early in the text to help them comprehend the logical content. The tone is a reoccurring motif leading to expectations for the important concepts and ideas. If the text tends to be "atmospheric" that is, seemingly non-linear, the tone acts to reduce the intellectual effort needed to process the text and also reduces the time to process it. The knowledge gained is a more immediate, direct knowledge, the kind that Brennan (1954) compares to knowledge through love, a knowing by becoming at one with it, and entering into it. Answering the question posed earlier about what tone does for the text and the reader involves a long list of functions for each.

#### Determinants of Tone

A natural question to ask about tone is "What determines tone?" "Just what are the forces that operate to produce tone?" The answer, of course, is that everything that goes into the construction of the text creates tone. Brooks and Warren (1949, 1979) have decided to divide up the determinants into smaller and larger elements or problems of tone. Under the smaller, more obvious devices that determine tone they discuss connotational diction. Tone is partly determined by deciding to use "officer" rather than "cop" or "rube" instead of "farmer." Projectile adjectives, which make direct valuations, (nice, gorgeous, good, fine, miserable, and so on) are another obvious device as are the emotional and subjective simple comparisons with little

or no objectives content ("He's a good egg," "She's a peach"). Diction, they feel, is only one of many elements that determine tone, elements such as figurative language, symbols, allusions, deviations from "normal" style, sentence structure and rhythm--all the linguistic devices referred to earlier as texture. The larger elements of tone they discuss are the adjustment of the text to specific and general audiences, the adjustment to subject material, irony, overstatement and understatement. For McCrawley (1971) the most important determiner of tone is the "role" or persona adopted by the author. "Role" is of a different order of things from rhythm, syntax, connotations, noun-patterns and the like; the role precedes all these things, determines them and is comprised of all of them. Milan and Rattner (1979) consider point of view the most basic determinant of tone while Watt (1980) feels tone is determined by time, place, occasion, subject, and purpose. According to Winkler and McCuen (1974) what determines tone depends on the text type or genre. In fiction, it's description and dialogue; in drama it's physical setting, descriptive language and dialogue; in poetry rhythm and rhyme convey tone.

Tone and adjustment to audience. According to Brooks and Warren (1949) a writer finds it easier to manage tone when he writes for a specific, particular audience than for a general audience. Writing which demands that the author take into account his particular audience is always "practical" writing--writing designed to effect some definite thing. The advertiser tries to persuade a housewife to buy something, a politician

writes a speech hoping citizens will vote for him, or a statesman urges a nation to adopt a certain course of action, the businessman sends customer a letter about an overdue account. A tone that wins one audience will repel another, so writers take into account the nature of the audience--its age, intelligence, amount of education, interest, habits and prejudices. The nature of the audience determines the tone of the text.

An example of a writer adjusting his tone because of his audience is a passage by Huxley. Huxley has a special audience in mind and a "practical" end in view. His audience is a nontechnical audience, and he writes for these intelligent laymen about scientific method. The audience is capable of following an argument, so Huxley tries to make himself clear, but he is not "writing down." In this passage he is concluding his argument that parts of England were once covered by the sea, and going on to argue that the period during which they were covered by the sea must have been a very long one. The scientist acting strictly as a scientist and waiting for other scientists does not argue with his readers; he "just tells them." The facts speak for themselves and in 'purely technical' writing they are allowed to speak for themselves. But the audience is a specially trained audience. Huxley is writing for an audience not so trained, and the tone takes that fact into account.

I think you will now allow that I did not overstate my case when I asserted that we have as strong grounds for believing that all the vast area of dry land, at present occupied by the chalk, was once at the bottom of the sea, as we have for any matter of history whatever; while there is no justification for any other belief.

less certain it is that the time during which the countries we now call south-east England, France, Germany, Poland, Russia, Egypt, Arabia, Syria, were more or less completely covered by a deep sea, was of considerable duration. We have already seen that the chalk is, in places, more than a thousand feet thick. I think you will agree with me, that it must have taken some time for the skeletons of animalcules of a hundredth of an inch in diameter to heap up such a mass as that. I have said that throughout the thickness of the chalk the remains of other animals are scattered. These remains are often in the most exquisite state of preservation. The valves of the shellfishes are commonly adherent; the long spines of some of the sea-urchins, which would be detached by the smallest jar, often remain in their places. In a word, it is certain that these animals have lived and died when the place which they now occupy was the surface of as much of the chalk as had then been deposited; and that each has been covered up by the layer of Globigerina mud, upon which the creatures imbedded a little higher up have, in like manner, lived and died. But some of these remains prove the existence of reptiles of vast size in the chalk sea. These lived their time, and had their ancestors and descendants, which assuredly implies time, reptiles being of slow growth

-Thomas Huxley: "On a Piece of Chalk," Discourses

Huxley might have shortened this passage by omitting such phrases as "I think that you will now allow," "I think you will agree with me," "We have already seen," "I have said that," "it is certain that." He did not, however, because he wished to reassure his audience, to help them see

the inferences he was making as being valid and reasonable. He refuses to overwhelm the readers with his authority although he does have a confident tone. This passage is an example of persuasive exposition.

Richards (1929) also discusses tone in scientific writing. He says that if a scientist writes a scientific treatise, he will put the sense of what he has to say first and will subordinate his feelings about his subject or about other views upon it and be careful not to let them interfere to distort his argument or suggest bias. His tone will be settled for him by academic convention. His intention is to be understood accurately. But if he wishes to popularize some of the results and hypotheses of science then the principles governing his language are not so simple for the popularizing intention interferes with the intention of making a clear, adequate statement of sense. For general intelligibility, simplifications and distortions may be necessary if the reader is to "follow." Also, the author will exhibit more lively feelings in the text in order to awaken the reader's interest and will use more variety of tone; jokes and humorous illustrations are frequent and perhaps a certain amount of cajolery. A human relation between the expert and his lay audience must be created, not an easy task, and one which falls under the heading of rhetoric.

In rhetorical writing there is a subtle leading away from the literal statement in a discourse--the discourse is a motif more or less freely used and the writers aim is to make the conclusion of the represented argument look acceptable rather than to make the argument entirely visible,

The Role of Tone

90

according to Langer (1953). She feels that in good discussive writing there is not an adjustment to audience but an adjustment to the characteristic form of literal, logical thought.

If a writer is writing for a general rather than a specific audience, tone is determined by the writer's thinking of some particular person, the most intelligent and discriminating person he knows, or else the writer must himself become the audience at which he aims, and so determines his tone by adjusting to this ideal, general audience. Adjusting tone to a general audience is more difficult than adjusting to a particular audience.

Tone and adjustment to subject matter. The occasion and subject matter may determine the tone even more than the audience. A serious subject, for example, may call for a certain formality of tone, even though the writer is addressing friends. When a writer writes for a general reader whom he does not know personally, he chooses to approach him formally or informally because of the nature of the subject and the strategy for handling the subject. In the following passage the subject matter, an invention to reduce pollution, determines the impersonal, factual tone. Although the subject could be treated lightly, it most typically would not be.

Siemens, the big German electrical equipment maker, has become the latest bidder for the business of cleaning up automobile emissions. Siemens researchers in Erlangen, Bavaria, have developed a cigar-box-sized device that replaces the carburetor and, they claim, allows today's piston engine to run essentially pollution-free without use of complex and bulky devices to clean up the exhaust after it leaves the engine.

The device, called a "crack carburetor," uses a catalytic process to break down, or crack, gasoline into gaseous components, primarily methane, hydrogen, and carbon monoxide. These gases are mixed with air and burned in the engine. Automotive engineers have long known that gaseous fuels, such as liquid petroleum gas or natural gas, give very clean exhausts, but their adoption has been blocked by problems of distribution and on-board storage. Siemens gets around that by allowing the car to carry gasoline as its fuel and produce its own combustion gases. (Business Week)

The writer's real subject, his chief concern is the process by which Siemens hopes to get rid of harmful waste products. This serious subject matter establishes the tone of the text. Sermons on salvation or newspaper feature stories on terminally ill youngsters would be other examples of subject matter determining the tone in texts.

Tone and speaker role. Disagreeing with those who think subject-matter determines tone, McCrawley (1972) in discussing tone in poetry believes that tone is first and foremost a function of the speaker in the poem. The role the speaker adopts for the duration of the poem will have everything to do with the tone of the poem. The speaker (author) of a text is an actor playing a part. Just as an actor's role on stage determines his actions--how he walks, stands at a given moment, speaks a line and so on, the role an author adopts in a text determines his "actions" as well. It determines the words he chooses, what kind of sentence he fits them into, the means of emphasis he uses, how many and what kinds of rhetorical devices he employs, the types of sense--impressions and dominant impressions he wishes to convey--in short, his role creates all

The Role of Tone

92

of what might be called the verbal "business" of his brief drama, the texture of the text. The texture, then, produces the tone.

McCrawley compares the tone in Keats' "Ode on Melancholy" to the tone in William Carlos Williams' poem "Tract." The tone of "Melancholy" is forceful and confident. The speaker puts on the role of the authority figure--one who holds his views with firmness and conviction because of his experience; he will brook no argument about them. There are two kinds of confidence, however. The poem begins in a tone of impatience and scolding; then in a note of kindliness creeps in as the explanation is given for the impatience. The rest of the poem maintains this "explanatory" tone. The speaker takes the role of the patient mentor, the experienced authority on melancholy, and the "connoisseur" who has acquired a taste for it. In "Tract" Williams is also a teacher--one who tries to teach townspeople "how to perform a funeral," but the tone is different because the speaker role is different. The speaker tries to maintain a calm, "instructing" or "informing" tone, but his feelings break through, so we notice a counter-tone of exasperation and impatience. In Keats' poem "Melancholy" the teacher speaker begins with a disapproval of the listener's method and ends with patient instruction; in "Tract" the speaker begins with patient instruction but continually erupts into an outburst of disgust. The role here is a man who is not quite right for the instructor job--he is acting as a human truly concerned about an aspect of human activity he finds disgusting. Williams' speaker bases his authority not so much on experience as Keats' speaker does, but on perceptiveness. He is a plain, blunt man who has bothered to examine the social phenomena

of preparing for a funeral and found it reprehensible, the public man, haranguing from a soap-box. Keats' speaker is a private sort of man, giving advice to an individual listener. Thus, the role each author assumes for a text determines the tone, for all texts have speakers whether they are poems or essays or business letters.

Tone and point of view. Point of view affects tone profoundly, creating or controlling diction and sentence structure. Point of view is the author's angle of vision, the position from which he views his subject. The following passages are both reminiscences of childhood. As Fowler (1973) pointed out in discussing "atmospheric" writing, atmosphere is often created when one views ordinary events from an unusual angle, giving them a mysterious air. This happens when the point of view is that of child trying to understand what is beyond him or the point of view of an adult remembering how things were when a child. Watt (1980) uses two examples of student writing to illustrate this notion.

His house rested on the adjoining hill. It was a small frame house, amply windowed, with a large, red-roofed porch to one side. The placement of the structure was such that the sloping ground to all sides gave it a certain eminence by exaggerating its not unusual height. The boy had a den beneath the porch which was referred to principally as "the cave." It was a black hole--at least half carved from the cold, musty earth itself. It had the smell of dampness and mold, and to be there was like being buried alive. Its drafts covered you. Its rawness ate beneath your skin. The boy loved it there, but often when he entered, his flashlight caught the shoe string tails of rats scampering nervously into the shadows. Often the gang--that was Jim and Chuck and Dick--held meetings there, in which they

burned candles and sat shivering as the restless light did things to their faces. But the cave was not important only for the atmosphere it evoked. It was also unsurpassed as a hiding place for certain invaluables. The various nooks and crannies concealed obscure literature which dealt intimately with the great, the infinite, the mysterious. There was a book on black magic which explained the complex symbolism of beech trees and disclosed the variety of effects arising from the intelligent employment of two aspen limbs and a dead rat. The most valuable possession of all, however, was a fifty-page picture playground in which the sun-bronzed students of Charles Atlas paraded in spotted skins, cloths and belts. The mighty man himself was on one of the pages--his seventeen-inch arm cocked like a steel spring. He could pull a freight car as most men would pull a wagon. Tenpenny nails became like rubber under his grip. His signature was as forceful as a slap in the face and it seemed chiseled into the page. This was the greatest man in the world. A book on crime detection was also of unusual interest. It told how criminals are brought to justice by means of fingerprints. Crime does not pay, it said. Toward the front cover was a picture of a woman gangster. She had a rather sweet face, and Chuck said she looked like Mrs. Kuntz (Mrs. Kuntz lived up by the hospital and was having trouble with Mr. Kuntz at the time). Because of the atmosphere and the treasures it held, the cave was a big part of the boy's life. It excited him like Stevenson's picture. It was dark and changeful. It was the Soho Street of Mr. Hyde.

In this passage of description the writer combines two tones: the excitement of the boy and his gang and the amusement of the adult view of childhood. Assuming the third-person viewpoint, he projects the mysterious atmosphere of the boy's special world. He accomplishes the atmosphere by his skillful choice of concrete details conveying dampness,

darkness and terror. The black hole conjures up horrors of Calcutta; buried alive reminds the reader of a story by Poe; the burned candles might suggest the ghostly ritual of a Gothic romance. The detail of "the shoe string tails of rats scampering nervously into the shadows" is from the writer's own life. In presenting the three books from the boy's angle (though not always in his words) the writer sustains the tone of innocent excitement while intentionally amusing the adult reader with his authentic, deadpan description of their spurious contents. The final allusions to the romance and terror of Stevenson end the paragraph on a note of eerie excitement.

The writer of the next reminiscence of childhood uses first person point of view and a lighter tone in his narrative.

In an effort to supplement the family income and earn the dime the Saturday matinee at the Wilbur cost, my brother and I once organized a popcorn company. I say we organized it, but the organization took place only after my mother bought fourteen gross of the stuff and told us we were going to sell it.

I was to be district vice-president in charge of salesmen. Brother was to be president in charge of business in the home office. This meant I would have to peddle popcorn all over the Borough while he stayed home and counted the money I was earning. I felt that this was unfair. My mother's feelings concurred with my own, so a reorganization took place. We now had two district vice-presidents, each supplied with a basket of popcorn and some change, and a new president whose duties at home would keep her from taking unfair advantage of the other two members of the company. So one bright sunny morning I sallied forth into the business world with the enthusiasm of a man who has just eaten his first mashed potato sandwich.

You who have not sold popcorn at the tender age of nine and a half cannot imagine the heart-rending anxiety I felt as I approached the door of my first would-be customer. They say a dying man will have his life flash across his mind during his last moments. They say a condemned man will repent of his sins while he walks to the electric chair. I was firmly convinced that a fate as terrible as these lay behind the door in front of me. Summoning all the courage in my quivering little body, I reached for the bell. I rang the bell! I said a prayer. My prayer was answered. Nobody came to the door. I ran down the street.

Here there is no atmosphere created from imagination and observation, but the writer does blend amusement with excitement. The amusement again, lies in the contrast between the worlds of the child and adult. The plain language in the first two paragraphs conveys no atmosphere of mystery; this is the practical business world. But the deadpan reference to the specialized organization of the juvenile firm indirectly ridicules the complex hierarchies of bigger business. The final paragraph turns on the excitement; the surprise ending is an effective comic anticlimax in keeping with the general tone of the story. The author here has the view of an adult, remembering his own childhood feelings of fear, using first person in a prosaic narrative account, all of which determine its tone.

Tone and text type. The notion that the genre of texts is a determinant of tone is held by Winkler and McCuen (1974). They present several examples illustrating how in fiction and drama, tone is determined by dialogue and description. In reading Chekhov's play The Cherry Orchard, the following

dialogue serves in an important way to establish the dreamy, wistful mood of a scene for the reader.

Mme. Ranevskaya: Now you want giants! They're only good in fairy tales; otherwise they're frightening.

(Yepihodov crosses the stage at the rear, playing the guitar.)

Mme. Ranevskaya: (Pensively.) There goes Yepihodov.

Anya: (Pensively.) There goes Yepihodov.

Gayev: Ladies and gentlemen, the sun has set.

Trifimov: Yes.

The content and pace of the dialogue convey the dreaminess and wistfulness with its use of 'giants,' 'fairy tales,' 'the sun has set,' and repetition, resulting in the lack of progression and slow pace.

The short story, "Flowering Judas" by Katherine Anne Porter has an ironic tone which is shown in the excerpt below where the description of the character Braggioni is given from Laura's point of view.

Braggioni loves himself with such tenderness and amplitude and eternal charity that his followers--for he is a leader of men, a skilled revolutionist, and his skin has been punctured in honorable warfare--warm themselves in the reflected glow, and say to each other: "He has a real nobility, a love of humanity raised above mere personal affections." The excess of this self-love has flowed out, inconveniently for her, over Laura, who, with so many others, owes her comfortable situation and her salary to him.

The irony is conveyed by the phrases "tenderness and amplitude and eternal charity" and "his skin has been punctured in honorable warfare." Removing

these phrases and paraphrasing the passage without Laura's viewpoint effectively removes the tone--the cynicism is gone, and therefore, the correspondence to the theme of the story is gone as can be seen in this written version:

Braggioni loves himself. He is a leader of men, a revolutionist. He has been injured in the war. His followers warm themselves in his glow and say to each other, "He has a real nobility, a love of humanity raised above personal affection." He likes Laura who, like so many others, owes her comfortable situation and her salary to him.

Scenery descriptions in fiction and drama provided a backdrop for the action and an external equivalent for the conflict taking place in the story. The opening description of Joseph Conrad's Heart of Darkness emphasizes a mood of becalmed gloom. Conrad describes this air as "condensed into a mournful gloom, brooding motionless over the biggest, and greatest, town on earth," and the captain's work "not out there . . . but behind him, within the brooding gloom."

The Nellie, a cruising yawl, swung to her anchor without a flutter of the sails, and was at rest. The flood had made, the wind was nearly calm, and being bound down the river, the only thing for it was to come to and wait for the turn of the tide.

The sun-reach of the Thames stretched before us like the beginning of an interminable waterway. In the offing the sea and the sky were welded together without a joint, and in the luminous space the tanned sails of the barges drifting up with the tide seemed to stand still in red clusters of canvas sharply

peaked, with gleams of vanishing flatness. The air was dark above Gravesend, and farther back still seemed condensed into a mournful gloom, brooding motionless over the biggest, and the greatest, town on earth.

The Director of Companies was our captain and our host. We four affectionately watched his back as he stood in the bows looking to seaward. On the whole river there was nothing that looked half so nautical. He resembled a pilot, which to a seaman is trustworthiness personified. It is difficult to realize his work was not out there in the luminous estuary but behind him, within the brooding gloom.

The words 'gloom' and 'brooding' occur again and again in the descriptive passages later on in the novel, maintaining a tone that is consonant with the conflict in the story. Conrad uses the landscape description as an external equivalent to prepare the reader for the character's downfall, his succumbing to an internal darkness. Authors manipulate mood through the use of appropriate background scenery. Authors who write atmospheric or mood stories, minimize plot and action, and project the character's state of mind and conflict into the imagery used to describe scenery.

In the passage below cited in Brooks and Warren (1979), the author, Herman Melville, wants to give the reader an impression of a group of tropic islands, a feeling for them, rather than a systematic analysis of their characteristics. The passage is organized in such a way as to return the reader continually to the sense of loneliness, ruin, and desolation that characterizes the islands.

Take five-and-twenty heaps of cinders dumped here and there in an outside city lot; imagine some of them magnified into mountains, and the vacant lot the sea; and you will have a fit idea of the general aspect of the Encantadas, or Enchanted Isles. A group rather of extinct volcanoes than of isles; looking much as the world at large might, after a penal conflagration . . . .

In many places the coast is rock-bound, or more properly, clinker-bound; tumbled masses of blackish or greenish stuff like the dross of an iron furnace, forming dark clefts and caves here and there, into which a ceaseless sea pours a fury of foam; over-hanging them with a swirl of grey, haggard mist, amidst which sail screaming flights of unearthly birds heightening the dismal din. However calm the sea without, there is no rest for these swells and those rocks, they lash and are lashed, even when the outer ocean is most at peace with itself. On the oppressive, clouded days such as are peculiar to this part of the watery Equator, the dark vitrified masses, many of which raise themselves among white whirlpools and breakers in detached and perilous places off the shore, present a most Plutonian sight. In no world but a fallen one could such lands exist.

The whole passage is based on the image of the cinder heap and the idea of sin and punishment, which combine to give the notion of a world after the Judgment, the final desolation. This notion, the controlling form, provides the organizing principle for the description. The passage begins with the comparison of heaps of cinders in a dumping ground, associating the used up, the dreary, the finished ideas with the islands. The sense of ruin and waste, sin and punishment are seen in image-making phrases "penal conflagrations," "clinker-bound," "like the dross of an iron furnace,"

The Role of Tone

101

"lash and are lashed" and the last sentence, "In no world but a fallen one could such lands exist." In his description of Encantadas, Melville points to his basic interpretation of the scene and his facts by continually emphasizing the ruined and tormented aspects of the islands. There are dark clefts and caves which are overhung with "a swirl of grey, haggard mist, amidst which sail screaming flights of unearthly birds." The details Melville selects constantly emphasize and reinforce his interpretation of the islands as an image of ruin and punishment.

In poetry, rhythm and rhyme are used to convey tone. Winkler and McCuen (1974) note the "complex interplay between the rhythm of the words and their meanings," with rhythm defined as manipulation of words in a line to produce a sound that underscores the subject of the poem. "If the poem deals with a gloomy and weighty topic, . . . we expect its lines to sound heavy and laborious; if its subject is light and frothy, . . . we expect its lines to sound likewise. The following stanzas illustrate this point.

Break, break, break,  
On thy cold gray stones, O Sea!  
And I would that my tongue could utter  
The thoughts that arise in me.

A. L. Tennyson

A sweet, a delicate white mouse,  
A little blossom of a beast,  
Is waltzing in the house  
Among the crackers and the yeast.

S. Kunitz

The rhyme of a poem will similarly underscore and reinforce the meaning as in this poem excerpt by Sylvia Plath.

DADDY

You do not do, you do not do  
Any more, black shoe  
In which I have lived like a foot  
For thirty years, poor and white,  
Barely daring to breathe or Achoo.

Daddy, I have had to kill you.  
You died before I had time--  
Marble-heavy, a bag full of God,  
Ghastly statue with one grey toe  
Big as a Frisco seal

And a head in the freakish Atlantic  
Where it pours bean green over blue  
In the waters off beautiful Nauset.  
I used to pray to recover you.  
Ach, du.

The primary rhyme of "do, shoe, Achoo, you" capture the gurgle of baby talk as the speaker of the poem addresses her father. The psychological conflict of the speaker--the simultaneous hating and loving moods correspond to the rhyme used.

There is again, an external equivalent for the conflict taking place in the mind of the speaker when poets use description in poetry as is done in longer narrative or ballad poetry. The principle of using description seems to be the same in all the genres--fiction, drama, and poetry.

Authors make use of description to establish a mood that readers can experience, a felt experience that coincides with the controlling form of the text.

Clearly, the determinants of tone are many. Linguistic forces operate to produce tone on different levels, the smaller elements that result in the texture of texts. The non-linguistic forces such as the author's persona, adjustments to subject and audience, point of view, and genre, also are important larger elements contributing to textual tone.

#### Apprehending Tone

Connected discourse is an integration of semantics, syntax, and tone and the united aim in its comprehension is to discover both the dominant thought and dominant feeling which we call tone. For tone apprehension, two categories of things seem to be operating: those in the reader and those in the text. This section examines the pre-conditions necessary in readers and texts for apprehending tone. It also discusses the problems and possibilities of measuring tone apprehension.

Readers and pre-conditions. The characteristics of readers that influence apprehending tone are certain to vary widely and be difficult to isolate. Most reading and literary theorists today (e.g., Goodman, 1967; Stanovich, 1980; Iser, 1978; Rosenblatt, 1978) consider the model reader as an active reader. Langer (1953) discusses the listener requirements for apprehending tonal sequences in music that perhaps have parallels for readers and textual tone apprehension. She begins by noting that there are two types of

hearing--an inward, mental hearing and a physical hearing. Model listeners are characterized by attentive hearing. What is missed by inattentive hearing is the logical connectedness of the tonal sequence. There is no impression of melodic or harmonic development or definite expectation of what is to come. Inattentive listeners hear succession rather than progression and miss all the subordinate tones. Inward or mental hearing is a work of the mind that begins with conceptions of form and ends with their complete presentation in imagined sense experience. "The final imagination of tone itself, as something completely decided by the whole to which it belongs, requires a special symbolic support, a highly articulated bodily gesture--the act of producing the tone--performance." Physiologically it is the feeling for the tone in the muscles set to produce it. "Probably all aural imagination apart from such symbolic action is somewhat incomplete, unless it is based on a vivid memory of actually heard music. The performed piece is the full realization. The performer's imagination is progressive and is helped from moment to moment by the actuality of tone already realized in playing. For making of a musical work requires the muscular imagination of tone, inward hearing, and the desire for outward hearing. Orientation knowledge is knowledge of probabilities that may speed the hearer's understanding of the essential movement in the music.

Perhaps what Langer believes to be true for hearing music is also true for reading texts. Understanding requires a mentally and physiologically active person, one who attends, imagines; progressively feels tone in the muscles and becomes a "performer" actually or virtually. Beloof (1966)

makes a case for the oral presentation of literature, believing that fully understanding a text requires a performance--a tuning of body and voice to the text. The body and the mind are inseparable in the behaviors of imaginative man--they are ignorant or knowledgeable together. With difficult and complex texts, "the material comes in and is converted to physical signals within the bodily vocabulary of the hearer, and it is that which determines the hearers' or readers' degree of understanding." He goes on to say that "full comprehension can come only through the participation of our bodies--that even the rational process itself is a special kind of emotional set which must be learned through a certain control of the body," and that "mere training of the historical or analytical faculty may be insufficient. Perhaps a training of the whole man would fill a lack." Readers, according to Beloof, must be sufficiently aware of the individual qualities of a word, of its function (grammatical), of its possible denotations and its possible connotations, of its temporal qualities, its degree of concreteness, and its possible level of usage--when that happens, they are ready to see how the word functions in its dramatic environment. Until readers know who is speaking, who is being addressed, and under what conditions, they cannot know that "the connotations selected by the author and their attendant tones, are congruous with the overall tone or meaning of the poem. Beloof sees readers as performers and texts as dramas.

Hungerland (1957) says that readers' apprehension of tone is influenced by two pre-conditions: "intralinguistic association" and "attitude association." The first of these terms refers to a lifelong "familiarity with

the verbal contexts of words, phrases, and sentences," the kind of familiarity needed to understand connotation as well as tone. Hungerland clarifies this notion by quoting from Virginia Woolf:

Words, English words, are full of echoes, of memories, of associations--naturally. They have been out and about, on people's lips, in their houses, in the streets, in the fields, for so many centuries . . . The splendid word "incarnadine," for example--who can use it without remembering also "multitudinous seas?"

Hungerland does not explain just how she thinks this phenomenon operates to influence our reading of tone. (Brower (1951) is apparently speaking of the same thing when he says, "Our recognition of a manner (and mood?) always depends on a silent reference to a known way of speaking (and feeling?) and on our perceiving variations from it. The poet . . . relies on such norms and on our familiarity with them.") When one word can call to mind a whole cluster of other words and phrases that tend to be used in the same verbal neighborhood with it, it is referred to as a "lexis" or "lexical set" by linguists. McCrawley tries to clarify and extend Hungerland's "intralinguistic association," and to demonstrate that our apprehending of tone is partially a matter of having heard words used in the vicinity of certain other words with an example. A reader, seeing the term "post pattern," will expect to see any number of other football terms such as "screen pass," "draw play," "red dog," "safety blitz" and the like. Anyone of the terms immediately evokes the entire lexical context and the reader would know that the author using the terms wanted to be taken as an authority.

on football and so would recognize an "expert tone" in the text. In a way, "intralinguistic association" seems to refer to cliches and stereotypes of a certain kind.

In texts where authors avoid using words and phrases in customary ways, a lifelong familiarity with English syntax is probably much more a factor in arriving at tone. Most readers realize that certain patterns are used for certain tones such as sick with \_\_\_\_\_, I recommend that \_\_\_\_\_, Once upon a time \_\_\_\_\_, moreover \_\_\_\_\_, not only \_\_\_\_\_, but \_\_\_\_\_. McCrawley (1971) suggests that familiarity with syntactical patterns is more important than familiarity with verbal contexts in tone apprehension. He also believes that the "attitude association" mentioned but not explained by Hungerland might be an echo process where a reader apprehends the tone in a text as a thrilling, lilting, ringing tone because of being accustomed to hearing and feeling the same tone on certain occasions that had certain circumstances in common--at the theater, church, a political convention, or the locker-room where someone exhorts a flagging multitude to renew its vigor and take heart. Perhaps also the theme of a text may be a stock theme so that readers bring to the text a backlog of experience of reading and hearing about the theme--a backlog of phrases and implied attitudes that cause readers to apprehend the tone of the text in a certain way. The tone could even act as a synecdoche, McCrawley believes, acting as a "part" that calls to mind a "whole," evoking a whole cluster of attitudes or perhaps a whole way of life or world-view. Also, intertextuality may be at work--a reader's apprehending of the tone of "Ode on a Grecian Urn," for example, may result

partially from the fact that he has also read many other poems about urns and other ancient documents involving death, immolation, and burial of heroes, so that a sort of "urn-tone" operates in him for which the tone of Keat's poem acts as a synecdoche.

McCrawley uses the analogy of a pinball machine in operation to explain how a reader might apprehend the tone of a text.

In searching for the tone of a given passage, the mind probably goes through a similar process, bumping against a certain kind of syntax which prevents it from taking the tone to be "better," than against another obstruction--say, an archaic phrase--which prevents the ear from hearing a "hip" tone, then perhaps glances off a shift in meter that rules out a "nursery-rhyme" tone--and so on until it slips into the slot that these various deflectors allow it to fall into: namely, the desired tone.

How fast this happens, the rapidity and accuracy of the process depends on the reader's stock of "experiences" of the kinds considered important by Langer, Beloof, Hungerland, Richards, and McCrawley.

Texts and tone categories. Often readers find apprehending the tone and grasping the propositional meaning of a text difficult to do in some texts, a fact that might lead one to think that tone and literal meaning are synonymous. The truth is that readers usually become aware of tone long before they see what the purport of the text is. McCrawley suggests that readers catch the tone of "Lycidas" after reading no more than two or three lines (long before the end of the first sentence) agreeing with Richards and Langer that tone is "grasped" before propositional meaning.

If analyzing various traits which a passage exhibits leads to apprehending tone, McCrawley believes the process would be accelerated by providing a list of tone categories and typical characteristics for each one. "If a sarcastic tone is regularly accompanied (as it is in Frost's "Fire and Ice") by homely expressions placed among more formal ones, plus the use of an abruptly shortened line, then we would be able to "predict" a sarcastic tone whenever those two elements were present. Looking at Milton's Samson Agonistes and Cassius' speech trying to persuade Brutus in Shakespeare's Julius Caesar along with "Fire and Ice," the reader can see common characteristics: the use of some sharp contrast within a few lines, and use of a pivot word that in its serious sense, has magnitude and laudation in it. Sarcastic tone seems to be associated with a use of pivot-word and "the effectiveness of such a usage seems to be in the extremity of distance between the serious usage and the sarcastic usage: the word shoots from the laudatory end of the continuum all the way to the condemning end in the flick of an eyelash." Although this is not enough to establish the characteristics of sarcastic tone, according to McCrawley, it will serve to illustrate the process by which the job could be done. Using the three example texts as a basis for data, McCrawley proposes a tentative Law of Sarcasm:

A sarcastic tone may be predicted when some theory, either presented or alluded to, is abruptly contradicted by the presentation of an actuality that makes nonsense of the theory, and when some extremely laudatory word used innocently in presenting the theory is repeated quite knowingly in the actuality that follows.

The Role of Tone

110

This seems to be a proposition that could be confirmed or disproven--it has "public verifiability." Other categories of tone could be described such as Yeat's poem "Her Praise" which is discussed and analyzed by Hungerland. She defines it as having a "casual" tone.

Her Praise

She is foremost of those that I would hear praised.  
I have gone about the house, gone up and down  
As a man does who has published a new book,  
Or a young girl dressed out in her new gown,  
And though I have turned the talk by hook or crook  
Until her praise should be the uppermost theme,  
A woman spoke of some new tale she had read,  
A man confusedly in a half dream  
As though some other name ran in his head.  
She is foremost of those that I would hear praised.  
I will talk no more of books or the long war  
But walk by the dry thorn until I have found  
Some beggar sheltering from the wind, and there  
Manage the talk until her name come round.  
If there be rags enough he will know her name  
And be well pleased remembering it, for in the old days,  
Though she had young men's praise and old men's blame,  
Among the poor both old and young gave her praise.

Yeats

According to Hungerland, the casual tone of the poem is marked by the following characteristics:

(1) None of the words or linguistic constructions in the poem is extremely formal or traditionally poetic; but the words and phrases have a certain dignity. (2) The syntax has some complication, but it is not an obstructing or difficult complication--it orders the thought clearly, giving a quality of directness to the language. (3) Finally, there is a predominance of referential or descriptive words and statements which serve to give a tone of relative restraint, though the appraisive aspects of the first line and 'I will' give emotional intensity. (p. 41)

Apparently the prevalence of "referential or descriptive words and statements" give restraint to the tone in contrast to "appraisive" ones that give emotional intensity. Describing or referring to something seems to be more casual than appraising something.

McCrawley believes that with perseverance one can arrive at some means of giving a sort of physicality to this "damnably intangible concept of tone; perhaps an anatomy of tone would not be entirely inconceivable. His idea is to move toward a classification of tones by examining a number of lyric poems with a set of continuums in mind--a carefully selected list of paired opposites. It then "might be possible to discover poems that seem to have the same tonal configurations, hence to equip ourselves with the means of observing common characteristics and pinning down a 'description' of this, that, and the other tone."

McCrawley decided to select the adjectives describing the most common or useful tones based on this set of criteria: inevitability, applicability, realness of range, and clarity of definition, no mutually-exclusive labels. He selected these seventeen continuums: formal-informal, distant-intimate,

courteous-discourteous, dominant-dependent, and loving-hating, serious-light, excited-calm, emotional-detached, positive-negative, happy-sad, sincere-ironic, and toughminded-tenderminded. His next step was to provide a list of poetic passages that stand as norms for each of the thirty-four terms of the seventeen continuums and a list of thirty-four verbal definitions.

With these norms and definitions at hand, an experimenter would be able to make use of the continuums in rating selected passages of poetry. He would use Osgood's seven degree scale from his 'semantic differential' measuring technique. The next step would be to select a number of poems (or passages) and give each one of them a rating of 1-7 on each of the seventeen continuums. McCrawley's chart (Figure 1) lists the passages of poetry on the vertical axis, and the continuums on the horizontal axis; the numbers represent McCrawley's scoring of each passage with respect to each continuum. This is, as McCrawley says, one person's subjective apprehending of the tone of these various passages. The method is what is important--the attempt to achieve some degree of order in the discussion of tone, as a means of giving a sort of physicality to tone, or at least a framework, so that if a tone is uncertain, "we can at least say that it's in there somewhere." If the classifications were further subdivided into groups such as serious, positive, distant, excited, McCrawley would put Coleridge's poem "Frost at Midnight" into this subgroup along with Wordsworth's "The Solitary Reaper;" Shelley's "Ode to the West Wind;" Tennyson's "St. Agnes' Eve;" and Hopkins' "The Windhover."

Another possible use for an objective measurement of tone apprehension is inclusion in batteries of tests that attempt to assess reading comprehension.

With the exception of the Davis (1962) reading test, tone assessment is not included in reading comprehension tests for children or adults. If the methodology proposed by McCrawley were followed, measuring of tone apprehension could be done effectively, using different types of prose and poetry. Finding an effective way to assess tone is important because tone is a necessary component in a model of comprehension and has been ignored by theory makers and test makers.

Non-discursive texts and tone. McCrawley was concerned with apprehending tone in poetic texts but what about non-poetic, non-discursive texts? Langer (1953) begins her chapter on "The Great Literary Forms" by stating that "All artistic conventions are devices for creating forms that express some idea of vitality or emotion." Artistic construction leads to evolution of special forms within one great general field of art--forms such as the ballad, medieval romance, novel, short story, literary essay, catechism, and dialogues. If the tone of a medieval romance is to be apprehended, readers must be aware of the prominent role of description. In this genre, description is not in the background to be tacitly understood with characters' and plot in focal awareness. In the romance, the description of weapons, costumes, tournaments, banquets, and funerals have a purpose--to hold back the action, to spread it out, slow it down to allow the complex actions to intertwine. The slowed story produces the constant relations of characters to each other which becomes the background. Instead of an implicit natural setting of sea, moor, fairyland, or graveyard willows, the story has an explicit social setting--a human environment. The descriptive technique

The Role of Tone

114

focuses on how things are done, arresting one movement of history while another flows on causing subtle distortions, appearances of existences and happenings in background events. Because these background events are too dense to perceive all at once, they are not to be "followed" by readers--but may emerge into full focus at any time. The romance gains its vitality from such descriptive expansions. The use of sensuous images and itemized procedures result in a fabric and not a thread of history according to Langer. The social scene is stressed, not an individual; description is primary while narrative is held in check; the characters and plot are typical, persons of all degrees and subsidiary adventures are involved. Clearly the romance reader must be a versatile reader to stay on top of the tone situation. The tones would shift frequently, and might be mixed. The deluge of impressions, the complexity of tones and shift from subsidiary to focal awareness would all be factors influencing tone apprehension.

The novel, in contrast, stresses personality, not social scenes. It portrays the contemporary scene and its import is formulated feeling. The purpose of a novel is to express human feeling--it's not meant for discursive understanding but intuitive understanding. The novel is presented in a "mnemonic mode" like memory but it is depersonalized and objectified. The virtual events in novels, however subdued, have character, and savor, distinct appearance and feeling-tone, or they simply cease to exist. What characterizes fiction is the quality of being completely felt or "livingness"--what Henry James called "felt life." The impression produced by a landscape, street, or house is an event in the history of one person.

Description is always within the register of that person. Apprehending tone in fiction requires that the reader become absorbed and involved with the persons in the fiction in order to experience the "felt life." It is necessary to see how the description-setting are related to what the characters do, say and think. The reader must see the correspondences between the background setting tone and the plot, characterization, and theme and identify the dominant impression.

Non-fiction and tone. Langer notes that non-fiction is related to actuality; the author draws all details from life--he doesn't create them. It is called literary when it meets an artistic standard. Examples of non-fiction are the critical essay where the author defines his attitudes, sets forth his opinions; philosophy, where the author analyzes ideas; history; biography; and exposition. Non-fiction or discursive writing is the purest form of "applied art." Literal, logical thought has a characteristic form which is known as "discursive" because it is the form of discourse. Since language is the prime instrument of thought, the product bears the stamp of language. According to Langer, "A writer with literary imagination perceives even familiar forms of discursive writing as vehicles of feeling. This is the feeling that inheres in studious thinking, the growing intensity of a problem as it becomes more and more complex and at the same time more definite and "thinkable," until the demand for the answer is urgent and touched with impatience." Discursive style at its best embodies such a feeling pattern.

The Role of Tone

116

Langer continues by stating that good non-fiction discourse seeks above all to be transparent, not as a symbol for feeling but as a vehicle of sense. The artistic form here is strictly bound to the literal function. The author must be committed to giving the reader the one living experience--the intellectual experience of following this discourse. The feeling presented has to be actually appropriate to the matter presented, the model. Expository style excellence depends on two factors: the unity and vividness of the feeling presented (which is the only criterion for "free" art) and the sustained relation of this feeling to the actual progress of the discourse represented. Clearly, apprehending tone in non-fiction involves understanding of what it is to think studiously and follow a problem through to its solution. Since the feeling must be appropriate to the matter presented, apprehending tone would depend on knowledge of a wide range of subject matter and appropriate tones. As the music hearer, the reader must follow the logical progression of tone and ideas. A following of successive words is not enough to apprehend tone; a recognition of relationships--feeling patterns, idea patterns, and feeling-progression interrelationships is necessary.

Apprehending time in drama has still other preconditions. If Langer's and Beloof's notions that listeners and readers must become performers for fully understanding a work of art are taken seriously, then it becomes necessary to investigate the nature of performance, dramatic works, and the process of perceiving drama for application to apprehending tone in written texts.

Cameron and Hoffman (1969) consider what is involved when a performance is communicated to an audience through the condition of performance. They suggest that performance creates a language of its own and that communication involves more than verbal messages. Although we use words, we add meaning to them by the way we speak them, through sound emphasis (tone), through physical gestures, and through personal relationships with each other. The playwright tries to catch and imply these nonverbal ways of communicating, for they are the principal components of performance. Gesture, tone, ways we perceive and comprehend life, cultural values, world-views, and the arts all represent a kind of meaning separate in itself, not based on logical discourse, and not easily converted into logical discourse. These kinds of meanings, the authors suggest, might best be treated as symbolic discourse. Theater operates as a kind of symbolic discourse since it communicates experience symbolically. "The work of art (text or performance) is a complex symbol (or unified groups of symbols) of experience. Symbol has to be seen as a state of meaning or a container of meaning." When theater operates successfully, audiences respond to the symbols that awaken in the audience's experience and perception of life, meaning of the same kind that the artists try to communicate. When textual tone is viewed as a kind of meaning (Richards, 1929) then it is also a symbol, and when it operates successfully, readers respond to it in the same fashion as audiences to successful theater.

The theater process is itself a perceptual process, as is the reading process; where the perceiver tries to experience the spirit of the work.

Most plays rely on suspense of plot with authors giving data to the audience which is then compared to other data as the plot progresses. The course of suspense of plot involves exposition, development, and climax. Although an audience may bring with it certain prejudices about what kinds of suspense the work should create, that audience has no way of knowing what suspense will be created until the work is underway. In the early stages of a work, the author must load the work with facts so that the perceiver can use these facts to make comparisons at later stages that will coincide with the kinds of suspense that is being created. What happens on stage is perceived by the perceiver and stored as data. These onstage facts are insufficient for full understanding; other "facts" must be given to the perceiver or audience through narration. Such secondary giving of data is called exposition and is essential to an understanding of the entire play. The plot suspense involves data comparison in the progression from exposition to the development, a movement toward the climax, and the climax which is the resolution of the suspense of the plot. "From the perceiver's point of view, they mark three different processes: gathering of information; simultaneous gathering and comparison; gathering of information as answers. Finally, the perceiver's use of, or reaction to, this information also falls into three stages: primary stasis; tension; and release (accompanied by surprise or self-congratulation)." There is an implied contract between the author and perceiver: The author agrees to promise a certain future to his audience and implicitly promises that all acts, events, incidents,

gestures, and words used in the performance of the play will lead to that same future. "The perceiver's work with comparison is thus greatly simplified, and his suspense, after a time, lowered by the degree to which he learns to put together the pieces of the puzzle that the playwright is offering. Plays that accept this dogma of necessity of dramatic action are called "tight" or "beautifully controlled" plays--well-made plays.

With the well-made play, audiences assume a mode of perception. When playwrights give them any information that does not bear directly on the primary plot suspense, they are confused and do not know what to do with it; it cannot be meaningfully compared to other data. Hamlet is an example of an ill-made play because it violates the implicit contract in not giving sufficient exposition about Laertes for example so that many perceivers are puzzled, annoyed, and bored by it. Audience response to a play is affected by the audience's real memory of former responses to similar plays. Suspense is lessened by the theatrical experience of an audience if the same means are used to create or maintain that suspense in subsequent works. Audiences seem to enjoy repetition of given structural patterns but playwrights often desire to violate the experienced expectation in order to be original.

\* There is tension then between the audience's desire for comfort-giving repetition, even to the point of ritual, and the author desire for complete suspense.

Now, according to Cameron and Hoffman, the theater is not a logical form, for the sequence of its discussive elements as not necessarily causal. Suspense of plot, not suspense of idea is its major concern. Suspense of

idea is the major concern in the essay and other forms of non-fiction. Whether texts are concerned with suspense of plot or idea, it seems that the perceiver must apprehend tone as well as the literal meaning by comparing data to arrive at the future promised by the author in the implied contract. He must also have had previous experience with the same structural patterns in well-made texts in order to form memories of former responses to similar works.

It may be the case that readers, in apprehending tone and reacting to it, go through the same processes as perceivers with suspense of plot: During the initial stages of reading a text, they gather information about feeling from the components of tone (the texture), they simultaneously gather texture information and compare it to the development of the literal content and future overall tone of the text, and gather texture information as answers and confirmations about the textural tone and correspondences with themes or main ideas. They then react to these three stages with primary stasis, tension (as they wonder whether their expectations will be fulfilled) and release (as they feel surprise at not finding confirmation of their expectations or congratulate themselves at finding their expectations fulfilled). When the text is well-made in regard to appropriate tone, and the tone is apprehended, the release is accompanied by positive feelings of self-confidence and understanding. When the opposite holds, frustration and confusion accompany the release.

And just as an audience's response to a play is affected by the audience's real memory of former responses to similar plays, so too is the reader's

response affected by memories of responses to similar texts or similar tones. Good readers approach a text with expectancy, and when the text is well made and the author holds to his implied contract of structural form, theme, and tone, the readers' task is easy.

#### Levels of Tone Apprehension

Tone apprehension is discussed by Langer in the section of her book dealing with significance in music. Some of the statements and findings about tone in music may have implications for tone in texts. She begins by noting that it is incorrect to refer to tones of a scale as its "words," for music tones lack the very thing that distinguishes a word from a mere vocable: fixed connotation or "dictionary meaning." In addition, tone has many aspects enter into the notion of musical significance but not harmony. These aspects have been carefully studied from a psychological standpoint by Dr. Kurt Huber with the non-musical factors such as personal association with tunes, instruments, styles, or programmatic suggestions rather well controlled. Huber traced the successive emergence of expressive factors in the apprehension of the simplest possible tonal patterns produced uniformly on an electronic instrument without the contextual elements of timbre, rhythm, volume etc. Subjects described their experiences by terms they chose such as qualities, relations, meanings, emotional character, somatic effects, associations, or suggestions. They reported any image, memories, or impressions as best they could. The study, according to Langer, demonstrates quite well how any factors of possible expressive quality are

involved in simple musical structure and how many things besides conventional composition materials function critically in communicating musical messages.

The findings, summarized by Langer are these:

- (1) The lowest stage of tone-apprehension yields merely an impression of tone-color of the whole tonal complex, or of a difference between tone-colors.
- (2) Meanings conveyed by such a mere impression of tonal brightness always involve states or qualities or their changes, i.e., passive changes. Imagination of an event does not occur without an impression of tonal movement.
- (3) The most primitive factor in the perception of tonal movement is a sense of its direction. This, according to the author, "constitutes the point of departure of that psychological symbolism of figures (psychic Gestalt symbols) which we encounter in the tending to relate musical motives to sentiments."
- (4) The apprehension of a width of tonal intervals is dependent of this sense of direction; and "all spatial symbolism in the interpretation of motives has its roots in this impression of intertonal distance."
- (5) The idea of musical step requires a joint perception of tonal distance and direction. "We are not saying too much if we make all the higher psychical interpretation directly dependent on the grasping of internal forms, or at least view them as immediately related to these."
- (6) Impressions of consonance, dissonance, and relatedness require the notion of a musical step, or progression (simultaneous tones were not given; the inquiry rested on melodic elements).
- (7) Tones taken as related may then be referred to a tonic, either chosen among them or "understood," i.e., imaginatively supplied by the auditor.

- (8) Reference to a tonic determines the feeling of modality.
- (9) A subjective accent may simply fall upon the tone which is harmonically more important as the hearer has organized the interval; it may, but need not, suggest a rhythmic structure.
- (10) Subjective rhythmatization, when it occurs, is built upon mental accentuation.

Since such mental accentuation occurred without any actual emphasis in the experiment, Huber believes that musical rhythm, in contrast with mere temporal rhythm of measures, grows out of the inner Gestalt-relations of the motif itself. No doubt these findings would hold true for textual tone also. There are different levels of tone-apprehension for readers; it seems plausible that at the lowest stage, readers would also receive mere impressions of tone-color of the whole tonal complex or separate tones. Sensing tonal movements, tonal direction (such as register), apprehension of progressively more complex tone concepts being dependent on perception of lower concepts and resulting in a feeling of modality (mood), interpretation dependent on grasping of form and relations, the emphasis on what is more important to the individual, the effect of individual differences, all seem as likely to be true of readers and textual tone. It is interesting to speculate what the findings would be if a similar experiment using textual tone were possible.

Perhaps the notion of different levels of tone apprehension can be exemplified with a poem by George Herbert that is analyzed for tone by Brower (1951).

## Love

Love bade me welcome: yet my soul drew back,  
Guiltie of dust and sinne.

But quick-ey'd Love, observing me grow slack  
From my first entrance in,  
Drew nearer to me, sweetly questioning,  
If I lack'd any thing.

A guest, I answer'd, worthy to be here:  
Love said, you shall be he.

I the unkinde, ungratefull? Ah my deare,  
I cannot look on thee.

Love took my hand, and smiling did reply,  
Who made the eyes but I?

Truth Lord, but I have marr'd them: let my shame  
Go where it doth deserve.

And know you not, sayes Love, who bore the blame?  
My deare, then I will serve.

You must sit down, sayes Love, and taste my meat:  
So I did sit and eat.

George Herbert

In this poem there is a trio of tones--the reserved decently colloquial manner of the narrator and within the drama he narrates, the intimate, deprecatory voice of the guest and the exquisite politeness and assurance of the host. "Regarded as a whole, the poem is a little drama of conversion. A sinner conscious of his guilt, feeling the pull of Christ's love ('oh my deare') but unable to accept it, rediscovers the meaning of Christ's sacrifice and is redeemed. In relation to this sequence, the reserve of the telling becomes extreme: The full reversal of feelings at the climax is indicated only by a colon:

You must sit down, says Love, and taste my meat:  
So I did sit and eat.

The restraint, the intimacy and sweet politeness bring out by contrast the conflict and resolution which is so quietly presented. Hence the surprising tension and strength of a seemingly gentle poem."

At the lowest stage of time apprehension, a reader might have an impression of restraint, intimacy, politeness, or gentleness. At the next stage would come an awareness of movement, changes in a tone or tones.

Here, a reader might see the movement from guilt feelings to the retraction to God's love to unacceptance to rediscovering Christ's sacrifice and finally to redemption and the corresponding movement of tones from gentleness and restraint to the conflict and resolution of the last line. Here the reader becomes conscious of a sense of direction of the tones and with this sense of tonal movement can image the event.

In the next level requires the notion of a tone step or interval which is dependent on a joint perception of tonal distance and direction. A reader would see the distance between the restraint tone and the tumultuous tone of conversion and see the direction of redemption. Then would come the impressions of dissonance and relatedness. He would realize as he got to the last line, the full reversal of feelings. The complementary but distinct tones of the sinner guest (feminine, intimate, humble) and Love (questioning, not accusing, the imperative mood softened--a sweet questioning and sweet commanding the humorous host) provide dissonance as the reader reads the last line, said by the sinner guest (so I did sit and eat) and realizes the

Thank you, America,  
for making our whiskey  
your whiskey.



Figure 2 House of Seagram Advertisement

The caption for this ad "thank you, America, for making our whiskey your whiskey" is in the position of the cap on the bottle. It is in large print and has high-sounding parallel phrasing--"our whiskey" . . . "your whiskey." Two tempting drinks sit next to the Seagram's bottle and the panoramic view of a mountain range makes an elegant background. The words seem to fit the picture,--properly noble and elegant, properly "American" in a patriotic and grand way. The tone is distant and formal--appropriate for the product and drinkers of Seagram's. On a more complex level, it is possible to see two tones working at once--as a straight appeal to people who want to drink an elegant grand whiskey and as a tongue-in-cheek appeal to people who feel that talking about whiskey in grandiloquent terms is silly. It could be a little joke that the writer and the manufacturers of Seagram's share with a sophisticated audience, having the light, mocking tone detected beneath the surface. It could also be a matter-of-fact ad, having a formal, serious, elegant tone.

Unsophisticated readers would probably apprehend the tone on a different level than more sophisticated readers, with a first impression, one of formality moving towards sensuousness and elegance, and then impressions of consonance with the harmonies of picture content, words and company image as the sources. After relating the formal, serious and elegant tones, they would no doubt subjectively accent the serious tone. In contrast, the reader more experienced with advertisements, manufacturers, and intellectual tones in written texts would have a first impression of dissonance and see a movement toward non-seriousness, relating the elegant tone to a mocking

tone and the mocking tone to the formal tone and ending up with a dominant impression of a light tone.

In addition to insights from the fine arts and epistemology that might prove beneficial in understanding how tone is apprehended are those from linguistics. According to Kahene (1980), tone is considered by linguists to be a suprasegmental. An interesting question for linguists is "Where does tone come from?" The problem of semantics enters when the question is asked of literary texts, a problem that doesn't exist in art or music as Langer noted (1962). Does tone in texts result from the lexicon, syntax, or the imprecision of description? In other words the linguist wonders if tone is achieved by context, form, or connotation. The three possibilities are that the tone or novel of a text might result from meaning (semantics), style (sentence structure), or connotation (a difficult topic and one that involves pragmatics). Literary critics would agree that all three operate in producing tone.

In linguistics tone operates on the word level and intonation operates on the sentence level and intersentential level. Another question that interests linguists is how intonation contours convey meaning and how they are interpreted by listeners. There is an interaction between tone (the word level) and intonation (the sentence and beyond level), for the realization of tones may be influenced by intonation applied to the utterance as a whole in certain languages called tone languages according to Lehiste (1970). Our English language is an intonation language. One of the meanings of the term intonation is the use of features to carry linguistic information

at the sentence level, intonation also carries nonlinguistic meanings. In this sense, it is similar to tempo where the features of duration at the sentence level reflect the attitudes of the speaker and the urgency of the message. In a study by Hadding, Koch reported by Lehiste, the findings were as follows:

- (1) It was not possible to correlate grammatical sentence types and intonation contours,
- (2) The elevated intonation level was shared by several types of sentences classified as "reactions" of the speakers.
- (3) The same contour was often interpreted differently, depending on the verbal context of the utterance and the context in which it appeared. A contour that was interpreted as "neutral" in one context became an indication of indifference when the situation required greater interest or friendliness to cover the meanings of the word adequately. In utterances with no particular pointing or interest, the same contour could be interpreted as neutral, without any suggestion of indifference. In further sentences, the use of the same contour was considered "negative" by the listeners. Evidently the attitude implied by the contour was not sufficiently "lively" to suggest an ordinary, neutral answer in that particular context.

As far as interpretation of the speaker's attitude was concerned, the listeners showed a very small degree of agreement among themselves as to what the intended attitude of the speaker might have been.

Although this study was a speech situation, there are possible implications for textual tone. Textual tone also carries nonlinguistic meaning. Perhaps textual tone also has levels, in addition to contours, with an

elevated level used for intensive "reactions" used in various text types. Interest in lexical or text content may make a difference in the way readers interpret textual tone. In some situations there may be little agreement among readers as to interpretations of the writer's attitude or the tone of the text. This may be true among speakers of the same language community, but may be especially true for speakers of different dialects and languages. Gumperz and Hymes (1972) found tone mismatches in a study they did in England using West Indian and native English subjects. Lehiste recognizes the importance of markedness phenomena in connection with suprasegmentals and notes that this is largely unexplored ground. Textual tone on a global and local level no doubt also has markedness phenomena that should be explored since markedness is important for attending and understanding.

When Dwight Bolinger (1964) discusses intonation, he uses the analogy of the ups and downs of the human voice and the ups and downs of the surface of the ocean. "The ripples are the accidental changes in pitch, the irrelevant quavers. The waves are the peaks and valleys that we call accent. The swells are the separation of our discourse into larger segments. The tides are the tides of emotion. Each larger unit carries the smaller ones on its back." There is a four tiered hierarchy of movement. We are conscious of the ripples but awareness of the rest of the movement might escape us as irregularities--it is difficult for us to separate the little ups and downs from the big ones and to relate each to some separate communicative function.

Emotion, deliberate or involuntary, is part of our message. When a speaker is full of emotion, the pitch range expands; when he is bored or

indifferent or depressed, the range shrinks; ripples and tides (pitch and emotion) are not language-specific, but stress and separation can be. Knowing the appropriate use of them is important. Cultures differ in their concepts of which displayed emotions are acceptable and when. Emotion and accent are inseparable. Accents are used to show the importance of a word for the speaker and to express great emphasis. The difficulty of separating emotion from other functions of intonation is also seen in the rise and fall of intonation. "Intonation is a half-tamed servant of language. The rise and fall can be thought of as grammatical signals of completeness and incompleteness or as emotional gauges of tension and relaxation. Adding intonation, we turn each logical message into an act of will." Different patterns exist in intonation for different sentence types. Bolinger suggests that many foreign language textbooks offer only worthless generalizations when discussing tone, discount visual diagrams as an aid in teaching intonation contour, urge imitation without explanations of what the student is doing, and do not point out the differences in different intonational systems.

The implications of all this for textual tone are that a four tiered hierarchy with each level carrying the next lower on its back may be true for textual "intonation," and it may be difficult for readers to separate the different levels. Readers are probably often not conscious of either the higher or lower levels of textual tone since there is no pitch they can hear for clues. It is important for readers to understand what is language and culture-specific about tone and its functions and patterns if they are to understand textual tone. Reading texts may not include sections

at all on tone, and if they do, may not offer visual diagrams as a way to illustrate tone or other specific strategies that help readers become less tone-deaf.

The pre-conditions for apprehending tone seem to be an attentive, active reader-performer and familiarity of verbal contexts, sentence structure, themes, genre, conventions, subject matter, and common characteristics associated with various tones most frequently used by authors. It is possible, also, that there may be different levels of tone apprehension.

#### Tone Problems for Students

##### Studies of Poor Readers and Tone

From the previous discussion of tone it follows that there are general implications for poor readers. Apparently student readers, including poor readers, like texts that leave an emotional impact on them and poor readers have passive ability to notice and judge linguistic, literary, and experiential qualities in a text. Hansson (1973) did a study with Swedish students in which they ranked for themselves the most important criteria for a literary work. The most important criterion was the affective quality of the work. In another study with university literature students, literature experts, and blue collar workers, the subjects interpreted and judged a poem using a semantic differential instrument. He concluded that uneducated readers' passive ability to interpret and judge a poem is much more developed than their active ability to verbalize their interpretation and experiences in a written statement. On the whole, there was a striking similarity for the

The Role of Tone

134

three groups of readers on the happy/sad part of the instrument even though the poem was difficult to interpret and had subtle tone problems.

Although Hansson's study found that uneducated adult readers in Sweden can detect tone and apprehend it to some extent using a semantic differential technique, an informal study with poor readers in an American high school in a small Midwestern city (Crismore, 1981) found that they had problems detecting tone. Eight students in grade 11 reading at or below the 8th grade level according to the Nelson Denny Reading Test Form B were measured on their ability to identify the tone (mood) in passages given to them from their reading textbook and workbook (Clymer: Ginn and Co., 1980) and the Davis Reading Test (1962). It is interesting to look at some examples from these measures and note these students' answers and problems.

The following sample exercises from the Ginn workbook were given to the students as a pretest and 5 weeks later as a posttest. During the training sessions between the pre- and posttests, the students were:

- (1) taught definitions of a 70-word mood vocabulary consisting of the mood terms used in their reading textbook and workbook mood tasks (identifying the mood of a passage or story; noting similarities and differences in story mood; comparing the mood of two stories) and in the multiple choices of the tone passages of the Davis Reading Tests for junior and senior high school Forms A, B, C, D;
- (2) taught to identify and underline words, phrases, and literary devices that contribute to tone using selections from their reading textbook;
- (3) taught to identify main ideas or themes and the corresponding dominant tone for reading selections, using a topic-comment

approach to identifying main ideas and themes where students determined the topic first and then the predication about the topic and selecting and underlining words or phrases that helped to create the mood; (4) asked to write their own compositions, labeling the mood, underlining words or phrases that helped to create the mood, stating their main idea or theme, and separating the statement into the topic part and comment part.

#### Identifying Story Mood

Writers often try to create a certain mood in their readers. Descriptive words and phrases can help to create mood in a piece of writing. The length of sentences and the kinds of punctuation a writer uses can also create mood. The list below gives twelve of the possible moods a writer might create in an article or a story.

matter-of-fact  
lighthearted  
eerie

sarcastic  
meditative  
enthusiastic

peaceful  
melancholy  
carefree

In the passages below, underline the words or phrases that help to create a mood. Then choose a word from the list above to describe the mood of the passage. Write the word in the appropriate blank.

lighthearted

1. I have said it a thousand times: children and pets are always trouble! Now I have to admit, I have enjoyed having both in my house and yard, but they're truly a lot of work and care!

eerie

2. The thin screech of an owl pierced the heavy curtain of night. Hartwick listened. A rat scuffled across the dusty ancient floor.

enthusiastic

3. You'll look as though you never made a mistake! The Rubbo Star Eraser erases without a trace! When you want your written work to look perfect, think of Rubbo Star. Buy one today.

peaceful

4. Wendel watched sleepily as the oars rose and fell with regular rhythm. The boat slipped smoothly along the still surface of the water. Everything was green and gold in the hazy sunlight. It was easy to drowse.

sarcastic

5. Standing there in his red plaid suit, he looked just like an angry upholstered chair. I was wrong, of course. I needn't even have wondered about it. There was no point in my defense. The great chair shook as he explained my faults to me.

melancholy

6. Strips of painful memory hung from the ceiling. Oh, how this room had changed! Margarita gently set the once-beautiful china cups upon the torn lace tablecloth. Her gestures were light and delicate. It was easy to imagine her in her youth, the pinnacle of fashion and refinement, dressed in silk brocade and lightly scented with some imported cologne.

carefree

7. It was such a pleasure for us to glide into the sunlit park on roller skates--all grace and swaying motion. Everything echoed our feelings: foolish birds flirted in the shrubs, flowers bloomed, children burst into ringing laughter without reason, and the glint of a smile crossed the face of a stranger.

## Identifying Story Mood

	# + correct pre	# - correct pre	# + correct post	# - correct post
Passage 1				
1	5	3	3	5
2	6	2	6	2
3	4	4	4	4
4	7	1	6	2
5	4	4	4	4
6	2	6	3	5
7	6	2	7	1
Total	34	22	33	23

It is clear that there were no significant changes in the pre- and post-scores. Students incorrectly identified the mood of passage 1 as matter-of-fact, melancholy, the mood of passage 2 as peaceful or meditative.

Passage 3 mood was identified incorrectly as sarcastic, eerie, carefree or left blank. Two students incorrectly identified passage 4 mood as carefree or lighthearted. Passage 5 was labeled mistakenly as enthusiastic, matter-of-fact, melancholy, and lighthearted. Some students thought the mood of passage 6 was matter-of-fact, lighthearted, enthusiastic, or peaceful. Passage 7 was mistakenly thought to have a melancholy or sarcastic mood by several students.

Davis (1972) concluded from his study that recognizing the mood and literary techniques of a writer was one of the five skills important in comprehension of reading and that comprehension was not a unitary ability. His instrument used literary passages and multiple choice questions for each item. These 8 students had problems in recognizing the tone in the Davis Reading Tests for junior and senior high school students given as a post-test. None of the students could correctly recognize the tone for this poem. Most students thought the tone was warlike or reverent.

May 1, 1898

Oh, dewy were the Spanish isles  
that humid day in May

When Dewey was the commodore  
on broad Manila Bay.

And dewy were the Spanish eyes  
that looked upon the sight

For Dewey met the Spanish fleet  
and put it all to flight.

And do we know that Dewey won  
and did not lose a single son

Of Uncle Sam? Do we? Of course, we do!

The tone of this verse is

- A. mournful.
- B. warlike.
- C. reverent.
- D. light.
- E. formal.

In this next example, only 1 of the 8 students recognized the tone as cynical, the rest chose equally among the remaining answers.

While he was British prime minister during the World War of 1914-18, Lloyd George said, "This war, like the next war, is a war to end war."

His statement might best be described as

- A. cynical.
- B. hopeful.
- C. unpatriotic.
- D. insincere.
- E. mistaken.

Two students knew that the atmosphere of the region in the following example was one of desolation. None thought it was one of supernatural beauty or suppressed excitement, but 6 students did think the tone was wearisome monotony or hopeless despair, tones close to the correct one of desolation.

Our wagonette topped a rise, and before us  
lay a vast expanse of moor, mottled with gnarled  
and craggy cairns and tors. A cold wind swept  
over us. The road grew bleaker and wilder over  
huge russet and olive slopes sprinkled with giant  
boulders. We saw no one nor any human habitation.

The atmosphere of this region was one of

- A. supernatural beauty.
- B. wearisome monotony.
- C. suppressed excitement.
- D. hopeless despair.
- E. desolation.

In this next short passage of verse, only 1 student could recognize the bitterly ironic tone--the same student who correctly identified the tone of previous passages. The student was a Chinese girl who has been in this country 3 years. She had good comprehension and did seem to benefit from the emphasis and training on tone during the 8-week session.

The golf links lie so near the mill  
That almost every day  
The laboring children can look out  
And see the men at play.

The tone of the verse is

- A. friendly.
- B. resigned.
- C. insincere.
- D. bitterly ironic.
- E. tolerant.

None of the students thought the tone of this next passage was strangeness or peacefulness, but only 2 knew the tone was loneliness, indicating ability to identify tone on a gross level.

After father drove off, I sat on the wooden stoop and looked at the sunset. It would have helped to see a thicket of aspen against the endless sky, but there was nothing but the shabby earth rolling off under the slack wires of the fence that marked a division in the prairie and here and there a single, twisted jack pine. The emptiness surrounded me and swept over me until I was nothing.

This passage leaves the reader with an impression of great

- A. loneliness.
- B. terror.
- C. strangeness.
- D. peacefulness.
- E. longing.

In the final example, the same Chinese girl correctly identified the tone as one of tranquillity, the only student to give a correct answer. The rest all thought the tone was one of despair.

Toward evening the rain ceased; and, rising up, I went out a short distance to the bank of the neighboring stream, where I sat on a stone and laved my bruised feet in the cool running water. The western half of the sky was of that tender blue seen after rain, but the leaves still glittered and the wet tree trunks looked black under the green foliage. The rare loveliness of the scene lightened my heart. Away in the east the hills of Parahuari, with the level sun full on them, loomed with a strange glory against the gray rain clouds drawing off on that side, and their new mystic beauty almost made me forget how these same hills had wearied and hurt and mocked me. On that side, also to the north and the south, was open forest, but to the west was a different prospect. Beyond the stream and the strip of verdure that fringed it, and the few scattered dwarf trees near its banks, spread a brown savannah sloping upwards to a long, low, rocky ridge, beyond which rose a solitary conical mountain.

As the sun went down over the ridge, beyond the savannah, the whole western sky changed to a delicate rose that had the appearance of rose-colored smoke blown there by some far-off wind, and left suspended--a thin, brilliant veil over the distant sky, blue and ethereal.

Birds were flying overhead, flock succeeding flock, on their way to their roosting place, uttering as they flew a clear, bell-like chirp; and there was something ethereal too in those drops of melodious sound, which fell into my heart like raindrops falling into a pool to mix their fresh heavenly water with the water of earth.

Into the muddy pool of my heart some healing drops had fallen--from the music of the passing birds, from the crimson disc that had now dropped below the horizon, the darkening hills, the rose and blue of infinite heaven; and I felt purified and had a strange apprehension of a secret innocence and spirituality in nature--a foreknowledge of some bourn, incalculably distant perhaps, to which we are all moving. This unexpected peace I had found now seemed of infinitely greater value than that yellow metal I had missed finding, with all its promise of boundless wealth.

The passage leaves the reader with a feeling of

- A. homesickness.
- B. tranquillity.
- C. dread.
- D. despair.
- E. uneasiness.

No doubt there were many reasons for the students' poor performance on identifying the tone/mood of passages, among them low vocabulary, lack of prior knowledge of the content or subject matter of the passages, lack of knowledge of text structures, the complex tones of irony, sarcasm, cynicism, the inability to see contrasts of feelings and problems included in the following categories established by Purves and Beach.

The Role of Tone

142

Purves and Beach (1972) list studies of reading problems in literary works based on student responses or of tests and test items. Problems were classified as I. Insufficient information; II. Failure to understand or cognitive failure; III. Psychological problems. In each category there are subcategories that have relevance for tone.

In the first category (insufficient information) these subcategories are the kinds of problems poor readers would have with tone: lack of background information, lack of knowledge about allusions in the work itself, failure to see context, failure to know literary devices, and failure to apply information. In the second category (failure to understand) these subcategories are relevant: Diction: lack of word knowledge; Syntax: lack of knowledge of expression; Imagery and Metaphor: failure to deal with imagery, failure to understand metaphor; Inference about parts: inability to get specifics; Inferences about tone, mood: failure to recognize author's attitude, difficulty in detecting irony, failure to perceive focus; Other: inability to make comparisons. In the third category (Psychological problems) the following subcategories apply to tone problems: Preconceptions: technical presuppositions, critical preconceptions; tendency to invent details: happiness binding; Dominance of rhythm; Feelings: feeling of an emotion and feelings that such and such will be or is, feelings of pleasure and pain; Lack of attention or concentration.

One assignment given to the 8 students further illustrates the kinds of problems students have with tone. They were given 2 paragraphs from

Frankenstein by Mary Shelley, which appeared in their reading text and asked to change the mood of the paragraphs from gloom and suspense to one of happiness and joyful expectation. They first were to identify and underline these words as the words that created the mood: dreary night, November, anxiety, agony, lifeless thing, one in the morning, dismally, candle was nearly burnt out, half-extinguished light, the dun-white (dull yellow) eye of the creature, convulsive motion, and so forth. Next they were to substitute other words in place of the identified words, thus changing the mood. They were started off by being given suggestions for the following changes in the first two sentences: It was a bright day of May that I beheld the accomplishments of my toils. With a happiness that almost amounted to complete joy . . . The original two paragraphs read as follows:

### Frankenstein

It was a dreary night of November that I beheld the accomplishment of my toils. With an anxiety that almost amounted to agony; I collected the instruments of life around me, that I might infuse a spark of being into the lifeless thing that lay at my feet. It was already one in the morning; the rain pattered dismally against the panes, and my candle was nearly burnt out, when, by the glimmer of the half-extinguished light, I saw the dull yellow eye of the creature open; it breathed hard, and a convulsive motion agitated its limbs.

How can I describe my emotions at this catastrophe, or how describe the wretch whom with such infinite pains and care I had endeavored to form? His limbs were in proportion, and I had selected his features as beautiful. Beautiful! Great God! His yellow skin scarcely covered the work of muscles and arteries beneath; his hair

was of lustrous black, and flowing; his teeth of a pearly whiteness; but these luxuriances only formed a more horrid contrast with his watery eyes, that seemed almost of the same color as the dun-white sockets in which they were set, his shriveled complexion and straight black lips.

Phrases the students failed to understand that helped to create the mood were: one in the morning, candle was nearly burnt out, half-extinguished light, and dun-white. These are more than just words and phrases--they are symbols, conventional symbols of gloom and suspense that they did not have under control yet. In general, they seemed to pick out the gloomy and suspenseful adjectives, nouns, adverbs, and verbs, but not the more complex symbols, perhaps because they had never been exposed to them in their literature classes or perhaps because they had not learned them. There was a noticeable difference in the passages "constructed" to show specific moods for the reading workbook and those "real" passages like Mary Shelley's in their textbook. The "real" selections were much more complex and made use of a wider array of texture devices than the workbook. Some of the students had serious problems in picking out the individual words, that helped to create the mood also.

#### Subjectivity and Biases

Subjectivity certainly is an issue in tone and is a problem with poor readers. The poor readers in the training study had to describe the mood in passages taken from their reading text and then in a brief sentence, tell why they thought as they did. Some reasons given for the mood of the passage were based subjectively on their own feelings and mood rather than objectively on the text features.

Two students described the mood of this passage as boredom.

Dad installed process and work charts in the bathrooms. Every child old enough to write--and Dad expected his offspring to start writing at a tender age--was required to initial the charts in the morning after he had brushed his teeth, taken a bath, combed his hair, and made his bed . . . Of course there were times when a child would initial the charts without actually having fulfilled the requirements. However, Dad had a shrewd eye and a terrible swift sword. The combined effect was that truth usually went marching on. ("Whistles and Shaving Bristles")

The reasons they gave were these: (1) Seems like it was boring to go do all of the things on the chart day after day. (2) Boredom because it is boring to me and it doesn't really talk about anything. In the following example, the Chinese student described the mood as boring. Her reason was that the words solid gray, the dreary street was still, the soot-darkened buildings help create the mood; she used the texture (text features) to support her mood choice. Several other students read this passage, and decided on the mood for subjective reasons.

The sky outside the classroom window was solid gray. Peter looked out. He hoped to see some lively snippet of color, a plaid coat, brake lights, something bright--but there was nothing. The dreary street was still. No cars, no passers-by. The soot-darkened buildings stared back at him with vacant eyes. Peter returned to his sorting. The papers all looked identical.

One said: "Boring. Books and class ALWAYS sound boring to me." Another said: "Boring because it is slow and does not hold my interest. For the first student it was the subject matter that made the mood of the passage boring for him. For the second student it was the lack of action. The descriptive rather than narrative mode resulted in her decision of a boring mood for the passage. Poor readers appear to have a bias for action (narratives) and plain style (Purves & Beach, 1972); therefore, atmospheric writing, description, setting and exposition might be avoided completely or read superficially. Because tone is established in settings and beginnings with many signals for reader expectations, these students, not realizing the functions of beginnings, might miss the signals and misapprehend the tone. Avoiding or skipping over sentences or parts with a dense texture (often descriptive passages) would have the same effect.

There are other biases that might cause problems for poor readers trying to identify and understand tone. In addition to having a bias for narrative, action, and linearity, they might have a bias for certain tones. They may have a happiness binding, for instance, presupposing that all stories should have a happy ending or have an overall dominant mood of happiness or that all essays should be serious, taking literally what the author intended to be ironic. There may also be a problem with students not being able to look at mood in texts objectively; they may project their own mood on the text. Another bias tendency is for the objective content of the texts when school tasks are assigned. The objective content of texts is picked up more easily and receives the most attention from the student. The motivational, affective, personal qualities are not

picked up as well, no doubt because educators, publishers, and researchers have not focused on these as being important. Markova (1979) noted that when students were assigned summary, they threw away all the subjective, evaluative material and retaining only the objective content in their summaries. She argues that a human perception and understanding of a text must necessarily preserve the author's values and his individual relationship to the content of the text, unless, of course, the author intended to convey facts rather than values and feelings. She believes that the affective characteristics of texts cannot be learned without a mastery of the expressive means and devices of language. The assimilation of the factual content and the tone of written texts is probably not possible for poor readers unless they have all of the expressive means and devices of language under control.

They would no doubt have trouble seeing the shifts in tone in the three business letters that follow (cited in Ruggiero, 1981).

First Notice

Dear Friend:

Guess what? You forgot to make your payment this month. We understand how easy it is to forget. Please take a moment now and drop it in the mail.

Cordially,

Second Notice

Dear Customer:

Ten days ago we notified you that your June payment was past due. It has still not arrived in our office, nor have we heard from you as to your reason for not remitting it.

It is most important that you send your payment at once. Failure to do so will damage your credit standing.

Sincerely,

Third Notice

Dear Sir:

Your failure to answer our previous requests for payment makes it necessary for us to inform you that unless your account is brought up to date at once, we shall refer it to our legal department.

We have shown every consideration and expect the same courtesy from you. Unless you wish us to take drastic action, you will make definite arrangements to pay. This is our final notice,

Yours truly,

Though the essential message is the same in all three letters, there is an unmistakable difference in the tone revealed in each. The patient, friendly tone of the first gives way to one of nagging in the second and finally to insistence and threat in the third. Poor students would need to recognize the obvious clues like the salutation--the warm friend changes to cooler customer, and then to the cold sir. But there are other, subtler indications as well. For example, the increasing formality and impersonality of the phrasing and structure. To perceive all these differences is to sense the tone of the letters. They could possibly see the difference in tone between the first and third letters but not between the second and third letters.

Poor students might also have a bias for premature closure. Determining the overall tone of a text requires paying attention to the whole text for confirmation of hypotheses about the tone. Poor students may make decisions about tone based on a minor tone because it comes early in the text and they have a need for early closure. In addition, they may be satisfied with what Richards called a summary reading of a text only. Summary readings are

based only on the presentational meanings; although good readers because of their trained perceptions and competencies usually have accurate summary readings, poor readers have inaccurate summary readings. They often undervalue the reflective aspect of fully understanding the tone in a text. They often have a bias for passive reading, not realizing the need for their participation in the act of reading for tone. They may also undervalue the need for close reading and analysis of texts that lead to trained perceptions and competencies seen in good readers.

#### Prior Knowledge and Developmental Problems

Poor readers would have problems handling the tasks that Beloof (1966) sets for readers who apprehend tone. Poor readers are often not aware of the qualities a word, its grammatical function, its possible denotation and connotation, of its temporal qualities (archaic, standard or new), its degree of concreteness, its possible level of usage, and how the word functions in its environment. Purves (1980) feels that the tone of a text is probably determined by a few key words and that poor readers would have difficulty detecting these few key words. Although poor readers can handle the gross distinctions between happy/sad, they would find it difficult to make the finer distinctions within the happy/sad category in different literary passages.

McCrawley (1972) also pointed out the need to see pivotal words in determining a sarcastic tone. He gives as an example Samson's opening speech in Samson Agonistes:

Promise was that I  
Should Israel from Philistine yoke deliver;  
Ask for this great deliverer now, and find him  
Eyeless in Gaza at the mill with slaves,  
Himself in bonds under philistine yoke.

The sarcasm turns on the pivotal word deliverer. Another example is from Julius Caesar where Cassius is trying to persuade Brutus:

And this man  
Is now become a god, and Cassius is  
A wretched creature, and must bend his body  
If Caesar carelessly but nod on him,  
He had a fever when he was in Spain,  
And when the fit was on him, I did mark  
How he did shake! 'tis true, this god did shake.

This time the pivotal key word is god. The authors in both examples introduce the words more or less innocently and neutrally in one line and then repeat them quite knowingly and contemptuously a few lines later. The second time Shakespeare uses god, he coats it with contempt, knowing the total inappropriateness of it in the context of fever and shaking. In addition, key words for sarcastic tone according to McCrawley lie at the extreme end of their continuums of meaning--there is a bigness associated with them, a magnitude and laudatory meaning for the normal serious sense at one end of the continuum which is the opposite of the condemnation meaning for them at the other end. Poor students would probably have difficulty in picking up on the pivotal words that determine sarcastic tone, and discriminating between close tones such as wearisome monotony, hopeless despair, and desolation as was the case with the eight poor readers when they tried to determine tone in the Davis Reading Test.

Beloof (1966) states that poor readers may also have problems identifying the speaker of a text, especially texts with several implied speakers. But "until they know who is speaking, who is being addressed, and under what conditions, they cannot know that the connotations selected by the author and their attendant tones, are congruous with the overall tone or meaning of the poem."

Moreover, the poor reader may not have in his head the vocal intonation, the proper bodily responses, as well as the vocabulary for a poem and therefore could not understand the tonal meaning of a poem. If a reader reads orally with a singsong rhythm or some other ironbound vocal pattern as so many poor readers do, his silent reading and ability to read beyond the superficial level will be impaired. These readers may not have trouble with the biologically oriented tones--(hate, greed, love, pain) that they would adequately have developed in their openly imitative period but would no doubt have trouble with the more sophisticated, abstract, intellectual tones of ironies, ambiguity, and other complicated "balances of attitudes."

No doubt less able readers would not have an easy time making the kinds of linkages or associations required by complex texts with several levels of tone according to Bartine (1980). As a result of extensive reading and an active approach to reading, good readers can recognize literary and rhetorical devices and see them functioning in a familiar way without being able to label them, but poor readers, who have usually read little and are passive, could not. The tendency of poor readers to be non-reflective, passive, lacking in metacognitive ability; and their lack of knowledge about

attitudes and conventions for tone and language would all contribute to difficulty in recognizing and apprehending tone.

There may be a developmental aspect to tone that causes problems for readers. According to Purves (1980), first and second graders have their own unfunny jokes (to adults) and do not understand jokes told by older children and adults indicating that understanding tone may be developmental. Handling the simultaneous tasks required for processing tone would have tone problems because of a developmental lag. Some students may not be ready developmentally to handle the multifunctionality of written texts; assimilating the factual content at the same time as the tone. They may be able to cope with the task channel (cognitive) and the expressive (feeling) channel simultaneously (Erwin-Tripp, 1981).

Non-recognition or misapprehension of tone may be a function of the oral and written discourse poor readers have been exposed to in their previous experiences. Because of home and school environment, these readers often have a lack of exposure to oral and written contexts of expressions. Many of these students have heard only informal, colloquial expressions in their homes, on television, and in school. They haven't heard the rhetorical, formal styles in church sermons, political and other public speeches. Schools, adhering to readability formulas, provide texts with "primer level" prose. These texts, often have an informal quality or lack texture, or both. Lack of texture results in lack of tone. Students have little opportunity to see examples of tonal clues because of the simple vocabulary, short sentences, and lack of sentence rhythm, found in school texts written or

edited according to readability formulas. Their thin-textured bland text-books are atonal. In addition, reading educators often do not consider tone a basic skill, and so, devote little attention to it in reading materials. Reading teachers often suggest that reading is factual and serious and writers using tone are evil and "trying to put one over on the reader," according to Purves (1980). Tone-deaf students need much good teaching and exposure to well-written texts composed of structure (the skeleton), texture (the skin), and mood (the nerves). When this happens the total effect is embodied tone, a vehicle of emotional and intellectual meaning and a necessary component in a reading comprehension model.

#### Issues and Implications for Education

It is evident there is much in the literature on tone that has implications for text processing of prose. We have seen that tone is not a simple matter--it is not found in any one specific element, and it is composed of a complex of devices or particulars called texture. Understanding tone requires understanding texture; texture involves understanding musical, lexical, syntactical, and connotational elements which implies familiarity with literary devices such as rhythm, diction, sentence and paragraph structure, symbols metaphors; and rhetorical devices such as antithesis, tropes, polysyndeton, etc. Recognizing these as features and clues for tone is necessary, but even more is required to detect tone. Also needed is an understanding of psychological details (feelings and attitudes), events, places, situations, style, speech acts, intentions, tone appropriateness, persona, problem-solving, composing skill, social relationships, and culture. In other words, knowledge

about language and language use and knowledge about the world. Understanding tone requires readers to assimilate all these facts, for tone is the sum of all the factors that go into a text.

The literature suggests some issues and problems to further explore in regard to tone and reading. One issue is whether tone might be culture-specific. Studies need to be carried out to see if this might be the case. There may be mismatches between the tone of a text and the reader because of cultural differences. The problems evident in translating a literary work from one culture to another indicate that tone might be culture-specific or dependent on cultural knowledge. Frenz (1961) mentions that harm can be done by a translator who distorts a literary work and thus becomes responsible for presenting a mood which was actually not expressed by the foreign writer. In discussing Sir Thomas Urquhart's translation of Rabelais he states, "By injecting an 'amiable scepticism,' by implying erotic undertones where none were in the original, Urquhart created, according to Samuel Putnam, 'a false or grossly distorted conception of Rabelais' . . . . An aura was created which the original never had." Frenz quotes L. W. Tancock, who promoted the principle of fidelity to the tone of the original, as saying it is "the duty of a translator to try to reproduce on English readers the effect which the original had upon its readers when it was published." Literal translation apparently results in distortion of tone.

Another issue is prior knowledge. How much a reader knows about a subject determines whether a reader can understand allusions, symbols, metaphors and satire. His knowledge of conventional attitudes, tones, and

textual clues affect his expectancies and processing of tone and text.

How much a reader knows about feelings and tone as well as a subject affects his motivation to read and his comprehension. The effect of new knowledge and old knowledge on processing tone should be carefully investigated.

An issue for educators to consider is the length of texts used in schools.

Since it is difficult (or impossible) to illustrate global tone with short passages and excerpts, it is clear that there is a need to use whole texts with students. Many students have limited exposure to whole texts, especially lengthy ones whether oral or written. Bartine (1980) notes they are not given opportunities, often, to hear complete, lengthy public addresses, sermons, or monologues. They may not read lengthy whole poems, novels, essays or nonfiction books. They frequently read fragments--parts of poems, chapters from books, passages, shippits. For a text to be read as presentational object, to be read for the first dominant impression and later reread and reflected on for complexities of tone, to be used as an illustration of tone, complete texts may be necessary. Educators must see that readers have opportunities to acquire tone skills and strategies. A reader using tone to process a text must have many skills and strategies at his disposal. First, he must be able to perceive tonal designs or patterns--the many sets of relationships and interrelationships of the total design that evolves through language. He must be able to connect these tonal patterns into a unified whole, often using disparate and antithetical elements to put the puzzle together. Also, he must be able to make inferences, for most of tone is conveyed through indirect means. Words, sentences, and paragraphs suggest and imply attitudes and feelings. A reader processing text must

simultaneously. The reader who apprehends tone will actively and analytically participate in the imaginative creation of the writer. He will read aesthetically, when it is appropriate to do so, seeing reading as an act and a dramatic process, not a logical one. He will also learn to read non-aesthetically when it is appropriate.

~~There are additional important implications for skilled readers and the role of tone or mood in prose processing not found in the tone literature but in semiotics and cognitive psychology.~~ Iser (1978) believes that for a skilled reader, text processing is an interaction of text and reader where there is an interplay between modified expectations and transformed memories. The reader must synthesize these and translate the text, transferring it to his mind. Because meaning is not manifested in words and therefore not mere identification of linguistic signs, understanding a text depends on gestalt groupings. A gestalt is possible because there is an interconnection and correlation between the textual signs before the reader sees them. The reader's task is to make these signs consistent. As he does so, the connections he makes will themselves become signs for further correlations. He must identify the connections between the signs as his part in the gestalt. Expectations and fulfillment in relation to the connections perceived between the signs result in a gestalt. Although Iser is discussing how a reader processes a text in general, his theory can be applied to processing tone, also.

For skilled writers, discourse production is directed by some schemas that specify the types of things to be written and their relationships and

be able to map the length and rhythm of sentences to attitudes and feeling, for instance, and map key words (usually just a few) to the personality of the real or implied author or the text itself. He needs to attend to minute language signs by which tone is fixed, and to determine the exact speaking voice, the persona, by asking questions about the implied social relationships of writer to reader and style.

Of course, he must go beyond the literal sense of the text by recognizing and understanding both the nonlingual tones of hate, love, fear, sadness, anger; and the intellectual lingual tones of irony, paradox, ambiguity etc. This requires not only inferencing ability but also the ability to read reflectively and aesthetically, carefully and closely--to process deeply. Imaging is another ability the reader must have to apprehend tone and process texts. Reading for the dramatic metaphor or controlling image, and the commanding form in the artist's head requires imaging. Being able to determine the commanding form, the work of art in the artist's head is a skill requiring the reader to become the artist, recreating the text, following the same process the author followed. To do this means the reader must have composing skills under control.

Another important skill is being able to integrate simultaneously the content and rhetorical planes of text, the denotational and the connotational planes--the literal sense and tone sense. He will usually not be aware of his strategic plans to do this; it will be done tacitly. When he processes a text, the reader will recognize which subsidiary features of the text are salient for tone and will unconsciously analyze the text at multiple levels

how it is to be said, the style and the tone. Skilled readers need these schemas also, if they are to recreate the text as they process it. In low affect texts, the end point of the text or a part of the text is structurally determined (when a particular schema element is instantiated), so structural knowledge is required by the reader for effective processing. But in high affect texts, the end point is determined by the emotional state of the writer who keeps writing until he runs down, resulting in a long and repetitious text. Skilled readers would have to recognize this type of text for what it is--expressive only rather than communicative--and call into play schemas for emotional responses. Furthermore, skilled readers need to recognize both the writer's goal or intention for the discourse (to explain, inspire, entertain, persuade, narrate, describe, etc.) and his global plan for overall tone (light and witty, heavy and serious) (Bereiter & Scardamalia, in press).

Metacognition is important in processing tone. Tone is ground (what is in subsidiary awareness) and not figure (what is in focal awareness) normally, and it tacitly understood. When the more subtle, complex, intellectual tones are involved, however, the reader must realize when he doesn't understand the tone and consciously use strategies in his attempt to understand (Brown, 1978). Skilled readers draw on various skills and coping strategies when they use tone to help process texts..

Perhaps textual tone is not a concept but an associative complex for writers and readers. Vygotsky (1962) in discussing complexes and concepts states that factual bonds underlying complexes are discovered through direct experience. Since a complex is not formed on the plane of abstract logical

thinking, both the bonds that create it, as well as the bonds it creates. are without logical unity. The bonds relating the elements of a tone complex to the whole text and to each other may be quite diverse. The associative complex has a nucleus object, and the bond between the nucleus and the other objects rests on some similarity or proximity in space..

The role of the tone complex in text processing is multifaceted. One of its functions is to act as a necessary preliminary before the reader uses more formal structures. Also, tone invites the reader to construct a world of concrete things out of a chaos of sheer impressions. Eliot's poem The Wasteland is an example of where tone creates a virtual experience out of jumbled impressions and holds the assorted items together in a single illusion. This can be compared to a color scheme unifying all the figures of a variegated picture. Tone precedes and prepares for verbal meaning. It helps the reader understand the text when he begins by intuiting the whole as in works of art and then contemplates its complexities and import. The complex whole is seen or anticipated first and meaning results from this, rather than out of a synthesis of a succession of intuitions. In addition, it helps turn perception into conceptions. If seen as a symbol, tone uses pre-rational material intellectually, expanding reason. Perception and comprehension of tone gestalten lead to concept comprehension. Langer's (1962) remarks about functions of symbols in art seem appropriate for tone as symbol also in a model of text processing.

As noted earlier, in her theory of symbolism she distinguishes between two symbolic modes, discursive and the non-discursive presentational.

The primary function of non-discursive symbolism is that of conceptualizing the flux of sensations. Visual forms--lines, colors, proportions, etc. are just as capable as words of complex combinations, but the laws that govern them are different from the laws of syntax that govern language.

Visual forms are not discursive:

they do not present their constituents successively, but simultaneously, so the relations determining a visual structure are grasped in one act vision. Their complexity, consequently, is not limited, as the complexity of discourse is limited, by what the mind can retain from the beginning of an apperceptive act to the end of it. An idea that contains too many minute yet closely related parts, too many relations within relations, cannot be "projected" into discursive form; it is too subtle for speech. A language-bound theory of mind, therefore, rules it out of the domain of understanding and the sphere of knowledge.

But the symbolism furnished by our purely sensory apprehension of forms in a non-discursive symbolism, is peculiarly well-suited to the expression of ideas that defy linguistic projection (p. ).

Although Langer discusses only visual forms as presentational forms, what she says seems to apply equally to the aural and written form of tone as well. Tone can be considered a presentational symbol, its constituents presented simultaneously, their relations determining a structure or gestalt that is grasped by the reader in one act and preserved in a disposition or an attitude. A whole work may consist of many of these tone forms all interrelated and forming one total gestalt. Langer states that the Gestalten, the perceptual forms of the presentational order, help us make sense out of

the "pandemonium of the impression" by furnishing the elementary abstractions in terms of which ordinary sense-experience is understood. This kind of understanding is directly reflected in physical reactions, impulse, and instinct. She hypothesizes that perceptual forms might be a principle for symbolization and therefore the conception, expression, and apprehension of sentient life and that the non-discursive symbolism of tone could be formulative of that life.

Another role of tone in a processing model is acting as a cohesive device. Leopold (1973) makes some pertinent remarks about cohesion that could be extended to tone. Tone works in a text like function words. Function words are linguistic devices used to link content words while tone is a nonlinguistic device that links content in a text. Both function words and tone are particulars in subsidiary awareness; the content words and content in texts are the focal objects. Tone acts as a pragmatic bond for functional relationships, a transitive bond for phenomenal relationships, and a heuristic bond for semantic relationships. As a gestalt, it helps weld the gap between perception and conception. It "fuses sensa that practical thinking would separate and grasps analogies that wide experience would reject as absurd," as Langer says symbols in art do (1962). Tone is a cohesive device in prose processing and educators must pay as much attention to this cohesive device as they do the linguistic cohesive devices.

Still other features characterize the role of tone in processing written texts. It elicits an organic response from the reader. Bartlett (1932) argued that remembering requires an organic response. Tone also no doubt

arouses specific attitudes characterized by feeling in the reader. Specific feelings or attitudes strongly influence recall according to Bartlett. They also produce conventional, stereotyped patterns and become a background for specific images. Conventional, stereotyped patterns are important and necessary in comprehension models, for readers need stereotyped patterns or schemes for content, (macrostructures, microstructures), and processing. Images help unify and fuse particulars into a whole, therefore, they also are important in a processing model. A general tone in written texts structural since images and tones make a chain, but it is textural since each image and tone is apprehended sensuously as it comes.

In addition, it is contentual because the chain carries a meaning that one link (an unrepeated tone) would not. Structure would be a matter of memory while texture would be a matter of immediacy.

Furthermore, tone qualifies meaning, leads to reader expectations, resolves ambiguities, adds precision, helps in rationalization, and helps the reader fill in probable detail in the gestalt. Tone leads to understanding of the word, the sentence, the paragraph, the whole text, all of an author's texts, and text types. We can consider tone as the key to full understanding of written texts.

References \*

- Altenbrand, L., & Lewis, L. L. A handbook for the study of poetry.  
New York: 1966.
- Atlick, R. D. Preface to critical reading. New York: Holt, Rinehart,  
& Winston, 1969.
- Austin, J. L. How to do things with words. London: Oxford University  
Press, 1962.
- Barnet, S., et al. A dictionary of literary terms. Boston:  
1960.
- Bartine, D. Personal communication. Urbana: University of Illinois,  
Speech Communication Dept., 1980.
- Bartlett, F. C. Remembering: A study in experimental and social psychology.  
Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press, 1967. (Originally  
published, 1932)
- Barzun, J. Simple and direct: A rhetoric for writers. New York: Harper  
& Row, 1976.
- Bechseng, K., & Ganz, A. Literary terms-A dictionary. New York: Noonday  
Press, 1960.
- Beloof, R. The performing voice. Boston: Little, Brown, & Co., 1966.
- Bereiter, C., & Scardamalia, M. From conversation to composition: The  
role of instruction in a developmental process. To appear in  
R. Glaser (Ed.), Advances in instructional psychology, Vol 2.  
Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum,

The Role of Tone

164

- Bleich, D. Readings and feelings: An introduction to subjective criticism. Urbana, Ill.: NCTE, 1975.
- Bloom, E. A., Philbrick, C. H., Blistein, E. M. The order of poetry. New York: 1961.
- Bolinger, D. L. Around the edge in language. Harvard Educational Review, 1964, 34, 282-296.
- Brennan, J. G. The role of emotion in aesthetic experience. The Quarterly Journal of Speech, 1954, 40,
- Brewer, W. Event schemas, story schemas, and story grammars. To be published.
- Brooks, C., & Heilman, R. Understanding drama. New York: Holt, Rinehart, & Winston, 1945.
- Brooks, C., & Warren, R. Modern rhetoric. New York: Harcourt, Brace, & Co., 1949.
- Brooks, C., & Warren, R. Understanding fiction. New York: I. C. Crofts & Co., 1943.
- Brooks, C., & Warren, R. Understanding poetry. New York: Henry Holt & Co., 1960.
- Brooks, C. The well wrought urn. New York: Reynal & Hitchcock, 1947.
- Brown, A. L. Knowing when, where, and how to remember: A problem of meta-cognition. In R. Glaser (Ed.), Advance in instructional psychology, Vol. 1. Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum, 1978, 77-165.
- Bower, R. A. The fields of light: An experiment in critical reading. London: Oxford University Press, 1951.

The Role of Tone

165

Cameron, K. M., & Hoffman, T. C. The theatrical response. New York:  
The Macmillan Co., 1969.

Christensen, F., & Christensen, B. A new rhetoric. New York: Harper  
& Row, 1976.

Clurman, H. The principles of interpretation. In J. Gassner (Ed.),  
Producing the play. New York: The Dryden Press, 1941, 280-289.

Clymer, T. Orbits and opportunities, Rainbow Edition, New York;  
Ginn & Co., 1980. (a)

Clymer, T. Windows and walks, Rainbow Edition, New York: Ginn & Co.,  
1980. (b)

Coffin, C. H. The appreciation of the drama, New York: The Baker &  
Taylor Co., 1908.

Coleridge, S. T. Biographia Literaria, ed. John Shawcross. London: 1907.

Comprone, J. From experience to expression, second ed, Boston: Houghton  
Mifflin Co., 1981.

Cooper, C. R., & Purves, A. C. Diagnostic tests of specific skills, 9,  
Lexington, Mass.: Ginn & Co., 1973.

Crismore, A. G. Unpublished study on tone/mood identification. Urbana,  
Ill.: Urbana High School Reading Laboratory, Summer, 1981.

Cudden, J. A. A dictionary of literary terms, London: Andrew Deutsch,  
1977.

Davis, F. Psychometric research on comprehension in reading. Reading  
Research Quarterly, 1972, 1, 628-678.

- Davis, F. B., & Davis, C. C. The Davis reading tests, Series 1 and 2, Forms A, B, C, C. New York: Psychological Corp., 1962.
- Dillon, G. L. Constructing texts. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1981.
- Elkhadem, S. The york dictionary of literary terms. Fredericton: N. B. Canada. York Press, 1976.
- Erwin-Tripp, S. Personal communication. March, 1981.
- Fowler, R. Dictionary of modern critical terms. London: Routledge & Keegan Paul, Publishers, 1973.
- Frederiksen, C. H. Representing logical and semantic structures of knowledge acquired from discourse. Cognitive Psychology, 1975, 7, 351-458.
- Frenz, H. The art of translation. In N. Stallknecht & H. Frenz (Eds.), Comparative literature: Method and perspective. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1961.
- Goodman, K. S. Reading: A psycholinguistic guessing game. Journal of the Reading Specialist, 1967, 4, 126-135.
- Gorelik, M. Designing the play. In J. Gassner, Producing the play. New York: The Dryden Press, 1941, 310-315.
- Gough, P. B. One second of reading. In J. F. Kavanagh & I. A. Mattingly (Eds.), Language by ear and by eye. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1972, 331-358.
- Gumperz, J. J., & Hymes, D. (eds.) Directions in sociolinguistics. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1972.

Hansson, G. Some types of research on response to literature. Research in the Teaching of English, 1973, 7, 260-284.

Holman, H. C. A handbook to literature. New York: The Odyssey Press, 1960.

Hungerland, I. Poetic discourse. University of California Publications in Philosophy, 1957, 33,

Hymes, D. Models of the interaction of language and social life. In J. J. Gumperz & D. Hymes (Eds.), Directions in sociolinguistics.

New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1972.

Iser, W. The art of reading: A theory of the aesthetic response. Baltimore: The John Hopkins Press, 1978.

Kahene, H. R. Personal communication. Urbana: University of Illinois, Linguistics Department, 1980.

Kintsch, W., & van Dijk, T. A. Toward a model of text comprehension and production. Psychological Review, 1978, 85, 363-394.

Langer, S. K. Feeling and form: A theory of art. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1953.

Langer, S. K. Mind: An essay on human feelings, II. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1972.

Langer, S. K. Philosophy in a new key. New York: The New American Library, 1962.

Lehiste, I. Suprasegmentals. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1970.

The Role of Tone

168

Leopold, S. Polanyi's "tacit knowledge" and the problem of invention.

In R. L. Brown & M. Steinman (Eds.), Rhetoric 78. Minneapolis:  
University of Minnesota, 1979.

Lukens, R. A critical handbook of children's literature. Geneva, Ill.:  
Scott Foresmans & Co., 1976.

Markova, A. K. The teaching and mastery of language, edited by Beatrice  
Szehely. White Plains, N.Y.: M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1979.

McCawley, D. L. The concept of tone. Unpublished dissertation, Urbana:  
University of Illinois, 1971.

Meyer, B. J. F. The organization of prose and its effects on memory.  
Amsterdam: North Holland, 1975.

Meyer, B. J. F. The structure of prose: Effects on learning and memory  
and implications for educational practice. In R. C. Anderson, R.  
Spiro, & W. E. Montague (Eds.), Schooling and the acquisition of  
knowledge. Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum, 1977.

Milan, D. K., & Rattner, Forms of the essay. New York: Harcourt Brace  
Jovanovich, Inc., 1979.

Miller, G. A., & Johnson-Laird, P. N. Language and perception. Cambridge,  
Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1976.

Ortony, A., & Clore, G. L. Disentangling the affective lexicon. Paper  
presented at the proceedings of the Third American Meeting of Cognitive  
Science Society,

The Role of Tone

169

- Perrin, P. C. Writer's guide and index to English, revised by Wilma R. Ebbitt. Glenview, Ill.: Scott Foresman & Co., 1972.
- Perrine, L. The importance of tone in the interpretation of literature. College English, 1963, February, 389-395.
- Perrine, L. Sound and sense: An introduction to poetry. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1969.
- Phillips, A. E. The tone system. Chicago: The Newton Company, 1910.
- Polanyi, M. The tacit dimension. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 1967.
- Preminger, A. (Ed.) Princeton encyclopedia of poetry and poetics. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1965.
- Purves, A. C. Evaluation of learning in literature. In B. Choppin & T. Postlethwaite (Eds.), Evaluation in education: An international review series, Vol. 3. 1979, 93-172.
- Purves, A. C., & each, R. Literature and the reader. Urbana, Ill.: NCTE, 1972.
- Purves, A. C. Personal communication. Urbana: University of Illinois, English Education Department, 1980.
- Ransom, J. C. Criticism as pure speculation. In D. Stauffer (Ed.), The intent of the critic. Gloucester, Mass.: Peter Smith, 1963.
- Ransom, J. C. The new criticism. Norfolk, Conn.: New Directions, 1941.
- Ransom, J. C. The world's body. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1938.

The Role of Tone

170

Richards, I. A. The philosophy of rhetoric. London: Oxford University Press, 1936.

Richards, I. A. Practical criticism. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1929.

Rosenblatt, L. M. The reader, the text, the poem. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1978.

Ruggiero, V. R. The art of writing. Sherman Oaks, Cal.: Alfred Publishing Co., Inc., 1981.

Rumelhart, D. E. Toward an interactive model of reading. In S. Dornic (Ed.), Attention and performance, VI. Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum, 1977, 573-603.

Scott, A. F. Current literary terms. New York: Macmillan, St Martin's Press, 1965.

Searle, J. Speech acts. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1969.

Sebeok, T. A. (Ed.) Style in language. Cambridge, Mass.: The M.I.T. Press, 1960.

Shaw, H. Dictionary of literary terms. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1972.

Shipley, J. T. (Ed.) Dictionary of world literary terms. Boston: The Writer, Inc., 1970.

Smith, F. Understanding reading. New York: Holt, Rinehart, & Winston, 1971.

- Stallman, R. W. The new critics. In R. W. Stallman, Critiques in criticism. New York: The Ronald Press, 1949.
- Stanovich, K. E. Toward an interactive-compensatory model of individual differences in the development of reading fluency. Reading Research Quarterly, 1980, 16(1),
- Stein, N. L., & Glenn, C. G. An analysis of story comprehension in elementary school children. In R. O. Freedle (Ed.), New directions in discourse processing, II. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1979, 53-120.
- Thrall, W. F., & Hibbard, A. A handbook to literature (rev. ed.). New York: Odyssey Press, 1960.
- Tyler, S. A. The said and unsaid: Mind, meaning and culture. New York: Academic Press, 1978.
- Vygotsky, L. S. Thought and language. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 1962.
- Watson, S. Jr. Polanyi and the context of composing. In Freedman & Pringle (Eds.), Reinventing the rhetorical tradition. Conway, Ark.: L & S Books, University of Central Arkansas, Published for the Canadian Council of Teachers of English, 1980. Pp. 19-26.
- Watt, W. W. An american rhetoric. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1980.
- Wellak, R. John Crowe Ransom's theory of poetry. In Brody et al. (Eds.), Literary theory and structure. Binghamton, N.Y.: Yale University Press, 1973. Pp. 179-197.

The Role of Tone

172

Wellek, R., & Warren, A. Theory of literature. New York: Harcourt, Brace & Co., 1949.

Wimsatt, W. K. The affective fallacy. In W. Winsatt, The verbal icon. Louisville, Ky.: University of Kentucky Press, 1954. Pp. 21-39.

Winkler, A. C., & McCuen, J. R. Rhetoric made plain. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc., 1974.

Woodson, L. A handbook of modern rhetorical terms. Urbana, Ill.: NCTE, 1979.

Wright, G. T. The poet in the poem. New York: Gordian Press, 1974.