Planning-Programming-Budgeting Systems (PPBS) have been considered as either synonymous with abstract, advanced, mathematical systems analysis or as an advanced accounting and control system. If PPBS is to perform a useful function, both viewpoints must be combined such that a number of standardized procedures and reports are required and advanced analytical techniques are used when needed for attainment of excellence in planning, resource allocation and management of operations. The 210-item bibliography serves to inform state agencies of the availability and wide scope of PPBS and its applications as a means of utilizing this new management technology in state planning. (A supplemental bibliography is provided in LI 002 741.) (AB)
Council of Planning Librarians EXCHANGE BIBLIOGRAPHY

March 1970

PLANNING – PROGRAMMING – BUDGETING SYSTEMS

Dean Tudor, Librarian
Ontario Department of Revenue

Mrs. Mary Vance, Editor
Post Office Box 229
Monticello, Illinois 61856
INTRODUCTION

The increasing complexity of modern life and the public's demand for administrative governments on all levels to provide services geared to this life have made the task of policy makers, planners, and managers within the jurisdictional areas increasingly difficult. The range of problems, the possible range of responses to these problems, and the chronic shortage of funds to fulfill all demands, calls into question old methods of establishing priorities, designing appropriate programs, managing operations and controlling budgets. These "old methods" were probably adequate for the conditions which prevailed when they were developed; however, it is now recognized that there are a number of weaknesses inherent in the "old method":

(a) vagueness of objectives;
(b) limited analysis of alternatives;
(c) partial costing of programs;
(d) inadequate consideration of future year implications of present decisions;
(e) short review and decision period;
(f) emphasis on expenditure control instead of performance; and
(g) gap between planning, budgeting, and control.

In the last few years there has emerged a body of knowledge and a group of techniques, which can provide great assistance to policy makers and managers in their work. The system or management approach known as Planning-Programming-Budgeting (P.P.B.) sometimes known as Program Budgeting is now employed in a number of jurisdictions for this purpose.

A reading of the literature on P.P.B. can lead to two distorted views on what the system is and does.

On the one hand, a number of papers and lectures have appeared making P.P.B. synonymous with abstract, advanced, mathematical Systems Analysis. This approach, in its emphasis on the use of complex mathematical model building, programming and optimizing techniques, creates the impression that a P.P.B. system cannot exist unless these sophisticated econometric and mathematical models are employed. This might be called the "abstract theory" view.

Another view which is often presented represents P.P.B. as an advanced accounting and control system. In this view, the essential elements are a new way of presenting budgets and controlling expenditures. These changes
are accompanied by the inclusion of longer range projections of costs and the introduction of a form of performance reporting. This might be called the "book-keeping" approach.

Neither view is adequate or acceptable if a P.P.B. system is to perform a useful function. To some people, the "abstract theory" view seems to imply that the entire decision-making power can be turned over to the Systems Analyst and that managers become wholly dependent upon the mathematical wizardry of these analysts. Analysis of issues, Objectives and alternative courses of action is the backbone of a well functioning P.P.B. system, but the inference that only very sophisticated analysis constitutes P.P.B., or that P.P.B. cannot exist without sophisticated analysis is dangerously misleading. Often the greatest insights come from orderly and essentially simple analyses.

If, on the other hand, the "book-keeping" approach were adequate, and nothing but the basic ways of submitting plans and estimates and of reporting on operations were changed, the system would be a matter of substituting one form of paper for another with no essential change in the basic thinking and analysis. In fairness, there is no real evidence that authors and lecturers intend to create either of these impressions, but these impressions do seem to emerge in the minds of readers and listeners fairly frequently.

A good P.P.B. system will require a number of standardized procedures and reports, and it will undoubtedly encourage the use of advanced analytical techniques when they are needed. Its essential value to managers comes, however, not from the techniques used in analysis or the forms used in reporting, but from the degree to which it assists in the attainment of excellence in planning, resource allocation, and management of operations.

The basic objectives of a P.P.B. system are:

(a) to define jurisdictional objectives clearly and to relate them to defined needs and goals;
(b) to stimulate the in-depth analysis of all existing and proposed new programs in terms of their costs and benefits;
(c) to link the planning and budgeting process through the annual review of multiple year plans;
(d) to measure actual and planned performance; and
(e) to provide a systematic way of integrating all of these elements in order to arrive at a more effective system for the allocation and management of resources.

The adoption of P.P.B. systems by more and more governments usually means that those agencies which advise, report to, or rely on governments must begin to think in terms of P.P.B. Their criteria for evaluation must closely approximate the needs of governments for input into the P.P.B. system. The main criticism leveled against state planning is that the state has failed to take advantage of new management technology (P.P.B. systems, information systems and analysis, modeling and simulating). If this is true, then the following bibliography should be a worthwhile step towards informing state agencies of the availability and wide scope of P.P.B. systems and its applications.
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

   Papers presented at a conference of experts held November 7-9, 1963.


   The State-Local Finances Project, 1145 19th Street, N.W., Washington, D. C., has a number of publications available on P.P.B. including the well known P.P.B. Notes 1-11.

   Basic 'textbook' on P.P.B.

   Describes P.P.B.S. with particular emphasis on accounting.

   Basic work, includes an illustrative study of the evaluation of alternative water-resource systems.

   The classical work in the P.P.B. field.


   - with Dr. A. C. Enthoven, Assistant Secretary of Defense, September 27, October 18, 1967.

   Includes articles by A. Schick and A. Wildavsky (available in reprint).

Includes articles by Elizabeth B. Drew, William Gorham and Aaron Wildavsky.


Discusses, (a) general principles, (b) particular applications, e.g. water supply projects, transport, land usage, health, education, research, etc., also has an extensive bibliography on Cost-Benefit Analysis.


A down to earth book written by a man who has a wealth of experience as Director of the Bureau of the Budget during the Johnson administration.


A systematic approach to evaluating and selecting resource development projects with particular reference to the Canadian scene.


Alesch, D. J.

Alfandary-Alexander, Mark, comp.

American Society of Planning Officials.

American Society of Planning Officials.

Balls, H. R.
Balls, H. R. 

Banks, Robert and Arnold Kotz. 

Bateman, Worth. 

Bayer, Sylvan. 
"PPBS - A New Management Tool" Federal Accountant, 17: no. 4, p. 82-90.

Benson, E. J. 

Berkowitz, Monroe. 

Bierman, Harold, Jr. 

Blatt, Donald B. 

Bolton, W. B. 

Bopp, K. D. 
"Planning/Programming/Budgeting" Mayor and Manager, May 1968, p. 6-8.

Botner, Stanley B. 

Botner, Stanley B. 

Botner, Stanley B. 

Bridgeman, J. M. 
Burkhead, Jesse. 

Burns, Leland S. 

California. Dept. of Finance. 

Canada. Dept. of Finance. Treasury Board. 

Canada. Dept. of Manpower and Immigration. 

Canada. Treasury Board. 

Canada. Treasury Board. Management Improvement Branch. 

Canada. Treasury Board. Management Improvement Branch. 

Capron, William M. 


Committee for Economic Development. 


Consed Research Corporation. 

Cotton, J. F. 
Council of State Governments.
State Reports on Five-Five-Five: A Pilot Project on Planning-

Cribbfield, Brerard and George A. Bell.
"Budgeting for State and Local Government Services" American Academy
of Political and Social Sciences. Annals, Sept. 1968, p. 31-38.

Crowe, Eugene B. and Delmas D. Ray.
"Planning-Programming-Budgeting Systems" Economic Leaflets, vol. 28,
no. 5, 6, 7, May-July 1969. 12p.

Davis, Otto; M.A.H. Dempster; and Aaron Wildavsky.
"A Theory of the Budgeting Process" American Political Science

Denhardt, Robert B. and David F. Paulsen.

Don Vito, P. A.

Downs, Anthony.

Donaho, J. A.
"Planning-Programming-Budget Systems" Municipal Finance, Aug. 1967,
p. 17-25.

Dror, Yehezkel.
"PPB and the Public Policy-Making System" Public Administration

Eghtedari, Ali and Frank Sherwood.
"Performance Budgeting in Los Angeles" Public Administration Review,
Spring 1960, p. 63-69.

Elkin, Robert.
"Applying PPBS to Public Welfare." Management Contro'ss. 26: 237-242

Escarraz, Donald Ray

Exton, Elaine
"State Legislations Urged To Install Planning-Programming-Budgeting

Fairfax Co., Va. Board of County Supervisors.
Faulkner, Paul J.

Fazaz, Willard.

Feldstein, Martin S.

Fisher, G. H.
The World of Program Budgeting. Santa Monica, Cal, Rand Corp., 1966. 30p. (P-3361)

Fowke, Donald V.
"PPB for Provinces" Canadian Public Administration, 1969, p. 72-77.

Fox, Thomas G.

Gabis, Stanley T.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.
George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.
Planning-Programming-Budgeting for City, State, County Objectives.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

George Washington University, State-Local Finances Project.

Gillhespy, N. R.

Gorham, William.
"Notes of a Practitioner" Public Interest, Summer 1967, p. 4-8.

Gorham, William.
"Sharpening the Knife that Cuts the Public Pie" Public Administration Review, May-June 1968, p. 236-241.
Graese, C. F.  
"Program Budgeting for Government"  

Greenhouse, Samuel M.  
"A 'Distributed Output' Concept for the Planning-Programming- 
Budgeting System"  

Greenhouse, Samuel M.  
"The Planning-Programming-Budgeting System: Rationale, Language, 
and Idea-Relationships"  

Gross, Bertram M.  
"The New Systems Budgeting"  
*Public Administration Review*, Mar./Apr. 1969, p. 113-137.

Hammond, Richard J.  
"Convention and Limitation in Benefit-Cost Analysis"  

Hatry, H. P., and Cotton, J. F.  
Program Planning for State, County, City.  

Hatry, H. P.  
Systems Analysis and PPBS.  

Harrill, E. Reece.  
"Performance Building and Accounting"  

Henry, Marion L. and Willis Proctor.  
"New York State's Performance Budget Experiment"  

Hirsch, Werner Z.  
"Toward Federal Program Budgeting"  

Hitch, Charles J.  
Hitch, Charles J.  

Hovey, Harold A.  

Ijiri, Y.; J. C. Kinard; and F. B. Putney.  

"Is PPBS All That Good?"  
Armed Forces Management, April 1968, p. 32-33.

Jones, Roger H.  

Karsh, Norman.  
"PPBS: For better or for Worse" Budgeting, 1968? 4p.

Kelso, Maurice M.  

Knapp, George C.  

Koch, Vernon E.  

Levine, Abraham S.  

Levine, Abraham S.  

Levy, Michael.  

Little, P. L. and C. L. Mitchell.  

Luther, R. A.  
"PPBS in Fairfax County: A Practical Experience" Municipal Finance, Aug. 1968, p. 34-42.
Lyden, Fremont J. and E. G. Miller. (eds.).
Chicago, Markham, 1967. 443p.

Maass, Arthur.
"Benefit-Cost Analysis: Its Relevance to Public Investment Decisions"

Macdonald, N. Ian.
Program Budgeting; a speech given to IPAC, Sept. 4, 1968. 39p.

McLoon, Eugene P.

"Management Accounting for Government"

Massey, Robert J.

McCullough, J. D.

McGilvery, Francis E.

McGilvery, Francis E.

McKean, Roland N.

McNicol, J. A.

Michigan. Dept. of State.

Millward, R. E.

Morse, Elsworth H., Jr.
Mosher, Frederick C.

Murphy, J. S.
"The Quiet Revolution in Government Planning Techniques." (Management Review, Apr. 1968, p. 4-11)

Mushkin, Selma J.

Mushkin, Selma J.

Murphy, Joseph S.

Mushkin, Selma.

State-Local Finances Project, George Washington Univ.

National Industrial Conference Board.


Novick, David.

Novick, David. (ed.).

Novick, David.
Which Program Do We Mean in "Program Budgeting"? Santa Monica, California, Rand Corp., May 12, 1952 (Clearing house, AD 422827). 31p.

Ontario. Legislative Assembly.


"Performance Reports Used with Performance Budgets" Public Management, March 1962, p. 63-64.

Planning-Programming-Budgeting Systems: A Collection of Bibliographies Collated by the Staff of the Treasury Dept. Library, 1968 -

Planning-Programming-Budgeting Systems, Special Readings Collated by the Staff of the Treasury Dept. Library, 1968 -
Posner, Ben.  
"Planning-Programming-Budgeting: A Financial Management Approach"  

"Cost-Benefit Analysis: A Survey"  

Quade, E. S.  
*Systems Analysis Techniques for Planning-Programming-Budgeting*,  
Santa Monica, Cal., RAND, 1966. 31p.

Roberts, Ralph S.  
"USDA's Pioneering Performance Budget Experiment"  
*Public Administration Review*, Spring 1960, p. 74-78.

Rosenzweig, H.  
Problems Associated with Measurement and Evaluation of Performance in Connection with State Programs and Agencies.  
Santa Monica, Calif., Rand Corp., No date. 11p.

Ross, N. G.  
"Toward Better Control of Federal Government Expenditures"  

Ross, William B.  
"Some Perspective on Federal PPBS"  

Rowen, Henry S.  
"PPBS: What and Why"  

Schelling, Thomas C.  
"PPBS and Foreign Affairs"  

Schick, A.  
"The Road to PPB: The Stages of Budget Reform"  

Schick, Allen.  
"Systems Politics and Systems Budgeting"  


Simmons, Edwin H.  
"Planners, Programmers, and Budgeteers"  

Smithies, A.  
Conceptual Framework for the Program Budget. (From Novick, David  
Spindler, Arthur.

Steiner, George A.

Sterns, A. A.

Sterns, A. A.

Stromsdorfer, Ernst W.

Tai, N. W.

United Nations. Dept. of Economic and Social Affairs.

U. S. Bureau of the Budget.

U. S. Bureau of the Budget.

U. S. Bureau of the Budget.

U. S. Bureau of the Budget. Library.

U. S. Congress. Joint Economic Committee.

U. S. Congress. Joint Economic Committee.


U. S. Dept. of Agriculture. Office of the Secretary.
Planning-Programming-Budgeting System. (Secretary's Memorandum, No. 1965.) 5p.

U. S. Dept. of Defense.


U. S. General Accounting Office.


U. S. President's Commission on Budget Concepts.

U. S. Senate. Committee on Government Operations.

U. S. Senate. Committee on Government Operations.


COUNCIL OF PLANNING LIBRARIANS

PLANNING - PROGRAMMING - BUDGETING SYSTEMS

Additional copies available from:

Council of Planning Librarians
Post Office Box 229
Monticello, Illinois, 61856

for $2.00