

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 078 331

CG 008 129

AUTHOR Johnson, Ralph H.; And Others  
TITLE Evaluating Counselor Effectiveness Fact or  
Fallacy--Counselors Relate Equally Well to All  
Students.  
INSTITUTION Minneapolis Public Schools, Minn. Dept. of Guidance  
Services.  
PUB DATE 73  
NOTE 13p.  
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29  
DESCRIPTORS \*Counseling Effectiveness; Counselor Evaluation;  
Counselor Performance; \*Evaluation; Evaluation  
Techniques; Measurement Techniques; Minority Groups;  
Noncollege Preparatory Students; \*Secondary School  
Students; \*Student Attitudes; Student Needs; Student  
Opinion; Surveys

ABSTRACT

In order to investigate counselor effectiveness in urban secondary schools, guidance personnel developed a ninth grade and a twelfth grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. Data collected were processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and the reaction of students to their relationship with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of interactions with counselors. Results show two trends: (1) minority students responded more positively than others; and (2) noncollege-bound students responded more positively than college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level. Implications of the resulting data include the following: (1) individual counseling programs can be studied from the students' point of views, (2) staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to meet student needs; and, (3) student priorities concerning counseling services can be readily identified. (Author/SES)

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Minneapolis Public Schools  
Department of Guidance Services

EVALUATING COUNSELOR EFFECTIVENESS

FACT OR FALLACY--COUNSELORS RELATE EQUALLY WELL TO ALL STUDENTS

Prepared by:

Donald M. Peterson - Counselor at Roosevelt High School  
JoAnne M. Wilson - Counselor at Folwell Junior High School  
Ralph H. Johnson - Director of Guidance Services

ED 078331

Problem and Hypotheses. In the spring of 1971 several Minneapolis counselors discussed ways to obtain feedback from students regarding counselor effectiveness. Counselors were also concerned about negative comments relating to their counseling services. Of particular consequence are remarks indicating that counselors were not relating consistently to all groups of students and that counselors were not available, knowledgeable, or helpful. To investigate counselor effectiveness in Minneapolis secondary schools, personnel in the Department of Guidance Services, with counselor input particularly from those who served as junior and senior high department chairmen, developed a Ninth Grade and a Twelfth Grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. The purpose of the administration of this questionnaire was to determine, through actual student response, how counseling effectiveness was viewed by students using the services.

The following hypotheses were formulated:

1. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the number of student-counselor interviews.
2. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statement regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's sex.

CG 008 129

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,  
EDUCATION & WELFARE  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF  
EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

3. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to student's race.
4. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's post high school goal.
5. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's school marks.

Design. The Counseling Accountability Questionnaires were administered in the spring of 1971 to 76 percent of the 9th grade students and a 22 percent sample of the 12th grade students in 25 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools and in the spring of 1972 to over 80 percent of the 9th grade students and over 80 percent of the 12th grade students in 27 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools (approximately 4,500 per class).

Minneapolis students in Grades 9 and 12 in the spring of 1971 and 1972 were asked to complete the Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. They did not sign their names but were asked to designate their sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times they had interacted with their counselors. Subjective comments were invited.

Data collected was processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and reaction of students to their relationships with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times interacted with counselors.

Results. Representative graph results indicate that the criticisms and questions of counselor effectiveness that initiated this study were not borne out by the data. No significant difference was found to exist in student response to questionnaire statements for either grade 9 or grade 12 for either the 1971 or 1972 administration for any of the hypotheses with the exception of the first hypothesis. As the number of individual interviews increased, the responses were significantly more positive.

Although no significant difference was found for the other hypotheses, there was a trend evidenced from many questionnaire statements that minority students responded more positively than others and that noncollege-bound students responded more positively than the college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level generally.

From the administration of these questionnaires and the resulting data came the following findings and implications:

1. Areas of strength and weakness for city-wide and each individual secondary school counseling program can be studied from the student's point of view.
2. Minority and non-college-bound students were as effectively served by counselors as the majority and college-bound students.
3. Staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to zero in on unmet student needs.
4. Priorities concerning counseling services as seen by students were identified.
5. Individual counselors can examine their effectiveness.
6. Item analysis of questionnaire item has implications for the delivery of guidance and counseling services.





1972

1972

	Interaction	Sex	Race	Goal	Interaction	Sex	Race	Goal
13. Get along better with others								
	757	Total			2493	Total		
	19	Never		49	49	Never		
	45	Once		144	144	Once		
	227	2 - 3		815	815	2 - 3		
	296	4 - 9		1085	1085	4 - 9		
	150	10+		386	386	10+		
	324	Male		1187	1187	Male		
	407	Female		1271	1271	Female		
	630	White		2221	2221	White		
	124	Non-white		110	110	Non-white		
	339	College		1116	1116	College		
	391	Non-College		1007	1007	Non-College		
14. Is a person I can trust								
	61	Yes		62	62	Yes		
	08	No		09	09	No		
	29	Don't know		29	29	Don't know		
	02	No response		01	01	No response		
15. Fasten to me								
	76	Yes		79	79	Yes		
	10	No		10	10	No		
	11	Don't know		11	11	Don't know		
	03	No response		01	01	No response		
16. Helps me learn to make my own decisions								
	46	Yes		54	54	Yes		
	22	No		21	21	No		
	23	Don't know		24	24	Don't know		
	04	No response		02	02	No response		
17. Is ready to get in to use								
	50	Yes		53	53	Yes		
	40	No		38	38	No		
	07	Don't know		07	07	Don't know		
	03	No response		02	02	No response		
18. Know what I'm thinking about								
	61	Yes		64	64	Yes		
	14	No		13	13	No		
	22	Don't know		21	21	Don't know		
	03	No response		02	02	No response		

(DATA SHOWN IS AVERAGE OF ALL STATES ROUNDED TO THE NEARST WHOLE NUMBER)

1971

Question	Interaction		Sex	Race	Mar:	Mar:	Total	Interaction				Sex	Race	Mar:											
	1-3	4-10						1-3	4-10	1-3	4-10				1-3	4-10									
1. Learn more about my abilities & interests	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	15	31	46	39	38	38	44	40	37	43	38	54	17	23	35	43	43	39	37	38	39	38	38	37
	Didn't want or need	69	60	46	52	52	52	53	42	53	53	45	54	65	69	58	50	48	52	56	55	52	56	56	53
2. Think about my future education and career opportunities	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	15	31	46	39	38	38	44	40	37	43	38	54	17	23	35	43	43	39	37	38	39	38	38	37
	Didn't want or need	69	60	46	52	52	52	53	42	53	53	45	54	65	69	58	50	48	52	56	55	52	56	56	53
3. Learn what subjects to take	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	16	30	61	55	55	55	57	58	53	53	54	29	43	52	60	66	68	63	62	62	67	67	66	63
	Didn't want or need	69	60	46	52	52	52	53	42	53	53	45	54	65	69	58	50	48	52	56	55	52	56	56	53
4. Get a program change	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	13	34	51	43	42	42	47	39	46	43	42	42	14	25	35	49	55	43	42	42	48	40	44	49
	Didn't want or need	74	50	32	39	39	39	32	47	47	48	48	41	67	61	51	34	25	39	43	42	31	29	47	36
5. Learn about or participate in something special	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	11	15	32	22	27	24	36	25	22	32	26	29	11	11	19	30	41	23	30	25	40	29	22	34
	Didn't want or need	73	75	58	67	64	67	53	67	66	55	64	64	74	79	73	61	46	67	60	66	46	64	66	45
6. Learn about or need information about other people	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	06	07	16	13	11	11	20	10	14	12	12	08	05	01	07	13	25	13	11	12	15	10	14	24
	Didn't want or need	84	86	78	82	84	84	73	36	30	79	80	83	91	87	79	67	57	76	32	32	31	75	85	76
7. Learn about or need information about other people	Total	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1852	1372	166	
	Yes	02	04	11	08	09	07	13	06	10	09	08	04	03	05	05	06	06	09	03	08	11	06	09	18
	Didn't want or need	92	90	83	84	84	84	73	36	30	79	80	83	91	87	79	67	57	76	32	32	31	75	85	76

(DATA REPORT IS EXPRESSED IN PERCENTAGE POINTS)

1971

1972

Question	1971										1972														
	Total	Never	1 - 3	4 - 10+	Male	Female	White	Non-white	A & B	C	D & F	Total	Never	Once	2 - 3	4 - 9	10+	Male	Female	White	Non-white	A & C	C	D & F	
9. with a personal problem	3646	94	1512	1975	1818	1749	3208	364	1765	1283	188	3530	118	301	1142	1183	759	1719	1773	3062	295	1652	1372	166	
Yes	16	05	10	26	18	19	18	24	15	21	25	14	06	04	09	14	26	14	13	14	16	16	11	17	18
Didn't want or need	74	86	83	67	76	73	75	68	80	71	61	79	81	90	87	80	64	79	80	80	73	73	84	75	66
Wanted but didn't get	05	02	04	05	04	06	05	06	03	06	10	05	10	03	03	04	07	05	05	04	06	06	04	05	13
No response	03	09	03	02	03	02	02	02	02	02	03	02	02	03	01	02	04	02	02	02	06	06	01	03	03
10. Make an important decision	41	06	24	37	32	29	30	37	29	13	33	24	08	07	19	25	36	25	22	23	29	29	21	26	21
Yes	62	83	63	56	60	63	63	53	66	58	57	70	79	84	76	69	58	68	73	72	62	66	74	67	66
Didn't want or need	04	01	04	02	04	05	04	04	03	03	05	04	04	11	06	04	05	05	04	04	06	06	04	05	11
Wanted but didn't get	04	09	03	03	03	03	03	05	02	03	05	02	02	03	02	02	01	02	02	01	03	03	01	02	02
No response	04	09	03	03	03	03	03	05	02	03	05	02	02	03	02	02	03	02	02	01	03	03	01	03	04
11. Feel better about coming to school	13	05	09	17	15	12	13	21	10	17	16	14	06	06	09	15	23	14	14	13	25	12	15	22	15
Yes	73	83	31	74	77	30	80	67	34	74	64	81	82	89	86	81	71	79	83	82	71	75	86	76	66
Didn't want or need	04	04	04	05	04	04	04	05	02	05	12	05	12	03	04	05	08	06	04	04	07	07	07	15	15
Wanted but didn't get	04	09	04	03	04	03	03	06	04	03	06	02	02	02	01	02	02	02	02	01	04	01	01	02	04
No response	04	09	04	03	04	03	03	06	04	03	06	02	02	03	02	02	03	02	02	01	04	01	02	04	04
12. Carry about me	47	22	38	56	46	47	47	43	51	44	45	43	25	24	36	50	54	44	43	44	44	44	46	40	39
Yes	07	09	08	05	07	07	07	07	06	07	10	03	14	09	07	07	11	09	08	06	07	07	07	10	17
No	45	68	53	57	44	46	45	43	42	48	44	48	59	66	56	42	34	46	48	48	46	46	50	42	42
Don't know	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	02	01	01	01	01	02	01	01	01	01	01	01	00	03	01	01	02	02
13. Is a person I can trust	65	37	59	71	64	67	65	63	69	63	52	60	31	48	59	66	63	62	59	61	55	55	64	56	51
Yes	10	05	09	11	10	10	09	13	07	11	19	13	16	10	10	12	20	12	13	12	16	12	15	23	23
No	21	56	31	13	26	25	24	22	23	24	26	21	49	41	30	21	16	25	27	26	27	25	23	20	20
Don't know	01	01	01	01	01	01	02	02	01	01	01	01	02	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01
14. In a way to let an to see	47	32	40	54	43	47	47	46	47	49	50	43	21	33	39	49	50	43	44	44	47	44	42	44	44
Yes	74	77	83	56	83	85	84	80	81	85	87	78	82	81	87	87	88	83	80	80	85	86	86	84	84
No	27	27	33	36	43	35	34	30	31	35	37	38	32	31	39	37	42	33	38	38	34	34	36	47	44
Don't know	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	01

(DATA SHOWS EXPENSES IN PAROLEE'S BUDGET FOR THE MONTH BEFORE PERLUM)

Interaction	Sex		Race		Age		Marital		Status		Marks
	Male	Female	White	Non-white	A & B	C	D & F	A & B	C	D & F	
15. Listen to me	75	77	77	79	76	79	80	76	76	73	73
Yes	07	09	07	08	07	10	06	06	09	08	08
No	13	19	14	11	14	14	14	14	14	13	13
Don't know	02	02	01	01	03	03	01	01	01	01	01
16. Is a person I enjoy talking with?	56	19	56	58	65	58	58	56	56	48	51
Yes	08	08	07	08	08	06	06	09	09	13	11
No	20	23	20	19	20	21	21	19	17	17	20
Don't know	02	02	01	02	02	01	02	02	02	03	02
17. Know what he's talking about?	70	30	71	71	68	71	71	70	66	67	67
Yes	08	07	07	08	08	06	06	09	13	11	15
No	20	62	20	19	18	21	21	19	17	20	15
Don't know	02	01	02	02	02	01	02	02	03	02	04
18. Has visitor my classmate?	51	55	59	60	58	64	64	56	49	59	49
Yes	30	24	30	31	29	28	28	33	37	31	30
No	09	19	10	08	11	07	07	10	13	07	16
Don't know	02	01	01	01	02	01	01	01	01	03	05
19. Has involved me in group counseling session?	12	04	13	11	18	11	11	11	14	10	10
Yes	79	72	76	32	67	80	79	79	75	31	31
No	05	21	09	06	09	07	07	09	09	07	07
Don't know	01	02	01	01	06	01	01	01	02	02	02
20. Has talked with my parents?	22	13	29	22	31	21	29	29	43	24	24
Yes	07	06	05	03	06	05	04	04	06	07	07
No	16	30	17	14	20	15	17	13	36	14	14
Don't know	01	02	01	01	03	01	02	03	13	05	05

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS  
Department of Guidance Services

JUNIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

The counseling department is interested in knowing how students feel about the junior high counseling program. It will be helpful if you answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible the questionnaire on the back.

Since individual students will not be identified, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answering a question you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

\_\_\_\_ 1.  
\_\_\_\_ 2.  
\_\_\_\_ 3.

\_\_\_\_ 4.  
\_\_\_\_ 5.  
\_\_\_\_ 6.

---

JW/ja  
5/2/72

School \_\_\_\_\_ (71-73) Grade \_\_\_\_\_ (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item, check the one column that best describes your contact with your counselors in Grades 7, 8 and 9.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Learn more about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Think about my future education and career opportunities	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Learn about or participate in something special (WOC, WECEP, CAMP, NYC, Urban Arts, Talented Youth, Summer School, a meeting)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Understand how to get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. By helping classmates or teachers or family understand me better	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. Contact a person who could help me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know. (Check only one answer for each item).

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
12. Cares about me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
14. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Is a person I enjoy talking with	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Knows what he is talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Has visited my classes	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. Has involved me in group counseling sessions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
20. Has talked with my parents	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
21. How many times have you "talked" with a counselor during junior high? (Include seventh and eighth grade even if you had a different counselor)			
1. Never	_____	_____	_____
2. Once	_____	_____	_____
3. 2-3 times	_____	_____	_____
4. 4-9 times	_____	_____	_____
5. Ten or more times	_____	_____	_____
22. What is your sex?			
1. Male	_____	_____	_____
2. Female	_____	_____	_____
23. What is your race?			
1. Black American	_____	_____	_____
2. American Indian	_____	_____	_____
3. Spanish Surnamed American	_____	_____	_____
4. Oriental American	_____	_____	_____
5. White American	_____	_____	_____
6. Other	_____	_____	_____
24. Which of the following best describes the average grades you get in school?			
1. A	_____	_____	_____
2. B	_____	_____	_____
3. C	_____	_____	_____
4. D	_____	_____	_____
5. F	_____	_____	_____
25. If you have any additional comments, please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS  
Department of Guidance Services

SENIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

Please think about the counselor or counselors that you have had during tenth, eleventh and twelfth grades as you answer the questionnaire on the back. It will be helpful to your school if you will answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible.

Since individual students will be graded, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answer a question, you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

\_\_\_\_ 1.  
\_\_\_\_ 2.  
\_\_\_\_ 3.

\_\_\_\_ 4.  
\_\_\_\_ 5.  
\_\_\_\_ 6.

---

JW/ja  
5/2/72

School \_\_\_\_\_ (71-73) Grade \_\_\_\_\_ (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item check the column that best describes your contact with your counselor.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. See a college representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. See a vocational-technical school representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Get information about a job or an apprenticeship	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Apply for admission to college or vocational-technical school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. Apply for financial aid (Scholarship)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. By arranging for me to attend a career or another important meeting	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Learn about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
12. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know.

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
14. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Helps me learn to make my own decisions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Knows what he's talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. How many times have you "talked" with your counselor during the school year 1971-72?			
1. Never	_____		
2. Once	_____		
3. 2-3 times	_____		
4. 4-9 times	_____		
5. Ten or more times	_____		
20. What is your sex?			
1. Male	_____		
2. Female	_____		
21. What is your race?			
1. Black American	_____		
2. American Indian	_____		
3. Spanish Surnamed American	_____		
4. Oriental American	_____		
5. White American	_____		
6. Other	_____		
22. Which of the following best describes the grades you get in school?			
1. A	_____		
2. B	_____		
3. C	_____		
4. D	_____		
5. F	_____		
23. What do you plan to do next year?			
1. Full-time job	_____		
2. Military service	_____		
3. Technical, vocational or business school	_____		
4. College	_____		
5. Other	_____		
24. If you have any additional comments please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			