

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 203 715

FL 012 403

AUTHOR Torney-Purta, Judith V.
 TITLE The Role of NIE in Stimulating Research on International Education: Learning Issues, Testing, and Assessment.
 SPONS AGENCY National Inst. of Education (ED), Washington, D.C. National Council on Education Research.
 PUB DATE 29 Apr 81
 CONTRACT NIE-P-81-0050
 NOTE 52p.: Paper presented at a meeting of the National Council on Education Research (Washington, DC, April 29, 1981).

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
 DESCRIPTORS *Agency Role; Attitude Measures; Cultural Education; *Educational Assessment; Elementary Secondary Education; *Global Approach; *International Studies; Learning Processes; Literature Reviews; Nationalism; Postsecondary Education; *Program Effectiveness; *Research Needs; Second Language Programs; Student Motivation; *Testing

ABSTRACT

One of ten studies commissioned to investigate research needs and to stimulate planning activities, this paper addresses its recommendations to the National Institute of Education (NIE), the National Assessment, and other agencies with potential capacity to conduct or facilitate research in international education. A major part of the paper is devoted to a review of existing research under the following topics: (1) concepts of nationality and feelings of nationalism; (2) descriptive and developmental studies of views of other nations; (3) student awareness of global problems and solutions, including war, human rights, world hunger, and international organizations; and (4) the effectiveness of international education programs, including the cultural dimension of language studies. It is found that the overall picture is one of useful fragments, and of a general failure to develop rigorous measures to compare learning paradigms or to provide an understanding of the ways in which students form ideas about global problems and become motivated to be part of their solution. As a result of this review, nine priority research activities and areas are identified, and ways of implementing them are suggested.
 (Author/AMH)

 * Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
 * from the original document. *

ED203715

THE ROLE OF NIE IN
STIMULATING RESEARCH ON
INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION:
LEARNING ISSUES, TESTING, AND ASSESSMENT

Judith V. Torney-Purta
University of Illinois at Chicago Circle

Paper commissioned for discussion by the National Council on Education
Research (NCER) of the National Institute of Education, April 1981.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRO-
DUCEO EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM
THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGIN-
ATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS
STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT
OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

Thinkers in every age have included knowledge of the world and a sense of human community among the characteristics of the well educated person. Although interdependence has been mentioned by educational writers for several decades, there has recently been a dramatic shift in the extent to which the globalization of the human condition has been recognized. A recent survey of school board members and school superintendents indicates that more than sixty percent believe that global education is an important idea, and twenty five percent believe that it is "an overdue idea." (Mecklenburger, 1981) However, global education programs must compete with other important ideas for resources. Even the Council on Learning Project, which has found colleges and universities to be lacking in many important dimensions necessary to prepare students to take a world view, does not conclude that the reason for such gaps is opposition to the idea (Tonkin and Edwards, 1981). Reports submitted to UNESCO Seminars evaluating the implementation in the United States of the Unesco Recommendation on Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms give a relatively optimistic picture (Burgenthal and Torney, 1976; Torney, 1979; Tucker, 1980).

Nationally, sparse resources have been devoted to research on learning outcomes in international and global education. Even documents which have reflected and guided program development in this area. (such as the Report of the President's Commission on Foreign Language and International Studies and the UNESCO Recommendation) devote only a few paragraphs to research on the processes of learning about the world or to the importance of developing measures which are appropriate to evaluate the results of global education programs.

More than one thousand, two hundred abstracts of international projects funded by USOE, NIE, and FIPSE from 1956-1977 have been collected and published by the Department of Education (1980). Teaching and Learning about Other Countries is the category under which more than half of these listings are placed. Fewer than fifteen of these projects report any evaluation of their effectiveness in producing the desired learning outcomes.

A review of the State of the Art must therefore rely on three relatively well sampled large surveys -- Other Nations, Other Peoples (conducted by the Educational Testing Service, funded by the U.S. Office of Education); What College Students Know about Their World (sponsored by the Council on Learning, conducted by the Educational Testing Service, and funded by USOE); and Civic Education in Ten Nations (conducted by the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement, funded by an international set of agencies including USOE). The first two surveys included only American students but concentrated on international issues in their questions. The IEA survey included students from several nations but only a few questions dealt with international issues. Some data are available from the National Assessment of Educational Progress, but the proportion of questions dealing with global issues is also small. The remainder of the research reviewed has been culled from the political socialization literature, work on cognitive development of concepts of nations, literature on the impact of international programs and second language learning on attitudes,

Research is reviewed under the following categories: first, the development of national identity ^{and} nationalism; second, the development of orientations toward other nations; third, attitudes and knowledge of global issues; fourth, the effectiveness of programs in international education and cultural studies in foreign language. This is followed by a discussion of research priorities,

Research on the Development of National Identity/
Nationalism and its Relation to Other
Group Affiliations

The classic work on the development of a concept of nation-state and a sense of national identity remains that done thirty years ago with Swiss children by Piaget and Weil (1951). In early childhood there was found to be a lack of awareness of the societal environment; in this unconscious egocentricity the child presumed himself or herself to be the center of the social world. Only at about ten or eleven was the child able to show a conception of his or her country as a coherent collection of people and places. A concept of homeland developed. Affective growth continued in parallel with a constant preference for Switzerland but with different levels of reasoning associated with it.

Reciprocity is a very important concept in Piaget's theory, and it relates to this sense of national identity. Piaget and Weil noted that both cognitive and affective awareness of equality, similarity, and balance of relations between the child's own nation and other nations is necessary. They concluded:

. . . the child's discovery of his homeland and understanding of other countries is a process of transition from egocentricity to reciprocity . . . this gradual development is liable to contain setbacks, usually through the reemergence of egocentricity . . . as each new conflict arises. Accordingly, the main problem is not to determine what must or must not be inculcated in the child: it is to discover how to develop reciprocity in thought and action. (Piaget and Weil, 1951, p. 578.)

The concept of nation is thus the product of a continuous process by which the child constructs, explores and tests out theories with regard to society and interactions at various social levels (see also Furth, 1980). Developmental change slows at some point in adolescence. But those who believe that the cognitive developmental process shapes social knowledge would argue that a process of construction, exploration and correction takes place at all ages and that educational programs (even for adults) should take account of the stage level of the individual's concepts, should encourage the individual to bring these concepts into potential conflict with reality, and should encourage exploration of alternative ideas.

A number of authors have used the Piagetian framework to further explore young people's geographic, spatial, and nationality concepts. Jahoda (1962, 1963) interviewed children from Glasgow, Scotland, and delineated four stages in national concepts. He also concluded that by the age of eleven children had some awareness of the relation between Glasgow, Scotland, and Great Britain and had relatively well-developed notions about other countries --liking those perceived as similar to Scotland.

Over the three decades since the publication by Piaget and Weil, other investigators have verified this developmental progress using children from various nations (though the precise descriptions of stages vary somewhat). Of particular interest is a recent study of the development of national identity in white South African children. A similar progression through the stages was found, using children's pictures as well as interviews. There were, however, differences between English-speaking and African-speaking children's national identity (Moodie, 1980). English-speaking students

showed a deep affection for the land and its natural beauty, but made many negative references to political figures. In contrast, the African-speaking children were more aware of and positive toward symbols of the nation state (the flag) and toward the political status quo.

Metz (1980) has recently made an attempt to generalize the Piagetian model concerning nationality to apply to intergroup relations by focusing on "sociocentration" (centering on the position, perspective or actions of one's own group). She identified four stages - first, naive socio-centrism in which one does not distinguish one's own group from others; second, simplistic group differentiation using one's own group as the "universe's center;" third, desociocentering with a more complete set of dimensions distinguishing one's own group from others and with some growing consciousness of the meaning of group membership; and finally, reciprocity of social groups, resulting in a kind of meta-cultural reality in which groups' considerations can be transcended. As yet, this intriguing conception does not seem to have been subject to empirical verification.

One need not be a convinced Piagetian to realize the importance of egocentrism and perspective taking for international awareness. Research on the ability of children to take into account the perspective of others and the types of training or educational activities which enhance that ability and empathy have considerable potential for improving education with a global perspective (see Torney-Purta, 1981).

The studies reviewed to this point all point to developmental changes in children's understanding of nationality. There is also little disagreement among researchers that positive feeling for one's nation and its symbols is established in children at an early age. Connell (1971) conducted a very

imaginative interview study of Australian children and pointed to the existence of a "threat scheme" - a positive defense of the status quo and one's own nation because of a perceived threat that external enemies will disrupt the safe places of the child's own life. Cooper (1965) in a study of English and Japanese students identified a "patriotic filter" which was in existence by the age of 9 or 10, which screened out negative images of the home country. Hess and Torney (1967) found a similarly strong positive affective attachment to America developed by the second grade when an overwhelming proportion of students agreed that "America is the best country in the world." Although America is not yet seen as part of an organized system of countries, early in elementary school the patriotic defense of country was already strong. While young American elementary school students indicated that their pride in being American was linked to material elements (e.g. "Americans have beautiful parks") those in later grades stressed more ideological factors (such as freedom and the right to vote).

As a sidelight, it is interesting to note the results of a recent survey of university students and young workers in Poland, which indicates that "a tradition of struggles for freedom" and "bravery in difficult historical events" ranked first and second as reasons for national pride. The "socialist social order" ranked eleventh out of thirteen choices. (Jerschina, 1980).

The IEA Civic Education study in which more than thirty thousand students aged 10, 14 and 17 to 20 were surveyed in 1971 in ten Western nations (including the U.S.), demonstrated some variations among countries in the strength of the sense of national identity, specifically in the emphasis placed on national patriotic rituals or symbols and the strength of the

positive evaluation of the national government (Torney, Oppenheim, and Farnen, 1975). For example, students in Israel were much like those in the U.S. in having a strong national identification and in having experienced schooling with considerable attention devoted to patriotic practices; in contrast, students in the Federal Republic of Germany, Finland, and the Netherlands had elements of an anti-nationalistic position in some of their attitudes.

There were also considerable differences in the patternings of national and international knowledge and interest in these countries. Fourteen year old students in Israel and the United States were more knowledgeable about domestic political processes than students at that level in any of the other countries. The American students, in contrast, were less knowledgeable about international institutions and processes than the fourteen year olds in any nation except Ireland (Torney, 1977). An opposite pattern (higher scores on knowledge of international processes and institutions than on knowledge of domestic institutions and processes) characterized students in the Netherlands and the Federal Republic of Germany. Similar patterns were obtained in reports of the topics students were interested in discussing with parents and friends. The U.S. was the only country where there was substantially less interest in discussion of international political topics than in discussion of national political affairs.

Jones (1980) has confirmed in a reanalysis of the small number of existing NAEP exercises with an international focus that American students were almost twice as likely to give accurate responses to question relating to the functioning of a domestic political institution than to questions relating to an international institution. She also reported patterns similar to those of the IEA survey for interest in discussion of international topics.

She further cites data reported by NAEP in its study of change in political knowledge, showing that from 1969 to 1976 there was an overall decline in student performance on questions relating to international affairs. (See also NAEP reports on these findings.)

Some surveys have attempted to measure chauvinism as well as positive national feeling. Caplow and Bahr (1979) restudied the high school population of Middletown, U.S.A. surveyed by the Lynds in 1924; they reported that in both that year and fifty-two years later, more than seventy five per cent of students agreed, "The United States is unquestionably the best country in the world." More than forty percent agreed in both surveys that, "The United States was entirely right and England was entirely wrong in the American Revolution." Finally, in relation to patriotic attitudes, they report that fifty to sixty percent of students agreed, "Every good citizen should act according to the following statement: My country - right or wrong."

The ETS/Council on Learning survey of three thousand college freshmen, seniors, and students in two-year colleges showed somewhat lower levels of chauvinistic attitudes (Barrows, 1981). Between sixteen and twenty-seven percent of these students agreed with the statements, "I'm for my country, right or wrong." About the same number agreed that "pacifist demonstrations - picketing missile bases, peace walks, etc. - are harmful to the best interests of the American people." Forty to fifty percent agreed that, "the best way to insure peace is to keep the United States stronger than

any other nation in the world." Forty to fifty percent agreed that, "the immigration of foreigners to this country should be kept down so that we can provide for Americans first." Somewhat surprisingly, more than sixty percent agreed that "we should not allow foreign business enterprise to buy American farmland." Seniors tended to have slightly less chauvinistic attitudes than freshmen or two-year college students. This survey also found considerable support for international cooperation on global problems but not for a comprehensive world government. More than a third of the students agreed that "mining and distribution of mineral resources should be controlled by an international authority;" "a World Government should have the power to make laws that would be binding on all its member nations;" and "an international authority should be established and given direct control over the production of nuclear energy," Only ten to fifteen percent agreed that, "The United States ought to be willing to give up its independence and submit to the authority of a United States of the World.

These findings are placed into a comparative context in a study of university students (Klineberg, Zavalloni, Louis-Guerin, and BenBrika, 1979). Ten thousand students in eleven countries were sampled. The authors identified three basic orientations among students. The first, called "internationalist," combined attitudes favorable to immigration, the elimination of nationalism and the establishment of a worldwide government (most typical of Austria, Japan, and Spain). The second orientation was "nationalist" - opposed to any limitation of national sovereignty, perception of the need for control of immigration, and distrust of supranational organizations (most typical of Tunisians and Nigerians). The third orientation,

was called "social protectionist" and included some hope for the elimination of nationalism along with some distrust of world government and/^{some} support for immigration limitation (most typical of the U.S., France, Italy, Yugoslavia, and Australia). Interesting comparisons between data collected in 1970 and ~~in~~ 1977 showed decreasing liberalism on these issues among U.S. students.

Statt (1974) in a small study noted the strong national identification of American children compared with Canadians. The Canadian children were aware of their nationality but much less nationalistic or ideological about it.

In summary, the existing research is adequate in documenting the stages through which children pass in forming a national identity. There is little need to replicate these in general, although it would be useful to have research which considered the implication of these stages for the sequencing of material about one's own and other nations. Existing research is also adequate in indicating the strength of American students' nationalistic orientation. Surveys which attempt to estimate the amount of chauvinistic feeling among students at different periods historically are interesting but of limited value in designing educational programs. Further, there is some difficulty in interpreting the precise meaning of agreement with the often used survey item ("My country, right or wrong.") Measures which are less expensive and time consuming than interviews and more satisfying than paper and pencil surveys need to be developed if there is to be further useful work in this area.

Research questions which do need to be asked include the following: First, what is the process by which the child begins to see himself as linked to and a member of the human species and global society? This is a sub-question within the more general area of understanding how children perceive themselves as members of groups with which they have no face-to-face

interaction. The nation is one such group; the global system is another. By the end of middle childhood the child has accepted a kind of implicit social contract binding him or her to the nation. Certain responsibilities and rights are involved in that acceptance. What are the parallel processes at the international level? The research of Gallatin and Adelson (1971) on the relationship between individual freedom and group welfare suggests some ways to begin.

Second, how does a strong sense of national identification contribute to or detract from a student's ability to acquire differentiated concepts of other nations or global problems to which there are no simple solutions? The young person has a very great capacity for identifying with different groups, taking many perspectives, and generating a wide range of alternatives. How can that capacity be nurtured in a way which neither subtracts from the student's basic positive national feeling nor is hindered by extremes of that feeling.

Descriptive and Developmental Studies
of Orientations Toward Other Nations

The classic study in this area was conducted by Lambert and Klineberg in the late 1950's. Three thousand three hundred children, at three age levels (6, 10, and 14) from eleven parts of the world were interviewed. (Lambert and Klineberg, 1967). Among the most important research questions were those aimed at finding out whether children perceived a country as similar to or different from their own. The groups which were seen by American children of all ages as predominantly different were the Chinese, Indians from India, Negroes from Africa, and Russians. Younger children either gave no response or determined similarity/difference on the basis of clothing, physical characteristics, or language. By fourteen, children were much more likely to focus on political characteristics.

In some countries, children expressed positive attitudes only to nations perceived as similar. In the United States, however, children at all age levels appeared to be high in their liking for foreign persons. Of special interest is the authors' conclusion that American children of about ten years of age were particularly receptive to approaches to foreign people and were interested in people who are seen as dissimilar to themselves as well as those who are similar. By the age of fourteen American young people were much less open to positive views of foreign nations. There was further evidence that from about the age of ten children begin a process of stereotyping foreign people.

In a study conducted in 1968, in which forty-five American children were interviewed about human diversity, a number of specific countries were spontaneously mentioned in response to general questions about differences between the U.S. and other nations. (Torney, 1969) Oriental countries (especially Vietnam) were mentioned as being different from our country four times as often as countries in any other part of the world. It is interesting to contrast this with Lambert and Klineberg's study in which Oriental countries were mentioned as different, but not nearly as frequently. One possibility is that America's highly conflictual involvement in an Asian war during the period in which the interview study was conducted may have impressed upon children in this country the differences between themselves and Oriental people. Johnson (1973) also found that English children expressed strong negative stereotypes of Germany dominated by war themes even two decades after the end of the war.

An even more striking finding of the interview study just discussed was that children, when asked how other countries differed from America, very frequently answered that those in other nations spoke other languages, "talked different," or "didn't talk right." When asked whether it would

be better if everyone in the world were American, younger children sometimes volunteered that it would, because then "they would talk normal, the way we do." These responses give both indices of egocentrism and suggestions about the importance of research which considers the connection between learning to speak a second language and acquiring an international perspective.

Hicks and Beyer (1970) collected information on the attitudes toward Africa of more than 3,000 seventh and twelfth graders. They developed the World Regions Perception Survey, consisting of an outline map of the world divided into seven labeled regions. Accompanying the map were ninety cards, each containing a different phrase -- some selected because they might be part of a stereotype of sub-Saharan Africa (in which the authors were especially interested), some associated with other parts of the world. The student was asked to place each card on the region of the world it best described.

A re-analysis of their data confirms the existence of negative ideas of Russia and positive ideas of North America at grade 7. Concepts associated with Russia by more than 45 per cent of these students included "dictatorship" and "enemy." Asia was described as "overpopulated." Europe was characterized by "art," "sculpture," and "music." A long list of characteristics was attributed to North America including "freedom," "well-educated," "civilized," "rich," "democracy," "churches," "capitalism," and "racial problems." The following concepts were associated with Africa south of the Sahara: "wild animals," "witch doctors," "jungles," "spears," "tribes," "drums," "cannibals." Somewhat surprisingly, there was an increase in the tendency for students to express stereotypes between grade 7 and 12.

On a multiple choice test of factual knowledge about Africa, students in the seventh grade were found to have very limited accurate information. In some items, forty five percent or more selected a single wrong answer. These were characterized as major misconceptions and included the following: most of Africa south of the Sahara is covered by jungles (correct answer - by grassland); in terms of dollar value, the most important exports are mineral products (correct answer - agricultural products). Hicks and Beyer used the results of this survey (both its attitudinal and cognitive components) to justify the importance of curriculum materials about Africa south of the Sahara and to design those materials to correct misconceptions and weaken the process of stereotyping.

A number of other authors have also studied children's orientations toward Russia and other countries perceived as Communist (Hess and Torney, 1967; Glenn, 1970; Targ, 1970). They are seen as untrustworthy, atheistic, lacking in freedom, led by dictatorships. Several of these studies have also indicated that some children perceive that tolerance and friendliness should be extended to the people who live in Communist countries even if their political leadership is perceived in a very negative way. This suggests that there may be some basis for children to understand how it is possible for the United States to collaborate with a Communist nation on a space flight or to better the plight of refugees or to engage in trade without approving of their political systems.

A series of studies has been conducted in Europe on the cognitive structuring of perceptions of other nations and the role of similarity to homeland in determining positive or negative attitudes (see the work of Tajfel and associates). Jaspars, van de Geer, Tajfel and Johnson (1972) based their study on Allport's three-stage theory of prejudice. During the first stage of pregeneralization, children seem aware of group differences

but do not have strong negative feelings toward other groups. The next stage is total rejection and is thought to reach its peak in early puberty. At adolescence greater differentiation and less generalized prejudice is expected.

The theory was tested on a group of Dutch students. They showed a clear preference for the Netherlands when asked to compare pairs of countries. The intensity of this preference increased between grades two and six, and the total amount of differentiation between these countries also increased. In cognitive judgments of similarity between one's own country and others, there was a change from the second grade (when the Netherlands was believed to be different from all others but other countries were seen as relatively similar to each other) to grade five (when a more differentiated structure was found). The correlation between preference for five countries and the cognitive distance of these countries from the Netherlands reached a peak at the fourth grade.

Johnson, Middleton, and Tajfel (1970) found a curvilinear relationship between knowledge of other countries and preference for them. British children knew least about countries on which they had neutral opinions, most about disliked and liked countries. These authors identified a number of misconceptions in the knowledge test,-- More than thirty per cent of the children thought Germans were non-white; about forty per cent believed that the French and Italians were English speaking.

Middleton, Tajfel and Johnson (1970) used an imaginative technique in which children seven to eleven were asked to manipulate dolls and toy boats in an imagined rescue from an island. Older children showed stronger preferences for Britain. With age, children also became increasingly able to take the point of view of others (in realizing that citizens of other countries prefer their own countries). This reciprocal perception occurred at a later age when children were asked to predict the feelings of individuals from disliked countries (in comparisons to individuals from liked countries). When asked to

attribute fairness or unfairness to the behavior of dolls, only older children were not biased by liking for the doll's nation.

Johnson (1973) found that children who were asked to recall the same story set either in England or Germany showed a selective bias after seven weeks. The eight to ten year old Britishers were more likely to recall negative features of the story when it had been set in Germany, positive features when it had been set in England.

It appears that attitudes toward other nations, measured in several indirect as well as direct ways, influence cognition and judgments. It also appears that these attitudes are established quite early in life.

Tajfel and his collaborators have also studied equity theory and the influence of social group differentiation on in-group/out-group behavior, in thirteen to fifteen year old British boys. Even when groups were randomly constituted, not face-to-face interactive, and based on characteristics with little importance to adolescence (esthetic preferences), clear discrimination in favor of in-group members was shown. In some cases maximizing the difference between the in-group and out-group was more important than maximizing the in-group's total payoff. The authors interpret these results as illustrating a process of social group identification and the establishment of distinctiveness generalizable to process of ethnic and national discrimination. No negative experiences with members of the group or feelings of personal frustration were necessary for these adolescents to differentially reward groups in this way. (Billig and Tajfel, 1973; Caddick, 1980).

The largest recent U.S. study of concepts and attitudes in this area is Other Nations, Other Peoples (Pike and Barrows, 1979). More than 1,700 fourth, eighth, and twelfth graders from twenty seven states were surveyed in 1974. A knowledge test focused on six countries: USA, Mexico, France, Egypt, the People's Republic of China and the USSR. Students also rated these countries

(along with Canada, Spain, Japan, Israel, India, and East Germany) on a series of semantic differential scales and reacted to a series of paired comparisons of selected nation pairs. Questions were also included concerning interest in studying various countries and whether they had previously been studied. Teachers were also asked about various international experiences.

Students expressed considerable interest in studying Canada and Mexico (more than one might predict on the basis of relatively little study of these nations in the schools). Fourth graders were more interested in studying or visiting other countries than were eighth or twelfth graders. Major misconceptions on the part of students were also noted in this survey. Considerably more than half of the students selected a non-European country as a member of the Common Market. Egypt was a country about which very little was known. Only about half the students could locate it on a map. Less than half of the high school seniors knew that Anwar el Sadat was President of Egypt; a substantial number chose Golda Meir as the incumbent of that position.

As in many other studies, the investigators were especially interested in the structure of similarities and differences perceived between the U.S. and other nations. A series of quite complex analyses of the semantic differential and paired comparisons led to the following conclusion:

At grade 4 perceptions of nations show a pronounced "we-they" view, with the US set far apart from all other countries. Israel, Egypt, and Russia form a triad of similar countries that are undesirable, relatively poor/weak, and not like us. China and Japan are viewed as the most similar (pair)...At grade 8., the United States joins the world through its similarity to England and France in one sense, and to Mexico and Spain in another. East Germany and

the USSR now receive the most negative evaluations (undesirable people and nation, people not free). The occidental-oriental distinction continues to be very powerful. Variations between grades 8 and 12 are minor.

(Pike and Barrows, 1979, p. 44),

The report includes a large number of tables illustrating various scaling techniques applied to the data. Unfortunately the amount of useful information is low in proportion to the complexity of analysis. The text gives little information (beyond that quoted above) on the details of American children's perceptions of these nations.

A related approach to the problem of complexity in perceptions and concepts used to organize ideas about nations was taken by Signell (1966). Children aged nine to sixteen were asked to suggest how two countries were similar to each other and different from a third. They performed a similar task with triads of persons. Older children used more dimensions in differentiating nations and more complex single concepts in differentiating persons. The author concludes that in acquiring concepts of persons children rely on interpersonal experience; in acquiring such concepts for differentiating nations, the role of teaching by adults is of greater importance. Although older children may have a wider variety of dimensions for differentiating countries, they may not have many advantages in comprehensively representing the nature of individual countries or their differences.

In summary, there have been a number of studies of children's reactions to and knowledge of other nations. This includes both research in the U.S. and Europe. Changes in international relations may make some of these studies of limited value within a short time. Most of the research has focused on selective bias in the acquisition of information or attribution of characteristics and on ways in which young people group or categorize nations. The majority of questions which need to be answered about children's perceptions of other

nations seem to have been answered by the existing research. More surveys in this area will be of limited usefulness unless they are designed to provide more sensitive ways of measuring complexity of perceptions or unless they are tailored to evaluate the specific outcomes of an international education program. In other words, studies of young people's perceptions of other nations is probably not a priority area for research funding,

Among the most important substantive conclusions of this review is that the years between seven or eight and eleven or twelve may be a particularly important period for international education. Lambert and Klineberg found that children of about ten years of age are open to learning about foreign people; there appears to be a certain closing off by the age of about fourteen. Pike and Barrows found that there was considerably more interest among fourth graders than among eighth or twelfth graders in studying other nations. Hicks and Beyer found that stereotyped thinking increased between the seventh and the twelfth grades. These findings suggest the importance of middle childhood for introducing international education programs, if they are to be timed with maximum effectiveness. That it is not wise to wait until mid-adolescence is suggested by Tajfel's work with fourteen and fifteen year olds (where social group identification resulted in out-group intolerance) and by a number of studies showing that group conformity peaks at about fourteen (Strassberg and Wiggen, 1973; Pasternack, 1973). However, the question of timing and sequence in international education is one on which little research evidence of a direct nature is available. It is therefore an area of high priority.

Attitudes and Knowledge Relating to
Selected Global Issues

The idea that the major substance of international education should be a study of the global problematique is a relatively recent one (Weston, 1979-80). Thus it is not too surprising that the classic study in this area is the newest publication to be reviewed in this paper -- the ETS/Council on Learning survey of the global awareness of college students (3,000 freshmen, seniors, and two-year college students sampled in 1980 from 185 U.S. institutions).

The knowledge test -- constructed by an assessment committee including seven disciplines -- clustered around thirteen topics: environment, food, health, population, international monetary and trade arrangement, energy, race and ethnicity, human rights, war and armaments, arts and culture, religious issues, relations among states, and distribution of natural characteristics. There was also a stress upon topics such as interdependence, national development, and historical transformations. The test was a demanding one. Some of the items could have been answered correctly on the basis of regular reading of a newspaper with good international coverage (and, in fact, students who reported such reading habits had higher scores on the test). Other items would probably have required some kind of instruction or assigned reading (though it could have been at either the high school or college level).

The average score of freshmen was 41.9; of seniors 50.5; and of students in two-year colleges 40.5. The three student groups were very similar to each other in their particular areas of knowledge and ignorance. History majors achieved the highest mean score; education majors received the lowest. Among the most interesting data are the item statistics which indicate major misconceptions on the part of students. More than forty per cent were unable to recognize which graph (of four) estimated past and future consumption patterns for fossil fuels; only about half recognized Venezuela and Nigeria as members of OPEC; more than three quarters overestimated the number of

human rights treaties which the U.S. has ratified; only about thirty per cent correctly recognize a ranking of religions of the world according to number of believers; only about ten per cent recognized that foreign workers and their families working in Western Europe were the largest group of persons living outside their own nation in 1978-79; only about twenty five percent recognized the importance of inequalities of income in creating problems of hunger in less developed nations, (Klein and Agar, 1981),

The analysis which is to be found in the final report of this survey has only begun to probe the useful information contained there. The instrument measures knowledge across a wider range of global problem areas than any other and could be used for comparative analysis. For example, items which were applicable to other countries (without specific U.S. referents) could be selected and administered to comparable samples in countries such as the Netherlands and Finland (which were found to have high international awareness levels in the IEA survey). Further analysis is also needed to determine the source of the low performance of education students and clusterings which may exist among the various items.

The ETS instrument also included attitudinal items. In addition to those on nationalism cited in the previous section, students were asked to rate eight problems on eleven semantic differential type scales (with anchors specifically tailored to make them appropriate for global problems). Overall, students seemed to perceive all or nearly all the global problems as being important, related to other problems, and of concern to people in many parts of the world. They are aware that these are global not national problems and that connections exist between them. Two problems -- international conflict/war and depletion of natural resources -- stood out as important, of concern to people in many parts of the world, and increasing in the next twenty years. Intergroup conflict was perceived as the least important

problem (although some students may not have known what this was).

Economic problems--inflation and unemployment--were important and likely to increase in the next twenty years; but they were not thought of particularly as global problems. Their solution was also thought to involve primarily action by the American government.

It is also interesting to examine in some detail the extent to which students thought international organizations were powerful in solving various problems and the extent to which the American government was thought to be powerful in these solutions. Overall, students tended to attribute more power to the American government than to international organizations. Seniors perceived that international organizations could do more than the American government only on three problems -- malnutrition/inadequate health care, intergroup conflict, and the denial of basic human rights.

War was perceived very negatively by the college students. For example, less than five per cent agreed that "war is a satisfactory way to solve international problems." However, nearly fifty per cent agreed that "under some conditions war is necessary to maintain justice" while a similar percentage agreed that "violent revolution is sometimes the only way to eliminate an oppressive government." In other words, justification was perceived for certain kinds of limited wars.

A set of five items measured attitudes toward human rights. Between seventy five and eighty five per cent of these students agreed with items such as the following: "political freedom is a basic human right, and no government should be permitted to abridge it;" "no government should deny access to basic education to any of its citizens," Similarly, less than twenty per cent agreed with the following statement: "it is none of our business if governments restrict the personal freedom of their citizens." (Barrows, 1981). In other words, there appears to be strong support for certain universal human rights.

Previous to the ETS/Council on Learning Global Awareness survey, there had been surveys and other types of research on specific global problems. There had been no work, however, which had placed so many global problems in relation to each other, or which had assessed the perception of the connections between problems, the relation between knowledge and attitudes, and beliefs regarding the roles of the American government compared to international organizations in solving problems. It is important that relatively prompt reanalysis of these data be conducted. The survey is literally a gold mine of possibilities as it has been well-sampled and the instruments have avoided many of the mistakes of the past. In addition to the comparative study suggested earlier, certain of the items could be used with pre-collegiate samples. The ETS survey is the only research integrating the study of several global problems.

Over the last fifteen years (and especially during the Vietnam war years) there have been a number of ^{isolated} studies of children's perceptions of war and peace. Most children appear to be aware of war by the age of six. Younger children's images include concrete objects -- guns, tanks, and planes. Older children, who are capable of reciprocal reasoning, become somewhat more sophisticated about the causes of war. For example, a young child when asked how one can tell which side is right in a war is likely to say, "the one who wins is right", or "they should look on a paper to see which one owns the country." Older children can understand that one's personal preference or nationality may determine which side seems to be right -- "No country is right or wrong. Each one believes that it is right or it wouldn't be fighting. But it depends on your point of view about which is right and which is wrong. Nobody can say for sure who is right. Young people tend to define peace as the absence of war and not to see the active processes of cooperation and conflict resolution which are necessary to sustain peace. Children's ideas also become somewhat more sophisticated with age on the

subject of peace.

A less encouraging aspect of children's attitudes toward war is the evidence that many children see it as inevitable, necessary, and likely. Cooper (1965) in a study of English children found that fourteen to sixteen year olds saw greed, lust, hate, and desire for power as immutable human motives which made war likely. Tolley's more recent study (1973) found that many American children acknowledge the importance of fighting for national defense in general; somewhat fewer saw war as necessary to combat communism. More than ninety per cent felt that stopping wars was "hard" or "very hard." Tolley also commented on the importance of the fifth and sixth grades in the development of children's ideas about war. In these grades there seemed to be a considerable rise in the level of information about war (especially information attributable to television or newspapers).

The IEA survey (Torney, Oppenheim, and Farnen, 1975) also included some attitude items concerning war (e.g., "war is sometimes the only way in which a nation can save its self respect."). The large majority of students in all the tested nations rejected war as an instrument of national policy. War was most strongly rejected in the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, and Sweden,

A recent survey of fourteen hundred junior and senior high school students in Kentucky (Peterson, 1980) indicates that they see the United States as currently sharing a position of high power with Russia. A number of students expressed concern about the future erosion of American power and might. Students were relatively pessimistic, seeing increasing conflict in the world system. This study corroborates the research of Remy and Nathan (1974), which found that high school students were considerably more pessimistic about future events in the international system than in the domestic political system.

There were also a few pieces of research, previous to the ETS survey concerning young people's attitudes toward the international protection of human rights. A small study conducted recently with children aged nine through thirteen explored the extent to which there is basic consensus concerning the moral dimension of human rights (Torney and Brice, 1979). Children were asked questions taken directly from the Universal Declaration of Human Rights: for example, "suppose that in another country it was decided that it was all right to put someone in prison for several years without going to court or having a trial. Would that be right?" Another question asked, "what if someone in another country was arrested, and the police thought he was guilty. But the person wouldn't admit it. Would it be right if there were a law that said the police could beat the person to get him to admit to the crime or to get evidence?" In response to these questions (and others like them dealing with basic human rights) ninety to one hundred per cent of American children said that no law enacted by a country could justify actions which violated rights in this way. This suggests that there may be a deeply held belief that human beings have certain rights by virtue of being human. Some of the young people commented spontaneously that a government which holds people in slavery, tortures them, or refuses them a trial "is not a good government" or "can't expect much respect from its people." It should also be noted that although they could express cogent comments about these provisions of the Universal Declaration, most children were unable to respond when asked directly for a definition of human rights. They had the basic concept but did not yet have a label for it.

There is somewhat more research on attitudes to the United Nations, but again it is scattered and does not provide a very coherent picture of attitudes toward international cooperation in general. Young

American children tested during the 1960's tended to be aware of the UN at about eight years of age and to associate it with helping hungry children and making peace. (Hess and Torney, 1967). While children remembered the United Nations as a topic discussed in school relatively often, they did not report "taking sides" in discussing it (probably because it was presented as a relief organization without a political dimension).

In 1972 the National Assessment of Educational Progress included two items (out of 200) which specifically focused on the United Nations and probed knowledge of its role in promoting peace. More than sixty seven per cent of the thirteen and seventeen year olds answered both of these questions correctly. Only one question pertaining to the UN was administered to the nine year olds; forty seven per cent gave correct answers. This showing compared favorably with that on other items under the heading of Major Developments in World History. A slightly larger number of questions on the UN was included in the 1976 NAEP testing. Only about forty per cent of the thirteen and seventeen year olds knew that the United Nations could take action against a member country which violated the human rights of those of certain races.

The questionnaire used in the IEA cross-national survey included UN related items to measure both cognitive and affective outcomes. More than sixty per cent of fourteen year olds identified the UN Charter (as the document out of five listed) which contains the most accurate description of the organization. Approximately fifty per cent of the fourteen year olds knew that the Security Council (out of five listed units) is charged with major responsibility for keeping of peace. In addition to these cognitive items, there were a series of rating of the UN in a part of the instrument called "How Society Works." There students were asked to indicate what effect each of ten listed institutions had upon the realization of a series of

values. These students rated the UN relatively high on achievements such as "creates better understanding so that people can live and work together," and "settles arguments and disagreement." Many fourteen year olds (including Americans) saw other institutions as equally effective or more effective in promoting these harmonizing values. In summary, in the U.S. the majority of both fourteen year olds and seniors in high school have accurate knowledge about the major activities of the UN; however, it is not an institution about which they have extensive knowledge, a clearly developed image or strong positive attitudes. There is a very small change between the fourteen year old and the high school senior with respect to knowledge about the UN or clarity of attitudes toward it.

The junior and senior high school students tested by Peterson (1980) in Kentucky were about equally divided as to whether they thought the UN was doing a good or a poor job. Nearly eighty per cent agreed that the U.S. should remain a member, however. Some relatively imaginative questions regarding foreign aid were also asked. About half the students supported foreign aid in the form of food, medical supplies, or educational materials. Only about half agreed that the U.S. should provide aid in military supplies. Interview studies are necessary to follow up perceptions of these important national and international relationships.

Although items about international economic problems have been included in some recent surveys (Schur, 1973; Soper, 1979), they seem not to have been separately analyzed. There have in fact been no significant studies of children's perceptions of international economic issues or of economics as it influences the problems of developing countries. (Heater, 1980, draws a similar conclusion about a research gap from his survey of psychological research in Great Britain.)

In summary, there has recently been a significant study at the collegiate level concerning attitudes/knowledge about global problems and organizations which attempt to foster international cooperation.

If one looks at the pre-collegiate level, the research is scattered and often only represents small pilot studies of one or two issues. We know a little from an interview study of children's concepts of human rights. The picture is even bleaker in geography and international economics. Although there have been a number of studies of attitudes toward war, few of these have been placed into a coherent structure of relationships between nations, political change processes which are to be preferred to violence, conflict resolution strategies and diplomacy, or the connection between war and other problems.

It is in the area of studies of global problems, not in the area of attitudes toward other nations, that research is most needed. Fortunately the ETS survey provides a test prototype which, with some modifications, could be used either for high school students or for groups in other nations. It may be of even greater importance to promote studies which use interviews to probe children's understanding of global issues. How are connections between these problems perceived? If problems are perceived as complex and not amenable to rapid solutions, is the result pessimism or a commitment (on the part of at least some young people) to work on finding solutions -- either through personal consumption behavior, engaging in political participation, or further informing themselves and seeking to inform others? It is here that basic studies of the course of perceptions over the years of childhood are especially needed to guide program development.

Research on the Effectiveness of Programs
in International Education

In the area of effects upon young peoples' international knowledge and attitudes, as in other political socialization topics, it is clear that no socializing agent, no single institution accounts for all (or even a majority) of learning. This review will concentrate on school programs, as that is where NIE's mandate is the most clear,

A recent review of the role of the school in political socialization in general has concluded:

The school curriculum is found to be effective in transmitting knowledge but not in influencing attitudes;... Classroom climate and student participation in school activities, and the school organizational climate were main factors found related to student political attitudes, (Ehman, 1980, p. 99)

Confirming this, the IEA survey found that in nearly all the nine countries where full testing was done scores on scales measuring democratic values and interest in political participation were highest among students whose classes included few printed drill exercises and a great deal of opportunity for students to express their opinions in free discussions where teachers respected their points of view (Torney, Oppenheim, and Farnen, 1975). The teachers' attitude toward international topics is probably also important to successful outcomes in international education. National and international problems were seen as being of about equal importance by teachers in the Federal Republic of Germany, Italy and New Zealand. In Finland, Ireland, and the United States, national problems were rated as somewhat more important than international topics. Generally, teachers in all the nations surveyed tended to regard non-Western culture topics as of relatively little importance (when compared with other civic education topics).

Tolley (1973) studied several aspects of the schools' influence on children's attitudes toward war in general and in particular toward the war in Vietnam. There was a relatively low correlation of students' attitudes with those of their classroom teachers. However, he did find that "children in classes where the teachers believe they should expressly support the government's policy display the greater support for American involvement in Vietnam." (Tolley, 1973, p. 78). The greatest difference he found was between boys attending schools operated by the Society of Friends and those who were cadets in military academies. He also noted some differences attributable to the greater participation in patriotic rituals by children in public (as compared to private) schools.

The extent to which teachers influence the student's experience with international curriculum materials is indicated by Bellak's research (1966). A curriculum unit on international economic problems, with stress on the value of free trade, was taught by each of fifteen teachers. Pupils were given pre- and post-tests based on materials in the booklet they had studied. Teacher-student interactions were observed and coded. All teachers devoted a major proportion of their time to discussion related to the general topic, but there was great variation in the amount of time spent on specific sub-topics. For example, in one class exports and imports were discussed in 23.5% of the verbal interactions; in another class, this topic occupied only .5% of the time. Free trade was discussed in 38.4% of the interactions in one class and in only 4.7% of the interactions in another. These variations existed in spite of the fact that the curriculum guides and student materials were identical. According to the observations, teachers stated or explained facts in the majority of their interactions with students. The students of teachers who used these modes of instruction more than 85% of the time were less successful on the tests than those of the teachers who spent a smaller proportion of their time stating or explaining facts.

Four pieces of research have compared the effects of traditional with more innovative curricula having an international focus. These are Williams (1961), Elley (1964), Kehoe (1980), and Mitsakos (1978).

Williams compared two curricula concerning the geography of West Africa with thirteen and fourteen year old British students. The experimental curriculum, which was taught by the author, emphasized the "details of everyday life, the nature of current problems facing people of the area, and the help which was being given by such international bodies as the specialized agencies of the UN." (Williams, 1961, p. 293). The traditional curriculum (also taught by the author) studied the physical, historical, and regional geography of West Africa. A scale regarding attitudes to West African Negroes was administered to both groups before and after the twenty lessons. The mean score of the group given the standard curriculum was changed by .2 points in a "favorable" direction; the change reported in the experimental group studying social geography was 7.6 points.

Elley investigated the fostering of attitudes favorable to international understanding in fourteen year old New Zealand secondary school boys. Attitudes toward war and toward thirteen national groups were investigated. An experimental course, emphasizing international understanding, was taught by the author to the experimental group; a second class was taught by the author according to the regular curriculum; a third group was taught the traditional course by another teacher. After four months, all classes were retested to ascertain shifts in attitudes; the experimental group was tested again two months later. The experimental social studies curriculum included topics such as the following: causes and effects of war; attempts to keep the peace, with emphasis on the UN; illustrations of the interdependence of nations; detailed study of the life and problems of people in India, China, Japan, Holland and Russia. Active participation was encouraged. The control group studied the same geographical

areas with emphasis on climate, vegetation, and products. More traditional lectures were used. The experimental class increased in their tolerance of all national groups, particular those chosen for special study. The changes were maintained two months later. No such change occurred in the control classes. Attitudes toward the Japanese were somewhat more resistant to long-lasting change in both groups. The author's conclusion was that "schools make little contribution to international understanding unless teachers deliberately plan to foster it." (Elley, 1964, p. 325).

The reports of Williams and Elley have several common factors. First, both were conducted by teachers using curriculum plans of their own making and tailored to the special needs and abilities of their classes. Second, these curricula were designed to contrast with traditional approaches both in content and methods (although the same topics were covered). Third, both studies suggest that schools must make a conscious effort to foster positive international education and not expect increased knowledge of geography or political structures to result in improved attitudes.

In one of the only studies existing on human rights education, Kehoe compared two methods of dealing with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Kehoe, 1980). In the first approach teachers led students in discussions of cases related to the Declaration to make pupils aware of its provisions and their application to cultural practices which might be thought of as contraventions. Students were asked to consider what the consequences might be for society if everyone engaged in the behavior described. In a second approach, students did not stay in a single discussion group but moved from one area of the room to another. At each "learning station" an Article from the Universal Declaration was written on a large sheet of paper. A large envelope was attached to the paper containing newspaper stories describing contraventions of that article. Groups of three or four students moved

together to each station and discussed the Article as well as writing their reactions. A post-test evaluation of these students' knowledge of international law showed the group using the learning stations to be superior to the discussion group in their knowledge of international law.

Mitsakos (1978) performed an evaluation of the effectiveness of the Family of Man Social Studies program on third graders' views of foreign people. The program is aimed at helping children discover both universals and the psychic unity of human kind and to value cultural diversity. Twenty five schools from all over the U.S. participated. The experimental group included twenty one classes with about five hundred children who had used the Family of Man Curriculum. Control Group 1 included about two hundred children who had been taught with any one of several other social studies programs. Control Group 2 included about two hundred students who had not been exposed to a continuous or defined social studies program. Instruments used in the pre- and post-tests were adapted from a chauvinism-ethnocentrism survey (Schmidt, 1975) and from one of the national description measures used in Other Nations; Other Peoples. There was also an instrument called People Pictures which asked students to respond to photographs with evaluative descriptions. The three groups did not differ on a measure of social studies achievement or on chauvinism-ethnocentrism. Children in the Family of Man experimental group had a more favorable view of foreign people, according to scores on People Pictures; they used significantly fewer negative descriptions. There were also significant differences in use of fifteen of the twenty two adjectives in Describing Nations (e.g. peaceful, are like us, few people, many people, large, small, friendly, strong); This led Mitsakos to conclude that the experimental group had a "more comprehensive" view of eight of the twelve nations, including the U.S. That seems to mean that students associated a larger number of adjectives of

a negative, positive, and neutral character with these nations. Teachers in a post-test questionnaire indicated that they believed they had placed special stress during the experimental curriculum on certain world problems -- population, food scarcity, and the unequal distribution of wealth and resources. The author concludes that such a global education program can increase children's understanding of other nations, and that this focus does not decrease children's understanding of America but rather puts it into perspective.

A number of other unpublished studies in ERIC note some significant effects of studies related to world cultures and ideologies. For example, Lalor found that a one year world cultures anthropology course lessened ethnocentrism in high school students (Lalor, 1966); Pettibone and Petrosko, however, found no significant differences in cultural openmindedness resulting from a comparative approach to teaching world cultures.

There have been some attempts to study the effects of cultural units in foreign language classes. Riestra and Johnson (1964) taught a combined Spanish language and culture course to elementary school students. Their data from pre- and post-tests indicated that students' attitudes became more favorable not only to the particular culture studied but also to Spanish-speaking cultures in general. Tuttle, et al (1979) taught Spanish to seventh and eighth graders using slides to stress either similarities of Puerto Rican life styles to their own or differences in life styles. The group in which similarities were stressed showed significant (pre-test/post-test) changes on an Ethnocentrism Scale (not described) and on Semantic Differential Ratings of Puerto Ricans. There were no differences on a Social Distance Scale, and there were no differences for the group where differences were stressed.

It should be clear from the review to this point that there have been few attempts to compare carefully designed educational paradigms. The usefulness of one technique used extensively in international education — the simulation game — has been examined. Glover et al. (1978) concluded that an intercultural simulation game increased tolerance for ambiguity and decreased dogmatism (using Rokeach's scale). Williams (1980) found in his study that an economics simulation did not change social attitudes; he indicated that this might have been due to the lack of instructor experience in using the technique. Williams cited the work of Lee and O'Leary indicating that fifth graders could be divided into one group which benefited from simulations (those who empathized easily and for whom information was gained easily by listening) and another group which did not benefit (those who did not empathize easily and for whom information was gained more easily by reading). Brand (1980) reported using two games from Man a Course of Study dealing with the Netsilik and found that fifth graders showed increases in knowledge. Perhaps the most interesting study of simulation is that of Foster, Lachman and Mason (1980) which suggests that the greatest impact of the technique is not on attitudes measured in a direct way but upon "verstehen" -- subtleties or the subjective understanding of the complexities of a situation. They asked subjects to write short essays concerning what they felt they learned in a simulation and how they saw terms such as elitist and pluralist (before and after the game).

The research on simulations is among the most interesting because it moves beyond simple approaches to measuring attitudes viewed as positive or negative affect to consider complexity of concepts and understanding,

Many of the studies which attempt to evaluate the effectiveness of educational programs in fact suffer from measurement difficulties. Two techniques -- the Semantic Differential and the Social Distance Scale-- are very widely used. Especially when they are used in pre-post testing which is separated by only a few weeks, they are of dubious validity. When the concept pairs on the Semantic Differential are closely related to the objects being judged, they may be of some value. But the measurement sophistication level of many of the studies is quite low and the findings are thus difficult to interpret. Further, many of the studies are conducted with highly selected samples which may not be representative of young people in general. We know almost nothing about the particular age levels for which a given technique may be useful because the research is usually conducted by one teacher in one school with one/grade levels, or two

There needs to be additional research which uses more satisfying measuring techniques, deals with broader samples and explicitly compares learning paradigms.

In the area of the influence of foreign language instruction upon student attitudes there is an especially interesting field of potential research. In developmental psychology in the last few years there has been considerable study of fields known as meta-cognition, meta-memory, and meta-linguistics. These are defined (respectively) as the individual's verbalizable knowledge about the processes of thinking, remembering and speaking. Students are interviewed, for example, about how they believe that they go about generating or understanding language. So far, however, meta-linguistic studies have been confined to research on knowledge about speaking the mother tongue. Hake (1980), for example, has re- d English metalinguistic ability to concrete operations among four to eight

year olds. The interview study cited earlier (Torney, 1969) in which children were asked about differences between people who live in other nations (and in which the importance of language differences was noted) is a beginning in this direction. By the end of elementary school it was found that even without instruction in a second language, some students are aware that people are attached to speaking the language they learned as children, that it requires a long time to learn another language, and that people in other countries would appropriately resist being required to learn English (or even a world language, if such were to be developed). Some students, however, do not achieve these understandings. In the absence of readily available opportunities for American children to visit places where people speak only languages other than English, one of the most important outcomes of exposure to second language instruction may be the enhanced ability to more fully take the perspective of someone who does not speak English. Research on the metalinguistic awareness connected with second language is a very important area in which no work presently exists,

Research Priorities

Issues which deserve priority in international learning and assessment may be grouped into a relatively small number of broad categories. Nine areas of research are presented in rank order,

The first priority obtains this high place because it is basic to the other priorities and because it must be addressed early in any program of research. It is research addressed to the problem of developing better measures of learning outcomes and informing those who are developing programs which need evaluation of their existence. The need for improved measures of cognitive outcomes (knowledge) is acute; the problem of measuring in the affective domain is even more serious. Survey research and paper and pencil tests cannot provide a complete or in-depth picture of international perspectives.

Responses may be forced into categories with little opportunity for children to give unique or unorthodox responses. Validity of these measures has frequently been ignored. Sometimes face validity is relied upon to the extent that the questions are too obvious/anything except to measure the respondents' desire not to say socially undesirable things. Many measures have too low a ceiling; positive attitudes toward other cultural groups may be so high at the beginning of a training or educational program that any positive change is impossible to detect.

Educational researchers need to re-discover the interview, the focused open-ended question, and measures such as those employed by Gallatin and Adelson (1971) who asked young people to imagine that they were establishing a society on an uninhabited island. Fischer (1977) used open ended interviews to assess not only commonly used dimensions such as positiveness in views of intergroup relations, but also complexity. "Verstehen" was previously referred to as an important aspect of understanding to measure as an outcome of international education. Many international programs are designed to influence the complexity of the individual's world view -- something which might be thought of as falling between cognition and affect; measures such as these are useful places to begin.

Likewise, the recent literature on social cognition research done by developmental psychologists has considerable potential for yielding measures. Perspective taking, the child's ability to take the point of view of someone else, bears more than a superficial relationship to the global perspective; and a number of perspective taking measures exist. Furth (1980) and Leahy (in press) have queried young children in a modified Piagetian interview about their experiences with and judgments of social institutions and poverty (respectively).

Some studies with adults have used scenarios or hypothetical vignettes of international crises (Worchel, 1967), or cross-cultural interactions (Reich and Purbhoo, 1975). Small group research (such as that recently done on equity theory) also needs to be further explored. Whenever it is possible to anchor questions to concrete materials (e.g., maps) or obtain estimates of intended behavior (Grush, Clore, and Costin, 1975), this is useful.

Some recent studies, such as the ETS/Council on Learning study of undergraduates have, within the limits of a survey, given some very useful items (on which normative data is available). This instrument has considerable potential for use with modifications for younger individuals and for selected populations in other nations. Nearly every other study quoted here has one or two questions, at least, which could be included on an exemplary list. The problem is that there is no listing of these techniques or items which is readily available to investigators and which includes statements concerning reliabilities, validity, and possible uses. Such a listing would be the most helpful step toward greater willingness on the part of program developers to conduct evaluations of learning outcomes and toward improving the quality of evaluations. Investigators might even be able to use more than one measure of a given dimension!

NIE should undertake two steps. First is an attempt to cull instruments from existing literature, to develop guidelines for judging these measures and some prototype testing material. The second would be a contract for the assessment/and dissemination of these measures. This would involve their examination by measurement experts, followed by testing of the most promising ones. A full range of topics, such as that covered in this paper, should be included -- concepts of one's own nationality, other nations, international processes, global problems, motivation, international organizations, cooperation with European allies,

This priority should be given the earliest starting date and should be coordinate, wherever possible, with content projects such as those suggested in the remainder of the priority list.

Once measurement has been put on a more solid footing, it will be possible to accumulate knowledge about international learning -- to urge the National Assessment to use some of these items; to conduct appropriate studies of the role of language study; to consider comparative studies.

The second priority is for research which links educational programs to the global problems and issues which will be on the agenda of American national interests in the next several years. Thus, more research is needed on human rights, international economics and trade, resource distribution, international cooperation (including allies), and perceptions of security. All of these topics were given an important place in the ETS survey of knowledge and attitudes. At the pre-collegiate level, there has been only sparse attention to global problems. Although young people voice considerable support for human rights, it is not clear how their attitudes toward the issue domestically relate to it internationally. International economics is an area which is of vital interest to the U.S., yet there has been almost no research on young people's understanding of it or attitudes toward the current situation. Resource distribution is also of great importance, but geographical perspectives have not, previous to this, been well represented in studies of international education.

Several of the pieces of research reviewed in the body of the paper deal with attitudes toward war but none deal adequately with perceptions of national security and arms control or relations with European allies.

The National Assessment is an existing research unit which could be encouraged to devote more attention to global problems. Although a special global assessment was proposed in 1976, because of cut-backs in funds even the overall social studies assessment has been drastically reduced,

Only a small number of items dealing with global issues either directly or indirectly have been used in previous assessments. Even some of the interesting items which have been included in one assessment (such as those used by Jones, 1980) ^{for further analysis} tend not to be among the items repeated.

Studies of global problems could be stimulated through small grants to graduate students specializing in or interested in the content area. Once the compendium of instruments exists (as prescribed in Priority 1), it will be much easier for small projects to utilize specialists in geography, human rights, economics, and international relations to probe the knowledge base of students and consider the influence of different teaching units.

Professional associations and universities which have already developed or are currently developing materials in international economics, human rights, global geography, hunger issues, security/arms control could be encouraged with such small grants to make assessment and evaluation a stronger part of their projects. Existing law-related education programs may be encouraged to do research on young people's concepts of international law and human rights.

The overseas Dependent Schools may be particularly interesting sites within which to conduct some of the research on young people's understanding of world economics, resource distribution, and international cooperation (especially with European allies). The work of the Regional Educational Laboratories may also be useful in stimulating studies of global problems. Finally, competition for research funds under Title VI, Section 605 of the Higher Education Act of 1965 may include some of these topics.

The third priority for research is placed on studies of the developmental process to suggest the most appropriate timing and sequence for international education. At several places in the body of the paper it was noted that the period of middle childhood (age seven or eight to eleven or twelve) seems to be a time of high interest in foreign peoples and cultures, and a time when information is rapidly acquired about global problems. Piecing together the results of studies done for quite disparate purposes is an entirely unsatisfactory way of finding out whether this is an especially important period for international education programs to be concentrated,

Some authors believe that the primacy principle is operating (the earlier an international experience is given to a child, the more formative it is likely to be). Some authors believe that the recency principle is operating (the closer an experience in international education is to a child or adolescent's need to use information the better). Some authors believe that the prerequisite principle is operating (a child needs certain existing cognitive processes before he or she is able to effectively assimilate international issues or global problems). Finally, some authors (including this one) believe in the plasticity principle (a period, such as middle childhood, is an especially effective one for international education because of the child's open attitudes to people who are different from himself). A coherent research program is needed to examine these four principles with respect to several content areas of international education,

Such a research program will probably need to focus on the early concepts children have of the social systems in which they live -- what law means, what nationality means, what it means to belong to groups at different levels from the school to the world, What are the basic universals which children believe ought to be part of definitions of human rights for all people? What does foreignness mean to children? What do teachers assume

about children's images of the world which is not accurate? What have children overlearned? All of these questions need to be explored with a wide range of instruments (interviews) and may need to be explored in other nations using a comparative approach as well. After there is a research base concerning development of these basic concepts, some short-term longitudinal research may be necessary to provide information on timing. The culminating step would be studies of the effectiveness of different educational techniques for young people with different levels of conceptual development.

It would be difficult to undertake a broadly based research program such as this except through a grants program. Such a research program would probably require interdisciplinary cooperation and would need support over a period of at least three years. Adding a research or evaluation specialist (as suggested in the previous priority) or an extensive review of the literature (as suggested in the first priority) would not be sufficient. Funds available through Title VI-605, might be a supplementary source for some smaller project components, however.

The fourth priority for research is placed upon studies of the contribution of second language study to students' global perspective and metalinguistic awareness. Proposed studies might consider what children know about the process of speaking and learning other languages and the attitudinal concomitants of the acquisition of skill in one or more foreign languages, (A fuller justification for the study of metalinguistic awareness resulting from language study is provided in the body of the paper).

Research under this priority would require the collaboration of foreign language specialists and psychologists. Small research grants might make considerable contributions to building the necessary base. Studies conducted in the Overseas Dependent Schools could provide interesting comparative information,

The fifth priority for research is the comparison of learning paradigms in international education. The literature review found only very limited studies in this area. The studies of particular program approaches were too often of low generalizability -- having been conducted by one teacher, at one age level, with one school group. A few exploratory studies of classroom climate and simulations need to be followed up. There is little existing empirical work on which to base judgments about which topics are best dealt with in structured ways and which should be opened for extensive classroom discussion; what the optimal use of simulation games is; how audio-visual media should be incorporated.

Closely related to the problem of learning paradigms is the issue of motivation, which has also been given entirely inadequate attention in the research literature. The ETS study indicated that among college students the only independent variable which was consistently related to high test performance was frequent reading of a good newspaper. Yet reading a newspaper (especially its international news) requires a certain level of motivation beyond doing class assignments. How is this motivation acquired? What are the components of intrinsic motivation to learn about the world? To expose oneself to potentially depressing information about earthquakes and famines? To involve oneself in activities which may help to alleviate global problems? Although many of the activities relating to international awareness may originally be established in classes through external reward, for the citizen who has left school only intrinsic reward is often available.

A grants program supporting research which compares the effectiveness of different learning paradigms is needed -- motivation needs to be especially stressed. Some of these programs might be jointly developed with the aid of foundations which support research in journalism and communication.

The remaining priorities are listed somewhat more briefly, as it is anticipated that those considered will already tax the available resources.

The sixth priority area for research is work on how television contributes to the social construction of children's view of global problems and other nations. Many studies comment that children say they learn about world problems from television, but there has been little research on how this information is assimilated.

The seventh priority is placed on studies to determine how state level educational personnel and classroom teachers (and their administrators) might be most effectively trained to participate in research. International and global education is a particularly appropriate area for the participation of teacher-researchers.

The eighth priority is placed on studies of in-group/out-group relations. It is clear that children's reactions to other racial groups, immigrants, bi-lingual individuals are all important in understanding processes of international learning.

The ninth priority is more an over-arching concern than it is a specific priority. Whenever possible studies should include cross-national comparative data. The United States may hold a monopoly on many types of educational research; in the area of international education this is not true. In too many cases the U.S. has failed to take account of international education problems and solutions existing in other world areas. Many other nations present naturally occurring experiments in international education which we would be well to utilize.

The comparative data which exists should be fully used. The ETS questionnaire, culled for relevance to other nations, should be administered to students in other nations. The special advantage of comparative work with closely neighboring nations, such as Canada and Mexico, should be

References

- Barrows, T. Attitudes and perceptions. In What college students know about their world. New Rochelle, N. Y.: Change Magazine Press, 1981.
- Bellak, A. The language of the classroom. New York: Teachers College, 1966.
- Billig, H. and Tajfel, H. Social categorization and similarity in intergroup behavior. European Journal of Social Psychology, 1973, 3, 27-52.
- Brand, C. Learning from simulation games. Simulations and Games, 1980, 11, 163-76.
- Buergenthal, T. and Torney, J. V. International human rights and international education. Washington, D. C.: U. S. National Commission for UNESCO and U.S. Government Printing Office, 1976.
- Caddick, B. Equity theory and intergroup relations. In L. Wheeler, (ed.), Review of personality and social psychology. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1980.
- Caplow, T. and Bahr, H. M. Half a century of change in adolescent attitudes. Public Opinion Quarterly, 1979, 43, 1-17.
- Connell, R. The child's construction of politics. Melbourne, Australia: University of Melbourne Press, 1971.
- Cooper, P. The development of the concept of war. Journal of Peace Research, 1965, 2, 1-17.
- Department of Education of the United States, International Education Resources: Cumulative Second Edition. Washington, D. C.: U. S. Government Printing Office, 1980.
- Ehman, L. The American school in the political socialization process. Review of Educational Research, 180, 50, 99-119.
- Elley, W. B. Attitude change and education for understanding. Sociology of Education, 1964, 37, 318-25.
- Fischer, R. J. Toward the more comprehensive measurement of intergroup attitudes. Canadian Journal of Behavioral Science, 1977, 94, 283-94.
- Flouris, G. A study of cross cultural awareness among Greek-American students enrolled in a monolingual and bilingual school. Modern Language Journal, 1980, 64, 329-3.
- Foster, J. L.; Lachman, A; and Mason, R. Verstehen, cognition and the impact of a political simulation. Simulation and Games, 1980, 11, 223-41.
- Furth, H. The world of grown-ups. New York: Elsevier, 1980.
- Gallatin, J. and Adelson, J. Legal guarantees of individual freedom: a cross national study of the development of political thought. Journal of Social Issues, 1971, 27, 93.

47
Glenn, A. H. Elementary school children's trust in nations and acceptance of foreign children. Paper presented at the National Council for the Social Studies, 1970.

Glover, J. A.; Romeo, P; and Peterson, C. Effects of a simulation game upon tolerance for ambiguity, dogmatism, and risk taking. Journal of Social Psychology, 1978, 105, 291-96.

Grush, J. E.; Clore, G. and Costin, F. Dissimilarity and attraction. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 1975, 32, 783-89.

Hake, D. T. The development of metalinguistic ability in children. New York: Springer, 1980.

Heater, D. World studies: education for international understanding in Britain. London: Harrap, 1980.

Hess, R. D. and Torney, J. V. The development of political attitudes in children. Chicago: Aldine, 1967.

Hicks, E. and Beyer, B. K. Images of Africa. Journal of Negro Education, 1970, 39, 155-70.

Jahoda, G. Children's concepts of nationality: a critical study of Piaget's stages. Child Development, 1964, 35, 1081-92.

Jahoda, G. Development of Scottish children's ideas and attitudes about other countries. Journal of Social Psychology, 1962, 38, 91-108.

Jahoda, G. The development of children's ideas about country and nationality. British Journal of Educational Psychology, 1963, 33, 47-61 and 143-53

Jaspars, J. M. ; Van de Geer, J. P.; Tajfel, H. and Johnson, N. B. On the development of national attitudes. European Journal of Social Psychology, 1966, 1, 360-70.

Jerschina, J. The impact of universities on Polish students' attitudes toward their own nation and the Catholic religion. International Journal of Political Education, 1980, 3, 271-85.

Johnson, N. Development of English children's concept of Germany. Journal of Social Psychology, 1973, 90, 259-67.

Johnson, N.; Middleton, M. and Tajfel, H. The relation of children's preference to knowledge of other nations. British Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology, 1970, 9, 232-40.

Jones, R. National vs. international learning: political knowledge and interest in the USA. International Journal of Political Education, 1980, 3, 33-48.

Kehoe, J. An examination of alternative approaches to teaching the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. International Journal of Political Education, 1980, 3, 193-204

Klein, S. and Ager, S. Knowledge. In What college students know about their world. New Rochelle, N. Y.: Change Magazine Press, 1981.

Klineberg, O; Zavalloni, M.; Louis-Buerin, C. and Ben Brika, J. Students, values, and politics. New York: Free Press, 1979.

Lambert, W. and Klineberg, O. Children's views of foreign peoples. New York: Appleton Century Crofts, 1967.

Leahy, R. The development of the conception of economic inequality: I: Descriptions and comparisons of rich and poor people. Child Development, in press.

Metz, K. De-sociocentering: a Neo-Piagetian model of the process of decentration in the intergroup context. Human Development, 1980, 23, 1-16.

Micklenburger, J. A. What priority for global education. Washington, D. C.: National School Boards Association, 1981 (mimeo).

Middleton, M. R.; Tajfel, H. and Johnson, N. Children's early preferences for other nations and their subsequent acquisition of knowledge about those nations. British Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology, 1970, 9, 122-34.

Mitsakos, C. A global education program can make a difference. Theory and Research in Social Education, 1978, 6, 1-15.

Moodie, M. A. The development of national identity in white South African schoolchildren. Journal of Social Psychology, 1980, 111, 169-180.

Pasternak, T. L. Qualitative differences in the development of yielding behavior by elementary school children. Psychological Reports, 1973, 32, 883-96.

Peterson, J. The next generation; international attitudes of secondary school students in Kentucky. ERIC Document ED 187 610, 1980.

Pettibone, T. and Petrosko, J. A comparative approach to teaching world cultures. ERIC Document ED 046 832, 1970.

Piaget, J. and Weil, A. The development in children of the idea of homeland and of relations with other countries. International Social Science Bulletin 3, 1951, 561-78.

Pike, L and Barrows, T. Other nations, other peoples. Washington, D. C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1979.

Reich, C. and Purbhoo, M. The effect of cross cultural contact. Canadian Journal of Behavioral Science, 1975, 7, 312-27.

Riestra, M. A. and Johnson, C. E. Changes in attitudes of elementary school pupils toward foreign-speaking peoples resulting from the study of a foreign language. Journal of Experimental Education, 1964, 32, 65-72.

Schmidt, N. A study of global education in the United States. Los Angeles: I/D/E/A Research Division, 1975.

- Schur, L. Junior high school test of economics. Milwaukee: Center for Economic Education, 1973.
- Soper, J. Test of economic literacy. New York: Joint Council on Economic Education, 1979.
- Statt, D. The influence of national power in the child's view of the world. Journal of Peace Research, 1974, 3, 245-6.
- Strassberg, D. S. and Wigen, E. Conformity as a function of age in pre-adolescents. Journal of Social Psychology, 1973, 91, 61-66.
- Targ, H. Children's orientations to international politics. Journal of Peace Research, 1970, 2, 79-98.
- Tolley, H. Children and war. New York: Teachers College.
- Tonkin, H. and Edwards, J. The world in the curriculum. New Rochelle, N. Y.: Change Magazine Press, 1981.
- Torney, J. Research on the development of international orientations during childhood and adolescence. Paper presented at the American Political Science Association, 1969.
- Torney, J. The international knowledge and attitudes of adolescents in nine countries: the IEA civic education survey. International Journal of Political Education, 1977, 1, 3-20.
- Torney, J. The Implementation of the Recommendation on Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and education Relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, in the United States of America. Report prepared for UNESCO Meeting of Experts, Sofia, Bulgaria, 1979.
- Torney, J. and Brice, P. Children's concepts of human rights and social cognition. Paper presented at the American Psychological Association, 1979. ERIC Document ED 1978 185.
- Torney, J.; Oppenheim, A. N.; and Farnen, R. Civic education in ten nations: an empirical study. New York: John Wiley, 1975.
- Torney-Furta, J. Social cognition research: its implications for social and political education. Teaching Political Science, in press.
- Tucker, J. The Implementation of the International Education Recommendation in the United States of America. Report prepared for UNESCO Meeting of Experts, Helsinki, Finland, 1980.
- Tuttle, H.; Guitart, J.; Papalia, A. and Zampogna, J. Effects of cultural presentations on attitudes of foreign language students. Modern Language Journal, 1979, 63, 177-82.

Weston, B. Contending with a planet in peril and change: an optimal educational response. Alternatives, 1979-1980, 5, 59-95.

Williams, H. M. Changes in pupils' attitudes toward West African Negroes following the use of two different teaching methods. British Journal of Educational Psychology, 1961, 31, 292-96.

Williams, R. Attitude change and simulation games. Simulations and Games, 1980, 11, 177-96.